



**Comments Received on Draft 401 Water Quality Certification US Magnesium Canal Continuation Project
Certification Decision No.: DWQ-2022-08001**

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1 | Rob Dubuc, General Counsel, FRIENDS of the Great Salt Lake | Submitted FOGSL Comments Re:Draft US Mag 401 Cert (DWQ-2022-030234). |
| 2 | Rob Dubuc, General Counsel, FRIENDS of the Great Salt Lake | Friends is formally requesting a 30-day extension to the public comment period for this permit (through November 28, 2022), and that you hold a public hearing on the proposed 401 permit. We believe this is sufficient public interest in this matter to justify these requests. |
| 3 | Rob Dubuc, General Counsel, FRIENDS of the Great Salt Lake | Please see attached. [DWQ-2022-030675] |
| 4 | Cheryl Heying Great Salt Lake Audubon | See Attached comments [DWQ-2022-030476] |
| 5 | Eliza Cowie Policy Director O2 Utah | Please find the attached public comment regarding the US Magnesium Canal Continuation Project. [Attachment DWQ-2022-030491] |
| 6 | Wayne Martinson | Please see attached comments on draft US Magnesium Water Quality Certification.Thank you for considering these comments [Attached Comments DWQ-2022-030493, DWQ-2022-030477] |
| 7 | Cooper Farr, M.S. Director of Conservation Tracy Aviary | I have attached a written comment regarding the Public Notice to Issue a Section 401 Water Quality Certification (DWQ-2022-08001). Please let me know if you have any questions. [Attachment DWQ-2022-030633] |
| 8 | Joel Ban Ban Law Office Park City | Attachment DWQ-2022-030694] |
| 9 | Dave Carrier Utah Citizen's Council | Please consider our attached response to USMag's request to expand their canal system. We are writing to recommend that the Utah Division of Water Quality (DWQ) not approve Section 401 certification associated with the US Magnesium.[Attachment DWQ-2022-030673] |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 10 | John Ray Utah Waterfowl Association | Attached please find the comments of Utah Waterfowl Association filed in connection with US Magnesium's Canal Extension Project (DWQ's Draft 401 Certification – DWQ-2022-08001 Related to USACE SPK-2008-01773). [Attachment DWQ-2022-030466] |
| 11 | Lisa Neeshan | We understand the need for Magnesium in our everyday lives but worry that the approval of this permit would disrupt the ecology of the lake and put us at risk of toxic elements in our airshed. If Utah wants to continue being a top producer of Magnesium in the nation, we must first find solutions to raise the lake levels. Please don't allow this permit until the above is addressed. Our air quality is already bad enough. Thank you for your consideration! |
| 12 | Linda Zeveloff | US Magnesium extracts magnesium and other minerals from the Great Salt Lake by drawing water into canals that were not designed to function at the lake's record lows. If approved, this permit would allow for an extension of their canals to continue their operations of diverting 100,000 gallons per minute. We understand the need for Magnesium in our everyday lives but worry that the approval of this permit would disrupt the ecology of the lake and put us at risk of toxic elements in our airshed. If Utah wants to continue being a top producer of Magnesium in the nation, we must first find solutions to raise the lake levels. |
| 13 | Marjorie McCloy | I'm very alarmed that US Magnesium would consider drawing down water from the Great Salt Lake to aid their mineral production. Although I understand the importance of magnesium in our daily lives, the Lake cannot afford to lose more water. It is already bordering on an environmental and natural disaster. This is of great personal concern to me, as the toxic dust from the exposed lake bed exacerbates my asthma and breathing issues. Thank you for your attention. |
| 14 | Tara Shupe South Salt Lake Resident | We are all aware of the danger we face in losing the Great Salt Lake, from lost migratory bird habitat to exposed lakebed toxic wind storms, all the information is being published daily, getting attention globally because of just how dire the situation is. We can not hesitate in taking action a moment longer. You are trading the health of every animal that must breath the air to prop up an industry whose short-term survival requires exacerbating the depletion of the Great Salt Lake. Please use science and common sense and reject this permit! |
| 15 | Therese Berry Utah Resident | US Magnesium's request for a 401 permit from the Utah Division of Water Quality to extend their canals several miles further into the Great Salt Lake lakebed to an elevation of 4185 feet in order to continue to draw water from the lake is an act of complete disregard for the lake water resource at a time where the water situation at hand is dire for this irreplaceable body of water. The canal extension will allow US Magnesium to avoid disrupting their operations by maintaining their conveyance of 100,000 gallons of water per minute from Great Salt Lake. Extending the canal is a short term 'fix' for this company, it may buy them a year or two of operating time, but it compounds the threat of total and possibly irreversible ecosystem collapse at Great Salt Lake. This request is a clear illustration of the take, take, take mentality of industry tied to the lake when the time has come to pause, consider a long-term vision and a new mindset of giving back to the lake in order to save it from collapse. Any consideration to approve this permit should be abandoned as Great Salt Lake is already at 4188 feet, which is dangerously low, and every additional inch of water lost harms the lake's ecology and its ability to rebound in the future. The cost and consequences of any and all actions pursuing the continued removal of water from the lake bed are dire; to the health of the lake ecosystem, to the health of the residents of SL valley, to other economic stakeholders (skiing and brine shrimp industry), and to the public trust. This past year, the state appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to solving the problem of low water at Great Salt Lake. It would be irresponsible to issue a permit that benefits a single company (removing water from the lake), but makes the situation worse for everyone else, threatening an entire ecosystem, the health of millions of people, and all the other industries that rely on the lake. It is still incomprehensible to me that the leaders and decision makers of this state have not yet made the obvious move to declare a 'State of emergency' regarding Great Salt Lake. Such a declaration would raise this dire situation to a level of prestige and standing as to affect policy and protection of the lake over all else. We are at that crossroad! If Utah would like to continue to support US Magnesium and its operations at Great Salt Lake, the only solution is to raise lake levels, and that also means denying requests to draw it down further. Indeed, if US Magnesium would like to maintain its operation at Great Salt Lake, they too should consider investing their resources in getting more water into the lake, rather than taking more water out. Real effective change is still not taking shape in the agencies that are poised to make a difference. Do the right thing, Yes, maybe it's the hard thing to do - lead the charge for change - but it's the right thing to do. A moratorium on water removal from the lake until the lake is given a chance to recover. Decline this permit Division of Water Quality! My |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>eyes have gazed across this valley towards the Lake for the past 65 years. Am I concerned? I am absolutely, unapologetically, whole heartedly concerned for the life and livelihood of our beloved Lake. It doesn't matter if you have a love-hate relationship with this great body of water, we live in her basin - she belongs to us, she is the life-blood - the nature of this state, life giver to millions of migratory birds, maker of the greatest snow on earth, our name-sake. The Lake is who we are. Period. We can NOT stand by - business as usual as she edges toward catastrophic collapse. Our leaders and decision makers can NOT proceed – business as usual as she edges toward catastrophic collapse. Say NO to US Magnesium's plans to further devastate the lake's ecosystem. Say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. Great Salt Lake is at the lowest level ever recorded and is on track to continue receding until winter rains come in November. The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of GSL and the residents of Salt Lake valley. U.S Magnesium is historically a major contributor to lowering lake levels. They already evaporate away more than 40 billion gallons of water a year to turn a profit; that's more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. All this while millions of pounds of chlorine are spewed across thousands of acres of lakebed. While Great Salt Lake is on the brink of collapse, U.S. Magnesium has applied for permits to lengthen their intake canals by several miles by dredging more than 100 acres of lake body to reach the water and continue sucking the lake dry. The application states: "The project would maintain a conveyance of lake water intake flow of 100,000 gallons per minute from the Great Salt Lake." This equates to bringing the lake level down an additional 9 feet. This equates to an absolute death sentence for Great Salt Lake and its entire ecosystem. Yes, this is a water quality issue - as more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will continue to increase which will destroy the lake's ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by creating segmentation within Gilbert Bay which will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, that DWQ is required by law to protect. At a minimum, DWQ must conduct a Level II Antidegradation review to ensure that US Magnesium's permit request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the division is required by law to protect. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake in order to ensure the protection of the Lake's beneficial uses. Do the right thing Utah Division of Water Quality, make the difficult decision to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach (Attachment DWQ-2022-030034)</p> |
| 16 | Isaac Lindstrom Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am submitting my public comment to the Utah Department of Water Quality regarding the US magnesium plan to extend their canals. This permit need to be cancelled. The LAST thing of that the Great Salt Lake needs is more infrastructure in it and less water. It needs more water. PERIOD. If US Magnesium wants water in their canals, why don't they buy out the water rights from the upriver alfalfa farmers ...way better than extending canals to a dying lake. This permit need to be cancelled.</p> |
| 17 | G.D. & Jill Beckett Park City Residents | <p>We realize there must be a balance between environmentally sensitive decisions and the continuance of business activities. But in the case of US Mag, there should be no permit issued for canal extensions. US Mag's operations are questionable enough relative to the community benefits and costs. But the proposed canal extensions go too far (literally and figuratively). The extensions are proposed because the GSL has shrunk by about two-thirds. Extending US Mag's reach into the GSL comes at a cost too high for the GSL and the citizens and ecological communities surrounding it. There have been reports of increased dust impacts. The GSL's shrinkage is exposing more toxic minerals (yes, most natural but still toxic) to the air we breathe. Further, the GSL cannot sustain additional encroachments without further impairing the wildlife and communities that depend on its health. In this particular case, we need to say no to the needs of one business and rather respect the needs of the broader environment that includes citizens, wildlife, and moral stewardship of our lands for future generations. We don't own the GSL, but we are responsible for its health and welfare. We hope you will do the right thing and reject the permit to dredge and continue operations at this historic tipping point of the GSL.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 18 | Peter Erickson Brine Shrimper | I've been a brine shrimper (Salt Creek), I've been on the shores of the Aral Sea, I served on a TAG committee concerned about the Great Salt Lake, and I'm a sailboat owner and member of the Great Salt Lake Yacht Club. We need to do everything we can to keep the Great Salt Lake from getting any shallower than it already is and do everything we can to help it get deeper. DO NOT LET MAGCORP EXTEND ITS INTAKE CANALS! The U.N. declared what happened to the Aral Sea, thanks to Soviet mismanagement of natural resources, was the greatest man-made natural disaster in history. Let's not repeat that mistake right here in our backyard with our heads buried in oolitic sand. |
| 19 | Leslie Woods | Just say NO to US Magnesium, the Great Salt Lake is at its lowest point since I have lived in the Salt Lake Valley. |
| 20 | Elizabeth Braymen Salt Lake City Resident | I am a resident of Salt Lake City, Utah, who is against granting US Magnesium a permit to divert more water from the Great Salt Lake. As I'm sure you are aware, the entire world is trying to come to grips with the challenges presented by rapid climate change. Locally, I would say our biggest concern is, not just maintaining, but actually replenishing the water in the Great Salt Lake. We are in an historic drought, and climate scientists are telling us it is far from over. This is not the time to favor water diversion for any reason whatsoever. A greater reduction of water poses a catastrophic, existential threat to the entire web of life in our state, including human life. Hotter weather, less rain and snow, poor air quality, dust storms, all contribute to the destruction of our natural and our human community. I'm asking you to make saving our lake your highest priority and deny section 401 certification for US Magnesium. |
| 21 | Jared Winkler Cottonwood Heights Resident | I live in Cottonwood Heights and frequently visit the Great Salt Lake. Please do not let large corporations like US Magnesium drain the little water we have left. Over the years I have seen the levels drop to where I can't even launch my boat at the GSL Marina any more. You might have missed the dust storm on Sunday from Antelope Island to Farmington Bay. It's real and only getting worse. Please stand up for the environment and make the right decisions for ours and the lake's future. |
| 22 | Marilee Rowley | I am unable to attend the meeting tomorrow night, but want to speak up in support of our Great Salt Lake. We need to find more ways to put water back IN the lake, and not take any more water out of it. This lake is home to many migrating bird species, the water protects our air quality by covering the toxic lake bed, and it is important for lake effect snow and other recreation. Save the GSL, and say no to US Magnesium! |
| 23 | Margaret Edmunds Cottonwood Heights Resident | The Great Salt Lake is at the lowest level ever recorded and is on track to continue receding until winter rains come in November. The lake is dying because too much water is being taken out. Thousands of square miles of lakebed now lie exposed, creating a dustbowl full of toxins that blow across the Wasatch Front. My family and yours breathe this air on a daily basis, and the health ramifications are truly terrifying. U.S. Magnesium's recent application for permits to lengthen their intake canals must be denied. The GSL is on the brink of collapse and we must change the way we do things in Utah: we must stop enabling polluters. At a minimum, DWQ must conduct a Level II Antidegradation review to ensure that US Magnesium's permit request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the division is required by law to protect. Given the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake in order to ensure the protection of the Lake. Please oppose US Magnesium's application and do right by the residents of the Wasatch Front. |
| 24 | Josh McBeain | It's time to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake (GSL) crisis demands a new approach. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on GSL to avoid violation of beneficial use. All Utahns benefit from adequately full GSL. The new approach we need to take means saying NO to US Magnesium's request to extend two intake canals now. But US Magnesium will benefit, along with all Utahns, when the GSL is adequately full in the future. |
| 25 | Nick Neilhart | I am writing you to voice my deep concern for the Great Salt Lake. It is at a record low and its life is hanging by a very thin thread. Aside from the toxic dust it will (and already does) release, and the millions of birds which rely on the health of the brine shrimp each year as they travel to and from their feeding and mating grounds, I truly love this lake. I want it to be healthy because I love it and because it is a place of beauty. Because it is alive and breathing and right now it is very sick. Please do |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>not allow US Magnesium to dredge the lake bed in order to extract more water. Do not allow them to expand their operations. We are at a time in our history as a people where we need to reimagine our futures. A time in which the earth needs to be cared for and the policy written by our public officials needs, more than ever, to reflect the urgency of our time. To face the truth our situations. To choose to protect the treasures of our land, rivers and lakes rather than line the pockets of a wealthy few. If you have read this, then thank you. I hope there are so many emails and phone calls into your office that you couldn't possibly have the time to. Please, say no to US Magnesium's request for more water from the GSL.</p> |
| 26 | Douglas Day Centerville Resident | <p>I'm writing about the Section 401 Water Quality Certification to US Magnesium for the extension of two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. As a very concerned citizen, lifelong Wasatch Front resident, and someone who appreciates both water to drink and clean air to breathe, I cannot believe the Utah Division of Water Quality would even consider such an egregious request to further deplete the Great Salt Lake of water at such a crucial time when the lake is near extinction and our way of life is being threatened by it's loss. As the science shows and frankly anyone with eyes can see, the Great Salt Lake is nearly gone, is decreasing yearly, and we are quickly running out of water here along the Wasatch Front and the winters are getting worse without the needed lake effect happening to help snowpack. State scientists have already taken measurements of 19% salinity on the open water. Ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity levels persist above 18%. The impacts are anticipated to be so significant that several bird species that depend on the lake for food could become candidates for listing under the Endangered Species Act. The elected Utah government, including Utah Division of Water Quality, should be doing absolutely everything in their power to ensure not only the Great Salt Lake and all it's ecosystems survive, but is revived to it's full capacity, not only because it's the right thing to do, and our environment and quality of life here in Salt Lake City depend on it, but because when it goes it's going to be terrible for our entire community, state and economy, and all those voters will be forced to move when there's no water to drink, or the air is toxic filled with all the pollution and toxic junk that we've let build up on the now exposed lakebed. So much for our amazing Utah economy. Dredging the dying lake for some additional profit right now is so completely terrible I don't even have words to describe the atrocity that it is. The fact that US Magnesium would "maintain a conveyance of lake water intake flow of 100,000 gallons per minute from the Great Salt Lake," at this time is completely asinine. How dare they even request to subject our already dying natural resource, our community and state to such abuse when our citizens have been asked to not water their lawns all summer, or wash their cars, or any number of other water saving solutions because we are in such a terrible draught and the lake is vanishing to our peril?! My lawn has been mostly dead for the last two years to save water for our state and the lake. How dare your branch of government even consider such an atrocious request. I can't believe I even have to make a comment about such a thing. I grew up sailing on the Great Salt Lake, I've taken my family to it's shores in the past to recreate, we have all relied on the fragile balance of lake and snow here in our otherwise desert of a home, all of that is either gone or is being threatened by climate change, our massive draught, and now horrible polluting companies that threaten our very existence here in Utah and the government branches bending to their whims. The Utah government and the Utah Division of Water Quality need to get their act together and figure out how to get our lake back, not sell off the dregs to the highest paying bidder.</p> |
| 27 | Joshua McFarland, MPAS, BS Ogden Resident | <p>After graduating from Weber State University in 2006, where I studied Zoology and published research related to the ecosystem of the Great Salt Lake and migrating shorebirds, I left Utah for about ten years before recently returning to Ogden. The change that I see in the Great Salt Lake over this single decade is beyond dramatic, it is terrifying. The lake, at its lowest level ever documented, is on the verge of an ecological collapse as water inflows decrease and salinity increases. The fragile balance which brine shrimp rely upon, and which in turns supports the migrating shorebirds for which Utah is known worldwide, is under threat by falling water levels. The Utah Division of Water Quality designed Gilbert Bay as worthy of protection for the waterfowl, shorebirds, and their necessary food chain. In order to continue this protection, the division must deny the permit sought by US Magnesium to further decrease lake levels. The scheme proposed by US Magnesium to lower the lake by up to an additional 9 feet will result in segmentation of the ecosystem and increases in salinity. This issue however extends far beyond Gilbert Bay. As the lake continues to shrink, the concentration of heavy metals increases. These heavy metals are being exposed in dry lakebed, picked up in the wind, and brought directly into the communities where we live and breathe. This toxic air will have long term health consequences for the public. I urge the Division to deny the request by business interests to drain the Great Salt Lake, which would orchestrate the collapse the migrating shorebird ecosystem and increase the toxic metals in the air we breathe. McFarland, J.C. and Meyers, R.A. (2008), Anatomy and histochemistry of hindlimb flight posture in birds. I. The extended hindlimb posture of shorebirds. Journal of Morphology, 269: 967-979. https://doi-org.proxygw.wrlc.org/10.1002/jmor.10636 Kintisch, E. (2022, September 9). At the Great Salt Lake, record salinity and low water imperils millions of birds. Science. https://www.science.org/content/article/great-salt-lake-record-salinity-and-low-water-imperils-millions-birds</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 28 | Mary Anne Karren, PhD Utah Resident | <p>I'm calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. I'm a native Utahn and a resident of Salt Lake City for the past 25 years. I've spent hundreds of hours slogging through the mud at Great Salt Lake with my camera, photographing birds. Lately, I've been documenting more cracked mud, blowing dust, bleached microbialites, and dead brine shrimp than birds. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake supports one of the most unique and productive wildlife habitats anywhere on the continent. This ecosystem already hangs by a thread due to record low water. If the lake continues to drop, we face catastrophic collapse of the food chain. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake. Now, US Magnesium is asking permission to deliver the final blow to the Great Salt Lake ecosystem by extending their water intake canals in Gilbert Bay so they may continue to drain the lake unabated, below the point of survivability. Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of "frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain." The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project threatens to destroy a natural waterway and its world-class bird habitat, undermines the State's own efforts to protect the lake, and jeopardizes all other beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project. My reasons are further detailed below.</p> <p>1. The waters of Gilbert Bay are protected for the purposes of "frequent primary and secondary contact recreation. Gilbert Bay is used for hunting, swimming, wading, bird watching, wildlife photography, camping, beach activities, and many types of boating. The project will make Gilbert Bay unhealthy, unsafe, and increasingly inaccessible for all types of water-based recreation. The project will expose people to direct contact or immersion in the deepest sediments and waters of Gilbert Bay where deadly concentrations of mercury, selenium, arsenic, and other pollutants are concentrated. People will be harmed by inhalation of harmful gases and dust released from newly exposed areas of lakebed during recreation. People harvesting waterfowl anywhere nearby may consume unsafe levels of mercury and other heavy metals as the birds forage in increasingly polluted water and sediments at the bottom of Gilbert Bay. The canal extension project will create new hazards related to reduced navigability of the waterway, such as stranding and failure of emergency responses. Two state parks and their facilities on Gilbert Bay – some of the only public recreation facilities anywhere on Great Salt Lake - will be made unusable for water-based recreation. Access to the waters of the bay will become increasingly limited and hazardous.</p> <p>2. The waters of Gilbert Bay are protected for "waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain." Microbialites on the lakebed of Gilbert Bay are the basis for its highly productive food chain. The microbialites feed brine flies and brine shrimp, which feed millions of waterbirds. The waterbirds are in turn eaten by many predators, including humans. The canal extension project threatens the entire ecosystem by desiccating microbialites and degrading water quality in the remaining areas of the bay. Microbialites of Gilbert Bay are found almost exclusively between 4185 and 4195 feet of elevation. The proposed canal extensions down to 4185 feet will expose many of the bay's remaining microbialites at the surface, where they will dry out, destroying their vital food production for birds. Salinity in Gilbert Bay is already at the upper limit of ecosystem tolerance. Microbialites, brine flies, and brine shrimp not lost to desiccation will succumb to high salinity in large sections of the bay as water pools in the lower parts of the lakebed and becomes isolated from freshwater inflows. Loss of the bay's food production will devastate waterbirds, including dozens of species of waterfowl and shorebirds. Eared Grebes and Wilson's Phalaropes are two species that may face endangered status if their food source in Gilbert Bay is destroyed. By changing the concentration and surface proximity of mercury, selenium, arsenic, and other pollutants now sequestered in the deeper waters and sediments of the bay, the canal extension project will degrade water quality and impact all levels of the food chain, directly threatening wildlife and people who consume waterfowl that have foraged at the lake. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake's viability and its potential to rebound in the future. The US Magnesium proposal to extend its canals to 4185 feet may buy the company a year or two of operating time, but it devastates a natural waterway and a vibrant ecosystem of hemispheric importance for birds and for people. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah. If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium's existing canals can function as designed.</p> |
| 29 | Carol Macfarlane | <p>I am strongly opposed to the proposed extension of a US Magnesium canal in Gilbert Bay. Considering that the Great Salt Lake is at the lowest recorded water levels and the fact that the Great Salt Lake salinity is at 19%, I think it is unconscionable for the Division of Water Quality to consider such a proposal. Increasing the Great Salt Lake's salinity will decimate the brine shrimp. This delicate ecosystem is already in peril. Our efforts should be focused on saving the Great Salt Lake and not</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | destroying it. If we don't resolve to save the Great Salt Lake, then we become the authors of our own Apocalypse. Then we will deserve the outcomes of our own inaction: drought, dust bowls, and famine. |
| 30 | Stephanie Higginbotham Provo Resident | I am writing to urge you to deny a permit to US Magnesium to expand even further out into the lake. As you know, Great Salt Lake is at record lows-this is a terrible time to pull anymore water out of the lake! Please for the sake of all of us and the precious animals that depend on the GSL for survival, vote against this action by US Magnesium. |
| 31 | Anthony Roberts Bountiful Resident | My name is Anthony Roberts. I have lived in Bountiful my whole life. My health depends on the health of the lake and I hope the Division of Water Quality denies US Magnesium the Section 401 Water Quality Certification. If they want to continue extracting from the lake then they must come up with a proposal to give back to the lake. If the permit is issued as is, and they continue their extraction then it will increase evaporation in the lake which will increase salinity in the lake which will drastically affect the water quality in that precious ecosystem. |
| 32 | Sara Fladmo | I am writing to kindly request that the permit for additional water from the Great Salt Lake be denied. The lake can not handle any more water being pulled from it. In fact, we should be pursuing opportunities to raise the levels back up. We must deny this permit for the safety of the lake and the communities in this area. Thank you. |
| 33 | John Bowden | I don't think US magnesium should be allowed to continue to drain the lake. If the lake level drops too low a large amount of the population will move away, including me. |
| 34 | David Coyne | We all know how important the GSL is to our societal health, recreation, and life here in SLC. Why would we let business continue to make it worse for wear? It is time to turn the boat around and start taking action to save the GSL and fill it back up, not to leave a resource hanging in balance to the fate of the mineral extraction industry. I am saying NO to approving permitting for US Magnesium to dredge the lake. |
| 35 | McKenna Heck Cottonwood Heights Resident | As someone who relocated from the Midwest in hopes of calling Salt Lake City my home for years to come, the water situation here is incredibly distressing. I urge you to oppose the permit requested by US Magnesium. US Magnesium, a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore is once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster. Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake. |
| 36 | Becca Barratt | I am very concerned for the drying up of the GSL, as I live pretty close to that area. I genuinely stress about it often. I recently moved to my new location and since then I have had some suspicious issues with my health, despite being a young adult. I believe there are already adverse effects occurring with toxins in the air and allowing US Magnesium to drain more water from the lake feels like one of the worst things we could do. It is the wrong thing to do. At the very least, US Magnesium should be required to fill the lake as much as they take and while they are taking the water, so that no more lake beds become exposed. If the issue with the Great Salt Lake continues and worsens, I plan to sell my house and move away, probably from Utah altogether. It's not worth my health. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 37 | Lorene de St. Aubin | I am standing for a firm NO to allowing US Magnesium to dig canals at Gilbert Bay for the removal of water/magnesium. It is a devastating thought to drop the lake level another 9 feet! This will further increase the salinity of the lake this inhibiting brine shrimp population, not to mention harmful dust from the dry lake bed. No, no, no! Let us be mindful of the future of our precious landscape. |
| 38 | Kiera Brown | I'm writing in regards to the US Magnesium 401 Permit Hearing. As discussed in the cited academic papers below, the falling levels of the Great Salt Lake will result in higher frequencies of dust plumes, which contain heavy metals and are a public health concern. https://d1bbnjcim4wtri.cloudfront.net/wpcontent/uploads/2019/12/10101816/GSL_Dust_Plumes_Final_Report_Complete_Document.pdf https://ui.adsabs.harvard.edu/abs/2021AGUFM.B41A..06B/abstract Additionally, higher levels of aerosolized heavy metals, specifically arsenic, result in higher rates of lung cancer: https://www.mdpi.com/2076-3263/4/3/128/html US Magnesium must demonstrate that their diversion will not result in reduced flows to the GSL. Further, this hearing is an opportunity for the Division of Water Quality to increase the required environmental flows to the GSL in order to mitigate the effects of drought on the surface water level of the GSL. If no mitigation measures are taken, the papers above demonstrate that worsening air quality presents negative health outcomes. The Division of Water Quality will be to blame for negligence in the impacts to air quality in the Salt Lake Valley. |
| 39 | Ambyr Mishelle South Ogden Resident | My name is Ambyr Mishelle. I was born and raised in Utah and I am a current resident of South Ogden. Im honored to be able to live in such a special place. I am a Sailor and Filmmaker whose passion and profession has been affected by the decreasing amount of water of The Great Salt Lake. Consequently, I have been recreationally and emotionally restricted from being able to dock or launch a sailboat into the previously wondrous pride of our state due to its current state.The entertainment industry is tragically unable to utilize the once beautiful location that brought about a unique identity to our state. The endangered body of water is a shadow of its former self and aside from all the monumental ecological issues present and pending, it is aesthetically appalling and embarrassing that our leaders have allowed a non-natural topographical disaster to occur. Neglecting to head off the regression of the lakes health, when there was far less damage to correct is a disappointing lack of action as will be the decision to approve this permit. I'm urging the Division of water Quality to deny the permit before it's too late to regret. |
| 40 | Lily Darais Orem Resident | I do not support the idea of a permit that allows magnesium companies to withdraw more water from the Great Salt Lake. Saving the lake needs to be our top priority as Utahns. We should not sell our water, air and health for money. P.S. I should have clarified who I am! I am just a stay at home mom in Orem and I am very concerned about the health of my family because of the toxins in that lakebed. I am sure all Utahns who are aware that the exposed lakebed will mean arsenic in their lungs will agree with me. Please, please do not sell US Magnesium the right to build more canals to reach our dying lake. |
| 41 | Brittany Parks Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Brittany Parks and I am a SLC mother of two and a voter. Please do not grant these permits to lengthen the US Magnesium intake canals. Our air quality is becoming a nationwide conversation, and as that doctor mentioned this evening, a local medical emergency. Granting those extensions would truly affect every citizen of the Wasatch Front across every income bracket. My children are unable to go outside and play on windy days due to the poisonous dust clouds and this problem would only worsen with lower lake levels. My family has had to invest over \$1,600 on air filters for our home, which is a luxury the most impacted areas of the basin will likely not be able to afford. We are currently renting and are reluctant to buy until we see positive progress made on the local air quality. I have family that are concerned about purchasing in the Wasatch Peaks Ranch due to the risk involved in investing in an area with an unknown future. Governor Cox and Senator Romney have both vouched for the utmost urgency of this matter. For a government agency to ignore all of those stakeholders opposed to further reducing the Great Salt Lake water levels would demonstrate a dangerous level of negligence. It would also indicate an even more troubling allegiance to one local industry over all others including real estate, tourism, and frankly the entire economic viability of the Wasatch front. I also hail from a midwestern town that allowed a solo industry to destroy the environment, with long term catastrophic superfund results. Please do not let this happen to our beautiful region. Thank you for your time and extending this evening's meeting to hear all opinions! |
| 42 | Tennery Taylor Norton | We are on the brink of an ecological disaster, a 21st-Century dust bowl right here along our beautiful Wasatch Front. We need to be shutting down existing businesses that drain water off the lake, not allowing them expanded access to drain it further. We already are feeling the lack of the lake effect on snowfall and experiencing earlier |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | snow melt, thanks to falling lake levels and rising dust from the Great Salt Lake and Sevier lake beds. There is no way US Magnesium should be allowed to drain even more of the lakebed to continue sucking it dry. |
| 43 | Nathan Parks | As a recent transplant from the midwest, I am stunned at the poor air quality in the Salt Lake area. I feel that those born and raised in Salt Lake do not realize how bad the air is and how it negatively affects our health. With tech companies like Google, Facebook, and others bringing many jobs to the area, we need to rethink why we are giving so much water to companies like US Magnesium. Utah no longer desperately needs the jobs that US Magnesium provides. We need clean air and our children need to be able to play outside. A vote to grant these permits is a vote against the future of a healthy Utah, please do not approve these permits. |
| 44 | Duane Bush | As a lifetime utah resident duckhunter, skier and outdoor enthusiast I am extremely concerned about the water level of the great salt lake and any water use that would negatively impact the lake level. Please carefully consider how extending a permit for Mag Corp to continue draining water from the Great Salt Lake would dramatically negatively impact the rapidly receding lake level. The lake is in crisis mode and permitting any company or otherwise to drain water from the lake for any use at this time should not be allowed to continue. The GSL is on life support and drastic measures are necessary to save the lake and all of the wildlife, lake effect snow and all residents that depend on it. |
| 45 | Joan M. Gregory Salt Lake City Resident | I am very concerned. You should be too. I am writing to urge you to say NO to US Magnesium! The Great Salt Lake is at the lowest level ever recorded and is on track to continue receding until winter rains come in November. The lake is drying up because too much water is being taken out. Not enough water is reaching the lake body, and after decades of taking more water than could possibly be returned, thousands of square miles of lakebed now lie exposed, creating a dustbowl full of toxins that blow across the Wasatch Front. U.S Magnesium is a major contributor to lowering lake levels. In a typical year, they extract more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. They intentionally evaporate away more than 40 billion gallons of water a year to turn a profit for a few billionaires and the military industrial complex – all this while millions of pounds of chlorine are spewed across thousands of acres of lakebed. U.S. Magnesium recently applied for permits to lengthen their intake canals by several miles. The lake level is so low they aren't able to reach the water and want to dredge more than 100 acres of lake body to reach the water and continue sucking the lake dry. Because of how shallow the lake is, for every foot of elevation the shore line recedes, hundreds of square miles of lakebed are exposed. And U.S. Magnesium wants to take more water, while the lake is on the brink of collapse. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake's ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. All eyes are on the lake. The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of the GSL and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem. It's time to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. At a minimum, DWQ must conduct a Level II Antidegradation review to ensure that US Magnesium's permit request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the division is required by law to protect. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake in order to ensure the protection of the Lake's beneficial uses. (Attachment DWQ-2022-030034) |
| 46 | Taylor Dankmyer Resident of Salt Lake County and South Salt Lake | I don't think US magnesium should be allowed to continue to drain the lake. If the lake level drops too low a large amount of the population will move away, including me. I write in opposition to the permit for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation Project. US Magnesium is diverting more water than Ogden, Salt Lake City and Provo *combined" in a typical year. The Great Salt Lake (GSL) is already at historic lows and we know we have a drought, water crisis and have had some rough snow years. So everything must be done to keep the GSL at its current levels and ideally expanded. We must live within our means here. US Magnesium's extractive mining practices on the lake shore are once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | business in the face of ecological disaster (toxic dust storms, further shallowing of the lake, etc.) Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake |
| 47 | Steve Brush | I am very concerned about the GSL water level on many fronts. 1. The dust from the exposed lake bed. 2. The salinity level increasing killing off the brine shrimp population. 3. The bird migration stopover will have a massive kill-off with a lack of food. 4. The snowpack reduction due to a reduced lake effect snow (our drinking water source). I moved here in 1982 (the flood years) and have called SLC home ever since. The snow was the main reason to come and stay. As a realtor I have had at least 6 clients move out of state due to air quality. The news of our dying lake has hit the news all across the nation, people are noting this as they consider a move here. We need to find ways to increase water into the GSL. Please reject the permit request from US Magnesium. |
| 48 | Julie Emory | I urge you to DENY US Magnesium's Sec. 401 permit application as described here https://www.utah.gov/pmn/sitemap/notice/784075.html . I moved to Utah in February 2021 as a new retiree, expecting to enjoy the beauty of this area. But the beauty is crashing and burning before our eyes. You - DWQ - can and should act in the best interests of the people you serve, should carry out your duty to maintain and improve Water quality by denying this permit application. I oppose additional withdrawal of water from the Great Salt Lake and its tributaries until the lake can achieve and maintain a healthy level. Culture, tourism, recreation, community health, and wildlife are all dependent on the lake being at a healthy, sustainable lake level. Deny the Section 401 permit for this project. |
| 49 | Conor Kelly | Utah is a wonderful place. Profits are wonderful for a variety of reasons. But please do not allow the profits of U.S. Magnesium to outweigh the health of the hundreds of thousands of folks that live in proximity to the Great Salt Lake. However, much money U.S. Magnesium generates in taxes, of which I assume is disproportionately low, it will likely be dwarfed by the exodus of Utahns that cannot stay in Utah after our Great Salt Lake dries up and creates toxic dust storms. |
| 50 | Jim Dalrymple Utah Resident | I am a Utah resident living in Holladay and working for Savage Services Corporation in Midvale. I have become aware of the possibility of granting US Magnesium access to more water from the Great Salt Lake. I am strongly against this. The salinity levels of the lake are already at or above the levels where the ecosystem will collapse. Also the level of the lake would be significantly lowered thus exposing more potentially toxic minerals that could be whipped up and blown into our communities in the valley where we and our children would inhale. When the dangers of receding water levels are so clear and so much money and effort by our state government in the last year has been dedicated to preserving and increasing the water level of the GSL, why would we even consider a request from any entity to draw more water from the GSL? Not only is this dangerous to our citizens, but it is also a waste of any tax payer money allocated to preserving the GSL. |
| 51 | Markell McCubbin | I have spent 20 years in education in the Salt Lake Valley. I work with 5th through 8th graders at Salt Lake Arts Academy, who are learning about their world. They are practicing being active participants in their local community. These kids make signs and protest at the Capitol. They want to live healthy lives in their community. They DESERVE to be cared for by the adults in this city, representatives of our state and local governments. I am a mother and am terrified for my child's future. We know the science. We know the data. What we need to do is act mindfully and responsibly and prioritize people over profits. Please think about the children in each of YOUR lives, and imagine the horror they will face if we continue to deplete the critical Great Salt Lake, due to YOUR inaction. This is our ethical obligation to the land that houses us and the people we love. Please deny this permit to U.S. Magnesium. |
| 52 | Alex Stewart | I want to provide you with my strong opposition to the request to deepen US Magnesium's canals and take more water from the Great Salt Lake. The water diversion will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, that DWQ is |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | required by law to protect. Class 5A designation states: “[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). I think it’s critical that you take the larger context we are living in to justify rejecting these permits. YTD Salt Lake City’s rain/snow equivalent is only 7.49 inches when it should be above 12, 62% of normal (see https://www.weather.gov/slc/CliPlot). This is part of a larger trend that has Utah in a mega drought. Given the acute risks of US Magnesium’s request, and larger direction of the climate, I do not see this as safe for water quality, the wildlife that directly depends on the water, and the larger ecosystem including our families and friends. |
| 53 | Amiko Uchida | [In reference to comment 53] I could not agree more with Alex’s opinion. This is not a situation of moral complexity, there is one correct answer and it is to reject this expansion of permit. While I can appreciate there may be competing interests such as short-sighted economic interests, relationships, history, those must not and CANNOT take precedent over the moral and mid to long term economical choice to reject the expansion permit. If you do not reject the permit request for US magnesium to expand, you will irrevocably destroy millions of human and non human organism lives. Do not let that be your or our future. There is only one correct choice forward. Please have the strength and courage to make that choice |
| 54 | Erin Moore Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Erin Moore and I’m a downtown Salt Lake City resident writing to express my sincere hope that the Department of Water Quality rejects the permit applications from US Magnesium to extend their canals in the Great Salt Lake. While I know that last night there was a public hearing where many expressed their disapproval of the permits being considered, I want to do my part to say no, that we need to defend the quality of the lake, the organisms that survive on it and the health of our valley and everyone in it. Gilbert Bay, where US Magnesium wants to pull more water from, is supposed to be protected by the DWQ’s Class 5A designation—that means the body of water must support recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and water-oriented wildlife like the brine shrimp that are so essential to the ecosystem. But the lake’s salinity is already too high (19%) and it’s becoming an inhospitable environment for the shrimp and every animal that relies on their presence. The quality is already being compromised and to let more water be taken from the lake would be a death sentence. While the matter of the permits is one of water quality of DWQ, it needs to be said over and over that the fate of the lake is tied to the fate of the valley. Not only are the brine shrimp, waterfowl, microbial mats, and brine flies already suffering, but we are too, and none of us can entertain a thought of a future here if the lake continues to lose water, if the ecosystem continues to collapse, and if the resulting toxic lakebed dust continues to poison residents of the Great Salt Lake area. While you’ve heard all this many times before I’m sure, I hope you understand that for many young people like myself, the fate of the lake is shaping our whole future. If I could, I’d spend my life in this city, but as the environment continues to collapse and the air gets worse, I can already feel the effects on my health. I’m only 27, and I don’t want to leave my home. But if we don’t act fast, I truly believe Salt Lake City will be one of the first major metropolitan areas in the United States to see mass exodus due to environmental collapse. We can’t live here without the lake. Respectfully, do what must be done, for all our futures. Save the Great Salt Lake, say no to US Magnesium |
| 55 | Bridgette Meinhold | My husband and I are literally in the midst of buying a house in Salt Lake in hopes of moving there from Park City and I am very concerned about the health and well being of the Great Salt Lake. Allowing US Magnesium to take even more water out of the lake than they already do would completely destroy the ecosystem. Salinity levels are already too high to support Brine Flies, and their loss will impact the entire system, especially the birds. My husband has asthma and already I am greatly concerned about air quality in the valley and if the lake levels go lower, it will be even worse. Our air quality and water quality is much more important than their profits. Please please, prioritize the Great Salt Lake and deny their application to remove more water from the lake |
| 56 | Megan West Salt Lake City Resident | I oppose the canal extensions as the project would further degrade water quality and ruin the habitat for brine shrimp and the birds at GSL. I do not support canal expansion and increased water diversion from the GSL. Save the GSL!! |
| 57 | Louisa Brannon | I am writing to ask you to please not let U S Magnesium to extend its canals to further drain water from the Great Salt Lake . It seems just a first negative step towards a plan of getting as much water from the lake as possible. The lake is already lower than its been historically , we should be doing everything we can to keep water in the |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | lake rather than remove it. The health of our residents, the animals that depend on the lake and the future of the surrounding area depends on keeping the lake full of water . |
| 58 | Heidi Longi Kaysville Resident | My name is Heidi Longi, and I reside in Kaysville, Utah. As a citizen of Davis County very close to the Great Salt Lake, I am very concerned with the water quality impact if this certification is granted to US magnesium. The Great Salt Lake is at record low water level and record high salinity that has been documented by many local experts and even been the focus of national news stories recently due to the environmental and economic catastrophe that this continued trend will cause. I am very concerned about the catastrophic environmental effects that allowing US Magnesium to bring lake levels down an additional 9 feet will have. This increased salinity will cause ecosystem collapse in the area that will have long lasting detrimental effects. Additionally, lowering lake levels will expose more heavy metals and potentially release those metals into the air as more shoreline is exposed. This is extremely detrimental to the health of all Northern Utah residents and as a parent to young children something I am very concerned with. I urge this council to not issue this permit and to show that they value the health of Utah's residents, environment, and ecosystem over corporate interest. |
| 59 | Elizabeth Watson | Please deny U.S. Magnesium's recent request for a 410 Permit to divert additional water from our Great Salt Lake. Their request comes at a time when we all must be looking for solutions to raising the level of water in this gift of nature which is suffering unprecedented losses. This is a self centered and selfish request to draw more water from a drought ridden and climate change impacted lake. The unfavorable short term disruption and the long term impact on the lake level, salinity, environment, biota and natural resources is unacceptable and indefensible. Please deny this request and instead Invite then to participate in and support a complete environmental impact analysis to find solutions to raising this unique and precious resource which belongs to all of us. This request is selfish, destructive, solely business oriented and motivated by greed with total disregard for the environment and should be denied. They already benefit from the massive amount of water they currently divert from our lake and instead of requesting a permit to add to their current burden on the lake they should be looking at creative ways to use and even lessen their burden and return water they already have been permitted to use and be part of the solution. |
| 60 | Chip Nakagawa | We are at a serious crossroads in our state's health and future. We need to severely restrict water leaving the lake, or any watershed that odd not absolutely essential. I doubt that US Magnesium is essential for life for those who live in the Salt Lake Valley. If the lake continues to dry up and the shoreline to recede, it will not be many years before this Valley becomes a place no one wants to live in. Or perhaps even can live in. Please take the steps needed to secure a safe, healthy place for our children to grow up. |
| 61 | Adair Kovac Salt Lake City Resident | We all know how important the GSL is to our societal health, recreation, and life here in SLC. Why would we let business continue to make it worse for wear? It is time to turn the boat around and start taking action to save the GSL and fill it back up, not to leave a resource hanging in balance to the fate of the mineral extraction industry. I am saying NO to approving permitting for US Magnesium to dredge the lake. |
| 62 | Arianna Maquis | I'm opposed to this extension and fear the long lasting effects it will have on the eco system of the Great Lakes! No. |
| 63 | Cory Murray Bountiful Resident | Thank you for taking public comments. I am opposed to granting US Magnesium more access to the lake. I was shocked to hear how much water they use. That continued amount seems like it will be devastating to the life of the lake. I'm sure I don't have to tell you what the impact to hímen life and migratory birds will be if the lake dies, or rather, if we kill it in the name of economic development. Please do the right thing and DO NOT grant their request. We need the lake to reverse coarse before we let a few billionaires ruin our way of life on the Wasatch Front. |
| 64 | Oscar Graff | As a Salt Lake resident and someone who has called this place home for my whole life, I am disgusted that US Magnesium even has a chance of further degrading the Great Salt Lake. Pollution from this endeavor will continue to hurt the valley's air quality at the expense of everyday Americans. The GSL is already critically low and the combination of increased and sustained industry, with the exposure of more lakebed, could be lethal to Salt Lake City. Do the right and stand up for Americans, not the rich few who exploit and abuse what should be shared by everyone. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 65 | Catherine Mortimer | I have real fear about what will need to be implemented to ensure I can continue to live in my home on the west side of salt lake with the lake levels as they are and it's impact on air quality.Please do not let US Magnesium exacerbate this issue as we are currently scrambling to try and find water to put back into the lake. |
| 66 | Lauren Ritch Layton Resident | I am writing in to express concern over allowing US Magnesium to continue pulling water from the GSL. I live in Layton, where the issues with the exposed lakebed feel very near. I have young children and am concerned for the air quality issues that the exposed lakebed will bring. I don't understand how we can possibly allow additional water to be pulled from the lake with it in this condition. It seems like a non-starter and obviously wrong. I worry that Salt Lake City will soon become an unsafe place to live due to air quality and water issues. As a State we need to keep the natural aspects of this place beautiful and functioning. If we ruin the GSL, we destroy a whole ecological environment for so many species, including ourselves. We also destroy our snow. Can we really afford this? |
| 67 | Emily Horton Salt Lake City Resident | I am a resident of the west side of Salt Lake City and frequently use the Great Salt Lake for recreation. I am writing to ask the Department of Water Quality to please not allow US Magnesium to deepen their diversion canals into the Great Salt Lake. We are facing the environmental crisis of the Great Salt Lake drying, which threatens both the ecosystem there and the health of all humans living in the Salt Lake Valley. Especially now, and for the foreseeable future no entity should be allowed to draw water from the Great Salt Lake without contributing an equal or greater share of water to the lake through upstream water rights. Please stand up for this precious ecosystem, the residents and tourists who enjoy it, and the health of those living in our valley and do not allow US Magnesium to draw further water from the Great Salt Lake |
| 68 | Emily Ostler Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Emily Ostler, and I am a life-long resident of Salt Lake City, UT. I have just returned to Utah after a two-year break for graduate school, and things here are different. Utah is hotter than usual, and water levels are lower. Seeing these things, I worry for my own health, but more so for the health of people who do not have access to air-conditioning or healthcare as readily as I do, for the health of future generations who will have to bear even greater heat and dryness, and for the health of millions of birds, bugs, and other animals who share our home. Ms.. Kilbane, as an Environmental Scientist at the Utah Division of Water Quality, you and your colleagues are in a position to perform actions of significant consequence in our state and our nation. In the American West, water is scarce and needs to be fiercely protected, or we will suffer from drought. As desert people, we have a responsibility to be careful stewards over our water resources. Unfortunately, many of us have little say over what happens with Utah's water. That's why I'm sitting up late on a Saturday night, writing to you. I'm doing what I can, but it feels unlikely to have much impact. But I have hope that you can change that. I have hope that you will heed the many of us crying in our hearts, in our social circles, through newspaper articles and social media posts, through campaigns and art projects, that the Great Salt Lake needs our help. Right now, US Magnesium is asking for a permit that would extend their rights deeper into the lake, which would reduce the lake's water level, expose important brine and algae and thus reduce food for migratory birds, and increase its salinity. I implore you to please use your influence to stop this from happening. I understand that this is difficult; I understand that there are important political and economic factors at play. But we stand at a crux point in Utah's history. If we fail to act on behalf of this lake, we are bestowing catastrophe upon our children. Please, use your voice and your power to protect our home. Please, be brave and persistent at this point in our story.I want to finish by offering my thanks for the work you do on behalf of Utah. I am certain that you work with the well-being of the state at heart; and for that, I am grateful. I also want to offer my support in any ways you need at this pivotal moment. Please reach out if I can support in any way. Lastly, I will let you know that if significant actions are taken to protect this lake, very, very many people will be grateful. We will be grateful for greener land, for cooler weather, for cleaner air. We will be grateful that our children will have a healthier home. |
| 69 | Natalie Avery | I'm writing in support of a NO vote to US Magnesium future extraction plans. To further diminish the chances of the lake surviving for the sake of profit is unspeakable. To allow it without any consideration of how the water will be replaced is criminal. DWS, do the right thing here! The lake is already on the verge of collapse! |
| 70 | R. Jefre Hicks | Please register my opposition to any further extension of any of the canals that would reach farther or deeper into the GSL. I am also opposed to any expansion that would further increase evaporation of the GSL by the company. I have been hunting and boating on the Great Salt Lake for many decades, and any actions taken by industry which result in lowering the lake level would greatly impact my ability to use the GSL as a Utah citizen. The resulting degradation of the ecosystem and |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | increases in salinity will negatively impact the health of the lake and thereby impact my ability to utilize the lake.Please do not allow any more expansions or increases in water removal from the Great Salt Lake. |
| 71 | Eric Iverson Escrow Officer Lincoln Title Insurance Agency | I would like to register my displeasure/opposition of the US Mag expansion/extension. With the current status of the lake, any further depletion of the water could be catastrophic. As a lifelong resident and a regular user (duck hunter) we cannot allow this happen.Please do not allow any more expansions/extensions to occur. The lake and state cannot afford to lose any more water. |
| 72 | Evan Glassman UCS & Evan Mosaics | As a resident of nearly a decade here in SLC, I have seen firsthand the impact that US. Magnesium is having on the GSL, and the greater environmental and community impact on the Salt Lake Valley.I have visited GSL several times and also driven to U.S. Mag early on when I moved here to see where most all the blackish pollution was coming from nearby the Lake. I have recently flown over the GSL and was alarmed and astonished to see it's current condition and demise. As the lake continues to recede exposing more and more toxic particulates to the general population, as well as lower lake levels negatively impacting Lake effect rain and snowpack, and the die off of brine shrimp and flies in the GSL, the current condition is beyond critical. All extraction from the Lake should be stopped at this time until there is at least an environmental impact study, and until water levels start increasing again to a less dire level, partly by less water being diverted to the GSL. It is an uphill climb as the region continues to heat up, as well as with less precipitation, due to climate change and drought. We are at a tipping point now in the ecosystem and livability for wildlife and humans in the area, and if business continues as usual there will be dire consequences to quality of life here in the Valley and region, and an environmental disaster. Please consider the rights of nature and not only the short term business interests of US Magnesium. We need more long term thinking here in the area by our leaders and government agencies.thank you for your consideration |
| 73 | Daren Handy | Say no to anymore water leaving the great Salt lake or being diverted to any use other than to see lake waters rise |
| 74 | JoEllen Kunz | Folks - as you know the Great Salt Lake is at historic lows. The best available science we have, shows that the impacts on the lake from the current US Magnesium's Canal extension application will be devastating, long-lasting, and possibly irreversible. The science tells us that granting this permit will cause or contribute to the collapse of the Lake's ecosystem and the deaths of millions of birds. And there is no way to know the toll it will take on the air quality not only here in the Salt Lake Valley - but widespread throughout the surrounding states. What we do know is that it will be highly dangerous. All you need to do is look at what happened/is happening to the Salton Sea in California. The air is deadly. literally. Folks, we are out of time. We need to deny this permit request, AND we need to find some solutions to get MORE water into the Great Salt Lake, not less. In my research (which is limited) I have wondered if looking at Atmospheric Water Generators might be part of the solution. I have watched them being used by the US military as well as in non-profit situations such as Jackson Mississippi. the Moses West Foundation is using this to save lives currently. It just seems like this technology could help save us all! AWG Contracting is the Company behind the foundation. Please check them out. www.awgcontractingus.com Thank you for caring about the WHOLE of UTAH, and not just the profits that could be made off of this application. Money will mean nothing if our beautiful state becomes a dust bowl. |
| 75 | Jacob Schmidt Utah Resident | My name is Jacob Schmidt and I am a lifelong resident of Utah. I live in West Jordan and raise my family there. I am deeply concerned about the current state of the Great Salt Lake and how it will affect the quality of life for me and my children if they continue to live here. I am submitting my comments about the permits that were recently applied for by US Magnesium to lengthen their intake canals. I was able to virtually attend the public meeting that took place last week. I completely agree with all the comments that were shared that evening. I want to use the strongest possible language when I say that I was shocked and saddened to hear that DWQ was even considering this request. The lake is on the brink of collapse. I know that you are aware of what is happening with salinity levels and its effect on the lake's entire ecosystem so I won't go into the details on that point. With the current state of the lake, any group or business that wants to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. I believe this should be the minimum requirement set for future extractive |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | practices on Great Salt Lake. There should be a higher cost to using the water in the lake and for too long that cost has not been paid. This would also ensure the protection of the lake's beneficial uses. Thank you for your consideration and please remember the health and future of all Utahns depend on your decision. |
| 76 | Katie Newburn Utah Resident Educator | I'm calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. For the last three and a half years, I have managed environmental education programming for FRIENDS of Great Salt Lake. I have brought thousands of elementary students, teachers, and parents to Antelope Island State Park and Great Salt Lake State Park to help our community understand the lake's ecosystem and their role in protecting it. Today, the ecosystem of Great Salt Lake's Gilbert Bay is on the brink of collapse due to historically low water levels and rising salinity. The lake's continued decline threatens millions of migratory birds, \$1.3 billion in annual economic output, and three million Utahns downwind of the exposed lakebed. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake. Now, US Magnesium is asking permission to undermine that public investment by extending their water intake canals in Gilbert Bay so they may continue to drain the lake unabated. Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of "frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain." The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project threatens to destroy a natural waterway and its world-class bird habitat, undermines the State's own efforts to protect the lake, and jeopardizes all other beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake's viability and its potential to rebound in the future. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah. If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium's existing canals can function as designed |
| 77 | Annie Keller-Miguel Esq. | I write to you as a concerned citizen of Salt Lake County. I moved here from California and one of the biggest draws to Salt Lake City (and Utah in general) was access to pristine and unique natural landscapes. The Great Salt Lake is an essential part of Salt Lake City's, and Utah's, identity, wildlife, and environment. To threaten the longevity, accessibility, health, security, and sustainability of the Great Salt Lake is ultimately a decision that will threaten the safety of our air, the ability to connect to nature, and the sustainability of growing life in the valley and nearby areas. To allow for further extraction of water from the GSL by US Magnesium will have catastrophic effects on both the environment and trust in the political process to protect landscapes that we all love, and need. To say no to US Mag is to make it clear that our State values the landscapes and residence that came to coexist. Citizens of Utah have many differing values, all of which make this place so unique, but ultimately, we should all be able to agree that our landscape is the thing that brought, and continues to bring, people to our State. Everyone benefits from a thriving environment. The same cannot be said if we allow our lake to dry, toxins to be released as a side effect, and ultimately prioritizing extraction over preservation. I want to make my voice heard and make it count. I urge you to deny the permit requested by US Mag and to instead take a stance to protect the wonder that is our Great Salt Lake. If we let our GSL be further depleted, further abused, and further unprotected, we are doing future generations a historic disservice. I want to continue to live a thriving life here in Salt Lake. I want to grow my family here. I want to take them to float in the GSL. I want to live in a place that does not threaten my health by simply going outside. This decision is more than a decision to divert water. It is a decision to protect the habitability of our capitol city for citizens and the wildlife that travels to our Great Salt Lake. |
| 78 | Carrie Buse Utah Resident | I'm calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. Today, the ecosystem of Great Salt Lake's Gilbert Bay is on the brink of collapse due to historically low water levels and rising salinity. The lake's continued decline threatens millions of migratory birds, \$1.3 billion in annual economic output, and three million Utahns downwind of the exposed lakebed. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake. Now, US Magnesium is asking permission to undermine that public investment by extending their water intake canals in Gilbert Bay so they may continue to drain the lake unabated. Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of "frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain.” The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project threatens to destroy a natural waterway and its world-class bird habitat, undermines the State’s own efforts to protect the lake, and jeopardizes all other beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake’s viability and its potential to rebound in the future. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah. If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium’s existing canals can function as designed.</p> |
| 79 | <p>Radel Huley Former Salt Lake City Resident</p> | <p>I was born in the eye of a panhandle hurricane in the Florida offseason. As my mother, an Irish-Catholic Salt Lake City native struggled to find the hospital, days past due, she was rescued by a group of LDS women, who shepherded her through the storm and into the delivery wing. As a kid, no matter which ocean-side state where I lived, it was Utah that lit the backgrounds of my holiday photos. The Wasatch Mountains, the hidden creeks in the canyons, and mostly, the Great Salt Lake. My Aunt and Uncle took my Flat Stanley to the lake and dipped his paper leg in the briny water, and wrapped his envelope with a package of salt water taffy. There were photos printed from the local pharmacy featuring animals larger than I could name, and birds more beautiful than I had ever seen. Now, I'd understand they were bison, horses, and migratory birds stretched across Antelope Island. Birds which may become endangered if US Magnesium continues to siphon the water without replenishing what it has taken. We are no longer at a point where companies can take from the land, or from the creatures of the land, without there being an instant consequence. Whether that consequence is the wrath of the people or the destruction of the land. What is in the water is rich-- richer than any profit for any corporation. If we approve of this permit for the profits of US Magnesium, or any company who is not willing to put back into the Great Salt Lake more than what they have taken, then it is an entire ecosystems blood, as well as the name of this city, on the Department of Water Quality's hands.</p> |
| 80 | <p>Kim Brown, APRN</p> | <p>I am a 5th generation Utahn and a registered nurse who has worked in Salt Lake for the past 40 years. I want my children and grandchildren to continue to live here and I want all of us to have a healthy future without the fear of toxic dust blowing through the valley if the Lake continues to shrink. I have xeriscaped my yard and reduced my water usage both inside and outside my home. I do not want the Great Salt Lake dredged or any industry to take any extra water from this important Lake. Please do not approve the permit to allow dredging or increased water allocation.</p> |
| 81 | <p>Isabelle Ghabash</p> | <p>I am writing today to oppose U.S. Magnesium's recent application to lengthen their intake canals at Gilbert Bay. I am an architect here in the Salt Lake valley and have had a fondness for the lake's birds my whole life. I was devastated during a recent drive out to Antelope Island, seeing all the birds huddled together in a mud puddle instead of thriving on a healthy lake. The salinity levels at the Great Salt Lake are already outside of the healthy range established by the Salinity Advisory Committee. This causes stress to brine flies and shrimp, endangering the birds who migrate to the lake and the entire lake's ecosystem. U.S. Magnesium's constant and heavy water diversion (100,000 gallons per minute according to their public notice!) is responsible for this spike in salinity, and I do not believe their application respects Gilbert Bay's Class 5A designation or the future quality of the water upon which we all depend. I am also deeply concerned that their application permit states that "this project is intended to be the FIRST STEP IN A LONG-TERM PROCESS to ensure access to water from the Great Salt Lake." U.S. Magnesium does not intend to stop. I respectfully ask you to deny U.S. Magnesium's permit application.</p> |
| 82 | <p>Alyssa Garrett</p> | <p>I am emailing to voice my opposition to US magnesium’s canal extension permit application. Great Salt Lake is critically low and removing more water from the lake will only exacerbate the current effects we are seeing. I do not believe it is fair to future generations to leave them with toxic dust storms, no wildlife, and no jobs from Great Salt Lake. It is our duty to work with the environment, not against it. So please refuse this permit application.</p> |
| 83 | <p>Mabel Bates</p> | <p>Stop US magnesium from diverting 100,000 gallons of water a day! This would make the concentration of salt too high and be detrimental to the ecosystem and the water quality would severely decline.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 84 | Elle Taylor | <p>My name is Elle Taylor, I am 20 years old and I live in Salt Lake City. Until recently, I paid no mind to the Great Salt Lake, but have been deeply saddened and alarmed by its decline. I find it unfortunate that it has taken such grave conditions for people such as myself to learn of the beauty of the lake and understand the essential role it has in our economy, weather system, and ecosystems. I am writing to draw your attention to the State of Utah's intention to issue a Section 401 Water Quality Certification to US Magnesium for the extension of two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This massive water diversion will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, which states: "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). Further water diversion directly impacts the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, which DWQ is required by law to protect. As I hope many others have, I plead with you to do your part in protecting the lake. There is so much to be done, but stopping the US Magnesium extension is a pressing and essential action to stop us from reaching a point of no return. The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of GSL and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem. It's time to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach.</p> |
| 85 | Anika Larson Student Southern Utah University | <p>I am calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject the US Magnesium proposal to extend the P-North Canal and the P-0 Canal. As a Utah native, The Great Salt Lake holds a substantial amount of meaning. I remember visiting Antelope Island with my family as a kid, and I want future generations to have the opportunity to experience that as well. It is not only a beautiful lake, but it is also extremely important to the health of our local environment. We must do everything in our power to protect the Great Salt Lake. The Utah Division of Water Quality must act responsibly by denying US Magnesium Section 401 Water Quality Certification. My reasons are further detailed below. The decreased water levels would violate the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation. Class 5A designation states: "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. Hundreds of square miles of microbialites would die. Because The Great Salt Lake is so shallow, even one foot less of water (in elevation) would expose hundreds of square miles of lakebed. Exposing the lakebed also means exposing and drying up the microbialites, which are the base of the food chain. They feed the brine shrimp, which feed millions of migratory birds. With this proposal, US Magnesium intends to reduce the water levels an additional 9 feet, which would have dramatic and devastating effects. In fact, "The impacts are anticipated to be so significant that several bird species that depend on the lake for food could become candidates for listing under the Endangered Species Act." Salinity levels would increase to a dangerous and unsustainable amount. Plus, as water levels recede, salinity levels increase. The salinity levels of The Great Salt Lake are already measured to be higher than the lake can sustain, causing the food sources to be on the verge of collapse. The exposed shorelines would reveal toxic dust and put the local population at risk. Already, toxic dust has blown into the city, exposing people to the arsenic that is found in the lakebed. Approving this proposed project would only worsen the issue. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly, for both the environment's and the public's health, by denying the US Magnesium 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project.</p> |
| 86 | Catherine Patterson Orem Resident | <p>My name is Catherine. I'm a resident of Orem, where I live with my husband. I love this area, especially all of the amazing outdoor activities that are available here--in particular I like to rock climb! I'm not much of an environmental activist, but I've been following the evaporation of the great salt lake. I'm writing today because I'm concerned about the proposal of US Magnesium to extend their canals to continue to use water from the lake. The lake is in severe danger as it is; measures should be taken to ensure that the lake stays filled so that the ecosystems--human and animal--that call the lake home are preserved, before we think of allowing corporations to profit at the expense of those ecosystems. Not only would it be irresponsible and wrong for the residents of Utah to allow the environment, with all its unique plant and animal life, to be destroyed by a lack of conservation practices, but it would also be dangerous to human health (it already is). There are lots of families in Utah valley, and the population is expanding at a rapid rate. We need more, not less, water conservation to keep up with the amount of people who are here, and to keep the toxins in the lake bed where they belong. Utah's residents--NOT corporations like US Magnesium--MUST come first. If US Magnesium wishes to continue to use Utah's natural resources, Please require them to provide equal benefits to what they extract, such as putting equal amounts of water back into the lake. Otherwise, please DO NOT allow them to extend their canals at this time. Protect Utah's residents and wildlife first.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 87 | Kyle Lukacs | I wanted to send a brief message to say that I think the proposed trenching by US Magensium should not move forward. With the Great Salt Lake already at historic low levels, I do not see how further draining the lake could benefit any of the nature, animals, and organisms that rely on this ecosystem. Destroying this ecosystem to benefit a private LLC is a terrible misjustice and the Utah Government should not be complicit in this betrayal of the general public. Thank you for taking the time to read this. Please do not let this happen. |
| 88 | Barbara Ryder | I urge you to deny any further trenching in Great Salt Lake by US Magnesium. Please take every possible measure to preserve the lake for the sake of the health of area residents and the sake of the migratory waterfowl for whom the lake is an essential stopover.Thank you for your efforts in the preservation of the Great Salt Lake ecosystem. |
| 89 | Elizabeth Napier | I am not a resident of Utah, but my children and grandchildren live in Salt Lake City and I visit them regularly. As months and years pass by, my concern for their well-being increases. The Great Salt Lake is a barometer for how we are collectively addressing climate change and how we value the health of Utah residents. US Magnesium must not be allowed to put profits before health. They signed on to their present agreement with full knowledge of the risks they might run if the water level dropped, and it is dropping precipitously. It is too late for them to try to negotiate another “deal.” The well-being of current residents—human, avian, mammalian, reptilian, and others—must take priority over business gains. Everyone seems to be bending over backwards in SLC to conserve water. To grant this request is a slap in the face to present citizens who are doing their part and making daily sacrifices for the greater good. This entire country has its eye on Utah. The problems with Great Salt Lake are not something new, and the water district needs to draw a line in the sand, a painfully apt metaphor for the situation on which everyone is commenting. What Utah does will be pivotal in how the rest of the country deals with water shortages. To bend to the demands of big business over the health of its populace would be a gigantic and long-lasting mistake. I respectfully ask that you decline US Magnesium’s application. |
| 90 | Mary Eargle | I am a new Utah resident, and I am concerned about my future living here. As the Great Salt Lake continues to dry up, the air quality around Salt Lake City is predicted to deteriorate further. The air quality here is already so bad that it cuts two years off of the average resident's lifespans. As the lake dries up, the wind will pick up dust from the newly exposed lakebed and greatly increase dust particles in our air. This will most severely impact lower income areas around Magna and West Valley City, which is an issue of environmental justice. If this lake was located closer to high income residents of the city, this request from U.S. Magnesium would not be considered. The lake cannot take more diversion of its water at a time of record lows. The dire situation has even caught the attention of national news sources like The New York Times. I cannot imagine how the world would react if Utah's legislative powers choose to respond to a climate crisis with disregard and short sightedness. Allowing The Great Salt Lake to dry up is not an option, and playing with the idea of further water diversion is not a possibility. |
| 91 | Stavros Pretorius | The economy is at risk of depending on depleted resources. The Great Salt Lake is a valuable resource that provides billions of dollars every year in shrimp harvest, mineral extraction, and agriculture thanks to the bountiful rivers. Unfortunately, the Great Salt Lake has fallen to an elevation that threatens the natural resources we depend on, quickly killing the ecosystem and our profits. We cannot depend on depleted resources, lest we fall into depression. For the sake of all peoples of Utah, for their health and livelihood, I implore you to please reconsider allowing increased extraction of water from the Lake. |
| 92 | Lindsay Clark | I am writing as a concerned citizen regarding US Magnesium utilizing Great Salt Lake water. This will be devastating to the lake's ecosystem, and we should be exploring other approaches. |
| 93 | Nate Housley Salt Lake City Resident | As a resident of Salt Lake City who cares deeply about Great Salt Lake, I am writing to ask that you deny the 401 permit application for US Magnesium. Allowing them to extend their intake canals would cause an unacceptable degradation to the water quality of Great Salt Lake by creating inhospitable conditions for the local food supply for birds and other wildlife. Removing water from the larger lake body and allowing it to evaporate would increase salinity. Salinity in the lake has already been measured at 19%, a level at which brine shrimp can no longer reproduce. Lowering the lake level, as these canals would do, would also expose more of the microbialites that brine flies and brine shrimp depend upon. Brine flies and algae, which are vital sources of food for Great Salt Lake bird populations, are already suffering because of the salinity of the lake and because of how many of the vulnerable microbialites are exposed to the air. Brine fly larvae are ten times more dense on these microbialites. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>Birds are already feeling the impacts on their food web, and the 401 permit would exacerbate these effects. Several species which depend on the lake for their food could become listed for protection under the federal Endangered Species Act. Utah administrative code states that beneficial use in Gilbert Bay includes the well-being of local wildlife, so the 401 permit would contravene state law. Because two different alternatives exist for US Magnesium, there is no reason to allow the permit. Additionally, despite the claims of US Magnesium that these canals would only be used temporarily, their plans to dredge a canal down to the elevation of 4,180 feet—nine feet below the current lake level—undermine this claim. Their plans indicate that they are not committed to maintaining the lake at a healthy level, and thus US Magnesium should not be treated as a community partner who is engaging in good faith to maintain this public resource for all. Please deny the 401 permit in order to maintain water quality in Great Salt Lake. Thank you.</p> |
| 94 | <p>Holly Simonsen, MFA Membership & Program Director FRIENDS of the Great Salt Lake</p> | <p>My name is Holly Simonsen, I live and work in Salt Lake City. I've been working with Great Salt Lake issues for well over a decade. I work(ed) as an artist (specifically working with Great Salt Lake), as an adjunct professor at Westminster College (wherein I taught a class called Exploring Great Salt Lake), and for the nonprofit FRIENDS of Great Salt Lake (wherein I am the Programs Director). A healthy Great Salt Lake is essential for my livelihood and I plead with you to decline US Magnesium's recent 401 permit to extend their operating canals to 4185. Great Salt Lake remains dangerously low. Exposed microbialites serve as harbingers of a decimated ecosystem. Ecological collapse would have devastating consequences to all who live and work along the Wasatch Front. Most of the activities I participate in as a professional artist and educator occur along the shoreline of Gilbert Bay, including introducing stakeholders, college students, and industry partners to the hemispherically critical ecosystem via the sensitive habitat of Lee Creek and the Gillmor Sanctuary. I've also spent countless hours along Gilbert Bay, both in the water and along the shoreline as a recreationist where I kayak, paddle-board, sail, and row. Gilbert Bay has a class 5A designation protecting its waters for the beneficial uses of primary and secondary contact recreation. A lowered Lake level will not only make these waterways inaccessible, but dangerous to public health, as the dry Lake bed at this elevation will concentrate and expose dangerous toxins (methylated mercury, selenium, and arsenic). It will no longer be safe to study or recreate in this area. The time to listen to the best available sound science is now. Please push pause on this project.</p> |
| 95 | <p>Danielle Mantague-Judd Wanship Resident</p> | <p>I'm writing as a rural Utah citizen and person concerned with the health and future of the Great Salt Lake, regarding the issuing of a Section 401 Water Quality Certification to U.S. Magnesium so that it can extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay, Great Salt Lake (GSL). I urge you to deny the certification/permit to U.S. Magnesium for the following reasons: -levels of the Great Salt Lake are at historic lows, and extending the canals risks lowering lake levels further-lower lake levels, in turn, expose more of the lakebed, drying it out and exacerbating the release of dust, including toxins contained in the dust. Increasing levels of airborne dust and toxins will cause costly health problems and economic damage-removing more water from Gilbert Bay risks further fragmenting the habitat, increasing salinity levels, and destroying the algal microbialite food web (brine shrimp, brine flies, migratory and resident birds, etc.)-GSL lies along the edges of two important Northern Hemisphere bird flyways (the Pacific and Central Flyways) and plays a crucial role as a resting, feeding, and nesting area for hundreds of bird species and millions of individual birds. GSL is of such importance to bird life that it was designated as a Western Hemisphere Shorebird Reserve Network site in 1991.-salinity at GSL is currently around 18%. The food webs on which consumers such as birds depend, and which make GSL an important refuge, are predicted to collapse at salinity levels over 18%. In this light, Utah DWQ should do everything in its power to prevent further water withdrawals from the lake. For these reasons I urge you to reject issuing the Section 401 Water Quality Certification to U.S. Magnesium.</p> |
| 96 | <p>Sam Baldrige</p> | <p>I'm calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. Today, the ecosystem of Great Salt Lake's Gilbert Bay is on the brink of collapse due to historically low water levels and rising salinity. The lake's continued decline threatens millions of migratory birds, \$1.3 billion in annual economic output, and three million Utahns downwind of the exposed lakebed. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake. Now, US Magnesium is asking permission to undermine that public investment by extending their water intake canals in Gilbert Bay so they may continue to drain the lake unabated. Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of "frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain." The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project threatens to destroy a</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>natural waterway and its world-class bird habitat, undermines the State's own efforts to protect the lake, and jeopardizes all other beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake's viability and its potential to rebound in the future. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah. If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium's existing canals can function as designed.</p> |
| 97 | Cyan Larson Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am writing as a concerned citizen living in SLC to ask that you oppose the US Magnesium Canal Extension. The lake continues to shrink, and it is largely due to the industries continuously taking the lake water, including the Magnesium plant. Allowing them to continue extracting water, and allowing a canal extension into the shrinking lake will keep adding to the problem. At some point in our life times this plant will be gone because the lake will be too small for water usage if they keep extracting water. Of course, there are other big industries taking the water or extracting from watersheds that feed the salt lake. Action should be taking place now so that the lake can replenish itself. Otherwise our city will become the next dust bowl. The problem is that US Magnesium, alfalfa farms, etc. are extracting too much water to create conditions and creating their own problems where they need to build infrastructure to access more water. Please do not approve the canal extension for US Magnesium.</p> |
| 98 | Mike Christensen, MCMP, CNU-A, AICP Salt Lake Planning Commission Salt Lake City Resident | <p>As Vice-Chair of Salt Lake City's Planning Commission and a Salt Lake City resident living near the Great Salt Lake, I have major concerns about allowing the approval of the US Magnesium permit. Further removal of water from the Great Salt Lake for magnesium production further would reduce the already historically low lake elevation and drastically increase the lake's salinity level. This resulting decrease in water quality will destroy the food chain and cause the collapse of the Great Salt Lake ecosystem. I call on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's permit application.</p> |
| 99 | Rob College Salt Lake City Resident | <p>It is time to consider environmental and health concerns over the wants of US Magnesium. Please reject their request to draw and dredge water from the lake, as this would be potentially devastating when considering how historically low the GSL is now and efforts to save the lake are in early stages. Visitors come to our state for it's unique beauty, and the GSL is a large part of that. It contributes to the mountain snows in the winter, helping the ski industry and the water cycle. It's an important seasonal stop for migratory birds who come here to fuel up on brine shrimp to continue their journeys. It is the cornerstone of everything this area represents from long before white settlers stopped to build a community.</p> |
| 100 | Nan Seymour Salt Lake City Resident | <p>My name is Nan Seymour. I live in the Avenues neighborhood of Salt Lake City. I grew up in Salt Lake Valley and have a life-long relationship with the great saline center of this ecosystem, also known as Great Salt Lake. Thank you for reading and carefully weighing public comments regarding US Magnesium's proposed permit to lengthen their intake canals. I am writing to ask you to deny their permit. Decreasing lake levels by continuing to dredge and extract water is unethical during this time of active ecosystem collapse. This is an issue of water quality. The resulting increase in salinity, already at a tipping point of above 19% in many measurements, is likely to prove fatal to the microbialites and brine flies that are the platform of life for birds and all other creatures. The beneficial use of lake waters supporting the food chain and the ecosystem as a whole will be compromised if not destroyed. Collapse is imminent. Thank you for weighing my request. I write out of concern for all lives in this bioregion, including humans. We all need water in the lake.</p> |
| 101 | Suzanne Lewis Salt Lake City Resident | <p>Greetings, I am a Salt Lake City resident and recently learned about a new permit request from the company US Magnesium. I would like to submit a comment in opposition to this new permit that I believe will further threaten the viability of the Great Salt Lake. The Great Salt Lake is at the lowest level ever recorded. The lake is drying because too much water is being taken out. This is contributing to a significant loss for all that rely on this ecosystem as well as creating a health hazard for those of us that live here on the Wasatch Front. I'll share these additional words from the Friends of the Great Salt Lake, an organization who I believe speaks on behalf of many that want to see the Great Salt Lake and its ecosystem saved: "U.S Magnesium is a major contributor to lowering lake levels. In a typical year, they extract more</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. U.S. Magnesium recently applied for permits to lengthen their intake canals by several miles. The lake level is so low they aren't able to reach the water and want to dredge more than 100 acres of lake body to reach the water and continue sucking the lake dry. Because of how shallow the lake is, for every foot of elevation the shore line recedes, hundreds of square miles of lakebed are exposed. And U.S. Magnesium wants to take more water, while the lake is on the brink of collapse. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. All eyes are on the lake. The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of GSL and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem. It's time to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. At a minimum, DWQ must conduct a Level II Antidegradation review to ensure that US Magnesium's permit request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the division is required by law to protect. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake in order to ensure the protection of the Lake's beneficial uses."(Attachment DWQ-2022-030034)</p> |
| 102 | Sarah J. Balland Salt Lake City Resident | <p>My name is Sarah J. Balland and I am a resident of the Rose Park neighborhood in Salt Lake City and representing myself and future generations' rights to experience and live with the ecological functions innate to the Great Salt Lake. From 2017-2021, I served as a policy analyst for the Utah Legislature's Public Utilities, Energy, and Technology Committee, the Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls Task Force, and the Native American Legislative Liaison Committee, so I'm speaking to you from that formal background while also trying to channel the voices of those who continue to educate me now that I no longer work for that harmful institution. Firstly, I am urging you to deny U.S. Magnesium's request for a canal extension in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake and to NOT issue a Section 401 Water Quality Certification to U.S. Magnesium. Secondly, I am asking you to, at minimum, conduct a Level II Antidegradation Review to ensure that US Magnesium's permit request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the Division is required by law to protect. And last but not least, I want you to use your access and power to explore what it would take to grant upstream water rights to the Great Salt Lake – meaning that any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in – in consultation with the Indigenous Tribes who are the original stewards of the Lake and hold the greatest wisdom as to where we go from here, since it is apparent that our non-Native settler institutions of governance and conservation are incapable of caring for this sacred body of water or our environment in general. Such Tribal Consultation would include but not necessarily be limited to all Ute Bands of Utah, the Northwestern Band of Shoshone, and all Goshute Bands of Utah.</p> |
| 103 | Catherine Arnold Salt Lake City Resident | <p>Thank you for your work monitoring water in our state. I'm sure you saw the recent PBS Newshour episode about Great Salt Lake. Also, I was one of a large number of people who recently watched an Osher Continuing Ed lecture by Utah Rivers Council about our water use and the Great Salt Lake. Because you're an environmental scientist, I don't need to tell you that if we allow the lake to be depleted, we will increase dust and PM 2.5 pollution in the area. The New York Times reported on this a couple months ago and the environmental health division of the NIH has noted it. The health of our ecosystem will also decrease, with the huge biannual bird migration unable to find brine shrimp or sufficient wetland for a layover. Please consider carefully before allowing U.S. Magnesium to further dredge and draw water from the lake. Let's keep in mind that Utah's primary draw is its natural beauty, for many people who grew up here or arrived for employment in tech, healthcare, universities, and other industries. If we allow dust storms like those in spring 2022 to increase, we will endanger both public health and the attractions of this state. Also, please consider changing state policy to permit buying private water rights for unused agricultural canals to channel back to their source rivers and into the state's lakes.</p> |
| 104 | Rylie Ogden West Valley City Resident | <p>Hello, my name is Rylie Ogden. I have lived in the Salt Lake Valley for my entire life, 25 years. I currently reside in West Valley City and I work in child care with Granite School District. In my free time I take pride in diverting waste, volunteering with the community and being an advocate for things that don't always have a voice, in this case the Great Salt Lake. I write to you today to express my concern with the permit US Magnesium has applied for to expand their intake canals causing the Great Salt Lake water levels to further drop. US Magnesium should NOT be granted the permit due to impact on water qualities. Taking more water out of the lake would increase salinity levels to the point where it would be devastating to the ecosystem - brine shrimp, brine flies, and algae would not be able to survive, threatening the</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>food chain for millions of migratory birds at Gilbert Bay and by granting the permit request that would contradict DWQ's class 5A designation. Not only would lowering the Great Salt Lake water levels affect the ecosystem it will also cause more issues for people in the valley-exposed lake beds will worsen our already detrimental air quality, watersheds will be comprised due to the lake effect not contributing to the snow fall we receive, and our economy will be impacted. With our population in Utah growing and the Climate Crisis worsening no longer can legislation continue with "business as usual" where we put profit over everything else. We must find other ways of harvesting materials so that they will not take away from the preservation and conservation of sacred life sources. Give the Great Salt Lake the right to continue providing so many important benefits to its residents (animals, plants, and humans) for decades to come! In conclusion please, please, please deny US Magnesium the permit to expand their intake canals to keep the Great Salt Lake GREAT!</p> |
| 105 | <p>Vivian A. Utah Resident</p> | <p>I'm a citizen here in Utah and I am fully aware of the dangers of our already Insanely low water levels, especially in the great salt lake. We know what lies in the deepest bed in that lake, if that is exposed it will literally be a death wish on everyone who lives here. Including the wildlife and the environment itself. I cannot fully even comprehend that we the people have to even tell all of YOU to help stop this. It shouldn't even be an "option" on the table. Please don't allow this to happen. Please I am begging you, many of us are begging you all to help us all. The money will never be worth it. Have humanity.</p> |
| 106 | <p>Linda Strasburg West Jordan Resident</p> | <p>Do not allow US Magnesium to take more water from the Great Salt Lake!! They have already played a large part in damaging and depleting the lake water. They also played a part in its low level severely threatening our health in the valley, lowering our property values and hurting our way of life. Stop the mismanagement of our valley's resources and the Great Salt Lake; do not allow USMagnesium to take more water. Also, move them back from what they are taking now to rebuild the waters in the Lake. Allowing them to take out more water is short-sited. Good city planning focuses on our future not on greed and money for a few now</p> |
| 107 | <p>Sunny Strasburg, LMFT Salt Lake City Resident</p> | <p>Our Great Salt Lake should not be polluted and water wasted to benefit a few billionaires of US Nagesium. Utahns deserve clean water and air. Stop their extraction, pollution and selfish special interests! Protect our Great Salt Lake and the citizens and voters of Utah!</p> |
| 108 | <p>Susan Klinker</p> | <p>I am writing with questions about the US Magcorp permit application.1) What is the decision making body? Who makes the decision to approve or reject?2) On what grounds would they decide? What is the benefit to the people, or the State of Utah if approved?</p> |
| 109 | <p>Justin Wilde</p> | <p>I cannot believe how incredibly short-sighted this proposal is to increase water withdrawal from the GSL for use by US Magnesium. I am not anti-business. I am pro-business -- so long as it is responsible business. If US Magnesium wishes to extract water from the lake, they should be required to input water at an equal amount. Utah needs to mature. We cannot continue with the status quo. Please do not approve this application.</p> |
| 110 | <p>Amanda Lukacs</p> | <p>I am writing to you as a concerned US citizen and urging further consideration be paid to permitting U.S. Magnesium to lengthen their channels to divert more water from the Great Salt Lake. I am not a professional scientist, environmentalist, engineer, or anything related, yet even I can understand what a detrimental and irreversible decision this will be if further water is allowed to be drained from the Lake, which is drying up. I have enjoyed visiting Utah for the past few decades and as a new mother it is important to me that my daughter will have the opportunity to have the same beautiful moments in Utah that I have been so lucky to experience. I understand the importance of the natural resources that the Great Salt Lake offers in terms of providing industry jobs, providing materials to create electric car batteries and aluminum products. However, we are but mere stewards of this earth and for many years the alarm bells have been going off to tell us that we are overstepping our bounds. It's time for us to stop ignoring them. If further water is allowed to be drained from the Great Salt Lake, some species are in danger of going extinct and harmful levels of arsenic will continue to be released into our air space. No one will want to come to Utah to experience the beautiful outdoors, camp, ski, see dinosaur bones in the State museum, or attend the University, which my husband and many friends attended. Now, during a period of years-long drought in the West, is not the time to allow U.S. Magnesium to expand their operation and further drain the Lake. Perhaps in the future, it can be considered, but not right now. Furthermore, it doesn't make sense to me that Utah would allow more water to be drained when simultaneously so much money is being spent to replenish the Lake. Please, let's give it a fighting chance to recover.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 111 | Carl Tuttle | No more water sucked from lake into toxic ponds from US Magnesium! |
| 112 | Olivia Miller Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing to express my opposition to permitting US Mag from taking more water from the Great Salt Lake. Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State seems like it might allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. |
| 113 | Ava Curtis Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Ava Curtis and I have lived in the Salt Lake Valley all my life. The Great Salt Lake is not only our namesake but an important part of our culture in this valley. I am writing today to express my concerns how the proposed diversions from the Great Salt Lake by US Magnesium would affect water quality. The Great Salt Lake is a dying body of water. Experts have said that ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity levels persist above 18%. They are currently at 19%. It doesn't take an expert to see how the lake has resided over the years and how much of the lake bed is exposed. If US Magnesium continues to pull 100,000 gallons of water per minute from this ecosystem it will surely make the drying worse. Exposing microbialites to the air, these microbialites when under water have Braine fly larvae in quantities 10 times the rest of the lake. These brine flies are the building blocks of an ecosystems of insects and birds which call this lake home. Simply put exposing this microbialites by continuing to divert water for Magnesium production will collapse the food chain and kill the ecosystem of the Great Salt Lake. It is your job to protect and regulate our waterways, this proposal would contribute to the destruction of Utah's largest and most well-known lake. I urge you to stop this destruction, return 100,000 gallons per minute to the lake and to save our Great Salt Lake. Thank you for your time and commitment to this issue. |
| 114 | Rachel Lake Salt Lake City Resident | I strongly, desperately urge the Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesiums proposal to extend their canals into our already drastically low Great Salt Lake. I was born and raised in Salt Lake City, my last name is Lake, the Great Salt Lake is a part of my identity. My parents immigrated here, I am the first American born citizen in our family. That being said, I was born in Murray without a culture, without family, and without a purpose. All I had was my last name, Lake. When I was young I remember floating in the salt water and coming home with white shoes from the salt. I knew from a young age how special the Great Salt Lake is. Now that I am older, I respect the lake even more. The Great Salt lake is special, biologically, spiritually, physically, geographically, ecologically, chemically. The fact that it is literally evaporating into thin air is tragic and should be treated as such. In my 22 years of life I have seen first hand how the lake has deteriorated. We as Utahns have acknowledged this and known this for a long time, yet our own lawmakers had to be taken on a helicopter ride to see firsthand that the lake is drying up. The fact that a helicopter ride was necessary shows just how out of touch those in power are with the issue. You however, are not as ignorant. The Utah Division of Water Quality is (or at least should be) aware of how huge the problem of the lake drying up is. Toxic dust will literally kill us slowly if the lake dries up to expose dormant arsenic and other potentially toxic minerals. Millions of people in the Salt Lake Valley will contract cancers and die if this happens. In a worse case scenario, the entirety of North Utah will have to relocate due to toxic dust. The issue of the Great Salt Lake being mistreated reminds me of the ignorance of Russian leaders when Chernobyl exploded. No one wanted to accept the facts, leading to immeasurable deaths. The fact is, the Great Salt Lake is drying up, and when it does, toxic dust will lead to death. Allowing US Magnesium to extend their canal will result in deaths. This is how the Division of Water Quality should be considering this issue. Are you willing to put to death future generations, just to give US Magnesium one maybe two years of operating time? I sure hope not. If US Magnesium wants water, they should be the ones investing in solutions that raises lake levels. Not Utah taxpayers like me who were born and raised here. I deserve a stronger say in the matter than any owner from New York. Just like at Chernobyl, if someone in power had stood up for the facts, lives would have been saved. The Division of Water Quality is in that position. By rejecting US Magnesiums proposal, you will save lives. Saving lives (not just human ones) is accepted as more important than one company making money. |
| 115 | Samantha Pensari | Hello, my name is Samantha Pensari, I am located on unceded Goshute, Eastern Shoshone, and Ute territory known as Draper, Utah. I just recently graduated from the University of Utah with a bachelors in Environmental Sustainability. I have been very fortunate to grow up in a state filled with diverse landscapes and communities. Living within miles of one of the most extraordinary landscapes Utah has to offer, The Great Salt Lake. I am beyond words to describe the heartache that I have felt seeing the Great Salt Lake shrink. This body of water whom we have named our city after is dying. A body of water that I have learned to love and consider a piece of |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>my home. I am here to voice my support for the Great Salt lake and to say NO to the US Magnesium plant in extending their permit for two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. This permit would further harm water quality and result in negative impacts of the wildlife population that is dependent on the Great Salt Lake. One example is the food chain, many migratory birds rely on the Great Salt Lake for food. One of the issues the lake is facing is the microbialites drying up because of the low water levels. Microbialites are what brine flies rely on for their source of food, as the microbialites begin to reduce, so do the brine flies, and so will the migratory birds that feed on the flies. This permit has the potential of reducing the water levels in the lake an additional 9 feet. Scientists have also already measured 19% salinity level on the open water which increases the chance of the ecosystems collapsing. The Great Salt lake is a piece of our home and we are all dependent on the survival of the lake. Saying NO to the US Magnesium permit would help prevent the destruction of our ecosystems and will increase the success of the Great Salt Lake.</p> |
| 116 | Rosie Philips Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I'm calling on Utah Division of Water Quality to say NO to US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. I'm in my late 20's and have lived in salt lake my whole life. I have spent many nights on the shores of the Great Salt Lake watching the sunset, and many afternoons wandering around Antelope Island. It's one of the most beautiful and treasured outdoor spaces we have. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is home to one of the most unique wildlife habitats anywhere on the continent. This ecosystem is already declining and in danger because of record low water. If the lake continues to drop, we face catastrophic collapse of the food chain. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake. Now, US Magnesium is asking permission to deliver the final blow by extending their water intake canals in Gilbert Bay so they may continue to drain the lake unabated. Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of "frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain." The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project could cause irreversible harm to the waterway and to all of the organisms living and trying to thrive in the area. With the air quality of Salt Lake City already being poor, it would be devastating to our health to keep taking water from the lake. The toxins from the dust have and will continue to hurt our air quality, quality of life, and the unique ecosystem that protects so much life here. I want to grow old here, and raise a family, like many people I know- and it gets harder to imagine a future here when the conditions are worsening. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project. I hope you hear our urgency and hope for this sacred land.</p> |
| 117 | Thea Brannon | <p>I read the Water Quality Certification Program wording for the 401 permit. It states that its' purpose is "to ensure that licensed activities will comply with applicable Utah discharge and water quality requirements in order to maintain the chemical, physical and biological integrity of waters affected by the project." (my italics) This is diametrically opposed to the designs of US Magnesium. The permit application by US Magnesium states that "The proposed project would be an initial phase in establishing long-term access to water from the Great Salt Lake." It further states that "the proposed project would not result in permanent loss of any waters of the United States nor change the function of the existing lake bed." (my italics) How could that be? Does the company have a fairy godmother? We are supposed to be engaged in massive efforts to save the GSL, not further deplete it. Salinity is already at 18% by my last reading about it. Further abuse of these "waters of the United States" will even more critically affect the already severely damaged CHEMICAL, PHYSICAL AND BIOLOGICAL INTEGRITY of our iconic lake, as well as endanger the health of the one million (and counting) people directly affected by it. Does the state really want to face an incredibly costly and ineffective dust mitigation effort like the L.A. Water District must support? Does the state want to become a pariah in the national culture rather than continue to be a starry draw for new residents? Does the state want to take care of its own children, born and yet to be born? The project proposes to extend the P-O canal from 2.6 miles into the lake to 5.6 miles, and to deepen it in order to maintain a water extraction of 100,000 gallons per MINUTE, long term! I guess that means until there is no water left. The US Mag website maintains that it is "committed to operating the facility in an environmentally responsible manner and is continually developing ways to positively impact the environment and the community." Bold words. So they donated 16 acres and helped with a GSL Waterbird Study years ago, in 1997-2001. Big deal. The way the corporation can contribute to the health of the GSL and the one million (and counting) people directly affected by it and endangered by the drying lake bed is to use their technological expertise to produce magnesium in a wholly different way than continuing to rob our lake. I urge you to deny this permit.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 118 | Nancy J. Schmaus Salt Lake City Resident | The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of the GSL, as well as the people residing nearby. Please say NO to US Magnesium's request to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay. The Great Salt Lake, at its lowest level ever recorded, cannot afford to lose more water. We must demand a new approach to managing its diminishing water, and that includes saying no to businesses. Please decline US Magnesium's permit. Furthermore, please take action to reduce water usage so that GSL water levels return to sustainable levels. As a resident of Salt Lake City, I am incredibly concerned that the GSL will disappear. I read about this happening with other lakes and wondered how modern man could allow this with all of our knowledge and technology. Let's not follow in their footsteps. We need to look not at short-term profits, but the long-term well-being of our community. The GSL is a central part of our community. |
| 119 | Chelle Cruz | Doesn't make any sense to allow any more to be taken from a lake that's quickly disappearing and is going to poison us all. What is wrong with you people? |
| 120 | Mark Linford Cottonwood Heights Resident | I am vehemently opposed to any measure that would take out more water from GSL which would increase its salinity and hasten the looming ecosystem collapse. US Magnesium, a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore is once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster. Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. Any other ruling would ruin the salinity levels in the lake. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake. Please feel free to reach out to me to discuss my position live if necessary. |
| 121 | Christine Barker Sandy Resident | Don't allow the canal extensions that US Magnesium is requesting. At a time when considerable resources are being mustered to protect the Great Salt Lake and prevent it from decreasing further, it is not responsible that a private commercial enterprise be allowed to withdraw even more water from the lake. This will contribute to the lake's increasing salinity, thus disrupting the entire ecosystem. It will interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the Department of Water Quality is required by law to protect. It will expose more lake bed and create more hazards in the form of poisonous blowing dust. US Magnesium already extracts more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. They evaporate more than 40 billion gallons a year and spit back millions of pounds of chlorine across the lake bed. It is time for the responsible management of the lake's resources and water quality to take precedence over private profits. It is time to prioritize and preserve the quality of life in the valley, now and in the future. |
| 122 | Joy Emory | Thanks for the chance to comment. Please acknowledge receipt as soon as possible. The State's Draft 401 Certificate means that U.S. Magnesium's upcoming canal construction complies with the Federal and State law. It means that no significant water quality impacts will result from U.S. Magnesium pushing their drinking straw further into the puddle, the puddle being our Great Salt Lake. The approved Certificate will allow U.S. Magnesium to "maintain a conveyance of lake water intake flow of 100,000 gallons per minute from the Great Salt Lake." And "the proposed project would not result in permanent loss of any Waters of the United States (WOTUS)". At the granular level, it may be true that the actual canal construction itself won't result in a permanent loss of water. However, if U.S. Magnesium continues business as usual, at 100,000 gallons per minute, or even half that, this action will continue to result in a very large permanent loss of water. Any water U.S. Magnesium takes from Great Salt Lake evaporates, per their own website, and is lost indeed. The Lake is currently water-starved, at an all-time low level, the Lake ecology is near collapse, and Lake navigation is virtually impossible. From page 5 of the Draft Certificate, this canal construction is "intended to be the first step in a long term process to ensure access to water from the Great Salt Lake." Given that statement, the State is obligated to take a broader view of this application. This canal construction is necessary for U.S. Magnesium to maintain business as usual, and this application requires the State to consider the consequences of that. A conveyance of 100,000 gallons per minute is equivalent to a flow rate of 144 million gallons per day (MGD). Whether it is 144 MGD or 37 MGD, a lower value which is estimated as the most recent annual consumption by U. S. Magnesium (Salt Lake Tribune, October 20, 2022), this water usage is equivalent to that of a large city. This 144 MGD is sufficient |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>to serve the needs of 720,000 people. This puts into perspective the magnitude of the water used by U. S. Magnesium (and is not meant to infer that the water they use is of drinking water quality) and the importance of the State’s decision. The State must consider whether the canal construction will “cause further degradation regardless of whether a TMDL has been completed” and to consider the impact of this action to the Beneficial Use designation, which includes “waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” Maybe the State will argue, myopically, that as a single isolated action the canal construction alone won’t cause these particular types of damage. However, by approving this Certificate the State is also approving the “first step in the long term process”, which is continuing U. S. Magnesium’s business as usual. This could very well jeopardize the WOTUS, specifically that of the Great Salt Lake, which is in desperate need of water and is dysfunctional. How does the State know that further degradation won’t occur as a result of this action, or that the Beneficial Use won’t collapse as a result? Until they know, they should deny this request. The Lake is dying a death by one thousand blows. The State should stop the blows that can be stopped. If U. S. Magnesium keeps extending the drinking straw further into the puddle, they will dry up the puddle on which they themselves rely. Let them find other alternatives for now – they’ve reaped the benefits of the Lake’s minerals for decades. The State doesn’t have to approve this right now. The State must reconsider the impact of this much water usage from Great Salt Lake at this time. The State needs to take the comprehensive view, uphold the public trust, protect the Commons, and deny this Certificate, and any others like it. The condition of Great Salt Lake requires special consideration now.</p> |
| 123 | Kelly Stevens | <p>Clearly our Great Salt Lake is in trouble. And clearly allowing Mag Corp to lengthen their intake canals by several miles so they can continue to be the biggest users of the lake water would be a mistake. The business negatively impacts millions to benefit monetarily just a few. I’m keeping it short and simple for both our sakes. Just say no.</p> |
| 124 | Alex Dawson Utah Resident | <p>As a long time resident of Utah and Salt Lake City, I strongly oppose the permit to extend U.S. Magnesium's intake canals in the Great Salt Lake. I'm sure you are aware that the Great Salt Lake is already at a historic low level. Permitting a corporation to expand their draw from our already significantly depleted lake is wildly irresponsible and will have significant long lasting negative repercussions. Allowing this permit will set a dangerous precedent that water usage and rights, in the second driest state in the U.S., are for the highest bidders only. Please deny the U.S. Magnesium permit request.</p> |
| 125 | Allison Jones Murray Resident | <p>I am a Utah resident of almost 25 years now, and I am writing to you today concerning the Great Salt Lake and the Great Salt Lake ecosystem. I imagine you are getting an awful lot of letters right now. As you know, In the 1980s the level of the Great Salt Lake hit a high point of about 4,211’. Since then however, ongoing diversion of the waters that flow into the Lake and an extended period of drought (that is likely to continue indefinitely) have resulted in a dramatic drop in the level of the GSL. Today Gilbert Bay is reported as standing at a mere 4,188.4’. Given this dire situation, it is truly unthinkable that the Utah Division of Water Quality is even considering honoring U.S. Magnesium’s request for a permit to drain Gilbert Bay lower than it already is. The reasons hardly need repeating. Nevertheless, here are some of the main ones. 1. The paramount duty of the DWQ is to be the public trust guardian of the Great Salt Lake, not to ensure the economic prosperity of U.S. Magnesium. 2. Further drawing down of the lake as proposed by U.S. Magnesium would violate the public trust duty of DWQ to protect the Great Salt Lake, its ecosystem, as well as public health. 3. The salinity of the water in Gilbert Bay has reportedly reached 19% - a level at the extreme limit for its ability to support the brine shrimp-based ecosystem that all wildlife inhabiting the ecosystem (millions of birds along the Pacific flyway) depend upon. If the lake level goes down anymore the scientists tell us the brine shrimp could experience a mass extinction event. 4. The further the lake level drops, the more lakebed will be exposed and will this contribute to air pollution with toxic metal laden dust in the valleys of the Wasatch Front, including methyl mercury, lead and arsenic. Thus, not only will the wildlife that depend upon the Lake be harmed, but so will the human residents of the Wasatch Front. This would be entirely unacceptable and a gross dereliction of the duty of the State of Utah to protect both. 5. As the surface area of the Lake shrinks (already only about 40% of the historic average), the amount of “lake effect” precipitation in the Wasatch Mountain will also fall, thereby reducing the annual snowpack that in turn feeds the lake, resulting in a vicious cycle of an ever-decreasing volume of water in the lake. In addition, the dust blown onto the mountains by winds sweeping over the exposed lakebed will cause more rapid melting of the winter snowpack and quicker runoff, resulting in even less water post-runoff to supply the lake and the human inhabitants of most of northern Utah. In light of these considerations, I strongly urge DWQ to immediately grant 5A Class status to Gilbert Bay per Utah Admin. Code R317-2-6.5(a) and to deny US Magnesium’s request for a permit to deepen its outtake pipes. US Magnesium must make do with what they have if it can or fail. If the level of the water in Gilbert Bay continues to fall below its already historic low of 4,188.4’ as of today (October 26,</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>2022) there will come a time in the not too distant future when the loss of water will not only result in a collapse of the Great Salt Lake ecosystem and grave injury to the health of the public, but will necessitate the termination of US Magnesium's operation anyway. At that point, all will have been lost. It would be extremely unwise and imprudent to contribute to this alarming prospect. Granting 5A Class status to Gilbert Bay is the least that can be done to help ensure the future of a healthy Great Salt Lake, a healthy ecosystem and human population, and a vibrant economy. I just learned the disheartening news that the Governor's recent proclamation suspending any new water appropriations in the Bear, Jordan and Weber river basins on does NOT impact U.S. Magnesium Corporation's pending application of a canal expansion 3 miles further into the lake, as it was submitted before the governor's directive. The Tribune article this past weekend underscored that the governor's proclamation will not affect the pending application of US Magnesium to use 100,000 gallons per minute of lake water. For anyone I'm sending this email to who has the power to deny this application, if you have already decided to deny it, THANK YOU for doing the right thing, in the spirit of Governor Cox's proclamation, and to do your part to help save our Great Salt Lake. If you are actually considering approving the U.S Mag Corp request, please return to your senses. I am pasting in below the letter I sent in the other week for the comment period on the Mag Corp application, Thank you for your attention to this urgent matter!</p> |
| 126 | Dash Longe Professional Skier/Realtor | <p>I am a VERY concerned citizen that is extremely worried about the future habitability of the Wasatch Front and northern Utah for that matter. I am a professional skier and a Realtor - making both my passion and my livelihood at stake if this permit were to pass. The livelihood of all my associates, colleagues loved ones and client's are also at stake. I have had three separate people sell their homes and leave the state this year alone due to the concerns about the safety of their children with increased arsenic in the air with every square inch of shoreline that recedes. Not to mention the privatization of water as water continues to become more of a commodity than even land in this state. I have friends and colleagues that have been working tirelessly for years up at the capital to make positive change and keep water in the lake so we can continue to live here, so to hear that a permit was even considered by the Utah Division of Water Quality is just beyond disheartening. It is very known that the Salt Lake and US Magnesium's SLC facility is one of the the largest producers of this resource in the United States but is it more important to have magnesium from this facility than to put every Utah Business at risk and further deplete the source of water the fuels the lake effect snow that returns to the water back to lake? Will we take the slogan of Greatest Snow on Earth off of our license plates? How about the doubling of the population by 2050 (or sooner) that every real estate developer and private interest group is banking on / running their projection analysis' on when continuing to move forward with the inland port or the additional terminals at the airport? Or what about the tens of thousands of homes, condos and apartment units that are being built here and constructed by Utah Contractors? Or the BILLIONS being spent by investor from out of state? How about every tech company and the infrastructure investing or being invested in to Silicon Slope? What about the United States Governments multi-billion dollar data center? If we can't live on the Wasatch Front then everyone's investments, not just Ira Rennert's investments will be obsolete and their billions of dollars will go belly up. If Ira can afford a \$248,000,000 home in the Hamptons, why wouldn't he want to protect his source of income and not deplete it to the point of no return? Now we know that 100,000 gallons per minute may not be the tipping factor on whether or not the Wasatch is a safe place to survive but it doesn't help the problem. It spreads the message that it is okay for people to continue to put this issue in the hands of GOD and hope for some bigger winters as we continue to grow as per capita as a state and continue to use water like we do. Using water from the Great Salt Lake to make salt of magnesium for profit is against the very nature of what the Utah Division of Water Quality is paid for by the tax payers to do. Unless Ira is writing the governor a personal check make this go through then there is no possible should even be a consideration. If you have a pulse and your family does too and you plan to live on the Wasatch Front, you MUST say NO to US Mag Corp's request to permit the extension of their their canals so they can continue to further degrade our watershed and the possibility for humans service along the Wasatch Mountains. Thank you for your consideration. I truly hope the right decision is made because there are a lot of very scared people and the lake is the first question I get from out of state clients. The word is out in every other state about the condition of the lake. If someone is going to push this permit through, I encourage to the two of you to ask them if they want the money they have invested in Northern Utah to be at risk. Please do not allow this permit to pass. It will be a massive middle finger to the patrons of this society.</p> |
| 127 | Wendy Blankenship Midvale Resident | <p>I'm writing to you out of great concern for the health of our community and the ecosystem of the Great Salt Lake. I live in Midvale (84047) at 74 East 7615 South. The Great Salt Lake is at a tipping point. We can't afford to approve more water for Mag Corp. We must give more water to the lake and keep what it has there. If we do not, we risk filling the air with dangerous chemicals found in the dust. The ecosystem will collapse dramatically damaging migrating birds. If we do not have a Great Salt Lake our economy will be damaged due to loss of snowpack because of the dust. Preserve our economy, healthy community and ecosystems by saying no to Mag Corp.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 128 | Anthony W Spehar Bountiful Resident | I am a 50 year resident of Utah and am alarmed at the continuing decline of the Great Salt Lake water levels. As a terminal lake it must raised and maintained at sustainable levels for both economic and quality of life issues for the State of Utah residents and visitors. The increasingly exposed dry lake bed is a source of harmful arsenic and heavy metal air pollutants. From my east Bountiful home I can see the dust picked up as the winds blows across the dry lake bed east of Antelope Island. The impact of the Great Salt Lake eco system on numerous migratory birds is well documented and in rapid decline. As citizens, we have increased our conservation efforts to save 9 billion gallons of water this past water year. The Utah Legislature has allocated \$40M to increase the water flowing to the Great Salt Lake. Extending the two intake canals in Gilbert Bay will significantly impact the lake level and contribute to negative consequences for Utah residents and visitors. We didn't let our lawns go brown and change our way of life only to let US Magnesium undo the progress this past water year. I urge you to reject the US Magnesium application for extending the canals in Gilbert Bay. |
| 129 | Matthew Ivan Bennett | Mag Corps' business model is built on evaporating billions of gallons of water in the Great Salt Lake. If water were plentiful here, it would make sense for Utah to host this business. Water is not plentiful here.I understand their products are important in certain sectors of the economy, but conditions at the Great Salt Lake have changed. To ignore the new conditions — or to allow Mag Corp to dig canals without a realistic plan for vastly increasing lake levels — would be irresponsible. |
| 130 | Alison Dernbach South Salt Lake Resident | I'm writing as a South Salt Lake resident and a concerned citizen. Please decline the US Magnesium permit for a canal extension. The lake's water level is too low and this permit would only make problems worse by removing an astonishing amount of water (as the permit states: 100,000 gallons per minute!) and leaving the lake saltier which only harms the delicate ecosystem that exists there. I work as an ecologist and I understand the crucial balance of lake salinity that the populations of brine shrimp need to live there. There have been some measurements of 19% salinity in the lake and that's too high for a sustainable ecosystem. Scientists have warned that 18% will cause ecosystem collapse. I urge you to reject this permit to withdraw more water from the Great Salt Lake. It's bad for the lake and bad for the animals that depend on the lake. |
| 131 | Annue Putman, Ph.D Geology USGS | I'm writing to submit a comment on the hearing for the US Mag 401 Permit. The following is my comment: The Great Salt Lake is in trouble - salinity levels are rising to the point that brine shrimp cannot survive, taking the whole food chain with them. Lake levels are so low that dry playas threaten the communities along the Wasatch Front with historic dust storms. When the lake is in trouble, we are in trouble. U.S Magnesium is a major contributor to lowering lake levels. In a typical year, they extract more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. They intentionally evaporate away more than 40 billion gallons of water a year to turn a profit for a few billionaires and the military industrial complex – all this while millions of pounds of chlorine are spewed across thousands of acres of lakebed. US Mag cannot continue to take and take from a public good, harming neighboring humans health, our shared local ecosystem, and cross continent food chains. DENY U.S. Mag their requested permit. |
| 132 | Nini Rich Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing with the greatest urgency to voice my opposition to the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake.The lake level is currently at an historic low. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 9% – will increase and destroy the lake's ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are “[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This a water quality issue that directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front.I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project. |
| 133 | Miguel Diaz | As part of the public comment period for this permit proposal, I'm writing to request that the proposed 401 permit for US Magnesium is denied. We all know (and US Magnesium is well aware) that the lake has been drying up more and more. We can't approve measures that will continue to suck up water out of the lake. The |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>implications of the lake drying up are huge. Blowing dust from the drying lake will have an effect on health across the Salt Lake valley, particularly the northern part of SL County and Davis County. The lake drying up would also have huge consequences for the local ecosystem that we can't reverse, and would also threaten the survival of migratory birds that rely on the GSL as a stopover point. Please do not allow measures that will continue to deplete the GSL and threaten our health and our environment. The profits of one company do not justify the adverse effects to everyone else.</p> |
| 134 | Mason Mehr | <p>My name is Mason Mehr and I am fervently against the 401 water quality certification to the US MAGNESIUM for the extension of the intake canals in Gilbert Bay and the Great Salt Lake. Taking more water would increase salinity levels to a point that would be far too high, decreasing the life that thrives at these water sources. These ecosystems are fragile and the passing of this certification would be irreversible. Brine Shrimp populations have already been declining with the level of salinity that the Great Salt Lake has gotten to, and if it maintains to be this high (or gets to be even higher), these populations will disappear. Air pollution will get even worse with the amount of land exposed from the lack of water as well, and I think this combination of things is far too detrimental. Please listen to the people and protect the water</p> |
| 135 | Jean Reagan Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am writing with the greatest urgency to voice my opposition to the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The lake level is currently at an historic low. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake's ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This is a water quality issue that directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front. I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project.</p> |
| 136 | Sara Rich Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am writing to oppose the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The lake level is currently at an historic low. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake's ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This is a water quality issue that directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front. I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project.</p> |
| 137 | Bob Avery | <p>US Magnesium, a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore is once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster. Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 138 | Richard E. Kanner, MD University of Utah Spencer Fox Eccles School of Medicine Division of Respiratory, Critical Care and Occupational Medicine Department of Internal Medicine | This email is to object to US Magnesium extending 2 canals that would allow them to extract more lake water and evaporate it off in order to extract the minerals in the fluid. As everyone is aware the Great Salt Lake is rapidly disappearing and is exposing the lake bed to the wind. US Magnesium does produce a valuable product but in the time of a prolonged drought we cannot allow the lake to disappear. If this happens US Magnesium will be out of business, the toxic dusts from the exposed lake bed will blow into populated areas, the increased salinity of what remains of the lake will destroy another industry, the harvesting of brine shrimp and we will lose the lake effect that increases snowfall in our mountains affecting not just our ski industry but also our vital water supply. Everyone, including industry, must adjust to the current situation to do our utmost to save the lake. Please deny US Magnesium a permit to extend their canals. In the long run this will extend the life of this corporation and it will help to save the lake. It will also keep toxic dusts out of our lungs, help our water supply as well as other benefits. The importance of saving the lake cannot be overstated. |
| 139 | Mikkel Davis Clearfield Resident | I live in Clearfield, Utah, and I'm very concerned about the health of our Great Salt Lake. I know that the lake's complete evaporation would bring a chain link disaster to the environment, which would then affect all other living beings dependent on it (which includes us humans). Please do not allow the US Magnesium Corp to take water out of it. We need more water going into the lake. I'm worried for all of us, the future generations, and other animals as well. Please uphold your fiduciary duty as the Division of Water Quality and reject the 401 permit. |
| 140 | Adam Culbertson | I'm calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. The GSL provides extensive benefits to Utah's economy, ecology, and well-being for reasons I'm sure you are educated on. Please do your part to do what is right on this matter. |
| 141 | Dr. Rich Beus | I am writing to voice my concerns about US Magnesium expanding their operations to extract more water from the Great Salt Lake for their personal use. As a concerned citizen of the Wasatch Front, this action will only lead to the further destruction of the Great Salt Lake and this fragile ecosystem that we all rely on from recreation, brine shrimp industry, wildlife and millions of migratory waterfowl that rely on this resource, to our famous snow pack from lake affect snow. US Magnesium is determined to put the nail in the coffin to ever struggling to survive Great Salt Lake. US Magnesium is one of the largest polluters in the US and their actions must be stopped. I reject US Magnesium's proposed action to further expand and destroy the Great Salt Lake. |
| 142 | Sarah Elizabeth Baird | I am not a scientist and I do not play one on tv, but despite these facts, I know that the Great Salt Lake needs to keep its water. The GSL needs water to prevent the collapse of a delicate food chain. This food chain collapse would impact communities beyond our own. As a family we are opposed to US Mag's extension request, for the benefit of all sentient beings, who need our great lake for survival. We visited the Spiral Jetty this summer as a family. The water levels were so low that our toddler couldn't make the long trek out to see the beautiful pink tinged shore. This ancient wonder, Our Great Salt Lake that sustains life in our valley and beyond, needs our protection. |
| 143 | Michael Schwab Utah Resident | I say NO to granting this permit to further destroy our beautiful great Salt Lake. We depend on this lake for our snow pack for our water and clean air as do all the wildlife. Our air quality is bad enough and this will make it so much worse !! Please do not let this happen!! |
| 144 | Megan Dalton | I'm calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake supports one of the most unique and productive wildlife habitats anywhere on the continent. This ecosystem already hangs by a thread due to record low water. If the lake continues to drop, we face catastrophic collapse of the food chain. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake. Now, US Magnesium is asking permission to deliver the final blow by extending their water intake canals in Gilbert Bay so they may continue to drain the lake unabated. Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of "frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>including their necessary food chain.” The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project threatens to destroy a natural waterway and its world-class bird habitat, undermines the State’s own efforts to protect the lake, and jeopardizes all other beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake’s viability and its potential to rebound in the future. The US Magnesium proposal to extend its canals to 4185 feet may buy the company a year or two of operating time, but it devastates a natural waterway and a vibrant ecosystem of hemispheric importance for birds and for people. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah.If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium’s existing canals can function as designed.</p> |
| 145 | <p>Camron Carpenter Salt Lake City Resident</p> | <p>I am writing to express strong concern about the State of Utah's alleged intention to issue a section 401 Water Quality Certification to U.S. Magnesium corporation for a permit request by U.S. Mag Corp to extend two water intake canals in Gilbert Bay on OUR Great Salt Lake...[See attached for complete comment DWQ-2022-030295)</p> |
| 146 | <p>Lara Chho Field Instructor and Community Outreach Coordinator Wasatch Mountain Institute</p> | <p>I’m calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium’s proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. I am a Utahn and watershed educator with Wasatch Mountain Institute, where we bring 5th and 6th graders (mostly from the Salt Lake City school district) high into the mountains to learn about the importance of water in our landscape and the role of snowpack in the mountains in generating this water. Using a State Park as our campus (Jordanelle State Park), we are uniquely situated to highlight the importance of public lands and each individual's investment in safeguarding our public trust that are the beautiful natural landscapes that make our state truly unique. I also spend a lot of time at Great Salt Lake, it is one of my favorite places in Utah, and I care deeply about the health of this ecosystem and its impact on the many species of birds that depend on it, as well as the opportunities for recreation that it offers to folks such as myself.I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project. My reasons are further detailed below. Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of “frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain.” The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project threatens to destroy a natural waterway and its world-class bird habitat, undermines the State’s own efforts to protect the lake, and jeopardizes all other beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay. 1) The waters of Gilbert Bay are protected for the purposes of “frequent primary and secondary contact recreation. Gilbert Bay is used for hunting, swimming, wading, bird watching, wildlife photography, camping, beach activities, and many types of boating. The project will make Gilbert Bay unhealthy, unsafe, and increasingly inaccessible for all types of water-based recreation. 2) The project will expose people to direct contact or immersion in the deepest sediments and waters of Gilbert Bay where deadly concentrations of mercury, selenium, arsenic, and other pollutants are concentrated. 3) People will be harmed by inhalation of harmful gases and dust released from newly exposed areas of lakebed during recreation.4) People harvesting waterfowl anywhere nearby may consume unsafe levels of mercury and other heavy metals as the birds forage in increasingly polluted water and sediments at the bottom of Gilbert Bay. 5) The canal extension project will create new hazards related to reduced navigability of the waterway, such as stranding and failure of emergency responses. 6) Two state parks and their facilities on Gilbert Bay – some of the only public recreation facilities anywhere on Great Salt Lake - will be made unusable for water-based recreation. Access to the waters of the bay will become increasingly limited and hazardous. If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium’s existing canals can function as designed</p> |
| 147 | <p>Maggie Laun</p> | <p>I am writing with the greatest urgency to voice my opposition to the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The lake level is currently at an historic low. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake’s ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This a water quality issue that directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front. I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project.</p> |
| 148 | Stacey Sayers | <p>It has come to my attention that the escalating disappearance of the Great Salt Lake is largely impacted by US Magnesium. You have the authority (and responsibility) to take action to protect the lake from the practices of US Magnesium resulting in the disappearing of our Great Salt Lake. The draining of the lake affects all of us. Toxic dust not covered by water in the dry lake beds creates toxic massive dust storms that fill the entire Wasatch Front when the predominant Western winds blow across the lake directly downwind of our major communities. The great decline of "Lake Effect Snowstorms" that fill our mountains with needed snowpack and thus water supply. Less Snow - Less Pow - Less good Skiing - our \$1.5 billion dollar annual ski industry suffers which employs thousands of People. THE abject unfairness of Thousands of citizens making sacrifices and contributions to sustain the most water reaching the Great Salt Lake as possible such as xero scaping, water conservation etc. and the State agency allowing a corporation to continue to drain more water out of the lake for private profit with no regard for consequences to the lake and health of the ecosystems and Citizens of Utah. I am one of those people who refrained from watering my lawn and make financial commitments to removing grass and being aware of water usage. And, it is simply WRONG for US Magnesium to be taking such enormous quantities of water from a stressed lake--and increasing the salinity of the lake resulting in the killing of aquatic life.</p> |
| 149 | Anders Kierulf Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am writing to oppose the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The lake level is currently at a historic low. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake's ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. Dredging will also directly impact the water quality in the lake. Instead of dredging new canals, all efforts should be made to maintain and increase water levels so that this becomes unnecessary. This a water quality issue that directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front. I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project.</p> |
| 150 | Sophie Shinsky South Salt Lake Resident | <p>I'm calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. Today, the ecosystem of Great Salt Lake's Gilbert Bay is on the brink of collapse due to historically low water levels and rising salinity. The lake's continued decline threatens millions of migratory birds, \$1.3 billion in annual economic output, and three million Utahns downwind of the exposed lakebed. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake. Now, US Magnesium is asking permission to undermine that public investment by extending their water intake canals in Gilbert Bay so they may continue to drain the lake unabated. Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of "frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain." The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project threatens to destroy a natural waterway and its world-class bird habitat, undermines the State's own efforts to protect the lake, and jeopardizes all other beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake's viability and its potential to rebound</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>in the future. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah.If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium’s existing canals can function as designed.</p> |
| 151 | <p>Janet Jamison Salt Lake City Resident</p> | <p>I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation projection Gilbert Bay. With the lake levels at a historic low, the salinity levels are already too high. As more water leaves the lake, that will increase. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will plummet if the 18% salinity levels remain. Brine fly populations are dramatically dropping and algae is dying; these are critical food sources for the millions of migratory birds who rely on the GSL for feeding. DWQ's Class 5A designation states that the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit should not be issued as it would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay. This is a water quality issue that directly threatens wildlife, me, my family and the entire population of the Wasatch Front. Please do not allow the permit to be issued.</p> |
| 152 | <p>Andrew Napier</p> | <p>I moved to Salt Lake 16 years ago. It was a no brainer. There’s nowhere else on earth with nature that is comparable. People in Utah often like to take their privileged situation for granted. Of course, there are exceptions. But the general lack of appreciation for our incredible surroundings is appalling. My job grants me the incredible luxury of traveling the world to seek out, film, and photograph areas of natural beauty. The alps are great. The fjords in Norway are stunning. The volcanoes of Iceland are breathtaking. New Zealand’s lush forests are addicting. None of it compares to Utah.Utah’s unique geographical position gives its residents more natural diversity than anywhere else I have ever traveled. From the low level red rock desert, to winding rivers lined with gigantic cottonwoods, to the 5,000 ft piñon pine and juniper forests, to the 9,000 ft aspen forests, and the sublime above tree-line landscapes- nothing compares. Yet there is also nowhere else I have traveled where I fear for the future of the nature, animals, and people more than Utah. There’s some rouge people out here. These people have lost the plot. There’s no other way to put it. From Orin Hatch to his pitiful childish prodigy Mike Lee, I’d be hard pressed to find a group of people who could care less about the place they live. Of course, they “care” in their own way- for the homo sapiens. But how about the other species of Utah? Do they care about the over 400 species of birds that live and pass through the great salt lake every year? Do they care about the micro organisms that are vital to our ecosystem in the lake? Do they care about the mammals that have existed in this great state millions of years before us? Do they care about Bears Ears- the greatest collection of Native American artifacts in North America? Do they care about Escalante, home to the greatest slot canyons on earth? I think not. For anyone with a basic understanding of history- the short sightedness of Utah’s current political culture is mind blowing. Are we any different than Easter Island? The Aral Sea? Of course not. Let’s pretend for a fleeting moment that only money matters. Let’s play into the bizarre 21st century fascination with money. Let’s pretend that the health of our economy trumps all other environmental concerns. Even if we go along with this short sighted approach, do we really still believe that resource extraction, drilling, and mining bring more jobs to Utah than the 1.5 billion dollar a year ski industry? Do we really believe these industries bring more money to Utah than the millions of tourists who visit our national parks and monuments every year? Does US Magnesium bring more jobs and opportunity to the table than the biking, hiking, skiing, and outdoor industries based in Utah? Yes, the big corporations here in Utah who extract resources happily line the pockets of our corrupt politicians. But are they really lining the pockets of the average Utah resident? I think not. In fact, I expect my lungs to be lined with arsenic dust, my blood to be lined with lead, and my drinking water to be lined with contaminates, long before I see my pockets being lined by a company like US Magnesium. Before moving to Utah in 2006, I spent the first 18 years of my life in New England. Most summers I go back east, work remotely, and spend time with my family. Since 2006, my friends and family rarely bring up Utah or know anything about it. However, the last couple years have been eye opening for me. Now when I go back east, my friends question me insistently. What is happening to the Great Salt Lake? How do you feel safe living out there? Are you concerned about the lead and arsenic? What is your state doing to Bears Ears? Has Escalante really been cut in half? Others around the world are currently paying very close attention to what is happening to our great state. There is a lot of publicity right now about our great state, and that publicity is sadly not great.I am writing this letter to beg you to not allow US Magnesium to dig further trenches, and further drain our Great Salt Lake. Our entire wellbeing rests on this decision. You have so much power, and I beg you to use that power for the good of Utah citizens (but human and non-human). Please set a good example- the entire world is watching.I leave you with this quote: “Yet people are beginning to suspect that the greatest freedom is not achieved by sheer irresponsibility. The earth is common ground and we are all over-lords, whether we hold title</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | or not; gradually the idea is taking form that the land must be held in safekeeping, that one generation is to some extent responsible to the next, and that it is contrary to the public good to allow an individual, merely because of his whims or his ambitions, to destroy almost beyond repair any part of the soil or the water or even the view.”— E.B. White, E.B. White on Dogs |
| 153 | Janna Lauer Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing with the greatest urgency to voice my opposition to the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The lake level is currently at an historic low. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake’s ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ’s Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are “[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This is a water quality issue that directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front. I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project |
| 154 | Taylor Hunter South Salt Lake Resident | I’m calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium’s proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. Today, the ecosystem of Great Salt Lake’s Gilbert Bay is on the brink of collapse due to historically low water levels and rising salinity. The lake’s continued decline threatens millions of migratory birds, \$1.3 billion in annual economic output, and three million Utahns downwind of the exposed lakebed. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake. Now, US Magnesium is asking permission to undermine that public investment by extending their water intake canals in Gilbert Bay so they may continue to drain the lake unabated. Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of “frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain.” The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project threatens to destroy a natural waterway and its world-class bird habitat, undermines the State’s own efforts to protect the lake, and jeopardizes all other beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake’s viability and its potential to rebound in the future. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah. If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium’s existing canals can function as designed. |
| 155 | Issac Martinez | I think they should stop using water cause our earth is more important, if we don't have a good place to live there isn't no point. So for the sake of our future we gotta protect and fix our earth so it's as natural as possible. |
| 156 | Chad Farnes | As a citizen concerned with the current level of the Great Salt Lake, I would encourage you to reject US Magnesium’s petition to extend their canals. The Great Salt Lake needs to be protected and with it reaching record lows this year, as a community we need to ensure that various local entities stop siphoning the water that is critical for our ecosystem. I believe that their proposal should be rejected. |
| 157 | Barbara Dobbs Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing with the greatest urgency to voice my opposition to the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The lake level is currently at an historic low. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake’s ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ’s Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are “[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This is a water quality issue that directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front. I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project.</p> |
| 158 | Anahi Gomez Nava | <p>I am emailing regarding the Utah division of water quantity to reject the US Magnesium proposal to extend their canals because it’s a bad idea to siphon the more of its water away is a very bad idea. There will be a lot of drought the brine shrimps, lake flies won’t survive due to the potentially inedible algae. It will also impact the million of migratory birds that depend on the lake or any other thing that depends on the lake.</p> |
| 159 | Kristen Blair, MDiv, BA Toronto, ON Resident | <p>I am a Chaplain in Toronto, Ontario. I grew up in Utah, which will always be my home. Over the past decade I have witnessed the decline of the Great Salt Lake from far away and felt helpless, even as institutions like yours with power to make positive changes for our children's future continue to choose greed. I implore you to reject US Magnesium’s proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake. You already know that Gilbert Bay supports a magnificent and unparalleled ecosystem of life, some forms of which are represented nowhere else in the world. The water levels of the Great Salt Lake have been dropping steadily and we must act now to save the water and preserve not just the magnificent diversity of plant and animal life which calls Salt Lake home but also the recognized citizens of Salt Lake who depend on the watershed for their livelihoods. Before moving forward with any kind of continued project with US Magnesium, the Utah Division of Water Quality must invest in the protection of the Great Salt Lake and ensure water levels are rising before contracting outward. Entering into a contract with US Magnesium could and, according to the best science, likely will wreak irreversible ecological devastation. We are counseled to look ahead seven generations. US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals further into Gilbert Bay looks only at potential profits. The Great Salt Lake is a living being who must be respected as much as any person. Seven generations from now, I hope we can be proud of how we acted when our choices mattered profoundly.</p> |
| 160 | John Horn Ogden Resident | <p>I am writing to you today because I am concerned about the Great Salt Lake and all of us who live in Utah along the Wasatch front. It is common knowledge at this point that the Great Salt Lake is drying up and the consequences of this will be massively destructive to life in our region. US Magnesium, a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore is once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster. Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium’s plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake.</p> |
| 161 | Zoe Perry Salt Lake City Resident | <p>What is being proposed will create an unlivable valley for everyone, in a number of years, not decades. I am writing with the greatest urgency to voice my opposition to the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The lake level is currently at an historic low. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake’s ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ’s Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are “[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” This permit would directly threaten the</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This a water quality issue that directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front. I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project. |
| 162 | Rebecca Wilson Salt Lake City Resident | What is being proposed will create an unlivable valley for everyone, in a number of years, not decades. I am writing with the greatest urgency to voice my opposition to the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The lake level is currently at an historic low. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake’s ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ’s Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are “[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This a water quality issue that directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front. I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project. |
| 163 | Joell Woodbrey Spanish Fork Resident | My understanding is that this could harm the whole ecosystem in and around the Great Salt Lake. Allowing the extension of these canals could cause devastating consequences. Millions of bird could die. Please do not approve this canal extension permit. |
| 164 | Gema Gomora Student Taylorsville High School | Hi, I do not think more water should be taking water from the lake while we are already in a drought with not much water in the lake. Especially with us in global warming and not getting much snow and rain it wouldn’t be good. With water decreasing as such a high rate every single year that passes in the future Utah won’t be a livable area anymore and we will have to all move because of the toxins in the air. Please take this into consideration. |
| 165 | Mariela Gonzalez | I don’t agree with the decision because the great salt lake is already low enough and by doing that I’m the end we won’t have any more water in the bread salt lake |
| 166 | Lola Culbertson | I’m calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium’s proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. The GSL provides extensive benefits to Utah’s economy, ecology, and well-being for reasons I’m sure you are educated on. Please do your part to do what is right on this matter. |
| 167 | | Hello, I'm from Taylorsville's LIA and I just wanted to give my reasoning as too why we need our Salt Lake. I don't agree to give away our Salt Lake, it's a national landmark and we need to take care of it. |
| 168 | Pan Dulce | Hello! I hope your having a good day I just read an article about how they’re gonna remove water from the Great Salt Lake and I just don’t think that’s a good idea as it’s already really low and if it gets lower it could affect the whole ecosystem causing the lake to completely dry up. If that happened it would be really bad because it’s one of Utahs biggest attraction and we could lose a lot of money as it’s a big tour attraction. I just don’t think it’s a good idea to remove that much water |
| 169 | Jenny Aguilar | I don’t agree because the lake already has way too little water and if they dredge the water will decrease and we won’t have enough water in the lake and it will have a bigger possibility of drying up which isn’t very good for the city because we won’t have a lot of water and we would be able to water the plants wash the dishes etc. |
| 170 | Carina Wells Law Student S.J Quinney College of Law Fellow, Wallace Stegner Center | I am writing to urge you to not approve the permit for US Magnesium to take Great Salt Lake Water.I grew up here in Utah and it has been wrenching to see the ski seasons get shorter each year and the lake get smaller each time I see it. I am a law student now at the University of Utah. In school, we have learned about the public trust doctrine. The public trust doctrine is a state common law doctrine that says that certain natural and cultural resources must be preserved for public use. The Utah Constitution embodies this principle—it states that public lands of the state are “held in trust for the people.” Courts, including the U.S. Supreme Court, have held that states must use submerged lands in a manner that protects the collective interests of citizens to use and enjoy their resources, and have prohibited states giving away |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | natural resources to private corporations when those resources were of value to the public. Illinois Central Railroad v. Illinois. We know that the Great Salt Lake is necessary to for the health and welfare of the public and environment—increased salinity in the lake will harm the food chain and more exposed lakebed will increase the public’s exposure to toxic heavy metals. The state has a responsibility to the public and the environment and it should not approve the permit. |
| 171 | Nicole C Bennett | This email is regarding the request for an extension for the US Magnesium Canal to continue access to the water of The Great Salt Lake. I have lived in Salt Lake City my entire life and currently attend The University of Utah. Recently I have been working on a project that involves The Great Salt Lake and the dangerously low water levels. As I am sure you are more than aware, this will impact not only every life in Utah but it will have a global impact. Economically, environmentally, and socially this lake is what Utah thrives on. If you don't care about the millions of humans in this state alone that will suffer from the decision to take billions of gallons of water away from this ecosystem then at least think about how it will impact you. Even the wealthiest and greediest of Salt Lake City's finest are going to be impacted by the Salt Lake drying up. So, do something about it because you can, or we will do something about you. |
| 172 | Alexia Martinez Salt Lake Resident Hotizonte Student | I’m calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium’s proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. For the last three and a half years, I have managed environmental education programming for FRIENDS of Great Salt Lake. I have brought thousands of elementary students, teachers, and parents to Antelope Island State Park and Great Salt Lake State Park to help our community understand the lake’s ecosystem and their role in protecting it. Today, the ecosystem of Great Salt Lake’s Gilbert Bay is on the brink of collapse due to historically low water levels and rising salinity. The lake’s continued decline threatens millions of migratory birds, \$1.3 billion in annual economic output, and three million Utahns downwind of the exposed lakebed. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake. Now, US Magnesium is asking permission to undermine that public investment by extending their water intake canals in Gilbert Bay so they may continue to drain the lake unabated. Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of “frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain.” The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project threatens to destroy a natural waterway and its world-class bird habitat, undermines the State’s own efforts to protect the lake, and jeopardizes all other beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake’s viability and its potential to rebound in the future. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah. If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium’s existing canals can function as designed. |
| 173 | Brooks Catmull Salt Lake City Manager Dykman | As I look into the request of US Mag to extend and deepen their canals to the GSL it baffles me to think this is being considered. We have fought for years the low water levels and by allowing it the situation will only get worse. This year we have been faced with Toxic dust storms due to the lake bed being exposed. lower lake levels will negatively impact so many things beyond “production”. Some issues to be concerned about: Recreation, hunting, boating, air quality, waterfowl migration, wetland destruction, etc. Maybe US Mag should pay their bills to their local vendors before spending money to deepen their canals! My business has now sent them to collections last week. This isn’t the first time but why allow them to gain more while they are hurting our local economy! I am 100% AGAINST this proposal!!!! |
| 174 | Tatiana Subbotin Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Tatiana Subbotin. I’m a resident of downtown Salt Lake and avid lover and visitor of the Great Salt Lake. The lake has been a refuge for many Utahans and wildlife alike. Allowing US Magnesium to pull yet more water from the lake will only serve to keep this corporation profitable but will rob our community and the future of our community of not only a lake but an immense eco system that supports our valley. The lake and it’s eco system and our community should be the number one priority, over the interests and profits of large corporations that do next to nothing in efforts of giving back to the community or care taking the very land that justifies their existence. I am in opposition of US Magnesium's request for additional water. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 175 | Davey Harding Salt Lake City Resident | I'm from Salt Lake City, born and raised. Watching the draining of the Great Salt Lake over the 40 years I've spent here has been heartbreaking, and I believe sets a terrible example for our children and leaves them to deal with the environmental repercussions. Please do not allow US Magnesium to continue contributing to the draining of our lake, let alone extend their infrastructure to reach below the level they were ever supposed to reach to. |
| 176 | Larry Castle-Fericks Park City Resident | I am adamantly opposed to the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. This project will lower the already historically level of the Great Salt Lake by another nine feet. This is not the time to allow any additional projects which result in further compromising the lake. We are already at a point where the salinity is too high for many on the life forms that live there. The lake is nearing the point of collapse. The Utah Legislature is considering ways to bring more water to the lake. Water conservation, working with farmers and other users won't solve the problem alone. Surely, permitting US Magnesium to draw additional water is in opposition to statewide goals. The collapse of the lake will adversely affect all of us. This water quality issue directly threatens me and my family. It will also affect millions of migratory birds which rely upon the lake for nourishment and nesting. When and if the lake recovers, US Magnesium will be able to apply for a permit. Meanwhile, it is irresponsible for your department to approve of this commercial project. I support your wise rejection of this permit request. |
| 177 | Stanley Holmes Salt Lake City Resident | I urge you to please Deny Permission for US Magnesium's project that would expand its water intake canals system. At this time of the Great Salt Lake's (GSL) historically low surface level and high exposure of lakebed, US Magnesium should be directed to halt its evaporative operations rather than be allowed to exacerbate causes of GSL's demise. US Magnesium is requesting permission to continue draining water from a Utah ecosystem hub suffering a water loss crisis. This is analogous to draining blood from an accident victim already hemorrhaging blood. Common sense should dictate that both scenarios are absurd. The US Magnesium project proposal, DWQ-2022-08001, increases the threat to my Salt Lake City family's health and economic welfare. Drawing 100,000 gallons of water per minute from the GSL under US Magnesium's proposal would permit increased airborne toxic dust from the lakebed to contaminate air along the Wasatch Front and worsen the respiratory burden my family and community now face. This negative externality from the proposed US Magnesium activities and subsequent operations will injure area residents and cause premature deaths, as noted by the 2020 BYU report on air quality and morbidity. Who will pay the associated health care and interment costs as an increasingly dysfunctional [writ "dry] existing lakebed turns to airborne dust? Degradation of air quality and other environmental consequences of the GSL ecosystem's demise hastened by US Magnesium's canals extension project would negatively affect property values including that of my family's sole residential property. And for DWQ to claim that "The Great Salt Lake would be the only water body that would be impacted..." ignores the reality that the GSL's "lake effect" feeds the Wasatch Mountains with moisture replenishing rivers, streams, and Utah Lake. I can't imagine that a qualified hydrologist approved that claim. It's also apparent that no economist acquainted with the GSL-decline related threat to the future of Utah's ski industry [think \$, jobs, tax base] vetted this proposal. For the state to permit this height-of-folly project and facilitate the range of negative externality costs borne by area resident victims would leave many wondering "Who do we sue? US Magnesium, the state, or both?" Please take a moment to imagine the class action lawsuit(s) that may ensue from the DWQ's giving US Magnesium a "green light" to proceed with this GSL drawdown project. Any further consideration of US Magnesium's proposal should factor-in the full range of solatium payments for civilian casualties and the increased tax burden that Utahns would bear to offset costs of damages. For US Magnesium to put corporate profits over Utahn's lives and communities is disgraceful, but consistent with US Magnesium's historical disdain for the environment, its workers, and the American public. US Magnesium was formerly known as MagCorp, until the first iteration declared bankruptcy from costs associated with massive air pollution that warranted EPA superfund status. For more information, I urge citizens and state decisionmakers to read the 2014 Utah Stories article at ... https://utahstories.com/2014/01/air-pollution-in-utah/ I urge Utah's DWQ to issue a firm "NO" to US Magnesium's proposal to extend two intake canals at its GSL Gilbert Bay facility. |
| 178 | Izabella Bourland Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Izabella, I'm a 23 year old queer woman, and I've lived in Salt Lake City my whole life. I have grown up going on annual field trips to Antelope Island, and have watched as the lake has gotten lower and lower with each visit. I was last out at Antelope Island just two weeks ago for bird watching, and it was heartbreaking to not be able to see water next to the causeway for miles and miles. The marina was dried up, there were no boats. Two months ago I flew over the lake, except I didn't really fly over the lake, I flew over dry lake bed, dirt, and dust. Four months ago I visited the Lee Creek Natural Area, a bird refuge on the south end of the Great Salt Lake, and had to walk multiple miles just to reach the water. Google maps showed that I should have been able to reach the shoreline in a matter of minutes. I'm calling |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium’s proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. It is widely understood that: 1. The Great Salt Lake is at its lowest level ever recorded. 2. This is because too much water is being taken out of the lake. 3. This has an immediate and devastating impact on our snow and winters, on our air quality, on the health of residents in Salt Lake and surrounding communities, and on the wildlife that depend on the lake.4. The lake is on the brink of collapse. Every decision the Utah Division of Water Quality makes regarding the lake and water use decides our future.I am begging you to reject this proposal. I want to continue to live in Salt Lake City, I want to show my kids the lake, and the millions of birds that depend on it. I want to take them sailing in the lake and let them swim in it. I want to show them a thriving and healthy ecosystem, but this is a dream that is disappearing so quickly. If things continue in a business-as-usual fashion, there will be no lake left, there will be no birds, there will be no snow, and the toxins swept into our air from the exposed lakebed will force me to move away from my home. There is no way we can save the lake and simultaneously allow a project that would bring the lake level down by 9 feet.</p> |
| 179 | <p>Corinna McMurtey Student University of Utah</p> | <p>I’m calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium’s proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. Today, the ecosystem of Great Salt Lake’s Gilbert Bay is on the brink of collapse due to historically low water levels and rising salinity. The lake’s continued decline threatens millions of migratory birds, \$1.3 billion in annual economic output, and three million Utahns downwind of the exposed lakebed. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake. Now, US Magnesium is asking permission to undermine that public investment by extending their water intake canals in Gilbert Bay so they may continue to drain the lake unabated.Water quality in Gilbert Bay is protected under a Class 5A designation for the beneficial uses of “frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain.” The US Magnesium canal extension project will clearly and unambiguously degrade Gilbert Bay, both by lowering water levels and by altering the chemical composition of the remaining water. The project threatens to destroy a natural waterway and its world-class bird habitat, undermines the State’s own efforts to protect the lake, and jeopardizes all other beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay.I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project.Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake’s viability and its potential to rebound in the future. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah.If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium’s existing canals can function as designed.</p> |
| 180 | <p>Anita Manitius Salt Lake City Resident</p> | <p>I’m calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium’s proposal to extend their canals further into Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake.I moved from Vancouver, Canada to Salt Lake City six years ago because I fell in love with Utah, the people, and skiing the Best Snow on Earth. I’m devastated and heartbroken learning about the effects of US Magnesium’s impact on the Great Salt Lake. When I first moved here, friends, family, and people I met would question me about my and Utah’s religion. Now, Utah has a different reputation and when I tell people where I live or when I see friends from elsewhere, they’ve asked if I’ve purchased a hazmat suit and gas mask. All eyes are on Utah. Are we going to make the right decision or are we going to let Big Business win yet again and embarrass ourselves? The toxic dust that is arising from the already-dried lakebed is finding its way into our drinking water. I recently read a water quality report for Salt Lake City’s drinking water and was terrified to learn that there is 109 times more arsenic in our water supply than what is considered safe by the Environmental Working group as well as 13 other contaminants. Trace amounts of chemicals build up within our bodies and are extremely dangerous. Not to mention the already frightening air quality that has a direct link to miscarriages in women living in the Wasatch Front. I understand that US Magnesium is an important company and provides resources and jobs to other industries. But there needs to be a compromise. Why should one industry have more leverage than others? The Great Salt Lake is relied upon heavily by other industries. While the proposal may buy the company a few years of operating time, it threatens a vibrant ecosystem of the utmost importance for birds, it harms the health of all our people as well as all the other industries that rely on the Lake. If this canal extension project is to move forward, it would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the state of Utah. If the Great Salt Lake continues to dry up, we know from understanding the water cycle and from the book, The Secrets of Greatest Snow on Earth by Jim Steenburgh, that the ski industry alone will suffer greatly. The ski industry was valued at \$1.8 billion in Utah in 2019. This number has only increased since then. US Magnesium is valued at around \$110 million. The ski industry directly employs at least 7,000 people</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>while indirectly supporting several other local businesses, while US Magnesium employs only 450 people. I agree with what others have said before me; the bare minimum for extractive practices on the Great Salt Lake should be balanced by a requirement to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This in fact cannot be a compromise but rather it is the only currently viable option. How are we going to explain this to our children? My husband is a bird watcher. How are we going to explain to our children that the beautiful birds that we spent years admiring are gone? That there are no birds left in the Great Salt Lake because we allowed the lake to dry up and they all died. Let's not be an embarrassment to our children and to the rest of the world. Let's not be known as the state that let this spectacular and important resource dry up because we couldn't figure it out. I urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to act responsibly to protect Gilbert Bay and deny US Magnesium the 401 Water Quality Certification for their canal extension project.</p> |
| 181 | Denise Jost Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am writing with the greatest urgency to voice my opposition to the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The lake level is currently at an historic low. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake's ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This is a water quality issue that directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front. I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project.</p> |
| 182 | Cathy Van Dyke Park City Resident | <p>I write to oppose issuance of a Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the proposed extension of US Magnesium's intake canals in Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake (GSL). The permit and the review process focus on the <u>construction</u> of the canals <i>per se</i>, yet the construction is solely for purposes of continuing withdrawals of water from the Great Salt Lake at a time when it is already at historically low water levels. Indeed, if the GSL were not at such low levels, there would be no proposed extension of the canals. The real concern here, and the ultimate impact of this project, is the <u>operation</u> of the canal extensions -- which WILL happen if they are allowed to be built. Focusing narrowly on placement of dredged material, or use of BMPs in the dredging processes is missing the point. The concern is not with "discharges" that impact the waters of the State of Utah, but with the disappearance of the waters of the State of Utah. There is no BMP for depleting a body of water. The narrative water quality standards in UAC R317-2-7.2 state that "It shall be unlawful for any person to discharge any waste. . . which result(s) in concentrations or combinations of substances which produce undesirable physiological responses in desirable resident fish, or other desirable aquatic life, or undesirable human health effects." While this project's impact (as stated above) is not in terms of "discharges", it clearly will produce undesirable responses in brine shrimp and brine fly populations and in the many bird species which depend upon their continued bountiful existence. Arsenic-laden dusts arising from areas of already exposed lake bed are known to cause "undesirable human health effects." On page five (5) of the Draft Certification is the statement that, "The proposed project would not result in permanent loss of any Waters of the United States (WOTUS) nor change the function of the existing lakebed". While that might be true when the project is narrowly considered as the construction of the canal extensions, ultimately operation of the US Magnesium canal extensions will result in permanent loss of WOTUS and will alter the lakebed by exposing it and its lifeforms. Finally, a Level II Antidegradation Review is required since the water quality impacts of increased salinity, loss of waters, and exposure of lakebed that would result from operating the extended canals built by US Magnesium and are neither temporary nor limited. I urge you to look broadly at this project -- not to limit the scope of your review merely to the construction of the canal extensions -- but at the true impact on the quality of the waters of the State of Utah if these canals are put into operation. We find ourselves in extraordinary circumstances with continued aridification of our state and the dire low level of the GSL. Extraordinary effort and perspective are required to address these challenges.</p> |
| 183 | Patrick Schirf | <p>I am writing to voice my opposition to US Magnesium extending their canals in the Great Salt Lake. As a Utah citizen born and raised here, and Real Estate agent in the Salt Lake valley, I am deeply concerned for the long term well being of the Great Salt Lake and the greater surrounding ecosystem. This shallow, short-sighted thinking can have major negative long term impacts on millions of migrating bird species, a decline in the health of this vital lake ecosystem, and major impacts to the wellbeing</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>of citizens of the Salt Lake valley and beyond. The more water we lose, the more toxic sediment is exposed into our atmosphere. The inversion is already causing thousands of premature deaths per year. This move would continue to exacerbate this problem, and I am sure it will create several others. As a real estate agent, I have already seen the impact the inversion is having on young families choosing whether or not to live in SLC due to the health effects their children will experience from the poor air quality. We do not need yet another reason to deter people from coming into the state. This could have major detrimental effects to the health of the UT economy as well. The time and resources of the state of UT and the Army Corp of engineers should be put into finding more efficient ways of putting water back IN to the Great Salt Lake, not taking it OUT. I ask that you take these concerns and the other concerns shared by my fellow citizens into account and deny access to US Mag to extend the canals. Thank you for your time and consideration.</p> |
| 184 | Elle-Rose Knudson | <p>I am humbly asking the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The Great Salt Lake provides extensive benefits to Utah's economy, ecology, and well-being for many reasons. Further lowering the level of the lake imposes serious and eventually fatal consequences on the already degrading ecosystem in and surrounding the lake, and the people of the Salt Lake Valley. Please serve our community by doing what is right: rejecting US Magnesium's proposal.</p> |
| 185 | Taggart Jenkins Utah Resident | <p>As a Citizen of Utah I find it deeply concerning especially with the state of the great salt lake that any proposal to deepen, widen or otherwise increase flows of water, out of the Great Salt Lake. I find that it is not in the best interest of the health of citizens, the lake itself, water quality, wetland habitat the state of Utah. This state should stop worrying about improving subdivisions/development and private industry and Instead focus or restoring the Great Salk Lake because of its abundance of not only natural resources, but tourism, Lake effect, harmful dust protection, and a myriad of other benefits to Hunters, recreationalists, and when the lake is healthy again, private industry will also benefit. At this point in time at the state the lake and surrounding water bodies in Utah are in, It is unethical, Damaging and disheartening that this project is even considered at this time.</p> |
| 186 | Perrine Anderson Salt Lake City Resident | <p>This is written to voice my opposition to the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification from the Water Quality Board, for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project on Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. The lake level is currently at an historic low. We cannot afford to lower it further. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake’s ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ’s Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are “[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. This water quality issue directly threatens me, my family, and the entire Wasatch Front. I am adamantly opposed to the issuance of the proposed Section 401 Water Quality Certification for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation project.</p> |
| 187 | Adam Cameron | <p>I’m calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium’s proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. The GSL provides extensive benefits to Utah's economy, ecology, and well-being for reasons I'm sure you are educated on. Please do your part to do what is right on this matter.</p> |
| 188 | Monica Heartwood | <p>I believe in speaking up and in our democratic system believing that maybe in some small way my perspective still matters. I have many concerns regarding this proposal put forth by US Magnesium pushing for legal authority to further degrade our beloved lake. It seems obvious that digging these deeper trenches will result in impacting the Great Salt Lake to the detriment of all. US Magnesium is responsible single handedly for taking more water out of the lake than all the residents of Ogden, Provo, and SLC combined. It's hard to imagine the effects this will cause to all forms of life that share in this resource. Right now we are at historic low levels in the lake. The humanitarian issues are frightening with the increased toxins and contaminants in our water and air, not to mention the equally important environmental issues ranging from all the migratory birds that will loose another valued resting place, to the many microorganisms within the lake and mammals who depend on this</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | watershed and ecosystem. Needless to say I am in deep opposition and all my votes now and in the future will be in favor of preservation and conservation of our natural resources |
| 189 | Petra Wells | Granting a permit to allow additionalWater use from the Great Salt Lake is incredibly irresponsible. Our leaders' job is to protect our states citizens and multiple studies Have shown that the lake is rapidly shrinking and that it's effects on the environment and the surrounding neighborhoods are devastating. |
| 190 | Mia Hayes | Don't let them take more water from our great lake |
| 191 | Alexis Davidson Utah Valley Resident | I have lived my whole life in the Utah Valley and as a severe asthmatic and long-time sufferer of the effects of the pollution caused by US Magnesium in the Salt Lake Valley. I have paid close attention to the pattern of US Magnesium Corporation (which will be referred to as Mag Corp for the rest of this comment) has been a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore, and once again they threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen its diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster. Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high, and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violating beneficial use. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in the extinction of life at the Great Salt Lake and, thus, the civilians living in the valley. As an asthmatic, the drying lake and pollution caused by Mag Corp personally affect my ability to live. You are posing the air we all share. I struggle to breathe most days in the winter due to the pollution from Mag. Corp., we all know this is the main polluter of our valley. This is directly affecting my ability to work and live a full and fulfilling life. It has also pressed me to think about how much longer I can live in a valley due to the damage by Mag. Corp. Why are you putting a company over the health and quality of life of the people of Salt Lake City? If the Lake goes well, all go with it. Long-term plans for a sustainable way of life in the valley for the people living here are where your minds need to be. Please don't choose short-term profits for a singular company over the long-term quality of life of the people. I am asking you to think of the future of the valley and others like me who suffer physical ailments directly linked to the environmental effects caused by Mag. Corp. operations |
| 192 | Megan Averill | I am writing to you to submit my public comment for US Magnesium's permit to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay. I am a resident of Salt Lake City.The Great Salt Lake is at a historic all time low. It would be irresponsible for the health of all Salt lake Valley residents to approve this permit. Additional water cannot be taken from The Great Salt Lake. As the lake shrinks, toxic dust is exposed and when winds pick up, it is kicked up into the air we breathe. This will result in health issues such as Asthma and Cancer. See below article on the Salton Sea in california, as a cautionary tale. https://www.cnbc.com/2021/11/06/californias-salton-sea-spewing-toxic-fumes-creating-ghost-towns-.html Please put peoples' health and wellness above Corporate profits. Do not approve the permit. |
| 193 | Carly Griffith | Like most Utah residents, who are aware of the rapidly decreasing Great Salt Lake, I am deeply concerned. Despite the impending environmental crisis facing the lake, the millions of migratory birds who depend on the lake, the ski industry that is affected by lake water, and the health of every Utah citizen that will suffer if the lake continues to dry up, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to further devastate the fragile ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake and the health of everyone living here. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 194 | Tay Haines | By now, everyone in Utah, and people across the country, are well aware of the critically low water levels in Great Salt Lake. US Magnesium is aware, as well. Despite concerns over arsenic-contaminated dust blowing through the Salt Lake Valley, the company is attempting to extend two canals to withdraw water from the shrinking lake. US Magnesium is a major contributor to shrinking lake levels. In a typical year, they extract more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. They intentionally evaporate away more than 40 billion gallons of water a year to turn a profit for a few billionaires and the military industrial complex – all this while millions of pounds of chlorine are spewed across thousands of acres of lake bed |
| 195 | Amy Dobbs | My name is Amy Dobbs. I was born in Provo and lived in Salt lake for over the last 24 years of my life. I am the great-granddaughter of the Ostlers and Petersons who has owned and farmed in Springville for many generations. I have been fortunate enough to live my entire life in Utah. I am taking the time to write and to express my extreme concern about the State of Utah's alleged intention to issue a section 401 Water Quality Certification to U.S. Magnesium corporation for a permit request by U.S. Mag Corp to extend two water intake canals in Gilbert Bay on OUR Great Salt Lake. Given the magnitude of your position and the responsibility you hold over all of Utah and the citizens living here in this amazing state, this needs extreme consideration for what this entails on all fronts and exploring all the outcomes. Obviously, U.S. Mag Corp claims that the extension of their intake canals to reach the new low water levels and being allowed to continue to drain massive amounts of water from the Lake each year would not have any detrimental effect on the lake or Gilbert Bay, which is naturally, an absolutely false statement. DWQ knows this claim to be false for many reasons and because of many consequences of allowing the lake water to continue to be pumped into evaporation ponds considering the current dire state of the lake and its ecosystems. There are many more reasons that I can list here, I will choose to speak from you as a mother of 3 sons, a daughter, a granddaughter, and a great-granddaughter who has loved living in Utah as I am sure you have as well. I would love for my sons to be able to enjoy all of the amazing things that Utah has to offer and one of them is the Great Salt Lake... it isn't as great and if this happens it will go away and be replaced with hundreds square miles of toxic lakebed exposed and dried up - leaving behind thousands of square miles of dry lakebed which contains, arsenic, lead, antimony, and other harmful heavy metals and chemical compounds and known carcinogens which are remnants of Utah's heavy mining industries that took place in Little and Big Cottonwood Canyons and Parley's canyon with water flow from these canyons arriving in the Jordan River and eventually terminating in the Great Salt Lake. The dried exposed lake bed sediment is easily picked up and becomes air borne by the predominate West, North West, and South West winds that blow across the exposed dry lake shoreline areas and directly into the Salt Lake City valley filling the entire Wasatch Front valley at times with toxic visibly thick dust. These types of dust storms have been witnessed 4 times in the Spring and Summer of 2022, with more massive toxic dust storm events certain to occur if GSL water levels are not stabilized and increased to fill the lake water back to higher levels and cover the exposed dry lake bed areas that have recently been exposed. |
| 196 | Andre Hamm Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Andre Hamm and I am resident of Salt Lake City. I moved to the area in 2014 to attend college, and I fell in love with the city and surrounding areas. I love to ski and climb and bike in the Wasatch and admire the Great Salt Lake from the top of those mountains. I am of mixed Latin American and European ancestry. As an avid member of the outdoor recreation community, I am very concerned that US Magnesium is applying to extend to intake canals into Gilbert Bay in the Great Salt Lake. The Great Salt Lake has reached record low levels and dangerously high levels of salinity. The lake needs our help not a continuation of its destruction. State scientists have already measured salinity levels of up to 19% in the open water, if these levels persist eco-system collapse is imminent. Diversion of water in Gilbert Bay by US Magnesium will not only continue to increase salinity in the area but increase the concentration of heavy metals as well. Microbialities like Gilbert Bay are very important for healthy ecosystem function as they contain 10x as much brine fly larvae as other parts of the lake. Millions of birds rely on these larvae for food, with an increase in salinity and heavy metal toxicity in the Gilbert Bay microbialites, these birds will suffer greatly. A loss of wildlife anywhere is a threat to wildlife everywhere, and the habitat loss of the Gilbert Bay area is sure to be felt by all Utahns. Please do not grant US Magnesium the rights to extend intake canals into Gilbert Bay. |
| 197 | Craig Gelman | It's sad to see all of these permits being requested for the sake of unneeded useless projects for the pettiness of mankind. We cannot thrive here in Salt Lake without the lake and the lack of care towards protecting it is mind boggling. stop taking water from the places that feed the lake. NO TO THE MAGNESIUM PROJECT |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 198 | Alyssa Quinn | I am writing to voice my strong opposition to US Magnesium's permit application to lengthen their intake canals and remove more water from the Great Salt Lake. If this permit is granted, it will cause devastating effects on local water quality, important ecosystems, and the long-term health of everyone living along the Wasatch Front. The Great Salt Lake is currently at its lowest level ever recorded. It is drying up because too much water is being diverted from it. If US Magnesium's permit is granted, it will bring the lake down an additional nine feet. This will prompt an increase in water salinity that will decimate brine shrimp and brine fly populations--a crucial food source for millions of migratory birds. Furthermore, if the lake dries up from water diversion, the exposed lakebed will release toxic heavy metals, including arsenic, into the air we breathe--something <i>The New York Times</i> has called an "environmental nuclear bomb." I am a resident of Salt Lake City and a graduate student at the University of Utah. Over the past few years, I have developed a deep love for the Great Salt Lake, and I am terrified of what will happen if we do nothing to save it. I implore you: deny U.S. Magnesium's permit application. To divert more water at this time would be unbelievably irresponsible. We must take a stand to defend our precious natural resources from corporate greed. The cost of not doing so is simply too high |
| 199 | Amanda Theobald | I am a local urban farmer and instructor of organic gardening at the University of Utah. I have lived in Utah my entire life and would like to continue to live here. In my class we have discussed in great detail about the effects of farming, municipal water use, and industry on the water levels of the Great Salt Lake. I think it is important to teach the various demands on our ecosystems, so that they fully understand that personal choices do little compared to the corporations, and large landowners that have such an outsized impact. US Magnesium should not be allowed to build any infrastructure to pull any lake from the Great Salt Lake. The water levels are too dangerously low to warrant the continued removal of water from the lake. One company's goals and potential profit should not put at risk the health of the lake and its "beneficial use" to us all. It is up to the Department of Water Quality to protect the health of the lake. I would hope your department cares about the air quality for the people in the valley as well, as it is intrinsically tied to the health of the lake. |
| 200 | C Elizer | As a resident of SLC , I strongly urge you to reject US magnesium corp's permit in order to preserve the long term health of the great salt lake. It is already at record lows, largely in part to mineral extraction by US Mag Corp, making an easy profit on a finite resource. |
| 201 | Lan Vo | I am a long time resident of Salt Lake City and am appalled that you would allow US Magnesium to take another 9 feet of water from the Great Salt Lake. We are in a drought and are forecasted to breathe in toxic arsenic and dust when the Great Salt Lake levels drop even further. Not only that, this permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain. This water diversion will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. Who will want to live in Utah after you destroy the Great Salt Lake? |
| 202 | Arthur Spencer | Hello, My name is Arthur Spencer. I am messaging you today to express my concern for the safety of my community. I was raised and currently reside in Salt lake City, Utah. My message for you is in regards to US Magnesium, they must not be allowed to continue depleting the Great Salt Lake. The Great Salt Lake is more than the name of my home town. It is a natural resource that contains its own ecosystem. The more water you allow US Magnesium to pump, the higher the salinity levels rise. The higher the salinity levels rise the more toxic the lake becomes. Making it incapable to sustain life. Brine shrimp, algae, and several species of bird rely on the lake for survival. We have a responsibility as a people to protect our homes community and environment. Not to mention the fact that due to decreasing water levels the lakebed is already exposed, and is now exposing us to toxins in the air. This is poetic in a way, we reap what we sow. So I am reaching out to you to ask that we begin to be more mindful and start sowing seeds of balance and preservation. Not only for the sake of the Great Salt Lake, but for our own sake and the sake of our children who inherit what we leave behind. Thanks for your consideration in these matters |
| 203 | Megan Hancock Salt Lake County Resident | As a born and raised citizen of SL County, I wanted to voice my monumental concern about the possibility of granting a permit to US Magnesium to further drain the Great Salt Lake. My household has drastically cut back on water usage to try and do our small part to help the valley's water supply the past few years. I know many of my county neighbors have also done as much as they can on a micro level and we have a great deal of stress about the neverending drought and our future here. It's outrageous to me that after all of the scientific studies that have been released that show the toxic dust that can and will be spread across the valley in the coming years, that this permit would even be considered. Our long-term and ecological health is much more important than whatever money could be made on the short-term in this |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | deal, if this permit moves forward there won't be any money to be made anywhere in this valley. No one is going to live in a toxic death trap. Please deny this permit and instead work on coming together to do everything we possibly can to save the Great Salt Lake and our other very valuable, precious water sources. |
| 204 | Martin Gelman, MD & Sheila Gelman | With the lake drying out US Magnesium should not be allowed to divert more water to profit from the lake. We will become a dust bowl. |
| 205 | Jerilyn Holt | We cannot continue to put business/corp. interests before the interests of preserving our lake! The drying up of the lake is a disaster for our community that will destroy quality of life! No! To the magnesium application. A resounding NOOO!!! |
| 206 | Laila Hakkarinen University of Utah | My name is Laila Hakkarinen, and I am an Environmental Science student at the University of Utah. I write this on behalf of myself and the passionate University of Utah environmental studies students that are stewards of the Utah environment and specifically, the Great Salt Lake. The Great Salt Lake is in danger, I want you to say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem. Please note the dangers the Great Salt Lake is currently in. Scientists have already taken measurements of 19% salinity on the open water. Ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity levels persist above 18%. This increase in salinity is causing the lake's food services to be on the verge of collapse. The application of the of this project intends to bring lake levels down an additional 9 feet, which is detrimental. This amount of water is equivalent to water intake flow of 100,000 gallons per minute from the Great Salt Lake. It is required that the DWG protects the Great Salt Lake, as seen in the Class 5A designation: "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). Please see what great danger this magnesium poses. |
| 207 | Annie Merrill Utah Resident | I was born and raised in this beautiful state. I have watched the Great Salt Lake diminish in a shocking way over my 37 years of life. I am very worried about the health of Utah's ecosystem. I feel very strongly that we need to do everything in our power to fix the damage that we as humans have caused to this beautiful land. I worry about the effects on the health of the people, plants, animals, and air quality. Please consider the land is living and provides for us in so many ways that we take for granted. Please do not let business and money be more important than the health of our land and people and all the living things. I would like to voice my concern that allowing u.s. magnesium to pump water out of the lake is very harmful, inappropriate, and negligent. Please do what is right for our land. I'm so worried about the effects of our choices on future generations. |
| 208 | Kim Hall Salt Lake City Resident | I'm writing to you today to express my concerns about U.S. Magnesium's request for permits to lengthen their intake canals. I am a fourth generation Utahan and take pride in the incredible environment the State has to offer. It saddens me to watch the impacts of corporate greed and climate change make such a lasting impacts on the land that I call home. The Great Salt Lake is at its lowest level ever and hence is creating uninhabitable environments for everything from brine shrimp to migratory birds. If the permit for US Mag is approved those habitats will be irrevocably altered. The salinity of the lake is already at an all time high of 17%. Dredging the lake to install canals that will remove up to 100,000 gallons of water from the lake PER MINUTE is NOT an option that supports the people of Salt Lake City. It can only lead to devastation of an incredibly unique ecosystem. In college I had the opportunity to teach elementary students about the ecology of the lake. Taking them out on the lake to explore the brine shrimp lifecycle and teach them about the importance of a balanced ecosystem for all species, all the way up to humans. I implore you to not take this away from our future generations. |
| 209 | Danielle Paterson | I am an outdoor educator. I have a degree in outdoor science and environmental education. I have worked around and explored many areas of the Great Salt Lake and the west desert. I have 40 years of experience around the Lake and was hired in 2005 by the EPA and the Justice Departments to gather Snowy Plover eggs around Mag Corp's waste ponds to be analyzed by the Department of Fish and Wildlife. What we learned from those eggs should be of great concern to all communities living near and around the lake and the greater metropolitan areas of Ogden and Salt Lake City. All of the six Snowy Plover embryos were dead and riddled with Polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBS) which are highly carcinogenic chemical compounds. The US Magnesium site is considered one of the most toxic sites in the world. Ground water studies also have revealed these substances are leaking deep into the ground water. This company is uniquely regulated because they are one of only a few magnesium producers in the world. In other words, they are not held to the same degree of scrutiny of other environmental regulations because they support the manufacture of steel. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>In my opinion, it has been an issue that most Utahans have not been privy to. The company has been held accountable many times to lawsuits and fines, only to file bankruptcy and morph in a new company to avoid the lawsuits filed to them. Why on earth should we risk the future of our groundwater, air quality and collapse of an ecosystem to fuel this nefarious company? Please do not grant US Magnesium to acquire these two new canals! Our GSL is on the brink of catastrophic, ecological collapse due to the rise in salinity. Scientist have been warning this for several years, that once salinity levels reach 18% and above we will lose the microbialities and the ecosystem will collapse. These unique homes are of great importance to all the life in and around the GSL, the brine shrimp, the algae, the brine flies and all the magnificent species of migratory and resident birds that rely on the GSL to live. The Department of Water Quality is responsible to maintain the class 5 designation for Gilbert Bay. They are responsible for the water quality for the lake. This designation alone should warrant a NO to the permit to US Magnesium!!!I feel a bit resentful when we as citizens are asked to cut back on water use when this proposal will take 100,000 gallons per minute out of the GSL and lower the Lake by 9 feet. The lowering of the lake will create high salinity. The toxic dust, of arsenic and other extremely toxic chemicals will blow right into our city affecting environmental health and air quality. Let's quit letting US Magnesium determine what could become the dead ecosystem of the once GREAT Salt Lake! And, create the possibility of a TOXIC Wasatch Front!</p> |
| 210 | Hilary Siberman Utah Resident | <p>As a Utah resident I am extremely concerned about the state of the great salt lake and its record low levels. I am concerned for my health and the health of my child due to the exposed dry lake bed and the toxins contained within . I am concerned for the effects this will have on migrating birds that count on the brine shrimp and refuge the lake offers during their migration Great Salt Lake is at the lowest level ever recorded and is on track to continue receding until winter rains come in November. The lake is d(r)ying because too much water is being taken out. A terminal lake, GSL has four inlets that flow in and none that flow out. Not enough water is reaching the lake body, and after decades of taking more water than could possibly be returned, thousands of square miles of lakebed now lie exposed, creating a dustbowl full of toxins that blow across the Wasatch Front. Over the last century, the Wasatch Front has become a hotbed of some of the most devastating extractors and polluters in the country, and many of us have no idea they are our neighbors. Within just a few square miles of each other stand U.S. Magnesium, the Kennecott Smelter, and the Kennecott Copper Mine. These companies have claimed titles of worst air polluter in the country, the tallest structure west of the Mississippi (constructed so toxins that are emitted rise a few feet above the federal guidelines, before settling into the familiar valley inversion), and one of the largest excavations and open pit mines in the world. The legislature has been selling our future to extractors for decades. Every year Utah sees more days topping the charts for worst air quality. The time of extractors hiding behind curtains of toxic haze is over. Now is your chance to say NO to U.S. Magnesium. U.S Magnesium is a major contributor to lowering lake levels. In a typical year, they extract more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. They intentionally evaporate away more than 40 billion gallons of water a year to turn a profit for a few billionaires and the military industrial complex – all this while millions of pounds of chlorine are spewed across thousands of acres of lakebed. U.S. Magnesium recently applied for permits to lengthen their intake canals by several miles. The lake level is so low they aren't able to reach the water and want to dredge more than 100 acres of lake body to reach the water and continue sucking the lake dry. Because of how shallow the lake is, for every foot of elevation the shore line recedes, hundreds of square miles of lakebed are exposed. And U.S. Magnesium wants to take more water, while the lake is on the brink of collapse. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake's ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are “[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. All eyes are on the lake. The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of GSL and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem. It's time to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. At a minimum, DWQ must conduct a Level II Antidegradation review to ensure that US Magnesium's permit request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the division is required by law to protect. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake in order to ensure the protection of the Lake's beneficial uses. (Attachment DWQ-2022-030034)</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 211 | Abby Barry | I'm writing as a mother and resident of the salt lake valley and am urging you to not allow the US magnesium company to increase usage of our great salt lake water. The lake is at a critically low level already that has dangerous ramifications if it continues to decline. We need to preserve the delicate ecosystem and the only way to do this is through protecting it from over usage. |
| 212 | Miranda Newsome | US Magnesium must not be allowed to use more lake water from the Great Salt Lake. The water levels are already extremely low and among other concerns as concerns that the reduced water will increase the salinity, making the lake incompatible with brine shrimp and affect the entire ecosystem. Giving US Magnesium a permit is extremely short sighted at the detriment of the critical environment in Utah. |
| 213 | Dee Munson | I'm writing to you to ask you to please say NO to US Magnesium's request to extend their intake canals. The Great Salt Lake is dying; literally DYING. The water level is the lowest it's ever been and we all need to start doing whatever we can to save it, to say NO to those who take from it. As the level of the Lake drops, the salinity levels increase. The current level of 19% is already too high and is destroying the Lake's ecosystem. The brine shrimp aren't surviving, the algae is dying and millions of migratory birds feed on those food sources. Also, the exposed lake bed has toxins in it that blow around and contribute to our air pollution. As the Lake gets lower; more lake bed is exposed and more toxins are in our air. This frightens me! If for no other reason than our own personal health, please say NO. As an individual; there's only so much I can do: reduce my own water use, write letters, vote for people who support saving the Great Salt Lake, etc. However, YOU, the Department of Water Quality have SO MUCH POWER TO MAKE A CHANGE. Please say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. Governor Cox just said NO to any new GSL water rights, please join him by saying NO to US Magnesium. |
| 214 | Natalie Petersen | What will matter 50, or 100 years from now? What kind of world and legacy are we leaving for future generations? Are we making decisions based on far-sighted vision, generosity, and courage, or short-term expediency, greed, or fear? We have the power now, to make decisions that will provide future generations with the resources needed for healthy communities and lives. It is scientifically validated that the Great Salt Lake ecosystem is in serious trouble, with potentially disastrous consequences to the millions of people and creatures who rely upon it. State scientists have established that current salinity levels are at 19%, and ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity levels persist above 18%. This issue can no longer be minimized or ignored! As a state resident whose taxes pay for the Division of Water Quality, I expect the Division to take responsibility for the health of the Great Salt Lake. DWQ should deny the permit to US Magnesium which would further devastate the lake's ecosystem. That a permit to deplete the Great Salt Lake of precious water is even being considered at this time, is incomprehensible. The permit would create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife that DWQ is required by law to protect. Approving the permit to US Magnesium would be in direct violation of Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a), which states that the area is "...[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." I appreciate the dedication and hard work of employees of the Division of Water Quality (DWQ) and acknowledge that decisions surrounding issues like this are often challenging. I call upon the Division to rise above political complexity and demonstrate vision, innovation, and courage in response to this critical issue. So that we can say with full confidence, that we have done all that is within our collective power, to provide a promising and healthy legacy for future generations. Please deny US Magnesium's permit to further destroy the Great Salt Lake ecosystem. Many lives truly depend on it. |
| 215 | Joel Paterson Millcreek Resident | I live in Millcreek, UT and am a frequent visitor to the Great Salt Lake. We love to camp on Antelope Island, hike and birdwatch at various locations at the lake. The Great Salt Lake is a national treasure and an important ecosystem for migratory birds. The proposed permit should be denied for the following reasons: The proposal to extend the intake canals will contribute significantly to the lowering of the lake level by extracting 100,000 gallons of water per minute. We all know that as the lake level recedes extensive areas of the lake bed are exposed. The exposed lake bed dries and then is vulnerable to winds that blow toxic dust and over the most populous area of the State. The dust carries a tremendous amount of harmful chemicals that further degrade our worsening air quality. These hazards have been widely documented for years. The increase in dust also coats the snowpack in the Wasatch which leads to earlier runoff and less water returning to the lake. US Magnesium should be required to replace the water that it uses for its evaporation ponds. The lower lake levels are contribution to the imminent collapse of the Great Salt Lake |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | ecosystem. The salinity levels in the lake have exceeded the critical maximum of 18%. Also, lower lake levels diminish the ability of brine flies to thrive and reduces wildlife habitat, This combination is damaging to the migratory bird population and may push several vulnerable species into the ranks of endangered species. the proposed water diversions will segment Gilbert Bay and increase salinity and toxic concentrations of heavy metals within the Bay. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, that DWQ is required by law to protect under Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). Please deny the water quality permit request. Priority should be placed on the health of the Great Salt Lake and the surrounding ecosystems and communities rather than the economic health of US Magnesium. |
| 216 | Stephanie Colton Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing to you from the perspective of a new resident of Salt Lake City who is deeply concerned about the threats looming over the Great Salt Lake. When I had heard that there was consideration to establish a permit for U.S. Magnesium dredging that would violate the Class 5A designation to protect the wildlife that depends on the health of the lake, I felt a responsibility to voice my concerns. As a previous resident of Colorado, I am familiar with the threat to our water sources (i.e. the shrinking water levels of the Colorado River that subsequently keeps a large area of the American West alive). While the situation leaves us feeling helpless for the future, we must do what we can to reduce the threats to the ecosystem. While the Great Salt Lake is the reason for the incredible beauty and recreation in the surrounding area, this permit poses a threat that is much greater than a lack of powder days. As the lake shrinks, the salinity of the lake will increase; with an already dangerously high salinity of 19%, the ecosystem is already on the brink of collapse as the surrounding wildlife's food source from the Great Sale Lake depletes. This permit will only exacerbate the issue and ruin any chances of reversing the drought that we are already facing, as it is projected to lower the lake level by 9 feet.I ask that you hear me and the concerned citizens of the Salt Lake valley who have voiced their opposition to this permit and consider the ramifications that this will have on the place that we call home. |
| 217 | Jonathan Clark, MS PhD Student University of New Hampshire | I am writing to you to speak out against the proposal of US Magnesium to lengthen their intake pipes on the Great Salt Lake (GSL) in order to continue extracting water despite the water level of the GSL being at historic lows. The GSL has shrunk by 2/3 since the 1960s, hitting its lowest recorded levels this year as a result of rerouting of the water that feeds the lake. This has resulted in the GSL's salinity levels nearly doubling from a historic range of 9–12% to levels of 19%. Sustained salinity at this level kills the algae and shrimp that are fundamental to the lake ecosystem, which will eventually result in ecological collapse of the GSL. One negative impact of this on Utah residents will be a loss of hunting and recreational birding spaces, as the lake will no longer support migratory waterfowl. Additionally, drying of the lake poses a risk to human health, as toxic minerals in the now exposed lake sediment can become air particle pollution, increasing the risk of lung cancer and other respiratory issues to Salt Lake City residents. I ask that you please do not approve this proposal for the benefit of Utah residents |
| 218 | Suryaveer Singh | My name is Suryaveer. I've lived in Salt Lake City and Provo for the last three years. I'm writing to you because I'm concerned about the Great Salt Lake drying up, and what that might mean for people with sensitive respiratory issues, like myself. In 2017, I suffered spontaneous pneumothorax (my lung collapsed). Lung surgery left me with Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease. In other words, I experience chronic chest pains, shortness of breath, and coughing. I recently became aware of US Magnesium's plan to extend their intake canals deeper into the Great Salt Lake. I'm worried that this will increase the amount of heavy metals and toxic pollutants, worsening air quality as the Lake disappears. I'm concerned that when the Lake dries up, it'll kick up a lot of dust and we won't be able to filter out the pollutants in our air. Utah's air is already difficult for me to breathe, especially during winter. I love Utah; it's a beautiful state. I want to continue living and working here, but if the air quality continues to decline due to increased particulate matter, I fear I may have to move for my own health and safety. I have a bachelor's degree in Biology and Ecology. As a previous Avian Technician, I'm concerned with the increased salinity of the Great Salt Lake and how this will affect the ecosystem. A bottom-up trophic cascade in the Great Salt Lake will have devastating effects on the millions of birds that use the Lake during migration. Please decline US Magnesium's application as well as future projects that hinder the water quality of the Great Salt Lake. Please save our Lake so that wildlife and residents can continue to thrive along the Wasatch Front. |
| 219 | Tawna Halbert, ACMHC | I have lived in Ogden, Utah my entire life, and am currently 8 weeks pregnant with my first child. At 35 yrs old, mine and my husband's decision to bring a child into this world was not taken lightly. We are scared for the future, the thought of leaving them a toxic dust bowl.We must not trade our future for the profit of a few!“US |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | magnesium extracts more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. They intentionally evaporate away more than 40 billion gallons of water a year to turn a profit for a few billionaires and the military industrial complex – all this while millions of pounds of chlorine are spewed across thousands of acres of lakebed.” This has to stop. Please for my child’s future, and all of ours. |
| 220 | Brandon Root | Entering a comment for the record. Do not allow US Magnesium to further degrade the Great Salt Lake Ecosystem. |
| 221 | Irene Lysenko Great Salt Lake Rowing | We all recognize the importance of economic security, but in this unprecedented time of Great Salt Lake water loss, it is simply about priorities. The reason that the lake has continued to drop is that we have put immediate need over long-term health for a very long time. Now we are poised to reap the consequences if we continue on our current path. Governor Cox has paved the way by not allowing the issue of further water rights. We must follow suit by not honoring requests to drain more water from the lake itself. The answer is not never, but not right now while we are fixing our most pressing need, the health of the Great Salt Lake.Please say no to extending piping into the Great Salt Lake by US Magnesium. |
| 222 | Kristin Mellus Salt Lake City Resident | I love Antelope Island and the Great Salt Lake. As a lifelong resident of Salt Lake and a frequent Antelope Island visitor, it is clear the negative impact the dwindling lake has already had on the ecosystem. The proposed permit would be even more devastating to supporting survival of the brine shrimp as the lake salinity increases while collapsing the lake’s ecosystem. Diverting more water from the lake clearly is not the answer. Please say no to this permit before we see and experience the devastating effects of its approval. |
| 223 | Gabriella Hunter | US Magnesium must NOT be allowed to use more Great Salt Lake water...seriously, stop already with short term money making being more important than all the lives living along the Great Salt Lake. I know this letter won’t help but at least hoping you people have a speck of morality. |
| 224 | Dan Willems, Sr Salt Lake City Resident | As a resident of Salt Lake City, I am writing to comment on a Section 401 Water Quality Certification regarding US Magnesium’s permit to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake (GSL).I am against approval of this permit. The Utah Division of Water Quality must revise or abandon this Certification. The best available science indicates that impacts to the lake from this project will be devastating, long-lasting, and possibly irreversible. Granting approval of this project will cause or contribute to collapse of the lake’s ecosystem, the deaths of millions of birds, and very likely promote a toxic dust danger to millions of people living along the Wasatch Front. At a minimum, DWQ must conduct a Level II Antidegradation review to ensure that US Magnesium’s permit request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the division is required by law to protect. The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of GSL and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium’s plans to further devastate the lake’s ecosystem. It’s time for our leaders to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. |
| 225 | Emily Colt Salt Lake City Resident | Please, please , please, do not allow us magnesium to extend access to the the lake bed. The great salt lake needs protection. No more should we allow the kind of access to the lake that companies have. This is an environmental crisis we already have that is of absolute importance. Say NO to US Magnesium !! We can no longer put the wants of companies ahead of the health of our environment and communities. No more taking anything from our lake!! |
| 226 | Rebecca Sabo | Please deny US Mag’s request to dig further into the GSL so they can access more water. Honestly, the US Mag site needs to be shut down completely. They have created a wasteland of canals and evap-ponds and slag piles that may never be cleaned up. (What has been done with the Superfund monies??) The constant emission of chlorine into the air from that stack has tainted that area and the chlorine levels in the air at ground level often exceed OSHA standards. The chlorine also breaks down the metal structures and machinery at the plant causing an unsafe work environment. Many workers have been injured and even killed at that facility. USMag doesn’t even contribute meaningfully to the economy of the Salt Lake Valley. They pay late and file bankruptcy and leave local suppliers holding the bag. It’s time for them to shut down for good. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 227 | Dr. Gandhi Zapata | US Magnesium, a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore is once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster. Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake. |
| 228 | Kinda Alquatli South Jordan Resident | My name is Kinda and I am from South Jordan area and I am writing a public comment to save our great salt lake and stop US Magnesium from extending pipes to access our Great Lake. |
| 229 | McKenzie West | My name is McKenzie West. I am 27 years old and live in Saratoga Springs, Utah with my family. and I am very concerned about the U.S. Magnesium wanting to claim water from the Great Salt Lake. The Lake is at a critical low with the continued severe drought and increased populations using more of the water resources. The Lake is not regenerating enough to allow for the U.S. Magnesium to take more water. If leaders do not do anything about preserving the Lake, we will be in a situation with hazardous air particles from a dried up lake bed. Utah is already #1 in the country for worst air quality. Air pollutants will affect the health of the Utah people with neurological health or respiratory damage. U.S. Magnesium is already known for being one of the worst air polluters. U.S. Magnesium's plant at Rowley has the most pollutants of any single county in America. U.S. Magnesium taking more water out of an already drying up lake is dangerous and irresponsible. Now is not the time to think about industry, it is the time to preserve and heal The Lake we depend on to live |
| 230 | Anika Boyden | My name is Anika Boyden and I just wanted to reach out to you to express my concerns over the water permit that is requested by U.S. Magnesium to lengthen their intake canals by several miles at the Great Salt Lake. As a resident of Salt Lake County who has been born and raised here- the health of the Great Salt Lake is a shared concern by all residents of this county. I am writing to you because I am hoping you share my opinion on why it is so important to not allow water to keep being drained out of the lake at a rate which is completely unsustainable for it to naturally replenish. Specifically why it should be a concern for you as a member of Utah's Division of Water Quality- is because it is your duty to protect the water food-chain at the Great Salt Lake which is currently being destructed by the increased salinity of the lake which is caused by companies like US Magnesium who are planning to extract water at a reckless rate of 100,000 gallons per minute. I hope you can relate to my concerns and use your voice and power to protect Utah's Great Salt from further depletion and destruction. |
| 231 | Randy LaLonde Millcreek Resident | As a resident of Millcreek, I write to ask you to strenuously oppose US Magnesium's application to extend their intake canals into our dying Great Salt Lake. The salinity of the Great Salt Lake is already growing by the day as current diversion activities on the rivers feeding the Great Salt Lake have starved it of water. Increasing salinity will only further destroy the brine shrimp population that is a primary food source for over ten million migrating waterfowl that count on this food source. It will exacerbate air pollution on the Wasatch Front and diminish the snowfall to our snow sport economy and the recreational appeal of the State as a whole. The Utah Legislature has recently proposed a series of measures, like water banking and water right leasing, to get more water into the Great Salt Lake. Governor Cox has recently proclaimed that no new water diversions from the Great Salt Lake will even be considered. Yet, in the face of all this, US Magnesium wants to siphon even MORE water from the GSL, which runs directly counter to these goals? You cannot destroy a lake in order to save it! At a minimum, any allowance for US Magnesium to extend their canals in the Lake must be met by a rigorously enforced commitment from the company that they restore every ounce of new water that they suck out of the GSL. As it is, already US Magnesium pulls over 100,000 gallons of water every minute from the Great Salt Lake, more than several of our smaller cities combined! It's time to stop business as usual in the Great Salt Lake and force US Magnesium to act as an environmental steward of the GSL, and not as a destroyer of the Lake. It's time to say NO to their permit application. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 232 | Emma Sikker | <p>I am a lifelong resident of Utah. I am close to finishing college and I am getting married soon! However, the city I have called home for my entire life may not be habitable for me and my future family. This is due to the exploitation of our land and our lake. If you continue to exploit the land, you will destroy this state and lives in it. This is life or death. Don't fuck it up. Here are some reasons why we MUST SAY NO to U.S. Magnesium and make moves to repair our damage, rather than make it worse! Density of the brine fly larvae is 10x higher on microbialites than it is elsewhere in the lake. The microbialites are essentially bird food factories in the lake. As the lake levels lower, microbialites become exposed and dry out. Brine fly larvae no longer have the microbialite mat to feed on and their numbers will be reduced. The water diversion will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, that DWQ is required by law to protect. Class 5A designation states: “[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). State scientists have already taken measurements of 19% salinity on the open water. Ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity levels persist above 18%. The impacts are anticipated to be so significant that several bird species that depend on the lake for food could become candidates for listing under the Endangered Species Act. The best available science shows that the lake’s food services are on the verge of collapse due to increases in salinity. The application intends to bring the lake level down an additional 9 feet. Application states: “[T]his project represents the first phase of a potentially multi-phased approach to establish long-term reliability for the Applicant to access water from the Great Salt Lake. If needed, the phased approach would include continuation of both facilities to a canal bottom elevation of 4180 feet[.]” This is an incredible amount of water they plan on removing. The application states: “The project would maintain a conveyance of lake water intake flow of 100,000 gallons per minute from the Great Salt Lake.”</p> |
| 233 | Jake A | <p>Reaching out on behalf of myself and others who are of a like mind: I don’t believe US Magnesium should have access to more of the Great Salt Lake’s water. The lakebed is at a dangerously low level for the brine shrimp that live in it, which is part of a dwindling ecosystem that keeps indigenous flora and fauna healthy. The lake level is already low enough for arsenic rich dust to be blown into our atmosphere. On that note, US Magnesium is a top polluter in the US and contributes drastic amounts of pollutants into our air already (which shows up in our inversion smog alongside lakebed dust). Granting more water rights to this company while asking private citizens to cut their water use is a gross misuse of our natural resources. Industrial and agricultural use of these waters makes up the lion’s share of the GSL water being diverted. This needs to change. My dearest hope is that we can deny wasteful water use of this kind and protect public health and natural resources going forward—as a population.</p> |
| 234 | Missy McGlone Utah Resident | <p>Please do not let the changes propose by US Magnesium. The lake is to critical to ignore!!</p> |
| 235 | Brooke O Walterson Utah Resident | <p>Hi, my name is Brooke Walterson, and I have been an Utah native for just about my whole life. Throughout my 16 years of living in Utah, I have lived in Kamas and Park City, and I have experienced great beauty and clean resources. Now, as a sophomore in college attending the University of Utah, I am just now coming to terms with the dangerous environment that this beautiful city is beginning to face. I have seen the distinct difference of air quality when driving down from Park City into Salt Lake, and I now see that the main contributors are these large corporations that are now my neighbors. Not only is the air quality a jarring problem, but so is the amount of water that is used by these companies. As our state continues to use more and more water, the effects of this is showing up in multiple ways: Hotter summers, unhealthy air pollution (also caused by the Great Salt Lake drying up), disappointing ski seasons, and more are beginning to show every day. I am afraid that if we continue to use up all of our natural resources, there will be no future for us to live in this beautiful state. But, as a 20 year old, I am finally glad that I am able to use my voice to help change that. I am sending this email to use my voice as a young female advocating for my community, the planet, and my future. Please, do not allow U.S. Magnesium permit to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. The effects of allowing this permit to pass are too dangerous for our fragile ecosystem that is already beginning to decay. Please listen to the voices of those living in these communities that care about the future of our planet, and make the conscious decision and keep Utah healthy.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 236 | Kay Denton Salt Lake City Resident | Thirty Years ago, I learned to row in the Great Salt Lake. Twenty years ago, a few of us formed Great Salt Lake Rowing both to encourage the sport among all age groups and to introduce the public to the wonders of the lake. Two months ago, some club members wrenched the docks from the launching area, now a mudflat. Today's Salt Lake Tribune headline reads: "Brine Fly Loss Signals Collapse of Great Salt Lake Ecosystem". MagCorp's proposes to lengthen its canals resulting in siphoning 100,000 gallons of water each minute. The lake doesn't have that to give. It is irresponsible and dangerous to the quality of life for all living beings in the Salt Lake Valley. I realize that MagCorp is a major contributor to Utah's economy, but it also has a responsibility to ensure the health of the lake, the species that depend on it and the general public. Now, if ever, is NOT the time to undermine the increasing fragility of the lake any further. I strongly oppose this permit and ask that the Utah Division of Water Quality deny this request. |
| 237 | Derrek Draper | The great salt lake needs more water to sustain its ecosystem. Just say NO to US Magnesium requests for diversions. In fact, please say NO to ALL future diversion requests. We need to restore the lake, not drain it dry. |
| 238 | Jordan Herman, PhD Conservation Biologist | I am a Salt Lake City resident who migrated here from the Great Lakes Region over a decade ago to study biology at the University of Utah. Like so many of my community members in the valley, I am an outdoor enthusiast who is highly invested in the preservation of the natural areas and resources that make Utah incomparable to other states in the West. One of our greatest resources, and our beloved namesake, is the Great Salt Lake. I don't need to remind you that the GSL is on the verge of ecosystem collapse, the cost of which will be devastating to bird and human populations alike. Utahns are flipping their lawns, taking shorter showers, and voting on water conservation measures to protect the lake, but our effect on the lake is almost negligible compared to agriculture and Magnesium draw, and we can only do so much. US Magnesium has taken more than its fair share, and enough is enough; we can't keep selling out one of our most precious resources to Industry. Now that the collapse of the GSL is on the national stage, this is an important moment for Utah to take a stand and be a leader in the conservation of resources in the West. The lake has nothing left to give, and we need our water managers to protect it at all costs by saying NO to US Magnesium's request to extend their intake canals. Your power to make change is greater now more than ever. Please wield it responsibly. |
| 239 | Geof Herman | I just learned that US Magnesium wants to enhance its methods of removing water from the GSL. That tremendous resource (GSL) and the crucial environment it provides for particular native species is in decline. Steps should be taken to protect it, not injure it further! I feel we are at a crucial juncture here as regards the health of the GSL, its connected ecosystem and the surrounding human population. If the conditions worsen, the GSL Basin could very well experience an ecological disaster in the very near future! My only child lives in SLC; I want her and her community to not suffer the fallout of a devastated GSL. It is an easy call: halt any efforts to extract more from the Lake and begin enforcing restrictions and protections on its behalf. Decisive action is needed now. Please act! |
| 240 | Luke Kimmel | I am a Salt Lake City resident who migrated here from Northern CA in 2015 to enjoy the natural beauty our state has to offer. Like so many of my community members in the valley, I am an outdoor enthusiast who is highly invested in the preservation of the natural areas and resources that make Utah incomparable to other states in the West. One of our greatest resources, and our beloved namesake, is the Great Salt Lake. I don't need to remind you that the GSL is on the verge of ecosystem collapse, the cost of which will be devastating to bird and human populations alike. Utahns are flipping their lawns, taking shorter showers, and voting on water conservation measures to protect the lake, but our effect on the lake is almost negligible compared to agriculture and Magnesium draw, and we can only do so much. US Magnesium has taken more than its fair share, and enough is enough; we can't keep selling out one of our most precious resources to Industry. Now that the collapse of the GSL is on the national stage, this is an important moment for Utah to take a stand and be a leader in the conservation of resources in the West. The lake has nothing left to give, and we need our water managers to protect it at all costs by saying NO to US Magnesium's request to extend their intake canals. Your power to make change is greater now more than ever. Please wield it responsibly. |
| 241 | Ryan Rombough | I'm writing to implore you to say NO, US Magnesium should NOT get a permit to dredge out canals to get to the Salt Lake to continue to siphon off more water. We cannot afford to continue to use up more water in these dire times. Please protect our ecosystem! |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 242 | Lauren Nelson Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Lauren Nelson. I am a resident of Utah for the past 24 years, currently living in SLC. I would like to comment on the proposal for US Magnesium 401 Permit. As you probably know our lake is already in a fragile place. Even national news is commenting on the decline of our lake bed! It doesn't make sense to keep taking water and resources from it. I have linked the article below for reference. I would request that you do not let this permit pass through so we can preserve our beautiful lake. Our air quality is already terrible, allowing this permit will only exacerbate this issue and so many others as well. |
| 243 | Bekka Carlson Salt Lake City Resident | I am a full time resident of Utah and a small business owner in downtown Salt Lake City. I'm concerned about Utah resources and our local economy if water and air continue to be an over-utilized resource in our community. Pragmatically, this permit appears to damage the ecosystem of the Great Salt Lake by increasing the salinity for the water and lowering the ability for the necessary water to benefit the ecosystem of the state. If US Magnesium has a plan to preserve or replace the water maybe there is an equally beneficial opportunity, but that plan would look a lot different than the one currently proposed. |
| 244 | Joey Howell | I would like to express my deep concerns about the proposed plans for US Magnesium to expand its intake canals and consume more water from the Great Salt Lake. I'm sure you are well aware of the dire situation the GSL is in and the thought of draining even more for industry while so many citizens are asked to conserve puts a terrible knot in my gut. I cannot imagine it is in any Utahns interest to put industrial profits over the health of our lake, wildlife and citizens. I'm sure there is a lot of pressure from both sides but please consider the future of not only the GSL but of all living things here, human and animal. Thank you for your time and I trust you will fight the good fight. |
| 245 | Alex Gennett Salt Lake City Resident | As a resident of Salt Lake City for almost a decade, I have watched the Lake shrink at an alarming rate in my relatively short time here. The fact that you are even considering allowing more abuse of our dying lake is quite disturbing, frankly. The death of the GSL will literally be the death of the Salt Lake Valley as a livable area. The matter is now widely known on a national stage and it's about time we fight to keep this city alive. As residents of this beautiful state, it is our duty to be stewards of the natural order, and to allow US Magnesium to dredge our lake and steal its resources is a blaring example of corporate greed and shortsightedness. I hope you can see past whatever monetary incentive you may have in front of you and keep the well-being of an entire city/region in mind. |
| 246 | Talmage Sanders | I would like to comment that I don't support US magnesium getting a permit to build intake canals. This will deeply harm an already harmed and fragile lake. Great salt lake is a wonder and should not be exploited. It is deeply important for wildlife, environment of Utah, etc. |
| 247 | Judy Brooke Larsen Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Brooke Larsen. I grew up in Salt Lake City and am writing first and foremost because I love my home and am concerned I won't have a future here if the Division of Water Quality approves US Magnesium's request. I also have a master's degree in Environmental Humanities from the University of Utah and work to mentor the rising generation of environmental professionals who are deeply concerned about Great Salt Lake. The science for why this permit request should be denied is clear. We know Great Salt Lake cannot afford to lose any more water. The lake is already on the brink of ecosystem collapse with salinity levels at 19%. We know US Magnesium's request to lengthen their intake canals and take more water from the lake will increase salinity and the concentrations of heavy metals, threatening the food chain for water-oriented wildlife that you by law are required to protect. In addition to the science, though, this is also a culture problem, and Director Andrea Kilbane and the Division of Water Quality, you have the opportunity to be part of ushering in a new culture that protects the lake for present and future generations. In the humanities, we examine our histories to understand the present and create a better future. I can guarantee you history will not look at you fondly if you approve this permit that will have devastating consequences for the water quality of Great Salt Lake and threaten all life--human and more than human--in this region. We can not just continue with business as usual and act as if we can engineer ourselves out of this crisis one day. As my friend Darren Parry, the former Chairman of the Northwestern Band of the Shoshone Nation, says, "All the science in the world is not going to make up for our selfish behaviors." We've been polluting, extracting, and exploiting Great Salt Lake for over a century. She has been protecting us from ourselves, and now as she sits at the brink of ecosystem collapse, she is telling us no more. Will you listen? It's time to say no to the selfish, short-term interests of US Magnesium and protect Great Salt Lake. |
| 248 | Anne Collier Salt Lake City Resident | The shrinking of our beautiful Salt Lake is now <u>national news</u> , and it's breaking our hearts, harming water quality as well as the fragile lake ecosystem and migratory birds relying on it, and threatening the wellbeing, both physical and economic, of us human inhabitants as well. As long-time homeowners in Salt Lake City, where we |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | moved in 1997 to raise our two children in a beautiful environment, my husband and I <i>urge</i> you to stop US Magnesium's plans to further drain the lake. We simply can't let any entity, no matter how big a corporation, help turn the Great Salt Lake into the next Owens Lake of California. We profoundly hope your Division agrees. Because we know from many academic and news sources – local and national – that US Mag's request for a permit to dredge more lake body would negatively affect the habitat and thus food for migratory birds, air quality for Wasatch Front residents and ultimately snow levels, drinking water, the ski industry and the economy. |
| 249 | Karina Kirk Salt Lake City Resident | Hello, my name is Karina Kirk, and I'm contacting you to voice my opposition to the permit that would allow US Magnesium extend their canals further into the Great Salt Lake. I'm a Utah native, and recently purchased my first home in the Salt Lake City area. As a millennial (generation Y), this accomplishment did not come easy, but I'm excited to settle my roots and begin starting my own family. Unfortunately, one of the biggest concerns I have for my future family is that we (Utah) won't have resources available for my children by the time they are ready to start a family of their own, or that toxic lakebed dust will make Salt Lake City unlivable in the near future. The Great Salt Lake, arguably our biggest resource, is in critical danger. To make matters worse, we suffer from some of the worst air pollution in all of the nation. It is time to start protecting life, future, and growth. We can not continue permitting heavy polluters to operate within our state, and we absolutely don't have the water resource to sustain US Magnesium's unquenchable thirst. The take aways, like many Utahns I am a skier, hiker, and a person who suffers from asthma because I was raised in Utah. I love my state and want to raise my own family here, but only if it is safe to. Please listen to the citizens who live here, rather than the manufacturing companies who exploit our most precious resources. Allowing US Magnesium to extend their canals would only further exacerbate our shrinking lake, and increase our already terrible air quality. We must do everything we can to save our beautiful, and keep Utah liveable for the next generations. |
| 250 | Lucas Moyer-Horner Salt Lake City Resident | I think it's a bad idea to let US magnesium take more water from the Great Salt Lake. The lake is already at very low levels and extracting more water will only exacerbate the problem |
| 251 | Danielle Moriondo | My name is Danielle Moriondo and I'm a resident of Salt Lake City. I vehemently do not support US Magnesium's request for a permit that would require using more water. Lest we forget, the Great Salt Lake is a fragile ecosystem that is already on the brink of devastation. It cannot afford to lose more. Please prioritize the aquatic community and the one that surrounds it over profits. Please vote no. |
| 252 | Ashely Raymond | The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of GSL and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to further devastate the lake's ecosystem. It's time for our leaders to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. Please do not issue this permit. |
| 253 | McKenna Andersen Student University of Utah | I am a student from the University of Utah and I have learned a lot about the Great Salt Lake and the situation regarding its water loss. I am concerned with US Magnesium's request to lengthen their intake canals in order to take more water from the lake. The result would be the Salt Lake lowering another 9 feet. I ask that you deny these permits to protect the Lake ecosystem and everyone living in Salt Lake. The loss of water will cause the salinity to rise which will make the lake too salty for brine shrimp to live, and the entire ecosystem could collapse. As the lake shrinks, the exposed areas containing toxic chemicals, are blown into Salt Lake City and cause health issues. My mother and my sister suffer from asthma and if the air quality gets worse they will need to relocate. Utah has enough issues with air quality, this needs to be prevented as soon as possible |
| 254 | Dr. Gary Hedlund | I am writing to express my great concern over the possibility that US Magnesium may be granted a Section 401 Water Quality Certification to extend currently established effluent canals into the Great Salt Lake. With evidence of the continuing shrinking of the lake's water volume and collapsing fragile ecology, please hold off on granting this Section 401 certificate until an in-depth environmental assessment can be accomplished by an independent body. |
| 255 | Gavin Bateman | I am a concerned Salt Lake City resident and Urban Ecology student at the University of Utah urging you to refuse the proposed extension of the two Great Salt Lake intake canals for US Magnesium. The extension will dredge over 100 acres of lakebed and pull an estimated 100,000 gallons of water/minute from our already-dangerously-dry lake. This will contribute to more of the lakebed being exposed to the wind, kicking up air pollution, including toxic arsenic dust, that will inevitably |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | cause drastic health problems for the valley and beyond. It will contribute to increasing the salinity of the lake, endangering the precarious local ecosystem, including the millions of birds that rely on the lake for survival on their migration paths. US Magnesium already has a history of causing large environmental damage, and is currently responsible for the creation of a Superfund site due to their toxic waste dumping-- don't let them make things even worse. Any entity that takes water from the lake must be required to at least return the same amount to the lake, to halt the dramatic shrinking of the lake, as a baseline standard. The Department of Water Quality must stand up for the health and safety of Utahns and the environment by stopping US Magnesium from draining our lake even drier. Do not allow a company's hunger for profit to strip Utah of one of its greatest treasures. |
| 256 | Teresa Rands | Please say no to U.S. Magnesium's plan to destroy the Great Salt Lake. U.S. Magnesium has applied for permits to lengthen their intake channels by a few miles so they can continue to withdraw water out of our Great Salt Lake. Our lake has already shrunk significantly from all the water we divert and take out of the lake. We need to stop this, not allow for more water to be taken. Less water will increase the salinity of the lake which the brine shrimp will not be able to survive soon. With the devastation of the brine shrimp, the native birds that eat these shrimp will suffer. The drying of the lake bed also uncovers large amounts of toxic dirt and dust which will start blowing into the surrounding areas and causing illnesses. I am a student at the University of Utah and double-majoring in Environmental and Sustainability Studies and Political Science. I care deeply about the health of our society and environment. The short-term economic benefit that this permit will not outweigh the massive cost this will bring to our future. If this permit is accepted, the health of our people and environment is on the line, which will cost our economy and society a fortune. So please say NO to U.S. Magnesium. |
| 257 | Tom Price | I am opposed to permitting additional draws from the GSL due to the negative impacts on natural resources. The lake is at its limit, it's time to protect it. |
| 258 | David Osokow | Please reject the permit for US Magnesium. This will decrease the water quality in the GSL and increase salinity. I live on the west side of SLC and my neighborhood is right on the front lines of any negative impacts from the declining health of the great Salt Lake. Please protect the lake and the people who live in the surrounding environment. |
| 259 | Pat Annoni | PLEASE say NO to US Magnesium's plans to further devastate the lake's ecosystem!The Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach for the health of GSL and of our people! |
| 260 | Skyler Elliot Casey Salt Lake City Resident | I'm a SLC resident and I'm very concerned about the troublingly low levels of the Great Salt Lake and what that means for our air quality and public health. Now hearing that US Magnesium wants a 401 permit to continue diverting 100,000 gallons per minute away from the lake I'm worried we are not willing to protect the lake. I'm not opposed to the mining, but we need to prioritize the lake levels. If the lake dries up, the valley could be inhospitable. Please don't allow this permit unless the water usage can be offset or corrected. A net negative for the lake is unacceptable at this point. |
| 261 | Kelly Bergdolt Salt Lake City Resident | I am a Salt Lake City resident who has been here for over a decade and work in environmental engineering. I got these words from a good friend, but I couldn't say it better myself: "I am an outdoor enthusiast who is highly invested in the preservation of the natural areas and resources that make Utah incomparable to other states in the West. One of our greatest resources, and our beloved namesake, is the Great Salt Lake. I don't need to remind you that the GSL is on the verge of ecosystem collapse, the cost of which will be devastating to bird and human populations alike. Utahns are flipping their lawns, taking shorter showers, and voting on water conservation measures to protect the lake, but our effect on the lake is almost negligible compared to agriculture and Magnesium draw, and we can only do so much. US Magnesium has taken more than its fair share, and enough is enough; we can't keep selling out one of our most precious resources to Industry. Now that the collapse of the GSL is on the national stage, this is an important moment for Utah to take a stand and be a leader in the conservation of resources in the West. The lake has nothing left to give, and we need our water managers to protect it at all costs by saying NO to US Magnesium's request to extend their intake canals. Your power to make change is greater now more than ever. Please wield it responsibly." |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 262 | Kevin Box Salt Lake City Resident | Do not allow US Magnesium to draw more water from the Great Salt Lake. The ecosystem is on the verge of collapse. We need to protect this precious resource for the good of the entire Wasatch Front community; not to continue to sell it out to private interests. |
| 263 | Moudi Hob Salt Lake Valley Resident | My name is Moudi. I live in Salt Lake valley and have called Salt Lake home for seventeen years. I am writing to voice my concern on behalf of the Great Salt Lake and its increasingly high salinity rates. I am asking you to deny the US magnesium permit to lengthen their intake canals. This permit would directly effect the beneficial use of the bay by killing off the necessary food chain. Our collective well being precariously depends on the vitality of the lake. Thank you for considering my request to steward the life of the lake, and the many lives which rely on it. |
| 264 | Katina Curtis Murray Resident | My name is Katina Curtis. I'm a long-time resident of Salt Lake County and a business leader in our great city. I enjoy living in this amazing place and while I'm passionate about being involved in our community, this is the first time I've written a public comment letter; I believe the protection of our lake is so important that I feel compelled to speak up. I have been following the work of the Great Salt Lake Collaborative and recently read an article published in The Salt Lake Tribune this week discussing the "ecological collapse" of the Great Salt Lake, which has me very concerned. I am writing to ask you to deny the permits that U.S. Magnesium recently applied for to lengthen its intake canals by several miles. The increase in salinity and heavy metals that is a likely outcome of these lengthened canals would greatly decrease the water quality and have a significant negative impact on the beneficial use of Gilbert Bay. The lake is already in the midst of an environmental crisis and approving these permits will only further this crisis. Thank you for stewarding our great lake. I appreciate you taking the time to read and consider my comments. |
| 265 | Erin Lloyd Tooele Resident | Hello, My name is Erin Lloyd and I would like to express my concern over allowing US Magnesium to extract more water from the Great Salt Lake. It is already so low and allowing this company to reduce it by nine additional feet seems counterproductive to what everyone is trying to accomplish. I grew up, and currently live in Tooele, I have seen the lake at its highest as a child in the 1980s and now, at its lowest. When I was a child, I played on the shore and in the water that wasn't too far out and I think almost everyone has seen historical pictures of folks floating in the water around Saltair. All of that has now gone and I am concerned that it is gone for good. I am also really concerned about the protection of the necessary food chain for shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife. I have seen the multiple articles in the Salt Lake Tribune recently and the descriptions of increasing salinity is concerning along with the disappearance of the brine flies. We have a picture of my sister running along the shore where you can't really see below her knees due to the amount of brine flies, I haven't seen them thriving like that for a long time. They are disappearing due to the increased salinity but also due to the exposure of the areas where they reproduce because of the receding water. I would like to ask you to block the request from US Magnesium and allow the lake all opportunities to bounce back and to hopefully thrive in the future. Thank you for your time and attention to this opportunity to bring the Great Salt Lake back to life. |
| 266 | Sarah Buck Salt Lake City Resident | I am Sarah Buck, a friend of the great lake that our city is named for. I am concerned about the collapse of our ecosystems around our Great Salt Lake and specifically the salinity levels being recorded in the Gilbert Bay. The current salinity reading threaten the beneficial use of the bay and the general food chain. It seems obvious that we need to tend to our lake and not further exploit it for US Magnesium's business purposes. I am asking you to deny the permit requests and honor this body of water as more than a source of minerals. Thank you for being a steward of the lake and for providing a chance to speak for the Great Salt Lake. |
| 267 | Debbie Fetters Layton Resident | My name is Debbie Fetters. I grew up in the SL Valley and on the GSL as the daughter of the harbor master at the GSL Marina which is now the GSL State Park. I currently live in Layton Utah, just off Antelope Drive and have lived here for the past 26 years. I have a deep love for the GSL and have spent many years in my childhood at her shores and sailing on the lake and am now enjoying sharing my love of the GSL with my 3 young grandchildren. I deeply care about what's happening to the lake with it's receding shoreline. More specifically, my concern is for the increased salinity and water quality of the lake. The impacts are anticipated to be so significant that several bird species that depend on the lake for food could become candidates for listing under the Endangered Species Act. The best available science shows that the lake's food services are on the verge of collapse due to increase in salinity. I am specifically concerned that the US Magnesium water diversion will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife that the Division of |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>Water Quality is required by law to protect. The Class 5A designation states: "protected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife, including thier necessary food chain." Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6 5(a). I am asking you to deny and block the permits being requested by US Magnesium which intends to bring the lake level down an additional 9 feet. This project represents the first phase of a potentially multi-phased approach to establish long-term reliability for US Magnesium to access water from teh GSL. Scientists are consistently currently measuring the lakes salinity at 19%. They are saying there is a 2 year window to possibly save the algae, brine flie and brine shrimp by putting more water into the lake. Taking ANY more water out is only going to increase the salinity of the lake and decrease the water quality of the lake. Thank you for your consideration to block the permits requested by US Magnesium. The water quality of the lake matters so much to me. The life living in the waters and the life depending on the quality of the lake water is in your hands. Thank you for having the courage to deny US Magnesiums permit requests to take more water out of the GSL. I am deeply grateful for your dedication to the highest possible water quality for the GSL and all the life that depends on that water quality. On behalf of my now deceased father, who dedicated his life to the GSL, and on behalf of myself and my grandchildren, Thank You for doing your part to ensure the highest water quality of the GSL.</p> |
| 268 | Chloe Skidmore Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I'm writing to you as someone who grew up surrounded by the Great Lakes of Michigan. I was raised to understand the importance of loving and respecting bodies of water. While I deeply love living in Utah, I'm admittedly baffled by the state's general lack of caring for Great Salt Lake, which is not only vital in innumerable ways, but which is a treasured neighbor. As you know, Great Salt Lake is at a historic and critical low right now and we're already seeing the myriad consequences of that. Of course those consequences will get increasingly worse the more we allow the lake to be destroyed by our actions. US Magnesium's request to dredge additional canals into our already wounded neighbor is unconscionable. Allowing the permit would expose hundreds of miles more of dusty lakebed, it would mean losing an additional 9 feet (!!) of the already critically low water level. All for the sake of profit from mineral extraction! We cannot allow this to happen. The Utah Code already speaks of protections for beneficial use in Gilbert Bay -- from recreation to the rights of birds to live and have access to their food source. Their food source, of course, consists of brine shrimp and brine flies. US Magnesium's permit greatly threatens the water quality of the lake -- we're already seeing increases to 19% salinity in those areas, which is barely sustainable for the brine shrimp and flies. Less water will mean even higher salinity which will make it impossible for them to live. That, in turn, will make it impossible for the birds to live. Damaging that ecology will have huge ramifications. The consequences of US Magnesium's permit request are enormous for the Salt Lake Valley and Utah as a whole. Choosing to allow the permit to move forward would mean choosing to participate in the ecological demise of Great Salt Lake and this valley. Our most important job right now as stewards of this land we live on is to save the lake, not to contribute to its destruction.</p> |
| 269 | Emilia Wint Salt Lake Valley Resident | <p>i am a young person who has lived in salt lake valley for 6 years and things are finally starting to feel like home. this valley and the surrounding mountains are a place i've studied, fallen in love, ridden my bike, grieved many losses, eaten picnics in parks, taken care of kids, climbed and hiked, written and read poetry, and so much more. i care about the water quality here because water is a fundamental part of living and i'm terrified i won't be able to call this place home much longer because of how threatened the water quality is and the impact that has on all the surrounding life and bioregion. i am asking you to reject the us magnesium permit. it is clear allowing the further diversion of water will increase salinity levels, and that these increased levels are having devastating effects on all the surrounding life. thank you for taking the time to consider this comment - it is an act of love for the lake that extends in all directions, through time and space to include you and i and the generations ahead of us thanking us for being the ancestors who stepped up for their birthright of clean water.</p> |
| 270 | Erin Geesaman Rabke Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am writing as a mother, a concerned citizen, and a benefactor of the beauty and biodiversity of the Great Salt Lake Valley and its watershed. I love living in this beautiful city. I care deeply about being able to continue to live in this valley without compromising my family's health and well-being, and I want to imagine my child's viable future here as well. I care deeply about the state and fate of Great Salt Lake. I care about the increasing salinity as the lake dries. I care about the reduction in the life-giving qualities of this vital body of water for all of us who depend upon its thriving life. I care about our air quality. I care deeply about the lives of the ten million migratory birds who rely on this ecosystem and who will be negatively impacted by an increase in water salinity and a decrease in brine shrimp and flies. An increased water diversion will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, that DWQ is required by law to protect. Class 5A designation states: "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). The application from US Magnesium intends to bring the lake level down an additional 9 feet!!! This is not feasible or acceptable in any way. I am asking the Water Board to unequivocally and clearly deny US Magnesium’s application to further expand canals and to further remove water from the lake which endangers us all. Thank you for caring for the water quality in the lake and for doing your part to protect a viable future for all of us who depend on the thriving life of this water body, today and for generations to come. |
| 271 | Brodie Lower Salt Lake City Resident | I am a Salt Lake City resident who migrated here from Virginia. Like so many of my community members in the valley, I am an outdoor enthusiast who is highly invested in the preservation of the natural areas and resources that make Utah incomparable to other states in the West. One of our greatest resources, and our beloved namesake, is the Great Salt Lake. I don't need to remind you that the GSL is on the verge of ecosystem collapse, the cost of which will be devastating to bird and human populations alike. Utahns are flipping their lawns, taking shorter showers, and voting on water conservation measures to protect the lake, but our effect on the lake is almost negligible compared to agriculture and Magnesium draw, and we can only do so much. US Magnesium has taken more than its fair share, and enough is enough; we can't keep selling out one of our most precious resources to Industry. Now that the collapse of the GSL is on the national stage, this is an important moment for Utah to take a stand and be a leader in the conservation of resources in the West. The lake has nothing left to give, and we need our water managers to protect it at all costs by saying NO to US Magnesium's request to extend their intake canals. Your power to make change is greater now more than ever. Please wield it responsibly. |
| 272 | Keri Bryant Sandy Resident | My name is Keri Bryant. I live in Sandy Utah and grew up in Murray Utah. The GSL has been a source of wonder since I first was went out there with a young adult group where it captured our imaginations and became a place where we bring friends and family when they visit. We have had visitors from China even that we have taken there. Our guests also enjoy the snow which truly is “the greatest snow on earth” thanks to that GSL. It has been a hard thing to watch the lake level shrinking so drastically and hear of the fates of the brine flies and brine shrimp and the water fowl who depend on that eco system. The alarming and mystifying news to hear of US Magnesium’s application to take more and more and to know the facts of this outcome if they are allowed to do so is why I am writing you today. My concern with the water quality of the Great Salt Lake is that the salinity tests are now at alarming levels. Any further use by US Mag. cannot be allowed. This is and will threaten the beneficial use of Gilbert Bay and affect all the lives who depend on the lake being at stable levels. I ask you to say NO to US Magnesium’s permit. To honor the Class 5A protections required by law. I appreciate your dedication to the health and lives of all who depend on an intact GSL |
| 273 | Katie Goeckeritz Salt Lake City Resident | I am a Salt Lake City resident. I bought my house last year and I live in the Glendale area. I am worried about the future of the Great Salt Lake, and how losing the lake might affect me and my community. If US Magnesium is granted this permit to use more Great Salt Lake water this could have devastating effects on water quality, air quality, wildlife and public health. I urge you to not allow this to happen. If more water is taken from the lake this could lead to the lake drying up and we would have toxic dust storms. With lower water levels the water will become more salty. Less water and higher salinity will not only impact wildlife such as the brine shrimp, but it will decrease the water quality. It is the Department of Water Quality's job to ensure that the Great Salt Lake remains healthy. Please preserve water quality by saying no to US Magnesium's request for more water. |
| 274 | Kelsey Udy | I am vehemently opposed to US Magnesium's plan. Please protect the health of the Great Salt Lake from this abhorrent and outrageous plan. There are better solutions for obtaining magnesium that do not involve devastating an entire lake's ecosystem by increasing salinity levels. At the very least, if they are taking this enormous amount of water out, they should be required to put the same amount back in. There are endless repercussions that could occur if US Magnesium's plan goes through and the salinity of the water is increased, which includes but is not limited to: killing brine shrimp and algae, disrupting the migratory birds and therefore other ecosystems, exposing toxic dust along the Wasatch Front, and creating even worse air quality. Please choose to protect the lake and do not move forward with this plan. |
| 275 | Jeanmarie Todd Alpine Resident | Please do not allow the diversion of more water from the Great Salt Lake. The situation is already dire. |
| 276 | Annette McIntyre, MD FRCPC | WE are 2 very concerned citizens living in Salt Lake City, who request your utmost attention to the preservation of the Great Salt Lake! We owe it to ourselves, our grandchildren and generations to come to avoid further harm to the ecosystem and composition of the Great Salt Lake!PLEASE DENY US Magnesium’s permit request |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | Rob MacLeod, PhD Salt Lake City Residents | to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. As you are well aware, it has been scientifically shown that any further upstream water diversions of the Great Salt Lake will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, that DWQ is required by law to protect. Don't let us all down by contributing to the destruction of the Great Salt Lake by allowing US Magnesium to siphon away more of our future!! |
| 277 | Matt Jevtic | I would like to make two comments in concern to US Magnesium's request for water diversion. I am in opposition to their request and feel strongly that more water should not be diverted from the GSL, even if it affects the economy, their business or magnesium supply. I believe the local ecology should be prioritized so that the city stays sustainable in the long term. I am a homeowner and business owner and fear that an ecological disaster would greatly affect my home value and business should SLC become less sustainable than it already is. I also believe that our natural landscapes are our greatest asset in Utah and that a great eco-tourism industry is the best and most conservative long term plan for the city and state. We must make innovative and bold decisions now to preserve our future and enhance our reputation as a state of natural beauty and environmental progressivism. |
| 278 | Ira Kaufman Midvale Resident | I am writing due to my concern over the US Magnesium's proposal to build an extension to their intake canals to continue draining water from the Great Salt Lake (GSL) for their industrial purposes. This will continue to increase the salinity of the GSL above the critical 18% salinity maximum that has been studied and quoted as important to not go above for sustaining the brine shrimp population for our migratory birds. But also will continue to expose the dry lake bed to the toxic dust sediments that reside there, continuing to worsen our already terrible air pollution. This concerns me as a resident living with a terminal lung condition, who is unable to move away from the Salt Lake region. It is time to require this business to replace the water they are taking out with requirements that they purchase upstream water rights to the GSL to ensure that the health of the lake remains intact. The days of business as usual have come to an end. We cannot continue to expect the earth to recover from man's foolishness and greed. |
| 279 | Denise Morgan | I would like to request that the Division of Water quality deny the permits that have been requested by U.S. Magnesium. I am a lifelong Utah resident, research scientist at the University of Utah, and lover of the natural world. The Great Salt Lake is such a unique and beautiful place in our state. In fact, it is one of the places I most recommend for people to visit when they come to Salt Lake City. It is a place where you can go and feel like you are in another world. We all know the dire circumstances that the Great Salt Lake is facing. People all over the state are stepping up and doing their part to save the lake. My neighborhood is dotted with brown lawns. Beyond the investments of our state and local governments, the citizens of this state understand how important the lake is and are acting accordingly. We need our government agencies to step in and do all that they can to support us in our efforts! Denying this permit isn't just the right thing to do. It's your duty as the agency that is tasked with safeguarding our water supply. If this permit is issued it will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. At a minimum, you need to conduct a more thorough review of the impacts of this proposal. Beyond just the canals themselves. The canal's sole purpose is to draw water. Water that must stay in Gilbert Bay to prevent the complete destruction of the ecosystem and preserve the beneficial use of the bay. Please do the right thing. Work on the behalf of the people of this state. We need your help. Thank you for your consideration. |
| 280 | Valerie Yoder Kearns Resident | US Magnesium must not be allowed to use more Great Salt Lake water. I am a Kearns resident who is concerned about the future of Great Salt Lake's water quality and its impact on wildlife and our community. Great Salt Lake's water quality is already declining, and removing more water would increase the salinity and concentration of heavy metals in the remaining water. Higher salinity levels harm organisms and wildlife living in and around the lake: algae is dying and brine fly populations are shrinking already. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 281 | Justin Lizama Utah Resident | As a concerned citizen who loves the majesty of Utah I formally request that US Magnesium MUST NOT be allowed to use more Great Salt Lake water. Their increase of usage would make the lake too salty for brine shrimp to live. Why? Less water equals greater salinity equaling less life in the lake. The waterline is retreating, we need measures to increase volume. The Great Salt Lake is a major environmental component and symbol of area and needs its own rights protected. Please stand up for our environment. If nothing else the optics of allowing a business like this permission to do damage is a gateway to other industries ravaging our area. Send them to Oklahoma or Texas for that. We have enough air and water quality issues. At some point enough is enough. We need to conserve & protect our beautiful area. It truly is one of the most beautiful places in the world and we need to keep it that way. |
| 282 | Alex Aberman | The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of GSL and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to further devastate the lake's ecosystem. It's time for our leaders to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. The lake is struggling enough, climate is struggling enough. This initiative would be detrimental. |
| 283 | Anne Thistleton | I'm calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation! I have recently moved to Park City from drought stricken Cape Town. I am an American and excited to make Utah my new home. But I am worried. For perspective, in 2018 in Cape Town, we were forced to live on 13 gallons of water per person per day. Can you imagine the lifestyle changes that are going to be required when Utah has to allocate water? In order to prevent Day Zero (the day the taps ran dry) we didn't flush the toilets until absolutely necessary. We took 2 minute showers. We collected shower water to flush our toilets—and water our thirsty vegetables and herbs. We had bowls in our kitchen basins to save any water if we were rinsing something. We only washed our sheets and towels every 2-3 weeks. Dishwashers were only run when they were absolutely jam-packed. We didn't wash cars or water lawns or re-fill swimming pools, or use that garden hose for any reason at all. Given the amazing efforts of those living in the Cape Town metropolitan area, we cut our consumption in half and prevented Day Zero. And in the process we learned how valuable water is—and how essential it is that it be protected. The water in the Great Salt Lake must also be protected—it is an essential part of the world's eco-system—as I suspect you know very well. Specifically, my family and I are deeply concerned about US Magnesium's proposal to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. Please tell me that the Department of Water Quality understands their role in protecting the water quality (and quantity) of the Great Salt Lake. You know that the levels of the lake are at extremely dangerous levels: putting migratory birds and other wildlife habitats at significant risk; putting Utahns at great risk as toxic dust becomes airborne; putting the brine shrimp population at risk of dying out on the lake, and the list goes on. I expect you know it all too well. The state of Utah is working so hard to put water back into the lake; how could the Division of Water Quality even be entertaining ideas of allowing US Magnesium to drain even more water out? As you must know that action would significantly exacerbate the problem—and essentially throw away millions of the dollars that Utah government has allocated to lease back water to fill it. In closing, I liken the Great Salt Lake to Table Mountain in Cape Town—a national treasure . . . a physical feature worthy of a designation of a World Heritage Site. Sadly as Frank Bruni of The NY Times wrote: if we cannot save the Great Salt Lake how in the world do we think we can save the planet. I so want Utah to take the leadership and demonstrate to the world what it means to save the planet—by saving those parts of the planet in one's back yard. We have to get the levels of the lake back up before we can consider giving anyone any more water, which is what the US Magnesium proposal would do. Please know that we are here to help you—to give you the people's power to say “no” to US Magnesium. If there are more specific things we should be doing, please let us know. We want to back you up—to enable you to do the right thing for Salt Lake and the surrounding community, for Utah and surrounding states, for the US and the surrounding countries—for the planet. And to use my favorite expression—if not a bit slang and a bit risky as I could inadvertently offend you . . . "you go girl—you got this". And we are cheering you on! |
| 284 | Harold Young Ogden Resident | The reason I'm writing you today is that I just learned that you are taking public comment concerning US Magnesium being able to dredge canals to access more water from the Great Salt Lake. I was amazed that this was even something that would be considered with all the attention that has been given to how a dry lake will affect the state. I realize that your number one priority is to provide good water quality. With that in mind it is clear that you cannot allow the dredging to move forward. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake's ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Please do your job and provide clean water for Utahns |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 285 | John Nestler, MD | As a resident physician in the Salt Lake Valley I implore you to not allow further extension of the pipeline for the US Magnesium mining operation in the Great Salt Lake. As has become national news recently falling lake levels pose a threat both towards wildlife as well as humans in the Utah area due to the exposure of toxic dust.Please help keep our citizens safe and prevent further degradation of the lakebed. The economic benefit of this mine pales in comparison to the possible super-fund effect of having a lake that dries out. |
| 286 | Lydia Trettis Salt Lake City Resident | Hi there, a a long time lover of our planet and of the Great Salt Lake, please do not allow US Magnesium to divert what little precious water remains in the lake.It is a delicate ecosystem and we are trying to bolster it by saving what water is in the lake.Please save our planet and our Great Salt Lake. |
| 287 | Scout Invie Salt Lake City Resident | I wanted to write to submit a comment to you before November 14. Please do not allow US Magnesium to use more water from Great Salt Lake. I'm sure you know of the science of ecosystem collapse by now — every day I look in the Tribune, there are more stories and studies of brine flies not hatching, birds relocating, and I know taking more water from the lake will make the lake too salty for brine shrimp to live, which would drastically impact industry, as well as ecosystem. We are at a breaking point.I am an artist and writer living in Salt Lake City; I work at Torrey House Press and we are currently compiling stories of people who live along the shoreline of Utah Lake for an anthology titled 'Water Stories' — their guilt, fears, anxieties, and hopes tied to the lake. It's curious to me how as these lakes in our state and the overall American West are at stake, we as people connect with and relate to them more. My summer art project funded with a grant from Salt Lake Arts Council related my personal and human heartbreak to Great Salt Lake's state of shrinking and collapse. Even now, with threats every day of more diversions and the lake continuing to lie at its lowest level, I fight for her. She is me, and we are hurt — and hopeful. Please say no to US Magnesium's request to take more water from Great Salt Lake. Here is a link to my art project on the matter if you are interested. |
| 288 | Terri Martin Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing to request that the Division of Water Quality deny the request from U.S. Magnesium to complete dredging in the Great Salt Lake bed so as to lengthen their intake canals and continue drawing water from the Great Salt Lake. I have been a resident of Utah for 49 years and live in Salt Lake City. I have come to know the Great Salt Lake from being a frequent visitor to Antelope Island where I enjoy the inspirational beauty of the lake and the solace it offers. I have experienced great sadness and grief over the last few years as I have watched the lake levels drop and the health of the lake decline. But my concerns are more than personal. As the Division certainly knows, a healthy water level is essential for many reasons. These include: Protecting Wasatch residents from the toxic dust that will be carried from winds blowing across the dry lake bed. This is a very serious threat to public health. Protecting the feeding source of millions of migratory birds that depend on the Great Salt Lake for their survival. Protecting the brine shrimp population which is essential for the birds. <i>US Magnesium has benefitted from drawing water out of the Great Salt Lake for decades. It is time to put the protection of public health and millions of migratory birds FIRST – ahead of the profits of an individual industry.</i> It is not the job of the Division of Water Quality to protect individual industries. It is your job to protect water quality for the well-being of the public and the environment. It is my understanding that the proposed water diversion will create segmentation with Gilbert Bay and increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in the isolated segments. This decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for water-oriented wlldlife, that the Division is required by law to protect. Please act in compliance with this requirement.The best available science shows that the lake's "food services" are on the verge of collapse due to increases in salinity. State scientists' measurements show 19% salinity on the open water. Ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity persists above 18%. It is my understanding that the proposal would bring the lake level down an additional 9 feet. How can this happen without doing immense damage to the already dramatically diminishing ecosystem health of the Lake? With the current state of the late, any entity that wants to continuing diverting water from the lake or increase their diversion should be required to put an equal amount of water back in the form of water provided by upstream water rights being released into the Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for continuing or future extractive practices on the Great Salt Lake in order to preserve the Lake's beneficial uses. <i>Given the current critical condition of the Lake, we cannot continue business as usual. The economic benefit to an individual industry should not be placed before the well-being and health of the public and the migratory birds that rely on the Lake.</i> Please say NO to U.S. Magnesium's request to dredge the lake to extend their canals. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 289 | Rob Kent de Grey, Ph.D. | Hello, I wanted to briefly express that as an environmental scientist, I am strongly opposed to the permit request filed by US Magnesium in order to extend their intake canals on Great Salt Lake. With the lake in crisis, we can not continue to allow normal business operations that rely on extraction of water. Consideration of a issuance of a permit should not be undertaken without DWQ conducting a Level II Antidegradation review to ensure that US Magnesium's permit request does not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the division is required by law to protect. We can always allow the extension of canals in future, but we may not have future opportunities to save the lake, and if we take proper care of the lake, the construction of the canal extensions will not be necessary. |
| 290 | Robert Brown | I'm writing about the permit for US Magnesium to extend its canals further into the great salt lake. As an avid hiker, biker and backpacker, I'm increasingly concerned about our mountains getting sufficient moisture and the resulting increasing in fires and habitat loss if they don't. Our mountains are one of our greatest sustainable resources in Utah and they are dependent on the great salt lake in so many ways. Putter by the profits of one company ahead of the profits and people and environmental resources of all of Utah is extremely shortsighted. Why do we need so much magnesium? Largely it is because we culturally think that bigger is better. Our ability to produce magnesium cheaply only makes bigger products cheaper. These larger products, often larger and larger SUVs and trucks, are so much more environmentally worse than their smaller counterparts or public transit alternatives. Reducing their manufacturing cost at the expense of our actual sustainable resources will further make fighting climate change harder, continue to increase pedestrian and bicycle deaths due to these more dangerous forms of transit. We must look into the future and ask how permitting US Mag to get this permit will help Utah in any way achieve its required steps to have a vibrant and sustainable future. Making the most polluting and least sustainable things more expensive is a good thing. Unless US magnesium cannot make huge profits to ship to share holders until it must close down due to the ecological disaster it created then declare bankruptcy and require Utah tax payers to foot the bill. That is not what a water right is. The first people to use the water of the GSL productively were the first people to use the rain and snowpack that it generated as well as the natural resources that it produced. That is, all Utahns. As such, we need a sustainable level in the GSL to be the first and most important water right to Utah collectively, because it is a right that helps produce the water for all the other rights. |
| 291 | Jessa Kian Munion | I am a mother and business owner living in mill creek. Due to the pollution, the lack of concern about the toxic implications of draining water from GSL, I'm considering leaving Utah and closing my business. I'm devastated to consider that you would put industry before your citizens. You must deny US magnesium's request for more water: Density of the brine fly larvae is 10x higher on microbialites than it is elsewhere in the lake. The microbialites are essentially bird food factories in the lake. As the lake levels lower, microbialites become exposed and dry out. Brine fly larvae no longer have the microbialite mat to feed on and their numbers will be reduced. Water diversion will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, that DWQ is required by law to protect. Class 5A designation states: "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). State scientists have already taken measurements of 19% salinity on the open water. Ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity levels persist above 18%. The impacts are anticipated to be so significant that several bird species that depend on the lake for food could become candidates for listing under the Endangered Species Act. The best available science shows that the lake's food services are on the verge of collapse due to increases in salinity. The application intends to bring the lake level down an additional 9 feet. Application states: "[T]his project represents the first phase of a potentially multi-phased approach to establish long-term reliability for the Applicant to access water from the Great Salt Lake. If needed, the phased approach would include continuation of both facilities to a canal bottom elevation of 4180 feet[.]" This is an incredible amount of water they plan on removing. The application states: "The project would maintain a conveyance of lake water intake flow of 100,000 gallons per minute from the Great Salt Lake." DO NOT DO IT |
| 292 | Karin Wilson Park City Resident | I am writing because I am extremely concerned about the plan by US Magnesium to dredge over 100 acres of land by the Great Salt Lake. We have all been made aware of the danger caused by shrinking lake levels, which include the spread of toxic chemicals through the air, and a reduction of animal habitats around and in the lake. From what I understand, this will lower Great Salt Lake water levels by an additional 9 feet! I am the chair of the Mountain Regional Water District Administrative Control Board, and I am very familiar with the water challenges the state faces. Mountain Regional Water, in conjunction with the Weber Basin Water Conservancy |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | District has spent a considerable amount of time and resources creating a drought plan to address water shortages in the region. I also participated in a Zoom meeting with Gov. Spencer Cox last month where he discussed Utah’s commitment to saving the Great Salt Lake. I am outraged to hear that US Magnesium could be given the right to further reduce Great Salt Lake levels. It is a slap in the face to those of us who have worked extremely hard to address the water crises that our state faces.I hope that you, as a member of the Division of Water Quality will look deep into your heart, and realize approving this is the wrong thing for Utah. We are all people that will have to live with the decisions we make concerning water, our most precious resource. We owe this to our families, and our children. |
| 293 | Robert L. Jensen Ph.D. Professor of Medicine University of Utah | I strongly oppose the permitting of new dredging in the Great Salt Lake by US Magnesium. |
| 294 | Kaydee Wulle | I am opposed to Salt Lake City providing extended water rights to U.S. Magnesium. What was once known as Magcorp. Magcorp's toxic endeavors have already caused chaos on the wellbeing of the citizens of Grantsville, Tooele and Magna, polluting our land and people. The pollution they emit causes cancer, autoimmune diseases and so many other health issues. They were once known as the biggest polluter in the U.S.A by the EPA. I beg you too not give these mother fuckers the water rights they are requesting this company has led to the deaths of many people due to its cancer-causing pollution. If they are granted these extended water rights the brine shrimp ecosystem will collapse. Please don't let U.S. Magnesium guzzle the last remaining water in the great Salt Lake. They are part of the reason we will all be breathing in toxic dust once the Lake dries up. They are part of the reason the Lake is drying up. They've had enough of our water. |
| 295 | Spencer Heilner | The Great Salt Lake is such an important natural resource for Utah, but also the thousands of migratory birds that call it home.The writing is on the wall...the lake is in seriously poor health. Why should we accelerate or “seal the deal” of that demise by permitting such a wasteful use of its precious water. Please do not renew the permit for US Magnesium. So much harm has already been caused. If you do, you and all Utahns will look back on the day and say “what were we thinking?” Please don’t make this serious mistake. |
| 296 | Dr. Robert L. Judson-Torres, PhD | I am writing in response to the call for public commentary on the proposed permit by US Magnesium to continue drawing 100,000 gallons of water from the Great Salt Lake per minute. I urge you to deny this permit as is presently written. To give context, I am a scientist - on faculty in the Department of Dermatology at the University of Utah. Specifically, I lead a team of skin cancer geneticists at the Huntsman Cancer Institute, and every day we are hard at work determining the best strategies for saving the lives of Utah residents afflicted with these terrible cancers. I moved my family here despite knowing the risks to my family due to both the high rate of skin cancer (highest in the US) and the tremendous air pollution which leads to lung cancer and disease. I did so because I knew I and my team could help the most people here in Utah, and I had hope that the state would rally behind efforts to reduce air pollution and increase air quality. Imagine my dismay then, that years later, air quality is not even the most pressing environmental hazard any more – but rather, due to bafflingly short-sited and profit-driven decisions by the local and state governments - water quality is now more pressing. We all know the GSL is in terrible condition – that water levels are already too low and water quality already too poor to sustain its ecosystem. A substantial amount of the water loss is already due to US Magnesium’s irresponsible exploitation of the water, and the responsibility of this disaster is on their hands and on the shoulders of the local and state government official who have permitted them to continue.If the current requested permit by US Magnesium is granted, it will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay, increase salinity even more, increase heavy metal concentrations even more and result in substantially reduced water quality – not to mention the destruction of the GSL associated ecosystem and the tremendous deleterious effect on an already poor air quality. We already have a problem – the GSL is already at 19% salinity and it is known that if these levels persist, even at 19%, the ecosystem is going to collapse. Right now is when we need to be taking drastic measures to reduce the salinity, not increase it, as US Magnesium is asking to do. My understanding is that the magnesium produced by US Magnesium is of critical importance for our national economy and defense. I get that – which is why I’m urging you to say NO to the permit AS WRITTEN. The permit should require US Magnesium to rescue the water they extract (after all, it is the magnesium, not the water they are acquiring) and return not only every drop they remove moving forward, but also an additional percentage to make up for the damage they have already done. Will this be expensive? Yes. Will it cut into US Magnesium’s profits? Obviously. Will they still profit? Yes, they will still profit. Considering how many decades they have enjoyed bottomless profits with zero accountability to the |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | well-being of the rest of Utah, it seems perfectly reasonable they be held accountable now, even if it cuts into their margins. If they want to continue to profit by having near-exclusive rights to a natural resource, fine, just require they do it in such a way that they are not destroying the natural resource, decimating our water quality, and putting the health of our families, our patients, and all our neighbors at risk. Bottom line, if this state and city continue to make “profits over people” decisions, in a very short period of time, there won’t be so many people left. Just stop – say NO to this permit, and let US Magnesium know you’ll consider a permit in the future if it includes accountability for replacing the water they take. |
| 297 | Chanin Christensen Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Chanin Christensen and I am a SLC resident and I am concerned about the Great Salt Lake water quality. Please say “No” to the permit to dig a canal several miles further into the Great Salt Lake that allows US Magnesium to use more of the already limited supply of Great Salt Lake water. |
| 298 | Andrea Judson-Torres Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Andrea Judson-Torres. I am a public relations professional, a mom, an immigrant and a Salt Lake City resident. Living in this great city for the past three years, I've greatly enjoyed exploring all that Utah has to offer from the great outdoors to the incredible people that make this state great. As I think about raising my two daughters here (2 and 4 years old), beyond the standard parental worries, I find myself wondering about their future -- will they have clear air and water? I write to you today with the hopes that you can help support their future and the future of so many other Utah families by turning down US Magnesium's permit. What I hope you will consider as you make this decision is the following: US Magnesium plans to take 100,000 gallons of water a minute from our Great Salt Lake. This will bring down our already low lake by at least another 9 feet. This permit is going to impact water quality by raising the salinity level. State scientists have already taken measurements of 19% salinity on the open water. This level of salinity can cause the imminent ecosystem collapse if salinity levels persist above 18%. This permit will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay, increasing salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those areas. This will result in both the decrease of the water quality and in the destruction of the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife that your division is required by law to protect. Thank you for taking the time to read my comment and I thank you for the important work that you and your office do. |
| 299 | Joe Evans | I’m writing this to let you know that as a life long resident of the Salt Lake Valley I oppose the expansion of US Magnesium’s use of water from the Great Salt Lake. As many experts have already stated the record low levels of the lake and its increase salinity pose a real and imminent threat to the ecosystems surrounding the lake and to us as humans in the surrounding area. We should be striving to preserve the lake, not continuing to exploit its resources. Preserving the beauty and life of the lake should be our priority, especially given the damage already done by record breaking drought and water being syphoned off for agriculture. Our policies need to be forward thinking and driven by an approach to support sustainability as the population of the valley grows and should not be solely profit driven. |
| 300 | Lukas Smith Student University of Utah | My name is Lukas Smith and I am a first year student at the University of Utah in Salt Lake City, UT. The Great Salt Lake is not only a staple landmark in the state of Utah, but also a supporter of so much wildlife, as well as our own lives. With companies using and drying out the lake, particularly U.S. Magnesium, their primary goals are selfish and only benefit a minute subset of already wealthy individuals and the military industrial complex. Essentially, if you allow the U.S. Magnesium corporation to lengthen their intake canals, it would cause the Great Salt Lake, and it's inhabitants to no longer be able to function as they have been. The salinity of the water would increase to uninhabitable conditions that would make it impossible for the brine shrimp in the lake to continue on, eventually causing a full crash of the species in two years if something doesn't change with the amount of water being taken out of the lake. I know how important the Great Salt Lake is to Utah and its inhabitants. I had the opportunity to take an Organic Gardening class this last semester and learned so many great things, including the impact and benefits of the Lake. That being said, I encourage you very strongly to PLEASE reject U.S. Magnesium's request to lengthen their intake canals. It only has the potential to do harm, and no good. |
| 301 | Elizabeth A. Amriott Salt Lake City Resident | I’m calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality (DWQ) to temporarily or permanently reject issuance of the section 401 permit to US Magnesium re: a proposal to extend canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. I know that the division has received substantial public comment on this proposal/permit application and as a resident since 2005, I add my voice to oppose the extension of the US Magnesium canals for numerous reasons related to the health and viability of Great Salt Lake and the life, as well as quality of life, that depends on the lake. Aside from those broader concerns, and more specific to the content of the permit – and the divisions’ directive to evaluate impacts related to the work that would be granted by the permit (the dredging and construction process |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>that would allow water removal operations to continue) – I offer the following notes or requests related to portions of the permit notice that seem concerning (contrary to the mandate of the DWQ), incomplete, or unjustified (text from the permit notice copied below in italics):The dredged material would be discharged utilizing the aerial broadcast technique adjacent to the canals.I would request that an assessment of impact to environment/air quality and potential for pollution related to the aerial broadcast of lakebed sediment prior to granting permission for the dredging project to proceed (perhaps under R307-410 or other appropriate state or federal statutes related to the intentional aerial broadcast of pollutants and other elements, including heavy metals and arsenic). This may fall outside of the DWQ review – but it seems directly relevant and applicable to the granting of the permit. While the dredging will likely not create new pollutants in significant quantities – it is likely to disrupt current deposits and redistribute pollutants into the air and surrounding lands. This may also impact or change the composition (therefore quality) of surrounding waters, not as a polluted or contaminated liquid effluent into the lake, but as the aerial broadcast sediment re-settles into the lake, within a smaller area of water, hence concentrating the pollutants that may have already existed in the lake, but previously more dispersed and diluted when water levels were higher (relevant to the DWQ review).The dredged material applied will not exceed 2 ft in height in order to mimic the natural variations of the lakebed. This proposed project is intended to be the first step in a long-term process to ensure access to water from the Great Salt Lake.I would request a more robust assessment of the impact that the creation of additional barriers to waterflow within the lake, in the form of 2 foot high piles of dredged material, would have on existing water quality (salinity and biological composition), and whether these piles, added to the current contours of the lakebed, would further inhibit waterflow and prevent or impair the necessary re-constitution/re-saturation of microbialites and dry lakebed should water levels increase.The proposed application of the dredged material adjacent to the canals will not have a significant impact on the chemical, physiological, or biological composition of the existing lakebed. The project would not affect any threatened or endangered species or their critical habitat.There is no evidence provided for this statement, nor definition of ‘significant impact’. I would request that the DWQ request the details of this analysis and conclusions prior to making a decision on whether to issue the permit. I would also encourage the division to conduct an independent assessment to confirm or refute the assessment of the requesting enterprise, for due diligence and also because US Magnesium does not have a strong history in making sound or responsible judgements on the impact of their operations on the surrounding habitat.The proposed project would not result in permanent loss of any Waters of the United States (WOTUS) nor change the function of the existing lakebed. The management of dredged material would mimic natural lakebed conditions which would have a less significant impact then disposing of the material in an upland area. The construction would take place along and adjacent to the existing canals to reduce impacts. Canal extension plans and discharge areas would be adjusted to avoid impacts to sensitive microbialites if possible. Again, no evidence or details related to the lack of impact or water loss provided. This should be required from the division prior to making a decision on whether to grant the permit. Should the permit move forward, there should be clause or amendment added to mandate that sensitive microbialites cannot be disrupted, as these are part of the biological composition of the water of Great Salt Lake that is within the directive of the DWQ to protect. The language must be stronger and more committed, with consequences if violated, than ‘avoid impacts to sensitive microbialites if possible’.The project proponent provided two alternatives to dredging, facility modifications and a floating pipe system. Facility modifications have been ongoing to try to maintain operations with lowered lake levels. The facility has been relying on stockpiled surplus to supplement the declining intake capacity but the surplus is anticipated to be gone by next year. The floating pipe alternative would require additional infrastructure including barges, pumps, and anchoring systems. This alternative would be at a higher cost and would be dependent on resource availability. These statements do not provide sufficient reasoning for the state/DWQ to grant a permit for this specific proposal. It appears US Magnesium has overextended, putting their own operations at risk. The state and citizens of the state are not responsible for business choices made by the private enterprise and have no obligation to allow for alternatives on the basis of being a cost, capacity, time and resource saving measure for the private enterprise. Lastly – I urge the State and division to consider that effluent, while a primary source of pollution, is not the only source of risk or harm to water quality. I encourage review of existing standards and laws to consider depletion and obstruction of waterflows, and other circumstances that can alter existing waterways and water quality, so that revision or creation of new standards and requirements can be initiated, as necessary, to account for such alternate sources of threat to our water and environmental quality. Thank you for your thoughtful consideration of the comments and concerns received from the public on this permit application. The health and viability of Great Salt Lake and all areas of the state is a complex situation but one that is and will be felt deeply and essentially by the citizens of Utah and particularly the Salt Lake Valley. We are counting on all of divisions of the State to uphold their responsibilities, small and large, to preserve the quality of our unique environment, ecosystems landscapes and waterways.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 302 | Cheryl Young-Metos Salt Lake City Resident | Please accept this comment AGAINST allowing US Magnesium to extend their canal. The residents and leaders of the Salt Lake Valley all know that the Great Salt Lake levels are approaching dangerously low levels. There has been much discussion about how to get more water into the GSL. It seems obvious to me as a lifelong resident of this valley that limiting the outflow of water from the lake is equally as important as looking for ways to add more water into the lake. Say NO to US Magnesium's request to lengthen the canal. |
| 303 | Emma Wilson Saratoga Springs Resident | I'm a resident of Saratoga Springs, Utah, with my family—including my almost one-year-old baby. I'm writing because I am very concerned about the lake, our air quality, and its effects on pregnant women and children. This concern is exacerbated by U.S. Magnesium trying to take more water from the Great Salt Lake when it's already at critically low levels. Given the continued severe drought, the increased population along the Wasatch front using more of the water resources, and the potentially devastating effects of the lake drying up, I hope we can make every effort to preserve the Great Salt Lake. We need to prioritize the health of Utah's family and environment, both. If Utah leaders don't do anything about preserving the Great Salt Lake, not only does it effect industry like the brine shrimp, but the hazardous air particles from a dried up lake bed affect the health of children and adults alike. Unfortunately, Utah is already ranked highly in the country for worst air quality. History tells us that U.S. Magnesium is already known for being one of the worst air polluters. U.S. Magnesium's plant at Rowley has the most pollutants of any single county in America. This industry, along with lake effects, adversely affect the health of children and those with neurological and respiratory damage. Please prioritize the short and long-term needs of Utahns over taking water at this critical juncture. Many thanks for your consideration, and may we keep this state beautiful and restore the Great Salt Lake to health for now and future generations. |
| 304 | Liz Jackson | I would like to please submit my comments for the US Magnesium Great Salt Lake canal expansion proposal. I am against this proposal. The potential impact on ecosystem(s) health - which has already been impacted to do over-usage of our water supply - is not worth the gains for US Magnesium. As the state has already proposed options to get and keep water in the lake moving forward, it seems hasty for US Magnesium to be allowed to extend further into the lake. There is a potential for the lake's levels to rise and their current footprint being adequate. Again, I am in opposition to the expansion of US Magnesium canals. |
| 305 | Geoffery Ferrer | Good morning. Please see my following concerns, below. Thank you. How much more extraction of resources can the Great Salt Lake take? Thousands of square miles of the Great Salt Lake (GSL) lakebed have already been exposed and their toxins released into the atmosphere, with no clear plan to manage these toxins, before they became exposed. And, now US Magnesium wants to make the problem worse? It is an affront to the lake and local communities, to even consider taking more water away from the GSL that is already on life support. US Magnesium is one of the reasons that the water of the GSL is receding, but clearly as slaves to their bottom line they are not trying to help resolve the problem, but want to make it worse. US Magnesium needs to consider more than their bottom line and put some focus on protecting, not degrading, the GSL. According to various internet sites US Magnesium's revenue is anywhere from 100 million to 500 million annually. So, there is no way they cannot divert some of those funds to find another way to meet their needs. A way that doesn't further damage the GSL and the surrounding ecosystem. Additionally, it should be considered what those exposed toxins can do to all the communities in the Salt Lake Valley. With Inversion still a yearly issue for residents, exposing more of the lake bed makes this problem of air quality even more dangerous for residents. Another red flag that cannot be ignored is that as recently as 2021 US Magnesium had to settle with the EPA over violations of the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act, centering around alleged illegal disposal of Hazardous waste at the Rowley, Utah facility. And now they are attempting to take more water from an already critically endangered ecosystem of the GSL. US Magnesium is a company that we cannot trust, based on their past activities to have any interest above their own. Is this a company we want representing the state of Utah? I don't think so and implore the community to stand up for our lake. |
| 306 | Roland Goyette | The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of Great Salt Lake and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to further devastate the lake's ecosystem. The permit approval would result in less water, more lakebed toxins, and more air pollution along the Wasatch Front. It would also make the lake too salty for brine shrimp to live which would decrease life in the lake. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 307 | Joan Entwistle Park City Resident | It is imperative for the survival of the Great Salt Lake for you to deny US Magnesium's permit to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. These canals will further decrease the lake level. As a student in the Utah Master Naturalist program in 2021, I measured and observed conditions. We learned that it was unusual to find brine shrimp cysts in July. The brine shrimp usually lay live larvae, but lay cysts when conditions are not conducive to the survival of the larvae. The salinity of the water was already too high. Brine shrimp have economic value to Utah, as well as to the world's bird population. This year a study was published and observations recorded that the brine flies population has collapsed, impacting many bird species which feed on the brine flies. If US Magnesium is allowed to extend their canals, water levels will be reduced further causing even higher salinity and further destruction of the ecosystems, including the collapse of the brine shrimp population. The solution to US Magnesium's problem should be to buy water rights to increase the water level in the lake so that dredging will not be needed. Ironically, one of the birds that relies on brine flies is the California Gull, the Utah state bird. California gulls miraculously saved the early settlers of Utah by consuming the crickets that were eating their first crops. We owe this to the gulls. |
| 308 | Julie Zamora | The Great Salt Lake cannot afford to lose any more water! At a time when the valley's water supply is becoming less and less secure, how could we even consider a measure that would divert MORE water from local ecosystems and species? We must take action NOW, this year, this minute, to protect the species of the GSL and the people who call the Salt Lake valley home. We must do what is RIGHT by nature and citizens, not necessarily what is easy or is going to make Utah the most money. Because, what good will money be if we can't even survive here? |
| 309 | Evan Richardson | Hello, my name is Evan and I moved here less than two years ago. Coming to Salt Lake City as a child, I was always in awe of how beautiful this state was especially in the winter months. After living here as an adult, I have been able to see the importance that the GSL has on Utah and North America. The yearly snowpack that has gained worldwide recognition and what became one of the reasons for my exodus from the south, is at its most vulnerable point in history. The GSL is the driver behind why Utah has the "Greatest Snow on Earth". How can our governing body turn a blind eye to ruining one of the best natural phenomena on this planet. Having less water in the Salt Lake returns toxic environmental impacts and less annual snowfall. With less runoff into the salt lake due to the growing population and demand for fresh water, how will draining more water out of the salt lake help this population? Bottom line; it won't. It will expose this state to pollution levels unseen before and quite possibly unlivable. The GSL to most people does not seem very useful but it serves a purpose to all of the migratory birds who feed on the brine shrimp. With rising salinity content due to less water, the brine shrimp could become extinct in the great salt lake. This would have major impacts on our neighboring ecosystems as much as our own. With no real plan in place to help increase water levels in the GSL, how can we continue to grant water rights to companies that will drain the lake for profit? What would the economic impact be on this state if the annual snowpack was reduced by half? With a majority of the state's tax revenue stemming from the ski industry, how could you potentially jeopardize that revenue stream? Allowing more companies to pull out billions of gallons of water from the GSL could be one of the most destructive environmental disasters in modern history. |
| 310 | Christi Leman Mormon Women for Ethical Government | I write today as a member of Mormon Women for Ethical Government to submit comment regarding US Magnesium's requested permit to draw "100,000 gallons of water per minute" from the Great Salt Lake. As a student of environmental humanities at BYU, I have studied the consequences of river over-diversion on lakes such as Owen Lake in California, where the drying out of a much smaller saline lake has led to harmful, expensive air quality problems and health problems of those living around it. US Magnesium's application proposes to reduce our already vulnerable lake--low due to ongoing drought and diversion--by another 9 feet, which in this shallow lake would result in exposing hundreds of additional square feet of heavy-metal-laden lakebed, the dust of which would be ready to take to the skies. In addition, the decreased water would increase the salinity of the lake, which experts say would kill the brine shrimp in the lake and thus destroy the entire ecosystem. This would be not only devastating in its own right, but also at odds with Utah Administrative Code, in which the DEQ identifies Gilbert Bay as class 5A, protected for its beneficial uses--which would be ruined. For the sake of our children's lungs and the birds and wildlife who call the lake home, do not issue this permit. Instead, conduct a full review to ensure the permit would not interfere with Gilbert Bay's beneficial uses, which the DWQ is required to protect. In addition, anyone who wishes to remove water from the lake should have to relinquish other water rights to replace what they're taking out. If they can't, the permit should not be issued. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 311 | Samantha Ferrell-Schweppenstedde Utah Resident | As a Utah native who has recently relocated back to Salt Lake following some time away, I'm shocked and dismayed by the state of the Great Salk Lake I have returned to. I have long worked to convince my husband that Salt Lake is the greatest place on Earth, but now that we have relocated here, I am left wondering how much longer the area will even be habitable and whether it's smart or safe to be investing our lives and starting a family here.The proposed US Magnesium water diversion will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in the diverted segments. The resulting decrease in water quality means the destruction of this necessary food chain and of the beneficial use of the Class 5A designation, which the DWQ is required by law to protect. Class 5A designation states: “[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a).I beg you to please do the right thing and say no to US Magnesium’s plans to further devastate the lake’s ecosystem. This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use and should not be issued. Thank you for your time. |
| 312 | Angie Parkin | My name is Angie Parkin, I live along the Wasatch Front. Recently both my husband and I were returning home on an airplane; passing over the Great Salt Lake we could see it from above. We were horrified to see how low the water in the Great Salt Lake was. I had previously heard that the Great Salt Lake was hitting new record lows every single day; it is one thing to hear this fact, quite another to see it with our eyes. Politicians are rightly alarmed. The Governor includes the Great Salt Lake in his stated priorities and the Utah Legislature have expressed concern as well as allocated money. The Great Salt Lake has even gotten national attention from The Daily, a New York Times daily news podcast. Our most unique treasure is threatened. Then to learn that a company is actively trying to remove 100,000 gallons of water a minute is unbelievable! Please do not give US Magnesium the permit they are asking for. Not only will it affect our water quality, it will be the ecological demise of the entire system. Which will directly impact the air quality for all the residents of Salt Lake City, UT, particularly along the Wasatch Front. With so much national and state-wide attention on the Great Salt Lake, the idea that the Utah Division of Water Quality could potentially undermine efforts is absurd. Please consider the long term ramifications of your decisions. Please do not grant US Magnesium the requested permit. |
| 313 | Monica Dobbins Salt Lake City Resident | I am a resident of downtown Salt Lake City, as well as a minister at First Unitarian Church in downtown. I am writing to ask that the Utah Department of Water Quality say NO to US Magnesium's proposal to lengthen their intake canals at Gilbert Bay on Great Salt Lake. This project would contribute to even faster environmental degradation at the Lake, when lake levels are already at historic lows and species collapse is imminent. If US Magnesium is allowed to lengthen their intake canals, estimates suggest that Great Salt Lake's water levels would fall another 9 feet. This would be devastating to bird populations and other species that depend on the lake. Please reject US Magnesium's proposal, as well as any other proposals that threaten the health of Great Salt Lake and its ecosystems. |
| 314 | Amara Bray | I have heard over and over again this summer about critically low levels in the Great Salt Lake, and how dust from the lake bed would be an ecological disaster for most of northern Utah. So I am puzzled as to why a permit to expose more lakebed is being considered. There is no financial gain for our communities that could be worth the health risks for all of us with polluting the air further with lakebed dust. Please don't allow US magnesium to expand their usage. Sincerely, Amara Bray |
| 315 | Christopher Parkin | My name is Christopher Parkin, and I live along the Wasatch Front. Recently both my wife and I were returning home from a trip on an airplane; passing over the Great Salt Lake, we could see it from above. We were horrified to see how low the water in the Great Salt Lake was. I had previously heard that the Great Salt Lake was hitting new record lows every single day; it is one thing to hear this fact, quite another to see it with our eyes. Politicians are rightly alarmed. The Governor includes the Great Salt Lake in his stated priorities and the Utah Legislature have expressed concern as well as allocated money. The Great Salt Lake has even gotten national attention from The Daily, a New York Times daily news podcast. Our most unique treasure is threatened. Then to learn that a company is actively trying to remove 100,000 gallons of water a minute is unbelievable! Please do not give US Magnesium the permit they are asking for. Not only will it affect our water quality, but it will also be the ecological demise of the entire system, which will directly impact the air quality for all the residents of Salt Lake City, UT, particularly along the Wasatch Front. With so much national and state-wide attention on the Great Salt Lake, the idea that the Utah Division of Water Quality could potentially undermine efforts is absurd. Please consider the long-term ramifications of your decisions. Please do not grant US Magnesium the requested permit. Thank you for taking the time to read this, and for your thoughtful consideration. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 316 | Montana Burack Student Park City High School | <p>My name is Montana and I am a Junior at Park City High School. I have lived in Utah for 5 years now, and my absolute favorite place to visit and recreate is antelope island. It is incredibly disheartening to see the water levels at the lake when I visit, and it destroys me to know that when I am older, the ecosystem that the lake supports will no longer be as prosperous as it is now. Thinking about the fact that I might not be able to bring my kids to the lake and show them the beautiful place that I enjoyed so much as a teen pains me and makes me cry. While US Magnesium's project might be located in Gilbert Bay, it will undoubtedly have effects on other parts of the lake, including antelope island. The increased salinity levels from the project would cause a massive decrease in the lake's brine shrimp population, which will inevitably then affect the large migratory bird population that calls the Great Salt lake home. State scientists' measurements have already recorded 19% salinity in the open water, and ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity levels persist above 18%. In addition to the project's catastrophic effects on salinity, it would lower the water level of the lake, which is already at its lowest levels that have ever been recorded. The Great Salt Lake is already in peril. Destroying it further would only further harm communities, recreators, and Utahns who depend on the lake for water, snow, recreation, tourism, and industries such as the profitable Brine Shrimp business in our state. Please say no to this project so that Utahns, including myself, will be able to enjoy and benefit from the lake for centuries to come. This decision might benefit US Magnesium and the state's economy, but is it really worth the human and environmental costs? I urge the department of Water Quality to protect the Great Salt lake by saying No to US magnesium's project.</p> |
| 317 | Beverly Vargo, MD FAAP, Salt Lake City Resident | <p>As a resident of Salt Lake County and a practicing physician, I wanted to express my concerns that despite the Great Salt Lake shrinking at an alarming rate, Magcorps is requesting to take even more water out it. If that were to be allowed, it would be a great mistake. Not only will the health and existence of the Great Salt Lake itself be negatively affected, but the natural ecosystem it depends on— including the residents who live in our area. As a pediatrician, water quality and the air we breathe (as we have learned from scientists that will change for the worse if we lose the Great Salt Lake) is critical to normal development of our children and grandchildren —and perhaps even our very ability to maintain an existence for those who live and have families near it. I strongly urge the Utah Water Board to deny their request. Thank you for your service on our Water Board and for taking the health of all of our families seriously as you navigate your responsibilities.</p> |
| 318 | Elizabeth Sanguinetti Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am writing to you as a concerned citizen of Utah regarding the permit application from US Magnesium LLC to extend their intake canals further in the Great Salt Lake. I have been fortunate to have lived in Utah since 1992. Prior to moving to Utah, I completed an M.S. Biology at Villanova University, with my thesis in Wetlands Ecology. The health of the Great Salt Lake is personal to me because of my background and knowledge of wetland ecosystems. Many people in Utah, especially northern Utah, are doing their part to reduce water use because we are aware that the lake level has been dropping. In September 2022, Salt Lake City Public Utilities announced that water use had been reduced by 15% since April 1 compared to the three-year average (see KSL.com https://www.ksl.com/article/50479856/salt-lake-city-meets-water-conservation-goal-saving-29b-gallons-of-water#:~:text=Daily%20water%20use%20briefly%20returned%20to%20about%20130,to%20the%20three-year%20average%20and%20consumption%20in%202000.). This is an important example of what can and should be done by all water users in our state. The health of the Great Salt Lake ecosystem, and the resident and migrating waterfowl, depend on the lake having sufficient water input to prevent salinity levels from rising any further. The ongoing drought already has reduced water levels to dangerous levels for the health of the lake. This is the time for all Utahns to do their part to reduce water use, not extend water intake pipes to take more water from the lake. Please do not allow US Magnesium LLC to extend their intake canals. Instead, please encourage a reduction in their water use. Thank you for your time to review comments from the public in opposition to their application.</p> |
| 319 | Devin Willie | <p>My name is Devin Willie, and I am writing you to beg you not to allow US Magnesium to suck even more water out of the Great Salt Lake. I am sure you are aware that their activities will increase the salinity of the lake to a level that the brine shrimp of the lake will crash and die. Imagine for a moment: next year, millions of birds flying toward a lake in the expectation of finding brine flies, depending on them as they have for thousands of years. And then they arrive, with no food to be found. Millions of birds, starving, confused, panicked because we killed their food source so one company, ONE COMPANY, could turn a profit. Please, please do not allow this. There are hard decisions that have to be made, and I pray that you will make them in order to save the lake, protect the animals that call it home, and the population of people who live near it. Please do the right thing. You have to say no.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 320 | Jill Thomas Salt Lake City Resident | I am concerned about US Magnesium being allowed to divert more water from the Great Salt Lake. You, I'm sure, are well aware of the dangers of a dry lake bed, which can pollute our air with nasty chemicals. Please, we need to keep more water in the lake, not empty it. I am really concerned about the future of Salt Lake City if we don't do something about the Great Salt Lake. |
| 321 | Kate Robinson | My name is Kate Robinson, and I am a working class gal raising 2 children in West Valley City, UT. US Magnesium must not be allowed to take water from the Great Salt Lake. It will devastate not only the ecosystem of the Great Salt Lake, but all the ecosystems of the migrating birds that feed off the flies and shrimp in the lake. If the water becomes too salty for the shrimp to survive, many migrating birds will die. This is very sad and will impact a much larger area than Utah alone. But mostly, as a working class gal, I cannot afford to move my family. My job is here, my home is here, and I don't want to be forced to relocate if corporations are allowed to create a toxic dust bowl in the valley by draining the lake and exposing all the dangerous chemicals to the air. Please, please, please take responsibility for the health of the Great Salt Lake and say NO to US Magnesium's water request. I've included a photo of my daughters hiking at the Great Salt Lake in the summer of 2021. here is nothing more important right now for the health of our children and the future of this state than protecting the Great Salt Lake. |
| 322 | Leila LeSueur Salt Lake City Resident | As a SLC resident, I beg you to protect The Great Salt Lake from further damage by U.S. Magnesium. They are contributing to the destruction of an important ecosystem, and ecosystem that me and my family are a part of. We rely on this air, this water, this land to survive. Please protect this land for us and all beings who dwell here. |
| 323 | Paul Robinson | My name is Paul Robinson and I want to voice my concern for the Great Salt Lake and stop US Magnesium. I understand the Magnesium is important to a electric future but it need to happen sustainably and not at the cost of the GSL ecosystem and the health of the Salt Lake Valley. |
| 324 | Kourtnei I Joffs | The Great Salt Lake has been for generations a great provider of natural resources. Hopefully it will continue to support our industrious Utah long into the future. But for this to be true, the lake must still be there. Alongside harvesting the benefits from the lake, we must also make sure that we promote the presence and vitality of the lake and its life. In all that we do, we must not exert excessive or unnecessary strain on the lake. US Magnesium would like to expand two already extant canals. If allowed to do that, other mineral companies will likely expand as well. But why does one particular industry's interest supersede those of others? It is risky to remove too much water from our unique lake: decreasing water increases the total concentration of salt in the lake. This is a risk that could prove harmful to those of the brine shrimp industry, as too much salt will kill their shrimp. According to the Utah Division of Wildlife Resources , this is an industry that is easily worth tens of millions of dollars; it will be worth steadily less than that as keeping shrimp alive becomes harder in a shrunken, concentrated lake. Aside from this, the shrimp themselves are vital food sources for many migrating birds. Both the lake and the birds attract tourists near and far. Most importantly, as I understand it, these various mineral companies are currently using the <u>minimum amount</u> of water that they can to sustain their business. If that's true, and if this amount of water provides them a fully functional and self-admittedly sustainable business, then I do not see any valid reason to grant mineral companies operating in the Great Salt Lake any more use of our already limited resource. If US Magnesium and other mineral companies—by their very continued operation and existence—demonstrate that they are fully capable of operating within their currently allowed means, then they do not <i>need</i> any more water than anyone else does. It is excessive and unnecessary to allow the expansion of these two canals. |
| 325 | Daria Casity Holladay Resident | My name is Daria Cassity. I am a 36-year-old resident of Holladay and have lived in the Salt Lake Valley since I was six years old. I am also the mother of three young children. Like many Utahns, I am greatly troubled by the reports of dangerously low water levels in the Great Salt Lake and the effect they could have on the lake's ecosystems and our air quality. If permits were given to US Magnesium to further divert water from the lake, those levels would continue to drop and exacerbate these issues. Please do not allow the economic interests of one company to take precedence over the wellbeing of this city's residents. |
| 326 | Therese Martin Salt Lake City Resident | Please say NO to US Mag request to extend intake canals on the Great Salt Lake. I am extremely concerned about the health of the lake and its ecosystem. It is time to take responsibility for the future and health of this important lake. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 327 | Tanya De Angel | <p>Why is the Division of Water Quality allowing US Magnesium to take water from the the already struggling GSL? The Division of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of GSL and the people of Utah. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum for future extractive practices on the Great Salt Lake in order to ensure the protection of the Lake and Utahns. Please say NO to US Magnesium. I've lived in SLC for nearly 20 years and I'm devastated at the current state of GSL, that it's at its lowest level ever recorded, and the potential health hazard and risks we all may face if it's not managed correctly.</p> |
| 328 | Candace Hansen | <p>US Magnesium, a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore is once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster. Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake.</p> |
| 329 | Maeve Barnum | <p>US Magnesium can not take more water out of the Great Salt Lake. The Great Salt Lake is already at the lowest water level it has been in decades, and removing more water would accelerate the problem. The Lake is a unique habit for many creators including brine shrimp, one of the few organisms that can live in the lake, however, if it becomes too salty it will become inhospitable even for them. We can not allow for-profit companies to take advantage of the earth's natural resources, depleting them and not thinking of the consequences it has on society and the various ecosystems. We need to work towards keeping more water in the lake, because in addition to habitat loss when the lake bed is exposed it can cause health hazards. When the water evaporates off the lake, salt and other chemicals are left behind and stay dissolved in the water or sink to the bottom of the lake. There is a lot of Arsenic stored in the lake bed, and when exposed storms or wind can pick up the chemicals and leave it as dust in the air around Salt Lake City and the surrounding area. Please listen to the many warnings against the project, we hope you decide to work for humanity.</p> |
| 330 | Sadie Braddock | <p>I am emailing to say NO to the permit that will allow US Magnesium to use more Great Salt Lake (GSL) water. As you may know, the GSL water level as at a historic low, and if more water is taken away from the lake, it will become too salty for the keystone species - the brine shrimp. The brine shrimp harvesting industry contributes nearly \$1.3 billion to Utah's economy. If the brine shrimp die off, then Utah's economy will suffer greatly as well as the millions of migratory birds who visit the lake each year to feed (and the rest of the ecosystem which depends greatly on the brine shrimp). If that is not enough, I would like to stress how if more of GSL's lakebed is exposed, more toxic sediments can be kicked up into our air quality, which is already bad enough in Utah due to our unique geography that produces inversions. Do the right thing and protect the people of Utah and our cherished Great Salt Lake by saying NO to this permit.</p> |
| 331 | Brandon Kitterman Springville Resident | <p>I write to add my voice to those who have asked the Utah Division of Water Quality to deny US Magnesium a permit to extend their intake canals in Great Salt Lake. I grew up in the Avenues area of Salt Lake City and currently live in Springville, UT. I love our state and I am concerned for the well-being of the amazing nature we share here in our lovely corner of the world. I am no scientist, politician, or economist, but I do know that Great Salt Lake is in trouble due to drought and overuse of the water it needs to survive. I know that many species thrive in and around the lake, and that the ecosystem there is on the brink of collapse. I also know that we have precious little time (months, not years) to act to prevent an ecological, economic, and public health tragedy. Certainly US Mag is not the only party at fault for this problem; as with most things, the cause of these problems is complex. But please, don't let our lake die. We can't let short-term economic gains (or the risk of short-term losses) cause the long-term loss of this rich resource of materials, diversity, and beauty. No doubt you've heard similar comments and arguments, and I don't expect mine to reveal anything you have not heard. But please, let the collective voices of those opposed to this permit have sway. Let us all do whatever we can to act as good stewards of our small piece of the Earth. Let us all stand against strong interests and the even stronger forces of denial and resignation. Let us all do what we know is right to preserve this lake for the benefit and enjoyment of future generations.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 332 | Terry Tempest Willaims Castle Valley Resident | As a long time observer of Great Salt Lake and resident of Utah, I want to include my voice of protest to giving US Mag Corp a special permit of drawing down the lake for their purposes. This is not only irresponsible, it is inviting further catastrophic collapse to the Great Salt Lake ecosystem of brine flies, brine shrimp and the well being of millions of migratory birds. It also puts the health of the human population at risk along the Wasatch Front with increased exposure of the lake bottom and whipping up toxic dust devils .This is a time of vigilance and restraint on behalf of Great Salt Lake, not a time of corporate accommodation and exceptionalism. The eyes of the future are looking back at us and they are praying we might see beyond our time and act with restraint on behalf of an ethical stance for life. — May you protect the water quality of this precious and unique ecosystem. May you be strong stewards of this shrinking inland sea. And may you deny Us Magnesium the permit they are seeking at the expense of the health of Great Salt Lake. It will be a deadly and costly decision if you say yes to Mag Corp’s special interest, costly to our future and the future of Great Salt Lake and wildlife, large and small, at this critical moment.May your decision be one of breakthrough leadership, not breakdown of the public trust. |
| 333 | Kyia Hill | My name is Kyia Hill and I am writing to you to submit my public comments regarding U.S. Magnesium’s recently proposed permits to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. I urge you to deny these permits. The Great Salt Lake has already too low water levels and approving these permits will further drain the lake. My husband and I live in Layton, Utah near Antelope Drive. We owe a lot of our history and livelihood to this lake and the water in it. Both of us have lived near the Great Salt Lake our entire lives and even on our first date, and many since, we spent hiking along the shores of antelope island. My husband works full-time at the Great Salt Lake Brine Shrimp Cooperative – a billion-dollar industry that relies on the lake to harvest the Brine Shrimp egg. Lake levels and the water quality directly affect this industry and the brine shrimp they rely on to harvest. Low lake levels greatly impact the lake's water quality, particularly in salinity levels and heavy metal concentrations. These water quality impacts affect the brine shrimp and the brine flies that feed a world of birds and the world’s fisheries too. The approval of the U.S. Magnesium permits would ensure further drops in lake levels. If more water is drawn from the lake, the lake and the ecosystem we rely on, will not survive.Please, deny these permits and protect our lake, our livelihood, and our brine shrimp from drying up. Uphold the Class 5A designation that protects the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, which the Department of Water Quality is required by law to protect (see Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5 (a)). Lastly, please work to get more water to the lake and deny any further permits request that will divert water from this vital ecosystem we rely on. |
| 334 | Liz Stika | I am absolutely opposed to the proposal to extend US magnesium access to GSL water Given the catastrophically low lake levels already, It is irresponsible, short sighted, and ultimately damaging to our health, environment and subsequently, our economy. Please look at the environmental evidence and don’t treat the lake as disposable commodity. |
| 335 | Hiedi Blackwelder Pleasant Grove Resident | U.S. Magnesium must not be allowed to use more Great Salt Lake water because it would make the lake too salty for brine shrimp to liveLess water = ↑ salinity = ↓ life in the lake |
| 336 | Shelby Stults Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Shelby Stults and I am a resident of Salt Lake City in the neighborhood of Rose Park. Today I am urging you to deny the application of US Magnesium to extend two intake canals on Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. US Magnesium is a major contributor to lowering the lake level, extracting more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. In addition to historically being a bad industrial actor with regard to non-compliance of air quality standards for chlorine pollution, their aggressive extraction process will disrupt the delicate balance of salinity levels in the lake. The proposed extractive process will disrupt the beneficial uses of DWQ's Class 5a designation, directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay, and destroy the necessary food chain for migratory and native bird populations. As a west side resident, I am acutely concerned about the actions that our state agencies are planning to take to address our dying lake. My neighborhood will be one of the first on the front lines of experiencing the impacts of dust storms blowing heavy metal contaminants into our homes. In order for the state to address the triage state of our lake ecosystems, we need full consideration of the people and ecological harms that could be incurred from additional industrial and commercial activities. Please place the livelihood of people who live in the surrounding communities and the wildlife dependent on these ecosystems above corporate profit.The Great Salt Lake cannot afford to be dropped an additional 9 feet as a result of these activities. Our city, state, and people cannot continue to thrive |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | without the stability of the Great Salt Lake, which in absence will make the region uninhabitable through poor air quality, diminished precipitation, and increased heat impacts. You have a duty to observe and reinforce Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). |
| 337 | Alisha Aravena Alonso Park City Resident | I've been a resident of Park City and Salt Lake for a combined total of 6 years, and I want to continue living here and raise a family here. Like all of my friends, coworkers, and neighbors in the area, I am concerned about the health of the Great Salt Lake, including its ecosystem — which is integral to our health, too. The best available science shows that the lake's food services are on the verge of collapse due to increases in salinity — and granting U.S. Magnesium permits to lengthen their intake canals will further increase the lake's salinity levels. The lake's low water levels are top of mind for everyone in my community and I feel we — including the Department of Water Quality — have a responsibility to do whatever we can to not worsen this issue. The lake is in critical condition, and we cannot afford to lose any more water in it. I'm asking that you help preserve the GSL and do not grant these permits to U.S. Magnesium. The health of the lake is vital to the health of our city, the health of future generations — magnesium extraction is not worth that. Thank you for your time. |
| 338 | Bryan Debbink | Please do not approve the US Magnesium's requested permit. Our state needs to do everything it can to maintain what little of the GSL we have remaining. Extending the canal effectively removes water from the public trust and turns it into an industrial waste site, which is a public liability. Governor Cox's recent prohibition on new water rights demonstrates Utah's commitment to preserve this resource at the highest level. Even our highly pro-business legislature has begun to wake up to the importance of conservation. I hope you will follow suit by denying the permit and allowing the innovation of private enterprise to develop other methods to run their operations. |
| 339 | Casey Jacketta Salt Lake County Resident | As a lifelong resident of Salt Lake County, I encourage you to vote NO against any additional water, rights, expansion, additional canals, or any other water requests that the US magnesium company is requesting from the great Salt Lake. As you know, our great Salt Lake is at the lowest levels seen since the 1970s Exposing toxic lakebed substances to Utah residents. In addition a healthy great Salt Lake is needed not only for the unique ecosystem that only exists in the great Salt Lake, but also to help prop up our ski industry that brings in billions of dollars in tourist money every year like affects no greatly affects the ski resorts in the Cottonwood Canyon and we need more like to have more lake effect snow. US magnesium is making the request and it is a water quality focused permit diverting water from the great Salt Lake will further segment the great Salt Lake within Gilbert bay Cree salinity in concentrations of heavy metals in those increasingly isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial to the food chain for the water oriented wild life. The great Salt Lake is a complex ecosystem and one of the only areas in the United States that has pelican breeding grounds. Millions of migratory birds stop here every year and it's a true beauty to watch. I've loved watching the birds from antelope Island and even from my home when you're the Jordan river at his truly broken my heart to see the great Salt Lake fail in the last few years and it has broken my heart further that our government has failed to regulate water in a meaningful way that continues to affect the great Salt Lake. The great Salt Lake ecosystem is in threat of collapse, state scientists currently police, the salinity of the segment at 19% with collapse, eminent at 18% say no to US magnesium water request. We cannot continue to send water out of the great Salt Lake and must focus on successfully supporting more water in the great Salt Lake no new diversion and protecting the ecosystem at all costs, there are other salt lakes in the Middle East that have dried up and communities around them have been decimated. I live in West Jordan not far from the Jordan river and I have had two families in my neighborhood that if expressed great concern, not only over air quality which the great Salt Lake also affects, but also the drying up at the great Salt Lake and the continue drought in our government ignorance. They both listed their homes for sale in the last six months to move out of the State because of these concerns. Not only is there a human impact but as mentioned above, there's also a wildlife impact the the impacts related to additional water siphoning from the great Salt Lake as requested by the US magnesium company as many of the migratory birds that rely on the great Salt Lake for migration, and feeding, would likely Face significant population declines that would result in them being listed on the endangered species act. The application itself demonstrates just how much water US magnesium company is wanting to remove from the great Salt Lake for these canals and for salt extraction. 100,000 gallons per minute will be siphon away from the great Salt Lake during a time of unprecedented drought, historic drought and when the great Salt Lake is teetering on collapse is a lifelong Utah resident who has watch the Jordan river change over three decades and watch the great Salt Lake dry up over the last decade. It infuriates me that this is even being entertained US magnesium should not have any more rights to the great Salt Lake. No more water for profit from the great Salt Lake. As one of your constituents, I urge you to vote no, and to stop US magnesium from their profiteering of the decline of the great Salt Lake. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 340 | John William Moffitt Utah Resident | <p>The Great Salt Lake and its surrounding wetlands provide a stopping point for mating, resting, feeding, and shelter for over 10 million birds that migrate through the state each year (UDNR 2018). Sadly, this important lake is shrinking. In 2022, the Great Salt Lake saw its lowest water levels since the U.S. Geological Survey (USGS) began monitoring the lake in 1875. This low water level has been caused by the long-term diversion of water by humans and exacerbated by recent exceptional drought that the state has been experiencing (Carlowicz 2021). The Great Salt Lake is reaching critical salinity levels that are threatening the brine shrimp population in the lake. If we lose the brine shrimp, we lose the migratory birds and the waterfowl that depend upon it. Allowing U.S. Magnesium to collect more water is ultimately a death sentence for the Great Salt Lake and the animals that depend upon it. As a Utah Native, I have enjoyed the Great Slat Lake and its incredible beauty for years. I am always amazed that the life that abounds on this beautiful lake. To have this lake is a privilege and we have abused it for decades. Now is the time to prioritize the Great Salt Lake. As an active member of the Great Salt Lake community, I am calling on our government leaders to put a stop to the continued exploitation of this crucial water resource. Now is the time for action. Please say NO to U.S. Magnesium.</p> |
| 341 | Calvin Scharffs | <p>We want to voice our concern about US Magnesium's application to dig a canal several miles further into the lake to continue pumping 100,000's gallons of water a minute every day. As citizens of this great state, we are concert that with the current lake levels, and concerned this will further acerbate the water situation of the lake. We must not allow more water from the Great Salt Lake until lake levels are restored. We are concerned about wildlife and the air quality from rising dust storms from the depleted lake. Please deny this permit and any future water requests.</p> |
| 342 | Derek Chang, MSPH MD Candidate University of Utah School of Medicine | <p>My name is Derek Chang and I am currently a fourth-year medical student at the University of Utah School of Medicine. As a future medical provider and a formal background in public health, I firmly stand that US Magnesium should not be given a permit to further expand it's water pipeline expansion into the Great Salt Lake, or dire health consequences will result. If approved, this will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase the salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The water levels in the GSL are already tenuous and if our local government does not act quickly, our future generations will suffer. From a macroscopic perspective, having more water pulled for industries like US Magnesium and exponential population growth will have untoward consequence of exposing the salt bed to winds that may aerosolize arsenic and other toxic metals to the greater SL valley. This can lead to extensive health effects to the population. This is a well researched phenomenon. As referenced Suzuki K and Madal B in Arsenic round the world: a review, having high levels of aerosolized arsenic will lead to a public health crisis where large population groups are at increased risk of developing cardiopulmonary disease, cancer, neurological deficits, and congenital defects. It even references people living in Millard County to have higher rates of hypertensive heart disease, nephritis, nephrosis, and prostate cancer due to its proximity to high arsenic level from industry and desert topography. Lastly, if we get to a point where the lake water levels are dangerously low without blocking industries to further pull water or pollute the environment, we may be the next case report, alongside Mono and Owens Lake in California, where Salt Lake City will no longer be habitable for humans to live.I firmly reject US Magnesium calls for approving its water quality permit application.</p> |
| 343 | Julia Salcedo Ogden Resident | <p>I'm calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation. I've lived in Utah for over 20 years now, resided in Roy and Ogden currently. I'm in my early 30's and have hiked and done bird watching at Antelope Island over the past 10 years. It's disheartening to see how quickly the Great Salt Lake is disappearing before my eyes. I recall visiting Antelope Island for the first time and marveling at the diversity of this ecosystem. The water was easily accessible to all those who visited, especially the birds. It's been difficult to see the drastic change in water levels and to observe docking stations surrounded by a dry lake bed but by saying No to U.S. Magnesium to stop unnecessary water intake, we can have a chance to protect it from a catastrophic collapse. According to state scientists' measurements, the water salinity is already at 19% salinity in the open water, which exceeds a threshold at which essential microorganisms begin to die and threatens a key bird habitat. If the salinity remains above 18% it will result in an imminent ecosystem collapse. The State of Utah recognizes this fact and has appropriated hundreds of millions of dollars to help save this ecosystem by getting more water into the lake.Please say No to U.S. Magnesium Canal Extension Project request, whose diversion of water would only create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, that DWQ is required by law to protect. We must raise the lake water levels first, before any additional water is removed.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 344 | Natalie Fillerup | <p>I am a lifelong resident of Utah who cares deeply about the current crisis at the Great Salt Lake. I have a deep connection to this beautiful lake, which started when I was a 12 year old girl in middle school. I chose to do my science fair experiment on brine shrimp in the Great Salt Lake and learned a great deal about this unique ecosystem. Since then, I have spent time at the Spiral Jetty, The Bear River Migratory Bird Refuge, Antelope Island, The Salt Flats, and the Farmington Bay Waterfowl Management Area. Over the past 14 years, it has been astonishing to see the drastic drop of the water level in the lake. As a prospective home buyer in Salt Lake County, I worry that if the lake continues to drop, our air quality will be degraded to the point where property values will decrease due to the hazardous air. I love this beautiful state and lake and wish to see it protected and safeguarded so that future generations may have a healthy and livable environment. Due to this, I am asking you to please say no to US Magnesiums request to divert more water from this finite resource. From what I have learned about this proposal, it will negatively impact the lake by bringing the lake level down an additional 9 feet. This will also increase salinity in the lake, potentially causing ecosystem collapse. Lastly, it has the potential to negatively impact our air quality due to exposed lakebed sediment which will be suspended into our air. Please take these points into consideration while evaluating this application. Thank you for your time and leadership on this critical issue</p> |
| 345 | Stella Dustman Student Park City High School | <p>My name is Stella Dustman and I am a Senior at Park City High School. I have lived in the Wasatch my whole life which has provided me with an opportunity to observe the changing environment of the Great Salt Lake. The thought of losing this interconnected ecosystem is heartbreaking. Fortunately, there is a way to save it: water conservation. Allowing US Magnesium to dredge more than 100 acres of lake bed would do just the opposite. The Great Salt Lake is one of the biggest stops for migrating birds. It provides a source of food critical during their long journey to other climates. The lowering of water levels increases the salinity of the lake and in turn, reduces the life able to live there. State scientists have taken measurements of 19% salinity in the open water. Ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity levels persist above 18%. As water levels drop, fewer brine shrimp will be able to survive, causing a decrease in available food for birds. The hundreds of species that rely on the Great Salt Lake for nutrients are at risk, some may even make the endangered species list. This imbalance will cause a ripple effect throughout the rest of the ecosystem which is detrimental to the life and biodiversity of Utah's greatest lake. To avoid this catastrophic event, DWQ must say NO to US Magnesium and its plan to divert even more precious water needed to sustain life. Making this decision would protect the hundreds of organisms that call the Great Salt Lake home and set a precedent for what needs to be done in order to conserve our land, water, and life.</p> |
| 346 | Jessika Cole | <p>Is the lake our state capitol is named after going to be a story from the past or an actual location? Building canals draining from the Great Salt Lake severely affects the ecosystem. The overuse of GSL water has caused the water to decrease, increasing the salinity, and reducing the population of wildlife in the area. Brine shrimp are one of the few organisms that can survive in the amount of salt in the GSL, but now it's even too much for them. In addition, it also has a terrible health affect on us. The floor bed of the GSL that is being uncovered is releasing a ton of unhealthy toxins across the Wasatch Front. This is having severe long-term effects. Instead of draining more water for economical gain, we need to acknowledge the crisis the GSL is in and instead, work to preserve the lake. The corporations taking water from the GSL should be required to put the same in it again. This is just step one in a long process to bring our beloved Great Salt Lake back, but it is needed because if this magnesium permit passes, then that is the last step before we lose the lake</p> |
| 347 | Amanda Chipman | <p>The Great Salt Lake is already at it's lowest ever recorded level and allowing US Magnesium to use more of the Great Salt Lake's water will only devastate it more. It has already shrunk 2/3 in 40 years. The GSL is already at a higher salinity than is safe for its ecosystem. Using up more of the water will only increase the salinity which will lead to further harm. Ecosystem collapse begins at 18% and the lake is currently at 19% salinity. This salinity is too high for the brine shrimp in the salt lake. The water quality will continue to decrease as more water is taken from the salt lake because the salinity will continue to increase. Please say no to US Magnesium and do not allow them to take more water from the GSL.</p> |
| 348 | Merritt Mecham Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am a constituent in Salt Lake City, and live downtown. I work at the University of Utah, and fiercely love our state, the Great Salt Lake, and the beautiful ecosystem it represents. I am writing to comment on the State of Utah's intention to issue a Section 401 Water Quality Certification to US Magnesium for the extension of two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. The Great Salt Lake is facing an impending ecological disaster, and it is absolutely imperative that the State does NOT issue certification to US Magnesium. The proposed project would take even more water away from the lake, destroying brine shrimp, brine flies, and the birds who eat</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>them. It would also increase salinity levels and destroy microbial life in the lake. With microbial life destroyed and the lake receding, residents of the Salt Lake Valley would be even more exposed to arsenic and other toxins. By entertaining this proposal, the State of Utah is putting business above the very people who live in and love this amazing state. Utah needs its legislature to invest in the future of Utah, and take measures to safeguard the air quality, wildlife, and the beautiful lake our state is known for. The Department of Water Quality must put the needs of UTAH first, take responsibility for the health of the Great Salt Lake, and say NO to US Magnesium's plan to devastate the natural ecosystem. The Great Salt Lake is our state's jewel, and it is dying. It is not time to perform business as usual. This crisis demands a new approach, and the safeguarding of our lake from companies and private interests like US Magnesium. I would like to continue living in Utah. I love this place, and I believe in Utah and its people. Please say no to this permit, and ensure that Utah is livable for generations to come</p> |
| 349 | <p>Lauren McBrier Salt Lake City Resident</p> | <p>I am writing as a Utah citizen, business person, parent, volunteer in Salt Lake City Schools, outdoor enthusiast and skier. Please do not allow US Magnesium to use more water from the rapidly declining natural resource, business driver, and natural wonder that is the Great Salt Lake, the backbone of our state and the Western US. This atrocious misuse of our region's water supply must end to ensure that our state continues its ability to flourish. Our current children's generation will move away in droves with the continued decline of the GSL and increase in toxic air from the drying out lake and lack of ability to maintain snowpack to sustain our water supply (not to mention our amazing but already declining winter sports and the many jobs and recreational opportunities our mountains create). One company and one industry cannot be allowed to ruin the environment for countless species let alone our state's population. Please consider that the water diversion will create segmentation in Gilbert Bay, increase salinity even more (past the 18% that already has been measured and ensures ecosystem collapse), and increase concentrations of heavy metals. Class 5A designations must be top of mind and protected at all costs. The wildlife that depend on brine shrimp cannot be forgotten - the devastation happening to brine shrimp affects the entire ecosystem. Please complete a Level II Antidegradation review to ensure that US Magnesium's request would not interfere with the beneficial use of Gilbert Bay. Please protect the lake's beneficial uses. Please do this to protect our lungs, our children, our economy, our quality of life.</p> |
| 350 | <p>Samantha Chipman</p> | <p>I am emailing you to notify you that I am AGAINST the drainage of The Great Salt Lake. If this continues it will be a huge problem for our air quality and the plants and birds that live there. Please do NOT allow this to pass. Thank you</p> |
| 351 | <p>Shannon Rabii Holladay Resident</p> | <p>I hope I am not too late in getting my comment to you today. I grew up in Salt Lake and have recently returned to raise my young children here. Their father works out of state so we are at the airport weekly and make frequent trips to the Great Salt Lake. My daughter age 7 started making comments about the water being 'so far away now' and that really struck home to me. I am requesting that you deny US Magnesium application for water diversion at Gilbert Bay as it will increase salinity and make the water issues we have currently even worse. We need this lake not only for the migratory patterns of millions of birds but also the namesake of our great city! If the permit is granted many of the beneficial uses that the lake provides will be wiped out. Please consider the livelihood of our children and future generations and deny the permit to US Magnesium.</p> |
| 352 | <p>Manpreet Singh</p> | <p>I am emailing to say I am AGAINST draining more of The Great Salt Lake. It's damaging to our air quality and the animals that live there. Without the birds, the entire landscape will die. I am very much against the permit to drain more water.</p> |
| 353 | <p>Samantha Chipman</p> | <p>I am very against draining more of The Great Salt Lake. Please do NOT allow this permit to pass. It would be damaging to our air quality, which already struggles. As someone who cares about our air quality, we should be doing things to IMPROVE our air, not hurt it more. Please do NOT allow this to happen. We need to take care of The Great Salt Lake or Utah's air will be very bad.</p> |
| 354 | <p>Natalie Knight, Owner Alpha Graphics</p> | <p>I'm very concerned about US Magnesium's Canal Continuation Project proposal. I strongly support no new diversions and this proposal will take 100,000 gallons per MINUTE from the Great Salt Lake. This would be devastating to the Salt Lake valley and ecosystems throughout the US and beyond. As a resident of Salt Lake City, the potential for toxic dust and worse air quality is a real fear in our future if we don't change our actions. This proposal will impair water quality by increasing salinity levels in the lake and disrupt the food chain. I understand that magnesium mining could be escalated to a national defense issue. In which case, I do support it but I hope the division could steer US Magnesium toward developing more sustainable mining techniques and require that they replenish the lakes water level to a safe depth</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 355 | Liz Rank Salt Lake City Resident | I just learned of the request from US Magnesium to be allowed to extend its intake canals. In light of what I read in the paper just a few days ago--that the brine flies are already in bad shape this year--it seems that anything that takes water from GSL is really courting disaster. I don't really want to know how many threads unravel if we don't protect the lake. Let's try not to find out. Please deny US Magnesium's request. |
| 356 | Josh Mickelson | Listen y'all you know this is a bad idea. We're in a drought and the solution is not taking even more water away from what we do have. Brine shrimp will struggle, the lake depth will continue receding to unsustainable levels and releasing all sorts of toxicity you've likely heard about from others who've reached out. Winter sports will suffer immensely in UT as our lake vanishes. The lake effect creates our "greatest snow." If you're worried about economics, consider the much greater economic devastation a loss of winter sports and tourism would have.K thanks y'all. Mainly just here to add to the volume of people perturbed by the expansion proposal. |
| 357 | Amanda Lynn Blair Salt Lake City Resident | This is a picture of one of my five children running through the briny Water of our Great Salt Lake. We are residents of downtown Salt Lake City and have spent many hours as a family finding joy and peace in this natural treasure. This lake has given much to us and it needs and deserves our protection. I have learned that despite our efforts to be conscious of the water we use in our community, U.S. Magnesium is asking to use more of the water as much as "100, 000 gallons per minute" according to their application. This would raise the salinity and lower the ability of life such as brine shrimp and microbialites to thrive and therefore also impedes the 10 million birds that migrate through this ecosystem. The water salinity is already too high as it is. This kind of harm is not easily fixed. We need to look ahead and make sure we are not robbing our future for the sake of monetary gain today. Please protect our Great Salt Lake, protect the health of its waters, and protect its life giving properties. Please say no to the U.S. Magnesium. |
| 358 | Kyle West Saratoga Springs Resident | My name is Kyle West. I am an Engineer living in Saratoga Springs with my family. I am writing to you because I was devastated to learn yesterday that US Magnesium is planning on increasing their intake canal sizes. This concerns me because US Magnesium is already one of the largest users of water in UT. We are in a drought. The Great Salt Lake has gotten lower every year at an alarming rate. The salt concentration of the water is too high to sustain life for much longer. I am horrified that there is a possibility for more harm to be done.From the application: "The project would maintain a conveyance of lake water intake flow of 100,000 gallons per minute from the Great Salt Lake." Although this may be small compared to the agricultural intake numbers, there is a large difference. Agricultural water can be controlled to return back into the watershed. I am worried that US Magnesium will not see similar treatment of their water. I propose an alternative: that US Magnesium only be permitted to fulfill their proposal after the lake has returned to sustainable levels for several years.Right now our lake usage is not sustainable. It needs our help. US Magnesium is not going to help our Great Salt Lake by draining it even more. |
| 359 | Otto De Groff Student Brigham Young University | During the past couple weeks several fellow students at BYU have informed me of US Magnesium's plan to extend their canals farther out into the Great Salt Lake. As a Utahn, and as someone who cares deeply about the ecological health of our water resources, I feel a need to make my opinion clear on this issue: I am decidedly against US Magnesium's plan to take more water from an increasingly threatened Great Salt Lake. Over the course of my life I've had numerous opportunities to explore much of western Utah. This is a land of bare, spreading desert that has become meaningful to me in a spiritual and emotional sense. I've spent days hiking around portions of the ancient shoreline of Lake Bonneville, on the dry Newfoundland, House, and Silver Island Ranges. These wave-cut platforms are visible reminders of past hydrologic change at our eastern edge of the wonderful Great Basin Desert. Today, the places where rivers flow and empty into this desert are marked by either ephemeral or shallow lakes. Sevier Lake sits at the end of a river of the same name, and is often dry. The Great Salt Lake is not dry (yet!), and is fed by several rivers flowing from mountains to the east. The drying of river systems draining into deserts are reminders of how fragile these ribbons of water, the lifeblood of our land, are. Water in Utah is sacred, which sacredness comes not from above but from beneath - the living, beating earth and indeed all life relies on these streams of water flowing into basins of drying alkali. Now, I ask that you and all those holding positions of political authority in Utah make decisions based upon the sacred character of water in our high desert state. Corporations come and go, cities may rise and wither, and if we do not act now to nurture the Great Salt Lake, our civilization here may not last the tests of coming droughts and climate change. Let us work together to give, rather than take, water from our rivers and lakes. Let us be unified in our resolve to maintain an unwavering view of the sacredness of water, and the land from which it come |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 360 | Harvey Day | We need water to survive. Not just water for agricultural, developmental, and individual purposes. We need water flowing through our rivers and reaching their destination of the Great Salt Lake to maintain the ecosystems that have emerged there. Those organisms' lives are dependent on the presence of water in that lake. The relationships and interactions between all of these organisms accomplish ecosystem services that human beings could only dream of concocting. No amount of revenue for a corporate enterprise will replace the services that our non-human relatives offer free of charge. We need to stand up and say No to the abuses of the natural systems that allow us to live. Say No to US MAG! Say Yes to life! |
| 361 | Katie Boué Holladay Resident | My name is Katie Boué, a proud resident and small business owner in Holladay. I, like many concerned Utah citizens, am writing you today with regards to the current proposal for additional permitting for US Magnesium. I am deeply concerned for the environmental impacts this could have, and how that will affect public health in our beautiful valley. Above all else, Utah's children deserve a liveable, and breathable future—and the decision you have in front of you right now will directly set the course for future generations. I am asking you to reject this permit. It is clear that this proposed water diversion by US Magnesium will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, that DWQ is required by law to protect. State scientists have already taken measurements of 19% salinity on the open water. Ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity levels persist above 18%. This is no longer a matter of tree hugger environmentalists versus economic capitalists—this is a crisis we all must open our eyes to and act on together as a united Utah. It is absurd to even consider allowing 100,000 gallons per minute to be drained out of the Great Salt Lake. The only option on the table for our precious lake should be adding water, not removing it. To whomever is reading this e-mail, I appreciate your time, and I pray that you will do what we both know is the only right course of action right now. We must protect the lake, we must protect Utah's future. |
| 362 | Camille Chipman | Please reject U.S. Magnesium's permit application to further their intake canals into the Great Salt Lake. Utah is already facing water and air quality issues due to drought and pollution. The Great Salt Lake is facing ecosystem collapse due to increased salinity. If more water is not diverted to the Great Salt Lake, then algae, brine flies, and brine shrimp will continue to decline. These food sources are essential to sustain bird populations. As more lake bed becomes exposed and airborne, residence along the Wasatch Front face detrimental pollutants in the air. I was born in Utah County and my family has lived here for three generations. I care about the future of this state and the quality of life it provides. I am disappointed that we are experiencing the effects of overcrowding and the resulting rise in crime, homelessness, and pollution. I believe careful growth and industry regulation is vital to protect the quality of life we all hope to enjoy. I am asking you to prioritize the health and safety of Utah residents and wildlife by protecting the Great Salt Lake as a natural resource. Industrial growth is only beneficial if it adds to the stability and quality of life in our state. Please consider the negative impact U.S. Magnesium has already had on the water quality of the Great Salt Lake and the air quality of Salt Lake and Utah Counties. Please prevent them from causing further damage. |
| 363 | Tara Morin | I am submitting my comment on the US Magnesium proposal. I am writing to encourage you to say NO to it. This would cause the water to be salty. This has many ecosystem issues. Including, making the water too salty for brine shrimp to live. The great salt lake is at the lowest level it has been at. The lake is drying because too much water is being taken out. U.S Magnesium is a major contributor to lowering lake levels. In a typical year, they extract more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. They intentionally evaporate away more than 40 billion gallons of water a year to turn a profit for a few billionaires and the military industrial complex. So, please say NO to this proposal. We need to preserve the GSL for us now and for future generations. The GSL impacts recreational resources, air quality, and it will impact our water levels by less snow going into the watershed. |
| 364 | Natalie Clements | I live in Layton. I had previously heard that the Great Salt Lake is hitting new record lows every single day. It is one thing to hear this fact, quite another to see it. I have never seen the lake this low in my whole life. Also, where my home is, we get the winds coming off the lake and high risk for the carcinogens that are now being exposed because the lake is turning into a dust bowl. Learning that a company is actively trying to remove 100,000 gallons of water a minute is unbelievable! Please do not give US Magnesium the permit they are asking for. Not only will it affect our water quality, but it will also be the ecological demise of the entire system, which will directly impact the air quality for all the residents of Salt Lake City, UT, particularly along the Wasatch Front. With so much national and state-wide attention on the |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | Great Salt Lake, the idea that the Utah Division of Water Quality could potentially undermine efforts is absurd. Please consider the long-term ramifications of your decisions. Please do not grant US Magnesium the requested permit. |
| 365 | Siera Whitten | <p>The Great Salt Lake is a lively lake, but it is dying at a rapid rate. Approval of this permit would hasten the death of the lake and its ecosystems and endanger the lives of the humans residing in the surrounding areas. The amount of water required for US Magnesium's extraction process is far more than the Great Salt Lake has to give while the economic and environmental impacts are greater than what the region can sustain. The below italicized statement regarding the environmental impact is just not true. The canal extension would degrade water quality by changing the concentration and surface proximity of mercury, selenium, arsenic, and other pollutants now sequestered in the deeper waters and sediments of the bay. People will be harmed by inhalation of the harmful gases and dust released from newly exposed areas of lakebed making Gilbert Bay unhealthy, unsafe, and inaccessible for all types of water-based recreation. The extraction of water at this rapid rate would disrupt the life cycle of the brine flies, and therefore that of the many species of birds migrating to the GSL which rely on them as a food source. These bird species may face endangered status. We are witnessing the collapse of ecosystems, and the daunting possibility of a public health crisis. Extracting water from the lake would absolutely have a "significant impact on the chemical, physiological, or biological composition of the existing lakebed." This is devastating, scary, risky and unnecessary." The proposed application of the dredged material adjacent to the canals will not have a significant impact on the chemical, physiological, or biological composition of the existing lakebed. The project would not affect any threatened or endangered species or their critical habitat." Page 5: https://documents.deq.utah.gov/water-quality/facilities/401-wq-cert/DWQ-2022-027626.pdf I believe if we work together, we can find an alternative solution that will maintain the health of the lake and its ecosystems while balancing the need for extracting resources from the lake. Please, first, reject the US Magnesium permit. Then, work with biologists, sociologists, hydrologists (scientists!), local government, residents and other stakeholders to formulate and implement a process to restore and raise the lake's water levels to healthy levels before extracting more resources. This could mean implementing restrictions on private and public water use, diverting water from other sources to the lake, buying unused water from agriculture to raise the water level, and if US Magnesium needs all this water specifically from the GSL, require that they bring in just as much water as they take for their process. We - the people - can be more responsible in how we use water - and the UDWQ has the chance to do the right thing for humanity. To choose a natural, living resource over destruction and the creation of an environmental and public health catastrophe.</p> |
| 366 | Jacob Winters | <p>I oppose the US Magnesium harvesting of the Great Salt Lake. As a resident of Lakepoint, this lake is my backyard and I feel like it is my responsibility to protect it. Not only do I have personal attachment to the ecological and aesthetic aspects of the lake, I have concerns about the health of our community as its salinity increases. Right now, I am an engineering student at Brigham Young University. I want to have a positive influence on my communities. However, the future of Utah right now is concerning me. We are in the middle of a record breaking drought, and the GSL is not being replenished. With this, the pollution of the city is increasing drastically. The more the lake shrinks, the worse it will get. This application intends to bring the lake level down an additional 9 feet. I honestly find this mind boggling and I have to try to get my voice heard about it. A BYU study (2015) concluded that 40% of the particulate pollution in Logan and Ogden is sourced from the drying lakebed of the GSL. Since 2015, it has only gotten worse. If this application is passed, I would be afraid for the health of our communities. We need to reevaluate this. We need to work together and think of the future consequences.</p> |
| 367 | The Rev. Lora Young et al South Valley Unitarian Universalist Society | <p>On behalf of myself and the members and friends signed below of South Valley Unitarian Universalist Society, I submit this comment for a no vote on the proposed expansion of the permit by US Magnesium to extend two canals to further extract water from the Great Salt Lake. The lake is experiencing environmental collapse and this poses a severe risk to human, animal and plant life here in the valley. We need a new approach to the management of the lake and we need it now. Governor Cox recently paused new water rights and our Legislature is actively exploring options for conservation. We need a new approach to the management of the lake and we need it now. Our congregation has been actively engaged in advocacy to stop the degradation of this critical source of life in the valley and bring human interests in alignment with what is ecologically responsible and sustainable in a time of climate crisis and change. We urge the Department of Water Quality to take urgent action to save the GSL and preserve the surrounding areas for the wellbeing of all of us. The time for action is now. Our congregation has been actively engaged in advocacy to stop the degradation of this critical source of life in the valley and bring human interests in alignment with what is ecologically responsible and sustainable in a time of</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | climate crisis and change. We urge the Department of Water Quality to take urgent action to save the GSL and preserve the surrounding areas for the wellbeing of all of us. The time for action is now. |
| 368 | Ricklen Nobis | US Magnesium is one of the top air polluters in the country and their permit approval would result in less water, more lakebed toxins, and more air pollution along the Wasatch Front. I've flown over the site in a small airplane, a devastating experience. Please deny this permit. This is a terrible idea. I'm actually thinking (after living here for 45 years) of finding another place of residency once those toxic winds start to blow in from the dry Lake bed. Please take action NOW. This is something that affects ALL of us along the Wasatch front here in Salt Lake City. |
| 369 | Sarah May Salt Lake Valley Resident | I am writing as a concerned citizen of the Salt Lake Valley, an artist, storyteller, a member of the BIPOC community, and an advocate for the Great Salt Lake. I am reaching out specifically due to the water permit US Magnesium wants to file to deepen their canals, taking 9 more feet of water from the Great Salt Lake which is already at critically low levels. As more water is taken through the canals, the water quality will decrease with the salinity levels already at an alarming rate of 19%, which will destroy the lake's ecosystem, and affect the air and water quality with the exposed lake beds becoming larger with the absence of water. Brine Fly populations and algae in the lake are hanging in the balance and dying as the lake loses more water, and without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds are affected. The Great Salt Lake has always been a sacred home and refuge for me. As a person of colour, as someone who grew up in the in-between of identity, race, class, and marginalized for my very existence, the Great Salt Lake has always been a sacred place where I have seen myself, and where I have been held, seen, and healed by the beauty and stillness in a way only nature can. I have been venturing to the Great Salt Lake for more times than I can count, and her beautiful horizons, salty air, sagebrush, gentle waves, and smelly brine flies have been an outcast, and afterthought just like I have been. It is in this moment and many after this comment, that I will stand and fight for Great Salt Lake for being a safe and sacred space, so that she may be allowed the space and opportunity to heal herself as she has healed me. I urge you to consider the consequences of allowing this permit to go through, and to acknowledge the evidence of rising salinity levels as one of the many reasons to stop this water permit from going through. By putting the Great Salt Lake in the forefront of our minds and your minds, you are seeing people like me, who were taken in by this lake to become artists, writers, storytellers, and advocates, who become the ones who make our city and our state more rich and beautiful. I have attached some samples of my artwork, depicting the Great Salt Lake, and her driftwood preserved in sand and salt. Please reach out to me if you have any further comments or questions. |
| 370 | Rory Weeks Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Rory Weeks, I am a resident of Salt Lake City, Utah and a recent graduate from the University of Utah in both chemistry and environmental & sustainability studies. I am writing to say that I am <i>strongly opposed</i> to the proposed expansion of US Magnesium's intake canals on the Great Salt Lake. The lake ecosystem is already on the brink of collapse, and any additional significant water removal could tip this fragile system into an unprecedented state with numerous negative impacts on humans and nonhumans alike. Withdrawing yet more water from the lake with expanded intake canals will further decrease water quality by increasing the salinity concentration to a level not suitable for brine shrimp to thrive in - this project must not proceed if we are to have any hope of keeping this unique ecosystem healthy and functioning. We are in the midst of years of record drought in the state of Utah and the lake is at its lowest level ever recorded, and so, quite frankly, any action to further reduce the level of the lake is absolutely ludicrous and hugely disappointing to see proposed in the first place, given the present conditions. At a time when so many members of the public and the legislature are concerned about the lake's future, I would urge US Magnesium to read the room. <i>We do not want this permit to proceed.</i> The potential detrimental environmental impacts on wildlife, e.g. the birds that call the lake home, if the brine shrimp populations collapse due to high salinity levels, and on the people living along the Wasatch Front, who will be further exposed to lakebed dust laden with heavy metals and arsenic if the water level continues to drop, are to me clear indications that this permit should not be granted. Water quality and quality of life for all the beings that make the lake a part of their home will decrease due to the proposed actions. The permit should not move forward. |
| 371 | Gregory Wilson | My name is Gregory Wilson. I was born and grew up in Lehi, but have spent many of my years living in Salt Lake City. My professional background is in Integrated Water Resources Management, in which I hold a master's degree. In summary, it is a watershed-level approach to water management. I also studied geography and worked in GIS prior. I am tempted to write a long letter on this issue, since I have a professional perspective and interest in the Great Salt Lake. But in short, I wanted to |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>comment on my strong opposition to the US Magnesium permit to dredge and lengthen their intake canals in order to reach the lake water at diminished levels. The economic benefit of the Great Salt Lake has been important for many industries and people in Utah. This includes those industries installed directly on its shores like US Magnesium, brine shrimp industries, and salt extraction. For the sake of this conversation, I support the legacy and continuation of these industries. I want to be clear that I understand their economic importance as well as their legal right to their activities, so long as they are compliant. The very existence of the Great Salt Lake as we know it is very clearly threatened at this time. Without intervention, it absolutely will continue to shrink from overuse. As it shrinks, its ecosystem becomes more and more fragile. I would liken the request of US Magnesium to making someone smoke a cigarette while hospitalized and breathing through a ventilator. It is my opinion that we cannot allow the economic benefit of the lake to take priority over the very existence of the lake while in a threatened state. Under normal conditions, US Magnesium uses their canals and benefits from what the lake provides. Under threatened conditions, in critical condition, the health of the lake, water quality, and its ecosystem becomes the priority. It does not become the new normal, especially when extraction of water (the very threat to the lake) is the activity. Further diversions from a lake at critically low levels would contribute to its decline at an accelerated rate, increasing salinity, destroying its very benefit. It is my opinion that this would result in directly threatening the beneficial use of the bay and the lake itself. The chemistry and quality of the water would suffer to the point of no longer sustaining its ecosystems. When there is no rain, the farmer does not have water. When there is no lake level, US Magnesium does not have water. Beneficial use from a plentiful resource, but not when the resource is threatened. Just like the lobster fisherman who throws back the biggest male lobsters to ensure and encourage the continuation of the resource he lives off. The act of "finding more water" through engineering and diversion projects has its limits and it has its consequences, one of which is the water quality of the remainder of the lake.</p> |
| 372 | Shea Sawyer | <p>The future of our Great Salt Lake is in your hands. For years, we have failed to address the lowering levels of the lake and we risk losing it entirely because of that. What do we value more? Thriving ecosystems which allow life on earth to exist cohesively or money for billionaires? They already take so much, why allow more cuts in the earth when it hurts so much already? Most of the metal extracted from the lake goes to military manufacturing. Death and destruction of the earth and the life that inhabits it. All for an insatiable need to produce more. Please, you are in a position of power. Use it to do something right. Say no to U.S. magnesium's request to extend its canals.</p> |
| 373 | Hannah Chipman | <p>I'm against the drainage of The salt lake, and worried for the future of Utah's air quality if we continue to dredge the lake at the current, or new rate US Magnesium is applying for.</p> |
| 374 | Christine Kirkham Salt Lake City Resident | <p>US Magnesium must not be allowed to use more Great Salt Lake water. Their plan would make the lake too salty for brine shrimp, further degrading the ability of the lake to sustain any life at all. Please—REJECT this proposal.</p> |
| 375 | Mara Krista Plato | <p>Please do not allow the Great Salt Lake to collapse. Please stop excessive water diversion. The salinity of the lake is increasing and water levels are dropping tremendously. Please stop hurting the people of SLC who are subject to excessive dust and air pollutants. Please stop hurting the wildlife who are losing their food supplies. Think with your minds, be accountable to God, do what is right for present and future generations. Destroying creation and creating pollution for the sake of money is immoral and evil.</p> |
| 376 | Gabby Huntsman | <p>My name is Gabby Huntsman, and I am a student at Brigham Young University. This semester I have been taking a geology class focused on water. In this class we have discussed the climatology of water, floods and droughts, dams, rivers, watersheds, hydrology, water poisoning, the future of cities based on water, and much more. I have learned a lot about water and the need for us to be conservative with our water use. The Great Salt Lake is at the lowest level it has ever been, and it is going to continue to be that way. I learned in my geology class that the dust from the dry parts of the Great Salt Lake contain arsenic. Arsenic is a dangerous element that can cause cancer. The EPA regulates water for arsenic. It used to be that water could contain 50 ppm until they realized even that was unsafe. Now drinking water can only contain 10 ppm of arsenic. What happens when the water is gone and the lake beds start to dry up? The arsenic does not leave. It becomes a part of the dust. Dust that gets blown across the Salt Lake Valley. Allowing US Magnesium to take more water would result in you harming the citizens of Utah. Please look out for your residents.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | You have a duty to keep the citizens of Utah safe. Your loyalty is not to a company, but to Utahns. Do not allow US Magnesium a permit. Protect the Great Salt Lake and Utah. |
| 377 | Brenda Voisard, Ph.D. | Please stand up for our community health and the health of the Great Salt Lake, and say no to US Magnesium's request for extending 2 intake canals in Gilbert Bay. Our beautiful Lake is in crisis, please take leadership that will enable it to thrive, or at least survive, by saying NO. |
| 378 | Chloe Taurel & Hadley Miles | Last month, we read the New York Times article on the Great Salt Lake in AP Environmental Science. While we were aware of this problem, we had no idea of the severity it'd reached. We've been students through the Park City School District for 12 years, and, therefore, Utah residents for the majority of our lives. So many people who deny this problem haven't seen it firsthand: the record-breaking toxic air quality, wildfires that have interrupted our education, and countless droughts. Now is the time that we can – and need to – take action. The Great Salt Lake is at its lowest level right now. Not commonly known, US Magnesium takes 40 billion gallons every year, turning our life-sustaining water into their excessive profit. However, the water levels are so low that they can no longer extract the magnesium, so they're applying for a permit to expand – which will lower levels by 9 feet. We loved getting snow days in elementary school after 3 feet of snow – an occurrence that is increasingly rare. We love to ski and snowboard in the winter on fresh powder. We love spending our summer days hiking through the mountains or paddling boarding in the Jordanelle Reservoir, breathing in air that isn't poisoned by inversion and arsenic. While you may never live to see the day when these treasures are distant memories instead of regular occurrences, we will. We love living in Utah and hope never to see our hometown as a ghost town. As leaders of PCHS's Earth Club, we strive to increase sustainability within our community and encourage fellow teens to care. And so we ask you to do the same. Please shut down US Magnesium's threatening proposal and help preserve our lake, safety, and community. |
| 379 | Bryton Sampson Salt Lake City Resident | I was born and raised in Holladay, Utah. I am now a homeowner in Downtown Salt Lake City. I work for a local civic organization. I plan on living, working, voting, and spending money in SLC/Utah for the rest of my life. I have read about US Magnesium's Canal Extension Project and I adamantly say NO! The effects are too severe and there is too much at stake to allow this. Generations call this place home and the ramifications of US Magnesium's continued destruction of the ecosystem will contribute to making this land undesirable and perhaps even uninhabitable. Think long term. NO! |
| 380 | Alex Lopansri High School Student | Hello, my name is Alex Lopansri. I am a current senior in high school. For over 10 years, I have enjoyed the beautiful life of Utah and all the fun adventures it holds. My first ever experience with Utah was swimming in the Great Salt Lake, and all the wildlife surrounding it. Now, I am not writing this to reminisce on my previous endeavors, but to discuss the current depletion of the Great Salt Lake. US Magnesium is decimating the water level of Salt Lake, regardless of the fact that the lake is already at its lowest point in history. U.S Magnesium is currently working on being granted a permit that would allow them to dredge the location known as "Gilbert Bay" so they can continue to expand their intake canals, and drain the lake even further. U.S Magnesium is blatantly ignoring the natural ecosystems and diverse life that surrounds the lake. The persistent draining of the lake is increasing the already high salinity levels, increasing it from its current 19%. The dangerously high salinity levels are decimating the brine shrimp and fly populations. If the populations were to plummet, this would result in a multitude of issues, the biggest being a trophic cascade. The lack of basic food for many birds will cause them to die, starve, or be forced to move to another location in order to survive. Why cause all this harm? Why support climate change and increase the effects it already has? I understand that birds and flies may not be enough to rationalize the termination of the Great Salt Lake drain. However, if U.S Magnesium continues to drain, it will result in horrific effects for the Utah population. Under the lake are beds of many minerals, including Arsenic. As the lake continues to dry up, more and more of the arsenic beds are becoming exposed, allowing storms and winds to carry arsenic into the air, and to settle on to the nearby residents, exposing three-fourths of Utah's population to the arsenic. Not to mention that arsenic can cause skin cancer, cardiovascular diseases, and diabetes, and has been found to significantly impact the development of young adults. Me, as well as my peers are all asking U.S Magnesium to stop. We must be aware of the dangers the dredging poses for not only Utah, but the future of America as well. |
| 381 | David Baldrige | I'm writing to express my opinion on the dredging and expansion of US Mag Corp's intake canals. I believe that we are at a crossroads with the Great Salt Lake and must take immediate and extreme actions to save the lake and prevent an unfathomable ecological disaster that will, in the end, destroy the Wasatch Front and possibly |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | make it even uninhabitable. These dire consequences mean we must say NO to business as usual. The US Mag Corp proposal is just one of many actions that we need to examine. It will take many changes by all of us to save the Lake. While US Mag Corp produces the vast majority of our Magnesium in the USA, we must not do anything more to hurt the Great Salt Lake at this time. We must side with the Lake or we will not have a future. I know there will be consequences by having reduced production by US Mag Corp but we will have to solve those issues in other ways. At this point, saving the Great Salt Lake is the TOP priority. Say NO to US Mag Corp extending their intake canals. |
| 382 | Nate Lanza Millcreek Resident | My name is Nate Lanza. I'm a resident of Millcreek, and I'm writing to oppose the issuing of Section 401 Water Quality Certification no DWQ-2022-08001. Recent scientific studies have shown that the lake's salinity level has exceeded the 18% upper limit needed to sustain the current ecosystem of the Great Salt Lake. The proposed project would remove a very large amount of water from the GSL, increasing salinity levels and likely leading to massive damage to the lake's ecosystem. The reduced water level would also increase concentrations of toxic chemicals in the lake. This is a serious water quality concern. Furthermore, the reduced level of the lake caused by the massive amount of water removed threatens the microbialites which form the basis of the GSL ecosystem. While the microbialites are mentioned in the Water Quality Certification, it is clear that the full extent of potential impacts has not been considered by the State of Utah. For these reasons, it is imperative that the Department of Water Quality conduct a Level II Antidegradation review and present the results of the review to the public for comment before issuing this permit. The Department of Water Quality and the people of the Salt Lake Valley, whose health and livelihoods depend on the Great Salt Lake, need more information before allowing an action with so many potential consequences. The Department of Water Quality cannot possibly have enough information to issue this permit without having conducted a Level II Antidegradation review. |
| 383 | Lauren Simpson Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Lauren Simpson-- I am a Salt Lake City resident who is concerned about the impact of the proposed expansion of US Magnesium to lengthen their intake canals. I hope this comment is not too late-- I heard Nov 14 was the final day. I believe in being responsible stewards of the land. And with the Great Salt Lake and the brine shrimp population already in such a precarious position, I don't think it's responsible to take more water at this time. If anything, big corporations who divert water from the GSL should be doing their part by decreasing their water use, not increasing it. I have a young daughter and am very concerned about the effects of the erosion of GSL on her respiratory health. This proposal would be a step in the wrong direction. Please vote against US Magnesium's proposed expansion. |
| 384 | E. Sabo, DVM | I would implore you to please reject the proposal from US Magnesium to extend its canals to continue to draw large amounts of water from the Great Salt Lake. As a production animal veterinarian, I work every day to ensure that farmers are providing adequate and healthy environments for their cattle. Without a complete and robust farm ecosystem, I know the animals will become ill and it is much more expensive, and much less effective to treat illnesses than it is to prevent them. The Great Salt Lake is like the farm environment for the brine shrimp, birds, but most importantly us, the residents of the valley. Our ecosystem is based on 2 inputs: the mountains and the Salt Lake. Continuing to extract unreplaced water from the lake will increase its salinity, which will decimate the brine shrimp, brine fly and algae populations. Just like on a farm, massively changing one main portion of an ecosystem will drastically affect the health of the entire ecosystem permanently. It will be a much more expensive problem to fix than it would be to prevent. For the sake of the brine shrimp, the birds and for us, Please say NO to US Magnesium. |
| 385 | Jacqueline Sundstrand Great Lake Audubon | I am a member of the Great Salt Lake Audubon, and I am writing to express my concern for the proposal to allow US Mag to further deplete the ready critically low levels of the Great Salt Lake. As we speak, the the salinity levels of the lake are already too stressful for brine flies to reproduce which will affect millions of migratory birds that depend on these birds for survival. Please say NO to US Mag and allow the lake to heal. |
| 386 | Julia Binns Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Julia Binns. I've been a Salt Lake resident for 15 years, living in the Avenues, Liberty Wells, and Sugarhouse. I moved here from my home state of Alaska and one of the main reasons that factored into my decision to move to Salt Lake City was the beautiful landscape and access to nature, including the Great Salt Lake. I greatly value our state's resources and want to fight to help protect them. I am writing to oppose the US Magnesium permit request to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. Allowing US Magnesium to continue to pull water out of our lake at vastly large volumes without accommodations for the drying of the lake. We should be taking measures to reduce the impact on the lake, not maintaining the status quo and further damaging this resource. Allowing for this permit from |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | US Magnesium will cause a negative impact to the water quality of the Great Salt Lake and a destruction in the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A Designation including the food chain for water-oriented life. In addition, the lower lake levels will risk greater exposure and drying out of microbialites. With that, the brine fly larvae will lose their food source and will thus have their population reduced which then impacts the food source for the birds that frequent the area. |
| 387 | Caitlin Payne | Are you kidding?! Have you been outside?! We are dryer than a mouthful of cinnamon. |
| 388 | Haley Wagoner Salt Lake City Resident | I'm writing regarding US Magnesium's permit to extend two intake canals into the Great Salt Lake. I do NOT support this action and strongly believe the permit should be denied. I am an environmental planner and am also expecting my first child in March... It's one thing for me to think about how extractive practices pretty much ALWAYS have an effect on ecosystems (from a professional perspective) but when I think about it through the potential perspective of my unborn child, who will hopefully live into the 22nd century, it becomes much more personal. When I think about raising a child here, the thing that I am MOST excited about are the outdoor opportunities that we will likely share. How many other places can you ski and mountain bike in the same day? How many places might you see a white pelican flying over your house and toward snow capped peaks? (The first time I saw that I was shocked and amazed!). The weather in the city is really comfortable for most of the year as well - more so than anywhere else I have lived including Burlington, VT, Tucson, AZ, Portland, OR and Austin, TX. Basically, what I'm trying to say is I love it here BUT the one thing in the Salt Lake valley that has been markedly different and WORSE than anywhere I have lived is the air quality. If US Magnesium is able to lower the level of the lake, more minerals and toxins will be exposed and able to get into our air and into our lungs. This has proven to be awful especially for developing young children (and pregnant women!). If the air quality worsens, the things that excite me most about this area will be inaccessible and definitely not something I want to expose my child to. It makes me wonder if we will have to leave someday, pushed out by environmental factors that were totally preventable. (Also, I know this is a privileged perspective - not all people will have the resources to leave if things get bad and that is a huge issue!) US Magnesium's extraction practices will also lead to consistent, higher salinity levels that will likely lead to ecosystem collapse. This is terrible news for brine shrimp, migratory birds, larger predators, etc. This is also terrible news for birds hundreds to thousands of miles away from the Great Salt Lake as this would be a huge hit to the flyway. The Great Salt Lake is a system within itself but also a part of a larger, continental, even global system. I want to be able to bring my kid to Antelope Island without a gas mask to see some bison and migratory birds someday. PLEASE SAY NO TO US MAGNESIUM'S PERMIT!! |
| 389 | Kelly Hauer | I am writing to you today to ask, plead actually, that the proposal made by US Magnesium to extend their canals several more miles in the Great Salt Lake be turned down. I have lived in Salt Lake City for several years now and am a partner to a native who has spent his entire 36 years here in Salt Lake and Utah County. We have multiple family members who have yet to see double digits in age. I cannot in good faith stand back and keep my objections to myself largely because of them. They deserve to feel secure in knowing that the future viability of their city is not in question. They deserve to believe in their legislatures prioritizing saving ecosystems from total collapse over business as usual. Especially when business as usual no longer fits the model of sensible or sustainable practice. The lake levels of the Great Salt Lake are at an all time low and according to scientific studies, water quality is waning at rapid speed. The current salinity sits at around 18% and if it increases due to more water loss (which it would if the canals were extended), the ecosystem faces total collapse. Why? The major species that inhabit the lake are brine shrimp and these animals cannot withstand the water increasing in salinity beyond the current level. If these creatures do not exist, migratory waterfowl no longer exist in the region either. As the brine flies and shrimp are the only food source known to the migratory bird populations. That is millions of birds we are talking about. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake's viability and its potential to rebound in the future. The US Magnesium proposal to extend its canals to 4185 feet may give US Magnesium a couple years of business as usual, but we cannot afford to be so short-sighted when it comes to this matter. We are talking about devastating a vibrant ecosystem of hemispheric importance for birds and for people. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah. The only acceptable way to continue issuing rights to US Magnesium would be to make it their responsibility to raise the lake levels first so that ecosystem collapse would not be imminent. Do the right thing by all Utahns and protect this resource once and for all. Take pride in allowing future Utahns the right to healthy ecosystems. You can do it. Please |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 390 | Emily Stenlund | <p>Regarding the Great Salt Lake Magnesium permit, there are so many ways it can affect our environment. As the water levels have been declining we have been seeing a decline in the brine flies which takes away the food source for many of the birds. If this permit is approved then we will see a decline in water levels, which will affect the birds, brine flies, and shrimp. As the water decreases then the saline levels will increase making it impossible for these organisms to thrive. Passing this permit will only make things worse for the animals living in the habitat. They will either die or have to leave. It won't only affect the animals, but humans as well. When the water levels go down there is more exposure to arsenic. If it gets bad enough there could be major dust storms made by the lake that contains arsenic. Yes, it wouldn't be constant storms, but the more water we take the increased severity of dust storms we will see. The Great Salt Lake is the cornerstone of Utah's name. It used to be one of our largest water sources, but we have been abusing it from the beginning. When people think of Utah they think of The Great Salt Lake. Once that is gone what will people think of us? We lose our pride and our lake. It would be better to show the rest of the country that we can take care of our water sources. If this permit gets approved it will do more harm than good. Not solely on animal habitation, but on us as Utah residents.</p> |
| 391 | Merrilee & Douglas Knight | <p>Say "NO" to US Magnesium! We are lifelong residents of Salt Lake City, and we are very adamantly opposed to the US Magnesium's permit to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. We strongly support no new diversions for the following reasons: The salinity of the water is at a dangerous levels, The lake is already dangerously low creating a dust bowl full of toxins, Our air quality is affected, It will devastate the natural ecosystem, It's totally throwing off our weather patterns--"The Lake Effect" How can you do this to this beautiful state? Is it all about MONEY? What a travesty! We all will be forced to move out of this state because of the dangerous levels of toxins that will come off of the lake when the lakebed becomes exposed. This is our home and it's being taken away from us with greed. Hopefully you'll do the right thing for our state.</p> |
| 392 | Soren Jorgensen | <p>My name is Soren Jorgensen, a lifelong resident of Salt Lake City and a biology student at the University of Utah. Too much water has been diverted from the lake at the expense of the majority of its residents, human and non-human alike. The lake is essential to the health of ourselves, our community, and the longevity of our city and as the lake's water levels drop, irreversibly ripple effects will cause ecological collapse, worsen air quality, and damage economic value across the Wasatch Front. Extending U.S Magnesium intake canals and dredging more lake water will only worsen our dire situation. Instead of spending time and resources on extending their canals, they should be promoting projects and legislation that return the lake to its former levels so that the current infrastructure can function as intended. Utah cannot afford to permit US Magnesium to take more water from the lake. Please deny US Magnesium's permit to extend their intake canals.</p> |
| 393 | Paige Willey Great Salt Lake Rowing | <p>My name is Paige Willey, and I am a board member and rower with Great Salt Lake Rowing. I'm writing to share my opposition to the US Magnesium permit to take more water from the lake. GSLR celebrates its 20th year as a club in 2022, but this is the first year we have ever had to cancel our season due to lake levels at the Great Salt Lake. For eight years I have rowed on this lake with my fellow club members. Just three years ago, we could row anywhere on the lake. Due to lake levels the last three years, we have had to restrict or cancel many of our activities. The lake's Class 5A designation states the water be "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation". To my knowledge, rowing falls under this classification. Increased salinity poses a risk to our boats, and the heavy metals we increasingly breathe as the lake recedes pose a risk to our health. We regularly take air quality into account when scheduling our club rows. Besides my own uses, the changes I have personally seen on the lake are disturbing and drastic. We have built our state on this water, whether we acknowledge it or not. There is nothing wrong with living within our means. Can our state withstand similar drastic changes that will come from destroying the delicate ecosystem? I strongly oppose permitting US Magnesium to divert more water from the lake, using this resource only for themselves and to the detriment of others and the ecosystem.</p> |
| 394 | Leah Lindley Student Brigham Young University | <p>As a senior accounting student at Brigham Young University, I love and understand numbers. Withdrawing money from a bank account without depositing as much as you're taking will leave it empty. Although I'm not an expert on science, I do understand that just like a bank account the water being removed from the Great Salt Lake faster than water is flowing into it will result in the lake being empty. According to the New York Times the lake drying up isn't the worst thing that could come from the low water levels. The New York Times also states that, "the lakebed contains high levels of arsenic." As the lake dries, this will be carried by the wind and nearby Utah residents will be breathing in arsenic. This is a big enough reason to act! US Magnesium, LLC doesn't have the population of Utah's best interest at heart. We must say no to US Magnesium's plans to extract more water from the Great Salt Lake. Human lives are more important than US Magnesium's revenue.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 395 | Laura Stingham | From personal and scholarly study, this permit to take more water from the Great Salt Lake will do more harm than good, and here is why. With the 20+ year drought here in Utah, taking more water from a lake that is already turning dry will worsen the situation. The Great Salt Lake as of late has reached historic lows causing dust from the dry lake bed, and increase salt density in the lake. The lake has been reported to be 19% salinity, which is terrible as 18% causes ecosystem collapse. We have seen this ecosystem already show signs of collapse with the lake having become too salty causing certain insects to leave, then making the birds leaving due to having no food to eat. We need to help bring water into this lake, not take more out. If this permit finds a way to make it so they give back more water than they take, then it would be alright. But it is the fact they are planning on lowering the level by 9 feet that makes it to dangerous to risk. I hope this helps the cause, and that people can see that we need to save the Great Salt Lake, rather than drain it till it is dry. |
| 396 | Helena Gaffney | My name is Helena Gaffney, and I'm writing to oppose US Magnesium's permit request to remove more water from the Great Salt Lake. I'm an outdoor enthusiast who recently relocated to Salt Lake City to enjoy its natural wonders; little did I know, mega-corporations are actively working to destroy them. This discovery infuriated me, not only as someone who enjoys the outdoors, but also as an environmentalist and humanitarian that wishes to preserve the Earth and the Human Race.US Magnesium is a major contributor to lowering lake levels, extracting more water in a year than Ogden, Provo, and SLC combined. Their efforts devastate our environment while profiting the 1%. Utah Administrative code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. The lake is a crucial pit stop for migratory birds, and as the water level decreases, the salinity increases, and the lakebed is exposed, making the lake inhabitable for birds' food sources. State scientists have already taken salinity measurements of 19% in open water and have warned that if salinity persists >18%, ecosystem collapse is imminent. The anticipated impacts are so significant that several birds could become candidates for listing under the Endangered Species Act. If ecosystem health isn't motivating enough, every square mile of lakebed exposed contributes to the dustbowl of toxins blowing across the Wasatch Front, negatively impacting human health. For every foot of water removed, hundreds of square miles of lakebed are exposed; US Magnesium is planning on removing 9 feet of water...This would result in thousands of miles more of exposed lakebed, equating to an exponential increase in airborne toxins, such as arsenic.I implore you to deny this permit request, if not for the sake of our environment, for our own survival. At minimum, with the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to return an equal amount of water in the form of upstream water rights; this should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on the Great Salt Lake in order to ensure the protection of the lake's beneficial uses.Thank you for your consideration. Please make the right choice for our home. |
| 397 | Tiffany Baird, DVM MPH Salt Lake County Resident | I am writing to express my disapproval for US Magnesium's application to extend two canals and remove water from the Great Salt Lake at a rate of 100,000 gallons per minute. As a Salt Lake County resident, I am greatly concerned about both the availability and quality of water in our area. Moving forward with the US Magnesium application intentionally puts the residents of Salt Lake County at risk. Please reject this application and focus on approving measures that will increase the size and quality of the water of the Great Salt Lake. Our children's future depends on it. |
| 398 | Cindy Maw | My name is Cindy Maw. I am 79 years old. I have loved the GSL since my childhood. If US Magnesium is allowed their permit there will be no turning back from the devastation to the lake. The decreased lake levels will increase salinity which will harm the living creatures in & around the lake. Please do NOT allow US Magnesium a permit. |
| 399 | Clarissa Chipman | Please save the GSL from US Magnesium's plan to extend their canals.Our lake has already suffered devastating water losses, reaching a historic low this summer. I received a B.S. in wildlife and wildlands conservation and a minor in Environmental Science from BYU. Birds are my passion. The UDWR sponsored the Great Salt Lake Waterbird Survey Five-Year Report written by D.S. Paul and A.E. Manning. Their report lists the following species dependent on the GSL: 20,000 breeding American white pelicans-one of four breeding colonies in North America, 50,000 Wilson's phalaropes-the largest staging concentration in the world, 30,000 marbled godwits-the only staging area in the interior US, 10,000 snowy plovers-the world's largest assemblage, representing 55% of the breeding population west of the rockies, 21,600 white-faced ibises-the largest breeding population in the world, 160,000 breeding California gulls (our beloved state bird)-the largest breeding population in the |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>world, 2,200,000 eared grebes- of the two largest staging populations in North America. Allowing US Magnesium to drain our lake so drastically hurts us all. I fear that US Magnesium's permit will increase salinity and heavy metal buildup in Gilbert Bay, destroying the water quality necessary to sustain bird populations. State scientists have measured 19% salinity in the GSL this year. At 18% salinity and above algae (the foundation of the GSL food web) starts to die. If salinity percentages don't decrease, the entire ecosystem of the GSL is going to collapse. This contradicts the beneficial uses associated with class 5A designation, which requires DWQ to protect the "...waterfowl, shorebirds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain". (UAC R317-2-6.5(a)). I'm a proud born and raised Utahn. My family has lived here for generations. I genuinely love this state, more than I can express. Please save our birds.</p> |
| 400 | <p>Joe Brown West Valley City Resident</p> | <p>I'm Joe Brown. Born and raised in the Salt Lake Valley. I love the state where I reside but I believe it's in a lot of hot water and if we allow US Magnesium to continue polluting the GSL, not only will the wildlife suffer but we as humans will also degrade. I fear the lake will dry up whether we like it or not and when it does we'll be faced with a once great city turned uninhabitable. Please save our lake, city, state, and way of life.</p> |
| 401 | <p>Kira Emery Brown West Valley City Resident</p> | <p>As a homeowner in West Valley City I have been feeling the effects of the Great Salt Lake losing water. I was born in Salt Lake and lived much of my life out of state until recently. I bought my first house in West Valley 2 years ago and childhood asthma came back in full force. There is not a single morning that I wake up and breathe easily. As more water leaves the Great Salt Lakemore pollutants are exposed to our air. I don't want to have to move because of my health. My family is here. My life is here. Please, block US Magnesium from taking even more water from our lake. The Salt Lake area is beautiful. Please, protect our natural areas and stand up for public health. Tell US Magnesium that people are more important than profit.</p> |
| 402 | <p>Sarah Schfaeful</p> | <p>I urge you to stand up for the health of our name-sake. Please say no to US Magnesium's plans to extend 2 intake canals in the GSL. The Salt Lake is in enough peril as is, it cannot afford to be further taxed. Thank you for your time & help. I look forward to yearning back from you & following up on your decision</p> |
| 403 | <p>Kali Koury</p> | <p>My name is Kali Koury. I am a student at Taylorsville High School. I love living in Utah and I would hate to have to leave because of compromising health conditions. If the elevation of the lake keeps dropping it would expose more lakebed and kick up more toxic dust. Receding water concentrates the salinity of the lake, higher levels of salt puts the lives of the brine shrimp, brine flies, algae, and microbes that live in the Great Salt Lake in danger and it could collapse the food chain. I say NO to US Magnesium's permit to extend the intake canals</p> |
| 404 | <p>Chris Phillippi Sandy Resident</p> | <p>My name is Chrie. I'm currently residing in Sandy, UT but am proud to call many areas of Salt Lake, Utah and Grand County my home, as I've lived all over in our state. I spent my childhood going on field trips to the Great Salt Lake. I take every friend who visits out to Spiral Jetty. The lake, and this state, is very special to me.. and I'm sure all of us who have grown up here. I'm writing to express my concern with U.S. Magnesium's recent application to lengthen their canals and dredge large amounts of water from our lake, which as we all know is currently in a precarious state. Their request directly threatens the protected state of Gilbert Bay, further raises our salinity levels, and comes at a time when the main focus should be sustaining and protecting our lake and its currently fragile ecosystem. This company is blatantly ignoring the state of our lake and how it affects the residents of Utah and only has eyes for its profits. I am asking that you please deny this application from US Magnesium until the following requirements are met: 1. A Level II Antidegradation review has been conducted and clearly indicates that the US Magnesium's request will not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay 2. U.S. Magnesium has plans to put an equal amount of water back into the lake. This is one business amongst hundreds. Our local businesses and our residents should not shoulder the burden of their request. Businesses that wish to use the GSL for profit, should be required to actively plan and follow through with sustainable action along with it.</p> |
| 405 | <p>Brittany Parry Taylorsville Resident</p> | <p>I am a mother of 4 & I love my home in SLC. The waning water levels of the GSL & the environmental repercussions to the health of my family are a huge concern. I say a big NO to US Magnesium's permit to extend intake canals in Gilbert Bay. GSL's water quality will be severely compromised. The increased salinity will kill the brine flies. The migratory birds won't have a foodsource. Please do not allow further destruction of our lake.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 406 | Oaklee Jones Utah Resident | My name is Oaklee Jones: Utahn, mother, wife, professional. I oppose section 401 water quality permit for US Magnesium. This is bad because rising salinity be decreased water levels will negatively impact plant, animal and humans living in the SLC area and beyond. Stop private companies from ruining our quality of life. Protect our waters-keep Utah nature in the forefront of decisions being made. Save our own future |
| 407 | | I am opposed to the section 401 water quality permit US Magnesium. This permit will allow them to decrease the lake levels and increase salinity in the lake which will harm the living creatures that depend on the lake water. |
| 408 | Jenna Templeton | I vehemently oppose the state's intention to issue a Section 401 Water Quality Certification to US Magnesium. Giving US Mag access to take water out of the Great Salt Lake would have a devastating effect on the ecosystem, migratory birds and human public health. If lake levels continue to drop, we will experience more catastrophic bad air days and expose ourselves to the toxic dust in the lake bed. |
| 409 | Gabriel Ambrose | I remember going to the GSL for the first time with my 3rd grade class. To this day, I can't forget the way that your eyes feel when you're submerged under that water even for a second, you take your first steps our seeing the brine shrimp nestled in the sand and the seagulls that soared high in the sky; all as one. I remember thinking that there truly is nothing like this in the world. Realizing that this place may not be here many years later truly does trouble me Not just in the malignant environmental impacts that will occur when the GSL dries, but in the experience that you take away from the Utahns of tomorrow. |
| 410 | Travis Jones Salt Lake City Resident | Please consider saving our Great Salt Lake. It is not only a part of Utah, it is a part of the US ecology. You can say no to the US Mag 401 Lake Water Bill and I hope you love Utah as much as I do. |
| 411 | Dallas Olson | I am opposed to the Section 401 Water Quality Permit for US Magnesium. This will decrease already low lake levels and increase salinity which will harm the living creatures that depend on the lake water. |
| 412 | Taylor Koury Taylorsville Resident | My name is Taylor Koury of Taylorsville, UT. If the magnesium permit passes I would leave home because of compromising health conditions. If the lake lowers, the lake bed will become more exposed and toxic dust will be stirred up. There will be a high concentration of salt in the lake. This means the ecosystem will be compromised and the food chain may collapse. Say no to US Magnesium's permit to extend the intake canals in Gilbert Bay |
| 413 | Crew Jones | Don't drain the Great Salt Lake! It is one of the iconic things about UT. If it is drained we will see a problem occur within our ecosystem. It would be awesome if the Lake stayed where it is and how it is! |
| 414 | | I feel this is an abhorrent lack of foresight into the structure of a national, historical, ecological landmark, all for \$\$! This will strategically displace all the fauna, increasing the salinity of the lake creating a toxic barrenness that man will not ever recover! We need action to save such a wonder and not squalor it away |
| 415 | Spencer Alan Moore | I am opposed to Section 401 water quality permit.the fact that my local government would entertain this idea is troubling. save the lake, save my city. |
| 416 | Sarah Ashbaker | I am opposed to the section 401 Water Quality Permit for US Magnesium. This permit will allow them to decrease the lake levels and increase salinity in the lake which will harm the living creatures that depend on lake water. |
| 417 | Susan Crapo | Do not allow US Magnesium to extend their canal deeper into the Great Salt Lake in order to draw off more water. The Great Salt Lake is currently at record low levels and allowing more water to be drawn from it is irresponsible. Please deny this request. |
| 418 | Kateryna Yurchenko Student | My name is Kateryna Yurchenko, I'm a student at BYU currently taking a Geology class. It came to my attention that the Utah Division of Water Quality is looking to extend US Magnesium's permit for two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. I would like to express my disapproval of this action as we must stop the |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | Brigham Young University | devastation of the lake any further. If there is less water in the lake, it will increase the salinity, which in return would make the lake too salty for brine shrimp to live in. Therefore, we must not proceed with this extension. |
| 419 | Ted Winkworth | I'm sure you'll start getting more messages like this in the coming days and weeks from people who are learning about the consideration being given to US magnesium to extend and expand their claim to the great salt lake. I'll keep my comments brief. Please act with common sense and in the interest of all Utahns by denying these permits. This is a critical moment for the lake and, subsequently, our ability to live here. Whatever financial benefits the state receives from these companies are far outweighed by the devastating impact that further lake depletion will have. |
| 420 | Jeff Ogzewalla North Salt Lake Resident | If Mag Corp truly extracts the amount of water from the GSL that has been in the news, please do not allow them to continue. One company's well being cannot outweigh the detriment incurred by the continued degradation of the lake |
| 421 | Calvin Davidson Student University of Utah | My name is Calvin Davidson and I am currently a student at the University of Utah. I have lived in Salt Lake my whole life. I have personally witnessed the levels of water in the Great Salt Lake lower each year. This is not okay and the use of these waters for human purposes must come to a stop. I hold this lake very close to my heart and our whole city is based around its significance. With the lake continuing to dry up and the continued allowance of extraction of this water we will see the ecosystem crumble with huge amounts of death to all kinds of species including humans. When the lake is gone as a result of letting humans hold no barrier will we rename our city? Will we pay for the millions of dollars it will take to protect civilians from toxic harm from the dried lake bed? We must act now and say NO to US Magnesium's continued draining of this immensely important lake. |
| 422 | Jesse Margolies | I am writing to you today to not allow US Magnesium to take even more water out of the GSL. The Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake's viability and its potential to rebound in the future. The US Magnesium proposal to extend its canals to 4185 feet may buy the company a year or two of operating time, but it devastates a natural waterway and a vibrant ecosystem of hemispheric importance for birds and for people. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah. US Magnesium is a major contributor to lowering lake levels. In a typical year they extract more water than Ogden, Provo, and SLC COMBINED. THIS IS NOT SUSTAINABLE! |
| 423 | Linda Hull | As I follow news and studies pertaining to the Great Salt Lake, it's my understanding that the Great Salt Lake is on the verge of an ecological collapse due to the on-going drought and historically low water levels. Issuance of a Section 401 certification to US Magnesium during this critical time for the Great Salt Lake is unconscionable. I strongly urge the Division of Water Quality to use any legal means available to delay action on U.S. Magnesium's request until further steps are taken to more thoroughly evaluate the anticipated detrimental effect on the Great Salt Lake ecosystem. |
| 424 | Ashley Raymond | The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of GSL and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to further devastate the lake's ecosystem. It's time for our leaders to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. Please do not issue this permit. |
| 425 | Zack Adams South Jordan Resident | It's hard to believe, while the entire Great Salt Lake ecosystem is near collapse, US Magnesium wants to increase their consumption of the lake water. I understand their water rights, and a business needs to make money. But a dry lake bed and a collapsed ecosystem affects everybody in the valley. For the health of our kids, and the survival of our natural ecosystems. I strongly advise that we deny this permit. Water rights should be purchased upstream in order to replace the water that is being consumed. One company shouldn't be allowed to ruin it for everybody. |
| 426 | Jennifer Ball-Strent | Please Please Please do the right thing and say no to US Magnesium destroying what is left of the Great Salt Lake. Humans, animals, the health of the planet and future generations need you to make the right choice. Please turn the tide and allow for something positive to begin here. Do not put one more nail in our coffins. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 427 | Emily Stromness | I'd like to go on record, stating my opposition to the magnesium canal. With the lake down 40% it doesn't make sense to grant anyone rights to take water out. The lake is vital to our air, our snow, and millions of migratory birds. We cannot afford to let this lake die. |
| 428 | Laurel Duncan, CRA Associate Director University of Utah | I'm very concerned about US Magnesium's Canal Continuation Project proposal. I strongly support no new diversions and this proposal will take 100,000 gallons per MINUTE from the Great Salt Lake. This would be devastating to the Salt Lake valley and ecosystems throughout the US and beyond. As a resident of Salt Lake City, the potential for toxic dust and worse air quality is a real fear. This proposal will impair water quality by increasing salinity levels in the lake and disrupt the food chain. I understand that magnesium mining could be escalated to a national defense issue. In which case, I hope the division could steer US Magnesium toward developing more sustainable mining techniques and require that they replenish the lake's water level to a safe depth. |
| 429 | Marilyn Smith | Why would it even be a question? It matters not how much money it makes anyone. You can't spend money when you or your planet's dead. |
| 430 | Wayne Phillips | My jaw dropped when I heard that US Magnesium is proposing diverting 100k gallons a minute from the great salt lake. I live in SLC and my work and life depends on clean air, clean water, and snow. This proposal will impair water quality by increasing salinity levels in the lake and disrupting the food chain - possibly to a point of no return. Please reject this and any proposal that doesn't return at least as much water back into the lake. |
| 431 | Matthew Monahan Salt Lake City Resident | I am a SLC resident, born and raised. My whole life the SLC has been shrinking and my family and I are increasingly scared that someday we'll be forced to move if the lake dries up. Allowing US Magnesium to siphon off large amounts of water, or basically any, will absolutely negatively affect water quality, not to mention the negative impacts to our air and wildlife health. The other corporate users of the lake, like the brine shrimp farmers and salt companies, also want water in the lake. Please hear the people and stop US Magnesium from irreparably harming our environmental health. |
| 432 | Madelon Juliano Utah Resident | I'm writing to BEG you. Please please please don't allow US Magnesium to further destroy our beautiful and important Great Salt Lake. I'm a sixth generation Utahn, and I just had my first child, bought my second home here and have so many beautiful memories here in the mountains and on the lake as a kid. It's devastating to see the impact we've had on the GSL as her waters continue to recede, exposing toxins that are incredibly dangerous and will detrimentally impact our already bad air quality. I sympathize with the fact that US magnesium employs lots of people and contributes to our economy, but we must realize that there will be many victims like this of climate change. We have an opportunity here to make sure that victim this time will be a corporation and not the life of my child. Your children. Ourselves. Please look at the science. The science does not lie, has no political affiliations, and is not in the pocket of any corporation. You have the power to make real change and I hope you all make the right choice. If not - and if you are all in the pockets of these great polluters in our valley, I do hope you can sleep at night knowing how you've destroyed our city with your massive contribution to the environmental disaster that is to come. Please. Please please please do the right thing. |
| 433 | Jalyn Bender | Please say NO to the US Magnesium Permit.-- |
| 434 | F Alvarez Salt Lake City Resident | Please give the lake time to keep what water comes in. We don't need more diversions. In all likelihood, Mag Corp can afford to truck in water to help short term, and when the water comes back up they can resume their usual business. |
| 435 | Nicholas Johnstone | My name is Nicholas Johnstone and I recently learned about the US Magnesium Permit to take more water from the Great Salt Lake. I greatly oppose this permit and I am asking you to please help stop this destruction of the ecosystem. If they are able to obtain this permit, it will drop the water level by 9 feet increasing the salinity of the water and killing the various animals that call the Great Salt Lake their home. For the homeowners in Salt Lake, this vast drop in water levels will cause a major change in the weather patterns. This will lead to less snow, more extreme droughts, and poisonous arsenic being released into the air. Is this what you want? Make the right decision for the millions of people living in the Salt Lake area. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 436 | Lily Bosworth Wasatch Front Resident | I'm writing to oppose the permit request by US Magnesium to use more Great Salt Lake water. Given the extremely low elevation of the lake currently, and unknown future hydrology, I am deeply concerned that shrinking the lake further would worsen the lake's water quality and lead to ecosystem collapse, which would have dire consequences for the well-being of Utahns. Our past ways of operating the lake are no longer effective given the numerous stressors the lake is experiencing, and so we need to change our management approach until the lake is restored and beyond. |
| 437 | Jessica Ellis Kaysville Resident | My name is Jessica Ellis. I live near the shore of the Great Salt lake in Kaysville, UT. I am a nurse-midwife and a professor. I am concerned about the drop in the lake level over the past several years. We need to protect the lake as it is vital to the Utah economy and to the future populations in the state. Lake levels impact our local environments like antelope island and the snow in the cottonwood canyons. Lake levels and salinity levels also impact the global environment by providing a place for migrating birds to stop along well-developed migration paths. The lake levels are already low, losing another 9 feet would be devastating. Please take care of the Great Salt Lake for the greater good of our state now and in the future. Please say NO to US Magnesium's plans to further devastate the lake's ecosystem. |
| 438 | Hannah Bybee Byers Utah Resident | My name is Hannah Bybee Byers and I have been a resident Utah resident the most of my life. I love this state, and recognize that the depletion of the Great Salt Lake is a very serious issue. I DO NOT support US Magnesium's request for a permit to extend their two water intake canals. I encourage US Magnesium to help find ways to replenish the GSL rather than dredging up toxic materials that have been found to be in the GSL lakebed. There are already reports of the environmental and health ramification of toxic dust, from arsenic and other naturally occurring metals, being blown into Utah's air due to depleting GSL water levels. US Magnesium is not looking for longterm solutions to the problem of the lake evaporating. The company's solution is to only to make their operation easier for the time being. US Magnesium is being reactive, rather than proactive. Their idea of extending their canals does not seem like a long-term solution for their business to operate. I encourage additional questions about how long before they have to request additional permits to AGAIN need to extend their canals. Protect Utahns. Protect the Great Salt Lake. |
| 439 | Stephanie Wilcock | US Magnesium is a major contributor to lowering lake levels. In a typical year, they extract more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. They intentionally evaporate away more than 40 billion gallons of water a year to turn a profit for a few billionaires and the military industrial complex – all this while millions of pounds of chlorine are spewed across thousands of acres of lakebed. U.S. Magnesium recently applied for permits to lengthen their intake canals by several miles. The lake level is so low they aren't able to reach the water and want to dredge more than 100 acres of lake body to reach the water and continue sucking the lake dry. Because of how shallow the lake is, for every foot of elevation the shore line recedes, hundreds of square miles of lakebed are exposed. And U.S. Magnesium wants to take more water, while the lake is on the brink of collapse. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels – already too high for life in the lake at 19% – will increase and destroy the lake's ecosystem. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in two years if 18% salinity levels persist. Brine fly populations are already plummeting and algae is dying. Without these critical food sources, the lives of millions of migratory birds hang in the balance. Granting the permit request would also result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with DWQ's Class 5A designation. Utah Administrative Code states the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay are "[p]rotected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain." This permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and should not be issued. All eyes are on the lake. The Department of Water Quality must take full responsibility for the health of GSL and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem. It's time to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake in order to ensure the protection of the Lake's beneficial uses. Please be a responsible steward of our important and beautiful lake. Refuse this permit |
| 440 | Camille Baker Holladay Resident | The Great Salt Lake is a public resource critical for nationwide ecosystems and the air quality of Utah. Granting a permit to US magnesium for a canal extension allows a private company to deplete the lake at unprecedented low elevations where the lake is already in severe distress. In the wake of legislative actions attempting to save the lake, repermitting to allow one private company to destroy the lake absolutely cannot be justified! I urge against the permitting of the canal. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 441 | Samuel Grenny Salt Lake City Resident | I'm writing as a resident of Utah and of Salt Lake City to express my strong opposition to US Magnesium's proposal to deepen the canals in the Great Salt Lake. Water quality is a top concern for me and this project seems rife with risks to it. With all of the other threats to water quality happening, letting this project move forward is an unnecessary risk and one that I really hope the DEQ will take off the table. Please protect clean water both for us now and for countless future generations who would be affected. We desperately need our state agencies to step up in this fight and not let the federal government make decisions for us that might imperil us. |
| 442 | Gayle Watts | We can not allow for the water to get any lower than it is and cause more health problems in Utah. Please wow what is best for those living in Utah and say no |
| 443 | Amy May Salt Lake Valley Resident | Hello, I'm just writing to let you know I hope the US Magnesium extension is denied. The lake is in peril and now is not the time for even more water loss. As a resident of the west side of the Salt Lake valley, I am concerned about the toxic dust and further air quality issues that will imperil our community. Thank you! |
| 444 | Brenda Hughes | As great salt lake levels drop the dust is poison and is blanketing our land.Areas that grow food, Children play and people live. Do not extend or renew this company for profit US Magnesium's canal or any permits. This is a toxic situation and the cats out of the bag, as the saying goes! |
| 445 | Miranda Menzies Eden Resident | Comments on US Magnesium Application for Extension of intake canals It is time for the State of Utah to put the health of citizens, and the ecosystem of the Great Salt Lake (GSL) ahead of the profit margins of US Magnesium. This doesn't mean that they should get No Water, but the amount must be reduced, commensurate with the sacrifice that is required by citizens, agriculture and landowners, in reducing water use. The likely goal for reduction for all of us should be to limit evapotranspiration by one half or more from artificial landscapes, drip-irrigation systems or through reduced application of irrigation water. Their contribution should be similar. Specifically, I recommend that the canal design be modified to reduce the inflow rate to less than 30,000 gals per minute, likely by changing the profile of the intake canals, or their width. (current goal of US Magnesium 100,000 gpm) My understanding is that US Magnesium uses / depletes through evaporation roughly 40 billion gallons or 120,000 Acre-ft per year through manufacturing and solar ponds. I recognize that the production of magnesium chloride and Titanium sponge through the Kroll process, and no doubt other valued metals, is a needed resource for Utah and the US. However, this value MUST be balanced by consideration of the improved health of Utah citizens and to the ecosystem of the GSL. Production needs to be limited or reduced to contribute water to the GSL in the amount of at least 50,000 AF/year. This water should be made available to the ecosystem of the GSL, in order to protect the health of the people of Northern Utah, by contributing to slowing the fall in the level of the GSL. In 2013, many state agencies contributed to the Comprehensive Management Plan for the Great Salt Lake, which included identifying functional management levels for the water surface elevation in the lake. This document and the agencies contributing to it have clearly identified that an elevation of approximately 4200 ft msl provides a broad range of support to multiple uses of the lake. The lack of a clear lake elevation management goal at that time was clearly a failure of the planning process. We need to work to get back to that elevation. Specifically, you need to prevent segmentation of the different bays of the GSL and the salinity issues, and ecosystem damage that then arise. This will reduce the exposure of the dust generating beaches along the exposed shorelines, that otherwise will expose our citizens to arsenic – a known carcinogen. I am confident that a Human Health Risk Assessment has been completed, and you already know exactly the excess deaths that can be anticipated, given the 2.5 million people who are down-wind. I am one of them! To this should be added the increased societal cost of increased autism and other health effects from the particulate air quality degradation that are caused, and already apparent on the Purpleair.com network. At this point, I would recommend to my daughter and her husband that they find an alternate location to start their family! The GSL ecosystem, specifically the brine shrimp and brine flies, and the food webs and migratory birds that depend on them ALSO need water and the maintenance of survivable salinity levels, maintaining beneficial uses such as recreation and environmental values (Class 5A designation). The continued removal of water, and its evaporation is a threat to this ecosystem. Utah cannot be a world leader and fail in these basic responsibilities to maintain the environment for the benefit of its citizens and the rest of the nation. |
| 446 | Christopher Davis Park City Resident | I'd like to comment today on US Magnesium's plan to dredge and take more water from our Great Salt Lake. As a concerned citizen of the air quality of our valley, I know that this plan will further the problem and put into doubt our health but also the health of my children and generations to come.This will have a dramatic effect on the future of Salt Lake City in all aspects. As an airline pilot who flies regularly out of salt lake, I know that the passengers on my plane are coming to Utah because of our majestic national parks, forests and mountains. This will all stop if the salt lake continues to get smaller and smaller. We know this as a fact. Please stop this plan |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | from going further! Unless US Magnesium has a concrete plan to dramatically increase the lake level BEFORE they start their dredging, we as the people of Utah should not allow this from happening. Please don't give into pressure from this powerful company. |
| 447 | Duanne Bush | The Great Salt Lake needs all the water it can get in order to prevent an environmental disaster that will impact the entire state of Utah. Please consider this when reviewing the request to pump water from the GSL. |
| 448 | Brooke Magelsen Student Brigham Young University | I am writing in regards to the permit proposed by U.S. Magnesium. Quite frankly, their request to pump at least 100 acres of water from the Great Salt Lake is horrifying. The GSL is already in critical condition- the water remains at 19% salinity (ecosystems face collapsing at 18%), and this condition will only worsen as lake levels continue to drop. Dropping lake levels will cause a chain reaction of seemingly irreversible damage- through segmentation caused by water pumping. This segmentation will not only increase salinity, but the concentration of harmful heavy metals in Gilbert Bay. Brine shrimp and brine flies are dying due to these conditions, which means that reliant species such as migratory birds are actively losing a critical food source, and may face a similar fate. Not only that, but people in surrounding cities face looming danger by over-allocation of the GSL. What concerns me the most is the over 800 miles of exposed lakebed- 800 miles of arsenic-laden dust and particles which already create dust storms over nearby cities. It is abundantly clear that further tampering with the Great Salt Lake is a ticking time bomb of ecological and environmental catastrophe. I am a BYU student from Seattle, Washington. Through my Geology class, I had the privilege to visit the Great Salt Lake for the very first time, and was captivated by its beauty. We visited the Northeastern shore near Spiral Jetty- which used to be submerged, but has been exposed since 2002, according to diaart.org. We had to walk at least 4-5 minutes past the Jetty to reach what is now the shore. Each step forward was more solemn than the last- revealing the reality that this strange and beautiful landmark was facing extinction. There is no one to blame but us. However, I know that if we take charge and make the proper decisions to preserve the GSL, we will be thanked for generations to come. |
| 449 | Brandon Tholen | I am emailing my opposition to US Magnesium's 401 permit request |
| 450 | Nicholas Walker | the purpose of this email is to express my opposition to US magnesiums canal extensions. In my view the great Salt Lake is under tremendous pressure from the drought and it makes no sense to be taking water from the lake. |
| 451 | Juliann D'Amore Coalville Resident | I am writing to express my concern over the Utah Department of Water Quality's proposal to allow US Magnesium to extend their canals deeper into the Great Salt Lake. The project threatens the already stressed Great Salt Lake and most especially the ecosystem in Gilbert Bay. As a long time resident of Utah, I urge the Department to act responsibly and find another way to raise lake levels first so that the existing canals can function as they were designed. Allowing US Magnesium to extend the canals will not only threaten wildlife, waterfowl, and humans, it is a short-sighted fix to a much more complex and long-range problem. Please protect Gilbert Bay and the Great Salt Lake. |
| 452 | Lana Neilson Utah Resident | I am opposed to U.S. Magnesium extending their water intake canals three miles further into the Great Salt Lake and to take 100,000 gallons of Great Salt Lake water per minute for corporate profit, while the lake is already at a tipping point of being nonexistent. This will be a catastrophe for the Great Salt Lake, all the 1,000s of migratory birds, the ecosystem, not to mention the toxins that would make Salt Lake's air quality unlivable, and devastate the economy and well being of Salt Lake citizens. It is an irresponsible decision to allow this to happen. Please do the right thing and do not pass this permit. |
| 453 | Patrick Johnson, Esq | I protest the motion, in the strongest effect, to grant US Magnesium Corp permission to extend canals through approval from the State of Utah and/or its subsidiary departments. The Great Salt Lake is under immense pressure and has seen greatly diminished water yield which has led to US Magnesium Corp request to lengthen and deepen their canals to continue operation past their reserve water supply. The course is clear: resolve the water rights and inflow issues with the Great Salt Lake before entertaining a motion to increase current withdrawals from any entity including US Magnesium Corp. If US Magnesium Corp operations, upon denial of motion / action, delay or impede current operations - all the better to pressure the State of Utah to right preexisting conditions that require rectification to increase inflow and management provisions. If, and only if, the State of Utah can then arrange for the resolution of such inflow / outflow discrepancies, then US Magnesium Corp should |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | reapply for motion and/or action. However, if corrections are made then existing infrastructure for US Magnesium Corp will prove sufficient, deeming future permit and approval changes unnecessary. I protest in the clearest terms the allowance of expansion in the water supply canal infrastructure for US Magnesium Corp and move that the State of Utah and it's subsidiary departments follow in the same course of action of denial. |
| 454 | Lisa Paterson | Please completely deny US Magnesium's application to extend their canal further into the Great Salt Lake. As numerous local and national headlines have stated: the Great Salt Lake Ecosystem is severely endangered because of the low water level in the lake. It makes no sense at this time to allow this corporation to pull even more water out of the lake. Scientists recently stated that the brine fly population is in collapse. Brine shrimp are also endangered which will severely impact this multi million dollar industry. Migratory and local birds are in danger of starving as the brine fly population plummets. And what about the toxic dust that is now blowing into the Salt Lake Valley? As the lake shore recedes, more and more toxic dust will be blown into the valley. Numerous Utah physicians, as well as medical professionals across the country, have warned of the health threat created by breathing this toxic dust. Certainly the health of the children who live in the Salt Lake valley is more valuable than US Magnesium's need to withdraw even more water from the lake. Thank you denying the canal extension requested by US Magnesium. I appreciate the work that you do to keep Utah's water clean and pure |
| 455 | Glen Lathrop | We are in a drought. The governor is asking everyone to cut back on water use. This should include U.S. Magnesium request to extend it's canal to pull more water out of the lake. |
| 456 | Casey O'Malley Midvale Resident | I'm writing to voice my concern and opposition for the dredging permit for US Magnesium. As a resident of Salt Lake County (I live in Midvale), I'm deeply concerned about the future of the lake. The reduction of its water levels have already had an impact on air quality, and more lots of water would only hasten that. Our economy relies on a healthy lake. The snow that powers our recreation economy is boosted by the lake effect. Without the lake, the ski industry would start to shrink. I have a three month old daughter. I want her to be able to live here in Salt Lake and enjoy all that the area has to offer in terms of outdoor recreation. If the lake is drained away by commercial interests, so much of what make Salt Lake attractive and liveable will be gone as well. Please do not approve this permit. |
| 457 | Kristina Pexton Centerville Resident | I am a resident of Centerville Utah, directly east of the Great Salt Lake. I am the mother of five children. I like the place I live. I often go to the nearby foothills and look out at the lake. It is very concerning to watch it disappear. I remember Tim Hawkes talking about water issues 2 years ago. It seemed like the problems would be distant and we should think about doing something. The problems are not distant, they are happening now. Everyone moving from our home and the surrounding cities is not feasible. We need to take action on preserving the Great Salt Lake. I understand there are many industries and millions made around the lake, but public health is vital to our communities. Please make the decision to protect our public health and the future of our iconic lake. |
| 458 | Cindy Hall | I implore the Division of Water Quality to not permit US Magnesium LLC to continue to take 100,000 gallons of water per minute from the Great Salt Lake. In August, I was at Stansbury Island and noticed the dredging equipment to extend the canal for the Morton Salt evaporation ponds. I was astounded to see water leaving the lake through their canal and now I'm aware of US Magnesium's operations that take 100,000 gallons of water from the lake per minute. This is preposterous! There should be a moratorium on any and all operations that remove water from the lake until enough water coming back into the lake to make it healthy to support sustainable industries like the brine shrimp, to prevent the Owens Valley type catastrophe with toxic dust storms from happening in our valley, and to support the Great Salt Lake's fragile ecosystem and migrating birds. This morning, I walked from Salt Aire to the current lake level and saw many dead gulls - far more than when I was there six weeks ago. The legislature, state agencies, LDS church, industry and agricultural operators need to band together to take drastic actions NOW to get the Great Salt Lake to a level that will allow it to recover. The science is available to guide policies and actions that must be put in place to assure that what is happening now does not happen again. |
| 459 | Jessica Griffiths Salt Lake City Resident | Utah will be nothing without our Great Salt Lake. Please stop corporate greed. Utahns are being asked to avoid watering lawn and to pray for rain when US Magnesium is actively making the problem worse. Please stop the hypocrisy. Vote no. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 460 | Jennifer Carlson | Please do not permit US Magnesium LLC to continue to extract 100,000 gallons of water per minute from the Great Salt Lake. With the ongoing drought this is an unreasonable request. There needs to be a pause on all water extraction from the lake until enough water has returned to support the ecosystem and to keep toxic dust storms out of the valley. I'm requesting this on behalf of myself and the health of future generations. |
| 461 | Ben Lange | I believe the great salt lake needs attention right now. If we keep going the way we have, the great salt lake will be gone in a matter of years. Not to mention the fact that the more of the lakebed exposed, the more toxins will be released, which may be the end of us all. Please think of the future. |
| 462 | Carol Breslauer | I am gravely concerned about the further environmental impact if the above-referenced permit is granted. We need more water in the lake not less. Please REJECT this permit request. |
| 463 | Kourtnei I. Joffs Layton Resident | The Great Salt Lake has been for generations a great provider of natural resources. Hopefully it will continue to support our industrious Utah long into the future. But for this to be true, the lake must still be there. Alongside harvesting the benefits from the lake, we must also make sure that we promote the presence and vitality of the lake and its life. In all that we do, we must not exert excessive or unnecessary strain on the lake. US Magnesium would like to expand two already extant canals. If allowed to do that, other mineral companies will likely expand as well. But why does one particular industry's interest supersede those of others? It is risky to remove too much water from our unique lake: decreasing water increases the total concentration of salt in the lake. This is a risk that could prove harmful to those of the brine shrimp industry, as too much salt will kill their shrimp. According to the Utah Division of Wildlife Resources , this is an industry that is easily worth tens of millions of dollars; it will be worth steadily less than that as keeping shrimp alive becomes harder in a shrunken, concentrated lake. Aside from this, the shrimp themselves are vital food sources for many migrating birds. Both the lake and the birds attract tourists near and far. Most importantly, as I understand it, these various mineral companies are currently using the <u>minimum amount</u> of water that they can to sustain their business. If that's true, and if this amount of water provides them a fully functional and self-admittedly sustainable business, then I do not see any valid reason to grant mineral companies operating in the Great Salt Lake any more use of our already limited resource. If US Magnesium and other mineral companies—by their very continued operation and existence—demonstrate that they are fully capable of operating within their currently allowed means, then they do not <i>need</i> any more water than anyone else does. It is excessive and unnecessary to allow the expansion of these two canals. |
| 464 | Tami Nabor | My name is Tami Nabor. I am a resident of Cottonwood Heights in Salt Lake County. I care about the levels and quality of water in the Great Salt Lake. Both affect not only our local ecosystem, but also our quality of life in the Salt Lake Valley. For that reason, I am asking you to deny the permit that is being requested by US Magnesium to dig a canal into the lake. |
| 465 | Bridget Lane Student Park City High School | My name is Bridget Lane and I am a Junior at Park City High School. I have lived in the Wasatch my whole life which has provided me with an opportunity to observe the changing environment of the Great Salt Lake. I visited Antelope Island in the 3rd grade and became fascinated by the interconnected thriving ecosystems. The thought of losing this life is heartbreaking. Fortunately, there is a way to save it: water conservation. Allowing <i>US Magnesium</i> to dredge more than 100 acres of lake bed would do just the opposite. The Great Salt Lake is one of the biggest stops for migrating birds. It provides a source of food critical during their long journey to other climates. The lowering of water levels increases the salinity of the lake and in turn, reduces the life able to live there. State scientists have taken measurements of 19% salinity in the open water. Ecosystem collapse is imminent if salinity levels persist above 18%. As water levels drop, fewer brine shrimp will be able to survive, causing a decrease in available food for birds. The hundreds of species that rely on the Great Salt Lake for nutrients are at risk, some may even make the endangered species list. This imbalance will cause a ripple effect throughout the rest of the ecosystem which is detrimental to the life and biodiversity of Utah's greatest lake. To avoid this catastrophic event, DWQ must say NO to <i>US Magnesium</i> and their plan to divert even more precious water needed to sustain life. By making this decision it would protect the hundreds of organisms that call the Great Salt Lake home and set a precedent for what needs to be done in order to conserve our land, water, and life. |
| 466 | Brad Allenick | I am writing to voice my opposition to US Magnesium's canal extension permit. As a Utah resident and frequent recreationalist, clean water is important for all aspects of life. If this permit is allowed to proceed, water quality will be disastrously impacted in the Great Salt Lake. Salinity will increase, and water levels will continue to |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | lower, threatening the entire ecosystem and leading to major impacts on human health and snowpack. The best available science backs up this statement. I strongly urge you to deny this proposal. |
| 467 | Scott Turner Bountiful Resident | Hi. I'm a resident of Bountiful, Utah, and am very concerned about the proposal by US Magnesium, a single corporation, to extend their reach into the Great Salt Lake to continue extracting water at a rate that exceeds that of the major communities in our area combined. Our communities have been conserving, letting our landscapes and gardens suffer, doing what we can to prevent the extinction of one of the most important ecological features in North America, and eliminate the risk of toxic dust to our population, with the reciprocal effort of restoring the snow pack to our adjacent mountains during this time of mega-drought. The request of this corporation is in direct opposition to every effort being made to be wise stewards of our environment and to restore the health and vitality of the Great Salt Lake. What legacy will we leave for future generations, for our children? A toxic dust bowl, or a healthy, thriving ecosystem which benefits our communities both economically and our quality of life? Once the lake and its ecosystem have been restored, and the threats to the public health have been removed, these kinds of requests by corporations may be appropriate to consider. Now is not that time. Please do not approve this request. |
| 468 | Dianne Gaschler | I want to go on record being against water being drained from Great Salt Lake, for magnesium extraction. This doesn't sound like it could be good in general for Utah. |
| 469 | Jennifer Ogzewalla | My name is Jenifer Ogzewalla, I am a native Utahn and have watched the Great Salt Lake diminish over the last 50 years. Our livelihood, economy, and health can in one way or another be linked back to the Great Salt Lake. I find it ridiculous that letting a company take 100,000 gallons of water from the GSL is actually on table! The lake is dying, we are breathing arsenic from the dry lake beds, snow pack is down, the brine shrimp are dwindling, need I go on! We are doing our part, we have taken our lawn out and replaced it with xeriscape, we try to minimize the amount of water we use in our household. What are you doing? The fate of the lake is in your hands, make the right choice! |
| 470 | Thomas Jameson | US Magnesium must be denied It's dredging permit. Residents of the Wasatch Front already suffer from poor air quality due to the declining water levels of the Great Salt Lake. Allowing for further mineral extraction during such a dire time in the lakes history would only exacerbate the environmental and economic catastrophe of a dry lakebed. Industries and residents will be forced out of Utah if the dust storms increase. |
| 471 | Janice Gardner Salt Lake County Resident | On behalf of myself, a resident of Salt Lake County, I respectfully submit these comments on the Certification Number: DWQ-2022-08001. I understand the Department of Environmental Quality is responsible for approving a permit application for the actions related to expanding U.S. Magnesium, LLC's water intake canal and the fill (dredge) materials placed on the lakebed of the Great Salt Lake. I understand the scope of this permit approval does not include the action of extracting 100,000 gallons of Great Salt Lake water every minute of every day. However, due to the unprecedented ecological crisis related to the low water levels at Great Salt Lake, I ask the Department of Environmental Quality to consider that this action cannot be detached from the cumulative and cascading effects posed to the Great Salt Lake and our human health. I ask the Department of Environmental Quality to consider the full impact of the degradation to Great Salt Lake that will result from this proposed project. Based on the scope of this permit application, the Department of Environmental Quality should consider revisiting the Final 2022 Integrated Report and collect the necessary information in order to determine Impairments and Total Maximum Daily Loads of Gilbert Bay. The Draft 401 Certification states that "indicated insufficient data were available to assess the Gilbert Bay Assessment Unit." To accurately manage Gilbert Bay and permit proposed actions such as this, sufficient data should be collected. I am also concerned this action will decrease the water quality of Great Salt Lake below standards that support the wildlife and recreational values of Gilbert Bay. I am concerned this action will increase harmful particulate matter from the lakebed of Great Salt Lake that further degrades air quality below regulatory standards. This permit application should include data on the contaminant levels in the dredged material, as I understand the Great Salt Lake contains high levels of pollutants that are easily suspended when disturbed. The permit application does not include any information about these risks. |
| 472 | Michael Staten | I've been out there a few times and they are major polluters. That land there is discolored and disgusting in all kinds of ways and the smoke stacks are polluting our air. Is the tax income we get from them worth the pollution and also draining the lake? I say no. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 473 | Suzanne Moffitt | Please stop allowing businesses to take water out of the Great Salt Lake!The GSL is a delicate ecosystem. Removing water from this inland wonder hurts wildlife and humans. We need to get back to balance. When the GSL has enough water, so does the Wasatch Front. Businesses making money off of natural resources should not be more important than the quality of life for the people and animals who live here. We need to preserve the lake, not rape it. |
| 474 | Eric Christensen Salt Lake City Resident | This Great Salt Lake is the largest salt water lake in the Western Hemisphere and plays an absolutely vital role in our area’s ecosystem. With new record lows being constantly hit and the sustainability of the lake on the threshold of collapse, I firmly believe now is a criminal time to willingly lower the lake to unseen levels. Criminal especially considering the protection of the Class 5A designated Gilbert Bay. That is in clear violation of Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). Now is the time to focus on bringing more water to the lake, not selling it off. I ask that you please take the interest of the future of the lake and the life that depends on it over the interest of one company. |
| 475 | Quinn Weber, MD Salt Lake City Physician | I am a physician in Salt Lake City and I am writing to oppose US Magnesium's permit to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake As a local physician, I am certainly concerned about the air quality for my family and my patients as the Great Salt Lake levels are dropping to record lows. The lake is already on the brink of collapse, and for every foot of elevation the shore line recedes, hundreds of square miles of lake bed are exposed. The Salt Lake Valley already has awful air quality, which will become potentially worse should lake levels continue to drop. Exposing my family and patients to increased toxins as the lake level drops would be an abomination. Additionally, by allowing US Magnesium to pump additional water out of Gilbert Bay, the resultant increase in salinity would disrupt sensitive ecosystems and could cause ecosystem collapse on the Great Salt Lake with innumerable downstream effects. As more water leaves the lake, salinity levels will increase. Salinity levels are already too high for sustainable life in the lake. Experts estimate that brine shrimp populations will crash in a few years if 18% or greater salinity levels persist in the lake. Without this important ecosystem and food source, the lives of millions of migratory birds are at risk. This US Magnesium permit should not be issued, as it would threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain and SHOULD NOT BE ISSUED. Please stop further destruction of the Great Salt Lake and it's delicate ecosystem. |
| 476 | Anne Terry Salt Lake City Resident | Thank you for the opportunity to submit comments regarding permitting of extending US Magnesium's canals in Gilbert Bay. If the Utah Division of Water Quality issues a 401 Water Quality Certification for the extension of US Magnesium's canals, it will have failed in its duty to protect the stated beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay, which include habitat for birds and their food chains. Great Salt Lake food chains are already collapsing due to dropping lake levels and rising salinity. This canal extension would exacerbate the problem. Another beneficial use of Gilbert Bay is recreation, and canal extension would impede search and rescue efforts and expose additional lakebed, contributing to dangerous dust containing heavy metals. These conditions are not conducive to recreation. Every effort to direct more water to Great Salt Lake and minimize diversions needs to be made, or our state will be responsible for rising respiratory disease in our people and collapse of a critical ecosystem. |
| 477 | Dennis Hartley Millcreek Resident | I am writing in regards to the US Magnesium request for lowering and extending their current canals in order to draw more water from the Great Salt Lake. I am a sailor, and have been sailing on the GSL for over 20 years. However, due to continuing un mitigated withdrawals, and drought conditions, I have no longer been able to use the GSL. A picture of the current conditions at the GSL Marina are attached. I do not support allowing US Magnesium to continue to draw the same amount of water as years past to from the GSL. As a user of the lake, like myself, they need to be a good steward and feel the effects of a drying GSL, and do their share to help with reducing and reversing the current trend of the GSL level |
| 478 | David Kleinman Summit County Resident | Dear Utah government, please deny the us magnesium permit request and all new permits that negatively impact one of our state’s most precious resources, the Great Salt Lake. I look forward to seeing a comprehensive state led lake restoration effort. |
| 479 | Cassandra Dillard Utah Resident | I’m emailing in regards to Us Mag. As someone who is born and raised in Utah, I’ve seen the explosion of the population and our commerce over the last 30 years. Some of this expansion is beautiful and supportive of everyone’s best interest. Some of it like what we see happening at the GSL serves only few and harms many. Please put the interest of Utah’s residents first when making a decision on US Mag’s proposal. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 480 | Atlas | I am opposed to giving US Magnesium permits to use more water from the Great Salt Lake watershed. My name is Atlas Goodrich, and I am a student at BYU studying Environmental Science and Sustainability, and recently went on a field trip to the GSL with my Water Geology class. Seeing this wonderful, unique lake, I feel a strong need to protect its ecosystem and am alarmed and deeply concerned about the GSL water levels and quality. Allowing these permits would greatly harm the water quality by increasing salinity, which would violate beneficial use, something I have learned about in my Water Geology course. These ecosystems are unique, and it is unacceptable to let the populations in this lake collapse. This would hurt not only the lake, but millions of birds who rely on this lake, the brine shrimp, and the highly unique microbial mats that brine flies rely on. According to my professor Dr. Carling, once the mats dry up, they don't really come back. We would lose millions of lives if the water levels continue at the rate they are. Furthermore, we humans too rely on this lake to protect air quality. As the lake dries up, more lakebed will be exposed and the lake's health and water quality will be put in severe jeopardy. I have asthma and don't want to breathe in more polluted air from the toxic lakebed dust. Don't sell out and let US Magnesium steal water that needs to go to the Great Salt Lake. |
| 481 | Ben Abbott Assistant Professor of Ecosystem Ecology Brigham Young University | I would like to express my opposition to the proposed deepening of the US Magnesium canals (the 401 Water Quality Certification currently under consideration). This project would allow excessive water extraction that would threaten the water quality of the Great Salt Lake. Specifically, it would lower water levels right at the moment we need to stabilize and increase them. Mineral extraction is the second largest consumptive water use in the basin, accounting for approximately 13% of the observed decline in lake levels. In addition to the direct effect of removing water from the lake, continuing mineral extraction at these unprecedented lake levels could have unintended consequences for groundwater circulation and impacts on the lake's littoral wetlands. US Magnesium is an important partner in lake conservation. When the level of the lake is critical, as it is today, we need all stakeholders to commit to restoring lake levels rather than continuing the status quo, which has led to demonstrable degradation of water quality and quantity in the Great Salt Lake system. |
| 482 | Paisley Rekdal Salt Lake City Resident | Just a quick email urging you to vote NO on the magnesium dredging permit. We need to preserve all the water in the lake that we can, and this permit will negate all the efforts already underway to put water back into our shrinking lake. |
| 483 | Clifford Smith | I write to you today inspired by the divine and my love for our sacred Mother Earth and her waters. To reject a permit to suck the life force energy out of our environment for the benefit of a few private interests. Many forces are watching carefully, and the decision you make will have life or death consequences for us all. Money is not the only motivation for all of us. While the elephant in the room is the agricultural water thieves, we cannot allow our lungs to be filled with arsenic and our lives to be killed for whatever you see as your personal interests or the financial interests of this private corporation. If Magnesium is critical to this nation, then they can work with the community to refill the lake before they steal the last drops. There is no argument, there is only a broken mindset and evil tradition of our pioneer forefathers that failed to understand their relationship to nature and created laws to take endlessly until they will kill our children in the cribs. This is not hyperbole. This is scientific fact with the glaring multitude of examples. Will you decide to follow the example of your theocratic Mullahs in Iran who killed Lake Urmia or will you decide to follow the better angels of your nature, listen to the prayers for the waters and stand up to preserve the very life force of the Wasatch Front that allows us all to live. Because if you do not, the deaths of literally tens of thousands of people killed by the environmental catastrophe that is already upon us will be on your heads. Even the Mullahs had the common sense to save this sister lake after widespread human and environmental destruction. If you have any sense of honor, love, or care for God's creation, you must oppose this permit. If you want an education, you can read Braiding Sweetgrass by Robin Wall Kimmerer. Killing lakes has theological implications. There are some things in this world you can't buy with money. By denying this permit, you will help create a solution to the problem faced by US Magnesium. You will show them that the lake is a valuable resource and we no longer have time or excess water to waste. You find yourself as the bridge of the USS Utah, our life support system has reached red alert, critical failure. Do you plunder the last of our energy reserves to power and escape pod for corporate CEOs to jet off to some New Zealand Bunker when our land turns into a toxic dust cloud leaving you stranded on this ship with the rest of us, or do you redirect that sacred life force energy of water to sustain our civilization? |
| 484 | Ronald Moffitt | As a resident of Salt Lake County and a concerned citizen, I urge you to NOT issue a permit to US Magnesium to allow additional dredging of the great Salt Lake Blake bed. As you know, US magnesium evaporates almost 40 billion gallons of water from the lake annually, which has added to lowering the level of the lake to low levels |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | Salt Lake County Resident | never seen in our history. Depletion of the lake harms residents of Salt Lake county and surrounding counties. It also has destroyed thousands of acres of bird and animal habitat. Moreover, US Magnesium pollutes our air with deadly chemicals. It's time to view the Great Salt Lake as a critical component of our ecosystem which must be protected. Please say no to increased harm to our citizens and to our environment. |
| 485 | Elisha Condie Salt Lake City Resident | Please do not allow the US magnesium permit to be approved! The Great Salt Lake is in a time of crisis and every decision matters. Please do the right thing! |
| 486 | Christine Parkin Salt Lake City Resident | My name is Christine Parkin. I have lived in Salt Lake City over 70 years. I am concerned, as most Utah residents are, with how low the Great Salt Lake level is. I'm concerned with the salinity and the overall water quality of the lake. I am asking the water board to deny the permit request from US Magnesium until the water levels have increased substantially. The permit request US Magnesium has made to remove 100,000 gallons of water a minute should not be considered at this time. Please do not grant US Magnesium the requested permit until conditions change and water quality is greatly improved. |
| 487 | Danny Bradley | I recently learned, from Heal Utah, of an application to approve more water diversion from the Great Salt Lake to aid with magnesium extraction. I'm deeply concerned with the decision that could come from this. The Lake is at historic lows. As lake levels continue to drop, toxic dust from arsenic poisoning will be blown into the valley affecting millions of surrounding citizens. This impact could result in a massive scale of human health issues and diversion to more habitable locations. Lower Lake levels will also impact bird migration on a massive scale. Millions of birds use the lake during the migration season. With lower Lake levels brine shrimp will die off, which the birds feed on. The die off of brine shrimp will have large implications on the economy, as we supply most of the nation with brine shrimp currently. Also, birds will not be able to successfully make their navigation over the great Salt Lake. Please strongly consider the implications of this decision. |
| 488 | Becca White | Draining more water from the Great Salt Lake is only going to completely ruin the ecosystem beyond compare. Salinity was already measured at 19% by state scientists and ecosystem collapse is imminent if they persist above 18%. Higher salinity will cause so many migrating birds to perish as this is a major migratory stopover point and the brine shrimp won't be able to support them if salinity levels remain high. As a wildlife biologist and birder, I really hope you do what is necessary here to protect the ecosystem, wildlife and the great salt lake itself from overuse and exploitation. |
| 489 | Natalie J. Clements Layton Resident | I live in Layton. I had previously heard that the Great Salt Lake is hitting new record lows every single day. It is one thing to hear this fact, quite another to see it. I have never seen the lake this low in my whole life. Also, where my home is, we get the winds coming off the lake and high risk for the carcinogens that are now being exposed because the lake is turning into a dust bowl. Learning that a company is actively trying to remove 100,000 gallons of water a minute is unbelievable! Please do not give US Magnesium the permit they are asking for. Not only will it affect our water quality, but it will also be the ecological demise of the entire system, which will directly impact the air quality for all the residents of Salt Lake City, UT, particularly along the Wasatch Front. With so much national and state-wide attention on the Great Salt Lake, the idea that the Utah Division of Water Quality could potentially undermine efforts is absurd. Please consider the long-term ramifications of your decisions. Please do not grant US Magnesium the requested permit. Thank you for taking the time to read this, and for your thoughtful consideration |
| 490 | Nain Christopherson Salt Lake City Resident | I'm a 23-yo Salt Laker and public school teacher living in the 84111 zip code, and I'm writing to ask that you please SAY NO to US Magnesium's request to lengthen their intake canals. As I trust many of my fellow Utahns have written to express, this project would be a disaster for our already imperiled Great Salt Lake, increasing the salinity of the water to a level that would make it uninhabitable to brine shrimp and therefore further destroy the lake's ecosystem of birds, aquatic creatures and other life. At the very least, US Magnesium should be required to divert as much unpolluted water back into the lake (via upstream water rights) as they take out in order to protect this crucial body of water. The stakes are so, so high here. Please do the right thing and protect the lake so that the Salt Lake Valley can remain habitable for me, my high school students, and my future family over the decades to come. |
| 491 | Spencer Shaver Salt Lake City Resident | I am submitting a comment in opposition to the proposed plan to allow for the construction of two intake canals at the US magnesium facility in Gilbert Bay of the Great Salt Lake. As lake levels continue to go down, as a Salt Lake City resident, I oppose any project that will increase the rate the Salt Lake is disappearing, and request that |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | DWQ conduct a Level II Antidegradation review to ensure that US Magnesium's permit request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the division is required by law to protect. |
| 492 | Abigail Knighton Salt Lake City Resident | I am commenting on the permit to extend the U.S. Magnesium pipeline deeper into the Great Salt Lake. This permit can not be excepted for many reasons. First, draining the Great Salt Lake of even more water will increase the salinity of the lake and create dense pockets of harmful heavy metals. This will degrade the food chain of the waterfowl that the DWQ are required to protect. The ecosystem of the Great Salt Lake has been projected to collapse at 18% salinity but state scientists have already found 19% salinity in the open water. The lake is already on the verge of collapse so the removal of more water is unacceptable. This project will also drain the lake down 9 ft, exposing dangerous dust and minerals. This will impact the air quality of Salt Lake City and harm the citizens. A business that destroys the future of an entire ecosystem and the future of an entire city should not be allowed to continue "business as usual". |
| 493 | Ethan Felt Salt Lake City Resident | Hello my name is Ethan Felt, I'm a Salt Lake City native and I've grown up within 30 minutes the great salt lake. I'm sending you this message because I'm concerned about the current state of the Great Salt Lake. With water levels continuing drop, so does the air quality, economic viability, and biodiversity of the Wasatch front. Im concerned for our community's health and future if we can't figure out something to fix the issue. I'm very worried about the proposal by US magnesium to dredge canals that would remove 100,000 gallons of water per minute for evaporative processes. It seems to me that this is the opposite of what we should be doing with the dwindling supply of water in the great salt lake. While I understand that the US magnesium is the only major source of magnesium in the US. Obviously we can't shut them down. But I believe we need to hold them accountable for the abuse towards our watershed and airshed. They need to find other ways of operating that don't directly affect the lake levels and Utah citizens. A few options could be purchasing water rights on behalf of the lake, supporting legislation that puts more water in the lake, and investing in solution oriented science. We cannot afford to continue taking more water from the lake at a time when we're trying to save it. I'm asking you to please deny the US magnesium proposal to dredge canals that will remove more water from the Great Salt Lake. |
| 494 | MaKenna Harmon Student Utah Valley University | I am a current student at Utah Valley University studying Outdoor Recreation Management, Earth Science, and Photography. In my recent studies I've been focusing a lot of my time learning about the Great Salt Lake and the current situation we're left to face as we're trying to mitigate the potential threats as the level of the lake decreases. I'm writing to you today to express my concerns about US Magnesium's request to pump more water out of the Great Salt Lake The lake's water quality is already decreasing. If US Magnesium is allowed to pump even more water out of the lake, the quality will continue to decrease even more rapidly, causing many devastating issues including major disruption in the food chain of the ecosystem due to rising salinity levels. It will also negatively impact the air quality as more of the lake bed is exposed and more dust pollutes the air that we breathe with arsenic and other chemicals that have ended up in the lake over time. I'm also concerned that as the lake gets smaller and precipitation becomes less common, snowpack on the Wasatch Front will decrease further and there eventually won't be enough water to support Utah's growing population as a result. For these reasons I ask that US Magnesium's canal extension permit application be denied for the sake of Utah's population, and for the lake's delicate ecosystem. |
| 495 | Julia Lisle Salt Lake County Resident | Hello, I do not approve of the magnesium shenanigans happening in the lake. It is deplorable! It will ruin the lake and cause damage to the health of those living in Utah. I want it noted the people of Utah do not want this here. |
| 496 | Jonas Maetani | Allowing US Magnesium to drain Salt Lake any more will lead to negative environmental issues in the future. To mitigate this, US Magnesium should only be allowed to take water from the lake if the amount taken is close enough to the amount replenished, keeping the toxins released from draining the lake in check. Air quality within the last two years has been noticeably unhealthy, which means it is the responsibility of everyone to stray away from a "business as usual" mindset. |
| 497 | Hannah Raines Student | As a student at Brigham Young University currently enrolled in a Water Geology class, I say no to U.S. Magnesium's permit to extend intake canals on the Great Salt Lake. According to state scientists, measurements of the water's salinity is already at 19% on the open water, and ecosystems will collapse if salinity levels continue at greater than 18%. This will be especially devastating to brine shrimp populations and the millions of birds that migrate here. U.S. Magnesium's proposal would be more |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | Brigham Young University | reasonable if they included plans to equate water input to their water withdraw. This is important to me because the lake is already drying, and U.S. Magnesium's permit to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay will greatly escalate the dangers. For this reason, the permit should be rejected or revised to include the needs of ecosystems. |
| 498 | Natalie Allen Bountiful Resident | I'm very highly about US Magnesium's Canal Continuation Project proposal. I strongly support no new diversions to the Salt Lake. This proposal will take 100,000 gallons per MINUTE from the Great Salt Lake! As a resident of Utah, the potential for toxic dust and worse air quality is a big deal. This proposal will damage water quality by increasing salinity levels in the lake and disrupt the food chain. This would be catastrophic to the Salt Lake valley and ecosystems throughout the US and beyond. I understand that magnesium mining could be escalated to a national defense issue. Could the division steer US Magnesium toward developing more sustainable mining techniques and require they replenish the lakes water level to a safe depth? Again, I strongly support no new diversions to the Salt Lake. |
| 499 | Samantha Whipple Alpine Resident | I just wanted to add my voice and my opinion to the public comments. I am truly concerned about the Great Salt Lake and its future. I strongly disagree with making new intake canals to continue to mine magnesium. Please protect our Great Salt Lake and deny this request. |
| 500 | Leah Stimpson | I am studying to become an ornithologist. I've been an avid bird watcher since childhood and there is little worse to me than the destruction of their habitats and the fragile ecosystems of which they are essential contributors. US Magnesium's proposed extension of intake canals into Great Salt Lake will have profound implications on wildlife. As outlined in their application, if this extension was to be granted, the lake could fall another 9 feet. A marked decline in water levels will inevitably increase salinity, killing even the brine flies specially adapted to harsh, salty environments. As brine fly populations drop, shore birds are doomed to population declines. Slowly but surely, we are digging ourselves into a hole that these ecosystems might not be capable of climbing out of. Many birds risk endangerment or local extinction under these conditions. If this appeal to prevent the collapse of precious ecosystems is not enough, then consider the implications for human life. Water segmentation in Gilbert Bay will lead to larger concentrations of toxic heavy metals and the inevitable dust storms from such destructive behavior will negatively affect public health. I say #NoToUSMag. |
| 501 | Kyle Brennan PhD Candidate Earth Science University of Utah | My name is Kyle Brennan. I am a conservation Earth Scientist and PhD candidate at the University of Utah College of Earth Science. Born and raised in the Wasatch mountains this habitat played a key role in becoming the person I am today. My expertise is in Earth systems and thus the bulk of my comments are going to focus on the shortsightedness of this permit from an environmental, climate, and vital resources perspective. The Wasatch mountains are the western most range within the continental scale Rocky Mountains. West of their ~10,000ft peaks is an expanse of over 100,000,000 acres of arid desert with an average rainfall of 7" per year. Snow falls in the Wasatch primarily because of two primary factors i) high elevation and ii) THE GREAT SALT LAKE ("GSL"), which hydrates (lake effect) storm systems before they hit the high peaks of the Wasatch. So let's take an objective look at the snowpack, its history in the west and its projections before we even start on the fact that the great salt lake is less than half its size since the 1980s and shrinking at a stark rate. Over the last 80 years annual snowpack has been measured at 100s of sites seasonally. The trends and near future projections are undeniable and sobering and should be taken into consideration with regards to the permit for US Magnesium. These are the numbers from the US Environmental Protection Agency (https://www.wcc.nrcs.usda.gov/).From 1955 to 2022, April snowpack declined at 93 percent of the sites measured (see Figure 1) Large and consistent decreases in April snowpack have been observed throughout the western United States (see Figure 1).All 12 states included in this indicator experienced a decrease in snowpack on average from 1955 to 2022 (see Figure 1).About 84 percent of sites have experienced a shift toward earlier peak snowpack (see Figure 2). This earlier trend is especially pronounced in southwestern states like Colorado, New Mexico, and Utah. Across all stations, peak snowpack has shifted earlier by an average of nearly eight days since 1982 (see Figure 3), based on the long-term average rate of change.From 1982 to 2021, the snowpack season became shorter at about 86 percent of the sites where snowpack was measured. Across all sites, the length of the snowpack season decreased by about 18 days, on average.Almost all snowpack prediction climate models show snowpack being completely absent in the majority of North America in the next 40 years. All of this data translates directly to the water the Great Salt lake receives, as well as our aquifers. The negative impact climate change could have on winter, and the GSL, has been discussed at length, but an October study paints maybe the bleakest forecast to date: In 35 to 60 years, mountain regions in the American West could see little to no snow (Sirila-Woodburn et. al. Nature Reviews 2021). So my comment is, why would we allow for more drainage from the GSL for private corporate usage when the water levels are expected to fall drastically, excluding their usage? Let's talk about water usage in the valley. The Utah Division of Water Resources released a future |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>projection on water consumption in the state. This report's results are also shocking. With no action to conserve water use, which has been the case year after year. The State as a whole will be out of water within the next 20 years. However, the Wasatch metro fed by its dwindling snow pack has an estimated 'reliable' supply of 923,800 Ac-ft of water. By 2030 we will have surpassed that amount in demand and use!!! (https://water.utah.gov/2021waterplan/) It's important to note that we have had a net increase in water use over the last 30 years as the state continues to grow, hence the primary reason for the Great Salt Lake drying up. The Great Salt Lake has been proven to provide approximately 25% of our snow via the lake effect [Alcott and Steenburgh, (2013) (2012) (1999)]. That snow pack is gone in all of these scenarios. Let's get back to Utah's water crisis and ultimately the Western US's catastrophic water crisis that we are just starting to see day to day effects off. The southeastern North America (including UTAH) is in what is being called a MEGADROUGHT by a new study published in nature (Williams et. al. 2022). Previous reconstruction back to 800 CE indicated that the 2000–2018 soil moisture deficit in southwestern North America was exceeded during one megadrought in the late-1500s. Here, they show that after exceptional drought severity in 2021, ~19% of which is attributable to anthropo-genic climate trends, 2000–2021 was the driest 22-yr period since at least 800. Do you really think people are going to allow the remaining drinking water resource of the wasatch to be used to make Magnesium instead of sustaining their lives (literally)? Absolutely NOT, the first thing to go is non essential water use. So again why are we allowing Private interests to use our public resources? The tax and job "gains" will surely underwhelm related to any costs related to future public water issues and conserving the GSL. We should be conserving as much of the GSL as possible, even at the expense of a company that will not be able to make up for the harm it has already done to the GSL. Corporations are hard to hold accountable, so let's act on this opportunity of prevention and preservation. Please let me know if I can be of any more help in opposing or suggesting this permit not be issued. Thanks!</p> |
| 502 | Maddy Corey Millcreek Resident | Please take responsibility for the health of GSL and of our people and say NO to US Magnesium's to dredge deeper into GSL and make the situation out there worse than it is |
| 503 | Caitlin Payne | Are you insane we barely have any water now, have you been outside in the last two years?! |
| 504 | Mary Phillips | I'm very concerned about US Magnesium's Canal Continuation Project proposal. I strongly support no new diversions and this proposal will take 100,000 gallons per MINUTE from the Great Salt Lake. This would be devastating to the Salt Lake valley and ecosystems throughout the US and beyond. As a resident of Salt Lake City, the potential for toxic dust and worse air quality is a real fear. This proposal will impair water quality by increasing salinity levels in the lake and disrupt the food chain. I understand that magnesium mining could be escalated to a national defense issue. In which case, I hope the division could steer US Magnesium toward developing more sustainable mining techniques and require that they replenish the lakes water level to a safe depth. |
| 505 | Tyler Christensen Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing to express my concern about the DWQ's permitting US Magnesium's to extend intake canals on Gilbert Bay. This issue is important to me as a native and current resident of Utah, who has grown to love the Great Salt Lake and its odd but beautiful ecology and hydrology. My earliest memories on the lake are exploring Antelope Island in Boy Scouts. I returned this past March and was dismayed by the low level of the lake and lack of birds. As you know, Gilbert Bay is another beautiful corner, and DWQ is directed under class 5A to protect the beneficial uses including brine fly and waterfowl that eat them. As scientists recently documented, salinity on the open water has increased to 19%, well within the danger zone for ecosystem collapse. Further extraction of lake water cannot be allowed without, at a minimum, a Level II antidegradation review to support improved salinity and water right inputs. Please protect this beautiful and essential place for ours and the next generation. |
| 506 | Kenison McEwan Student | Please consider the widespread effects of your decision to take more water from the Great Salt Lake. Not only do lower water levels of the Lake devastate the lake's ecosystem, it takes away from the natural beauty that is near and dear to many people. As a Utah resident myself, this issue feels personal to me. On a recent trip to Antelope Island, I was depressed by the receding water in the Lake. A boat docked where water once plentifully lapped on the shore now stood dusty and desolate. Looking out at the trees across the lake, the reflection that would have been truly awe-inspiring was now muffled by a vast expanse of dried lakebed. I love this Lake. It is hurting, and you would only hurt it more by taking more water. Please think about the personal effects it is taking on millions of residents like me who wonder how much longer they can spend with this wonder of nature before it is stolen from our hearts. I implore you, please make the right decision. Our faith and future rests with you. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 507 | Jeff Ward Bountiful Resident | My name is Jeff Ward. I am a Bountiful resident, writing concerned about the Great Salt Lake. I ask that you vote against the US Magnesium permits. While i recognize the importance of industry, permitting new canals is a short term fix that will cause destruction of one of our greatest natural resources. We should allow the lake to be restored through proper conservation and planning. Although the path ahead will require short term sacrifice, ultimately our actions today will benefit US Magnesium, the ski industry, and all Utah residents. Please vote against the new permits. |
| 508 | Carter Jasson Student Brigham Young University | My name is Carter Jansson and I am a student at Brigham Young University, Provo. I am disturbed by the idea of the US Magnesium's proposal to extend the intake canals in Gilbert Bay, thus affecting the Great Salt Lake (GSL). US Magnesium is known for the devastating pollution they produce and the effects they have on our GSL. GSL is at its lowest levels ever, and extending the canals in Gilbert Bay would only reduce the Lake to even lower levels. The salinity would reach such levels that the creatures that rely upon the lake for their habitat would no longer be able to do so. We have already seen declines in the number of migrating birds to the lake, and decreasing the water levels would harm native species as well. We need to protect our Great Lake, it is vital to the natural ecosystem of the Wasatch Front. I ask that you deny US Magnesium this permit to extend the intake canals. |
| 509 | Alana Burman | The fact that US Magnesium's request is even being considered is shameful. Are we not already knee deep in a crisis regarding the low water levels of the Great Salt Lake? Further extraction serves no purpose more than pure greed and selfishness; it will doom us all. Do not approve. History, and your fellow Utahns, are watching. |
| 510 | Lachlan Phillips | From what I know and understand I just wanted to contribute by commenting about the state of the Great Salt Lake and how it is currently at the lowest level ever recorded and is on track to get much, much worse. US Magnesium should not be allowed to use more Great Salt Lake water because it is going to make the lake too salty for brine shrimp to live. In doing this with less water will mean there is more salinity and less life in the lake. Say NO to the Permit! |
| 511 | Sydney Goodwill | I'll keep my words short, but I hope they'll truly be heard. We have millions of people living, enjoying life and thriving in the Ogden area through the Salt Lake valley. This area brings in more millions of visitors annually, with our wonderful snow for skiing, and our renowned position as host state for the Sundance Film Festival. These things would not be possible without the Great Salt Lake. Our Great Salt Lake is currently at a record-low as-is. So low, that the New York Times had to alarm us all about it back home (how embarrassing). We, Utah, are being seen as an "experiment" by other parts of the USA, to see how we will handle this water crisis. So to allow any more extraction, or unnecessary water usage, from this body of vital water would be a dire mistake. It would mean lethal consequences and ghost towns and cities all across the Wasatch Front. We cannot allow our beautiful home to be uninhabitable. I'm not even LDS, but I do believe Brigham Young was right to say "This is the Place" -- let's keep it that way. Let's treat it like holy land. Thank you. |
| 512 | Sydney Dowben | If this proposed project by US Magnesium is to take place, it will be the end of The Great Salt Lake — the end of the brine industry, the end of the snow industry, and the end for 7 billion migratory birds that depend on this endemic water source. Don't allow US Magnesium to drain more water out of The Great Salt Lake. |
| 513 | Hannah Warner | I do not think that we should be able to extract more water from the Great Salt Lake. With water levels already at an all time low it causes many different issues to the ecosystem here in Utah. Because we are receiving little moisture in these dry months, the water is being taken out of the lake faster than it can be replenished. This is causing many negative side effects. With the water levels being at an all time low it causes more of the lakebed to be exposed which then causes more dust pollution. This dust is dangerous to not only the lake but also the air. It makes the air full of toxic particles and pollutants such as arsenic and many others that are unsafe to breathe. With the excessive removal of water also will cause the salinity levels to be too high. The levels are already extremely high for natural fish and other creatures to live there, but if they increase any more than it is right now it will eventually kill of the entire ecosystem that lives in the lake. From Brine Shrimp all the way down to the microscopic organisms that live in the water. With all this being said, we need to stop the excess removal of water to the GSL and make sure that we can conserve it so we can conserve our ecosystem. |
| 514 | Matt Conn | I am a long time Salt Lake resident. I love this place for all of its natural beauty and our healthy living environment. One of our greatest resources, and our beloved namesake, is the Great Salt Lake. I don't need to remind you that the GSL is on the verge of ecosystem collapse, the cost of which will be devastating to bird and human |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | populations alike. Utahns are flipping their lawns, taking shorter showers, and voting on water conservation measures to protect the lake, but our effect on the lake is almost negligible compared to agriculture and Magnesium draw, and we can only do so much. US Magnesium has taken more than its fair share, and enough is enough; we can't keep selling out one of our most precious resources to Industry. Now that the collapse of the GSL is on the national stage, this is an important moment for Utah to take a stand and be a leader in the conservation of resources in the West. The lake has nothing left to give, and we need our water managers to protect it at all costs by saying NO to US Magnesium's request to extend their intake canals. Your power to make change is greater now more than ever. Please wield it responsibly. |
| 515 | Carl Tuttle | No more water sucked from lake into toxic ponds from US Magnesium! |
| 516 | Peter Erickson | I've been a brine shrimper (Salt Creek), I've been on the shores of the Aral Sea, I served on a TAG committee concerned about the Great Salt Lake, and I'm a sailboat owner and member of the Great Salt Lake Yacht Club. We need to do everything we can to keep the Great Salt Lake from getting any shallower than it already is and do everything we can to help it get deeper. DO NOT LET MAGCORP EXTEND ITS INTAKE CANALS! The U.N. declared what happened to the Aral Sea, thanks to Soviet mismanagement of natural resources, was the greatest man-made natural disaster in history. Let's not repeat that mistake right here in our backyard with our heads buried in oolitic sand. |
| 517 | Alex Taft Salt Lake City Resident | They should not be allowed to do it. I am saving water at home, not using more. We should urgently get more water to the Great Salt Lake. |
| 518 | Patty Becnel Ogden Resident | Please do not allow any additional water to be used in magnesium mining in the GSL. Though they promise to return most of the water, it is still jeopardizing the vulnerable water supply. |
| 519 | Erica Marken Salt Lake City Resident | This request to dredge Gilbert Bay is beyond irresponsible. We need to take the example of Lake Owens into account as we hit pivotal thresholds in GSL's long-term viability. Already the salinity level is at an unprecedented 19% which has a direct negative effect on the brine shrimp population which is then negatively magnified up the food chain to impact the millions of birds that have relied on this migratory stopover for thousands of years. Needless to say, there is plenty of conversation around the impact of less GSL water on the surrounding human population as shorelines grow and increase dust and toxic particles in the air impacting countless individuals. We cannot allow Great Salt Lake to die from a thousands cuts. Consideration of such a request as Mag Corp's must be taken within the larger context in which they take place. To do otherwise may be justifiable on paper, but would be unconscionable and irresponsible in the spirit of good stewardship of resources. Please decline Mag Corp's request or, at a minimum, require it to obtain and donate water rights for Great Salt Lake equal to the amount of water the company plans to extract from the Lake. |
| 520 | Amelia Wilson Salt Lake City Resident | I am a resident of Salt Lake City and would like to comment that I strongly oppose issuing US Magnesium a permit to expand their intake canals further into the Great Salt Lake. US Magnesium is already drawing 100,000 gallons of water per minute out of the lake and should not be allowed to continue to do so, seeing as their impact is part of the reason for low lake levels. Salt Lake and surrounding areas has an impending environmental disaster on its hands due to receding lake levels and allowing this to continue would exacerbate the problem. US magnesium is also a notorious polluter that has had to pay large settlement funds due to the toxic waste it produces. I am shocked that our division of water quality would even consider this permit given US magnesium/Magcorp's history of pollution. Please do not issue them this permit. |
| 521 | Rachel Devine West Valley City Resident | I'm writing to make a public comment regarding the low water level of the Great Salt Lake. DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. The water diversion will create segmentation within Gilbert Bay and will increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in those isolated segments. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the beneficial uses associated with the Class 5A designation, including the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife, that DWQ is required by law to protect. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 522 | Naomi Flinders | Have you ever read The Lorax, by Dr. Surss? It's about you. You are destroying everything with your greed and there will be nothing else. It's time to be done. It's the states job to protect us. Say no to a permit and start immediately healing the lake and the land. |
| 523 | Matthew Sargent | I strongly urge the DWQ to decline US Magnesium's permit application. We need to conserve the water in the Great Salt Lake, not use more. |
| 524 | William Littig Salt Lake City Resident | They say that all good things must end and US Magnesium Corporation has certainly profited while doing grave environmental damage to our fragile lake . Evaporation is the principle cause of the current demise of the Great Salt Lake. Reclamation of the evaporation ponds and related industries should begin post haste before this wonderful natural resource is completely gone. We must all act collectively and do whatever we possibly can to restore some of the lakes dignity. Please consider these simple words I am not a technician or scientist but I live here and want the best for our state. |
| 525 | Jackson Viscomi | Letting US Magnesium further drop lake levels will speed up what is already an environmental nuclear bomb. No amount of tax revenue that US Magnesium will bring in for the state will ever make up for the environmental and economical consciences a dried GSL will bring to the Wasatch front. As a state, we need to only support business that ensures the longevity of our State, US Magnesium is not one of those companies. |
| 526 | Jeanne Hayes | I am writing to say NO to allowing the extension of the two intake canals in Gilbert Bay in the Great Salt Lake. by US Magnesium.The Great Salt Lake is already in huge trouble and this move would only exacerbate the problem. We cannot afford to see the water levels of the lake drop any further as it is already on the verge of disaster of killing off more brine shrimp, bird species and causing the complete drying up of the lake which would cause health risks to the entire population of the SL Valley. Please do not allow this to happen!! |
| 527 | Randy Braegger West Jordan Resident | Please vote no to US Magnesium's request for a permit to extract more water from the Great Salt Lake. |
| 528 | Lydia Garvey Clinton, OK Resident | Science shows this could result in “catastrophic damage” to the GSL ecosystem:Will “cause or contribute to a collapse in the food chain” that “will result in massive die offs” of birds that depend on the Lake Salinity in South Arm currently > 18% (measured @ 19% during week of October 3rd) Modeling shows brine shrimp population will “crash” in 2 years if salinity isn't lowered Brine fly population already significantly impacted, We cannot allow US Magnesium to take more water out of the South Arm, DWQ's 401 Cert is necessary for US Magnesium's Dredge & Fill Permit with the Army Corps, DWQ must protect “waterfowl, shore birds and other water-oriented wildlife including their necessary food chain.” Your attention to his most urgent matter would be much appreciated by all present & future generations of all species. |
| 529 | Aaron Murphy Salt Lake City Resident | I am a fairly new resident of Salt Lake City and I'd like to voice my point of view. When I moved here I was shocked to see such a large disconnect between industry and preservation. It seems human nature is very short sided and doesn't play the tape out. If we keep only looking at dollar signs instead of out near future, this place will go the way of Salton Sea and this community we've grown to love with our children, will no longer be hospitable. Please do not renew the permit with US Magnesium to further exploit our children's health and future for a short sided profit with absolutely no sustainability |
| 530 | Davey Davis Salt Lake City Resident | I wanted to comment on the upcoming water quality certification project #401, concerning the expansion of US Magnesium's water usage from the Great Salt Lake. The lake is overtaxed as a water source and is reaching levels so low that it threatens the airshed of the entire Wasatch Front. Magnesium production is important, but it is not more important than the quality of life and continued prosperity of 2 million people along the Wasatch Front. Further, the presence of a rare resource presents an opportunity to perfect and refine methods for extraction that cause the least harm to the surrounding environment that is possible, rather than an opportunity to maximize profits for a corporation's shareholders. US Magnesium should be held to much higher environmental standards and improve their water recapture and extraction processes to remove less water from the lake and pollute our airshed less, directly and indirectly. They've operated with little to no oversight for far too long and this needs to be reformed and countered at every opportunity. Please deny their requests to expand operations. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 531 | Seth Griffin | As a citizen of this state and valley, I am voicing my opposition to granting US Magnesium further rights to extend their canal and access to the Great Salt Lake. Stop destroying our critical and natural resources for money. What good is it asking anyone to limit their water usage when this single company uses more water than any of us citizens in the valley combined? This project should not be approved. |
| 532 | John Bowden | I don't think US magnesium should be allowed to continue to drain the lake. If the lake level drops too low a large amount of the population will move away, including me. |
| 533 | Andrea Wasburn | I am writing to make a record of my opposition to the permit renewal for US Magnesium. The Great Salt Lake is at an historic low. Studies have shown that if the lake dries up the Salt Lake Valley will become filled with poisonous dust from arsenic located on the lake bed. This will make our home uninhabitable. US Magnesium uses a massive amount of water from the lake and, therefore, should not be allowed to continue operations in Utah where water is at crisis levels. Please do not renew the permit to ensure we are able to enjoy the Salt Lake Valley for years to come. |
| 534 | Jay Griffith Millcreek Resident | Every bit of scientific data regarding the Great Salt Lake indicates we must take immediate and drastic actions to preserve it. Not just for my grandchildren and future generations to enjoy its inherent beauty and recreational utility. Or for the over 10 million birds, represented by 338 species who depend on it. Or for the brine shrimp businesses. But right now, and every day the lake recedes, our air quality degrades, becoming more dangerous. Which is why it seems unthinkable that US Magnesium is applying for permits from the Department of Water Quality to lengthen their intake canals by several miles. They evaporate more than 40 billion gallons of water a year extracting more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City combined. Their permit, if granted, could eventually drop the Great Salt Lake up to 9 feet! That's hundreds more miles of exposed lakebed increasing the salinity of the lake, endangering waterfowl, brine shrimp, and humans due to dangerous toxic dust. Over the years I have run many miles on Antelope Island and experienced the lake's unique beauty from sunrise to sunset. I continue to be in awe of this valuable and unique asset from which so many benefit. Not far from its borders live family and friends who will be most impacted by the issuance of these permits. It is unconscionable that US Magnesium has asked to be granted them knowing the negative impacts they will have. Please deny them. |
| 535 | Jarrett Burge | US Magnesium must be held accountable for the damage they inflict on the environment of this state. As the GSL continues to shrink, we simply continue to allow them an unfettered hand in the wholesale destruction of our state. Their permit must be denied. |
| 536 | Nicholas Ball | US Magnesium is requesting to further RAPE our capitol city's name sake, the once Great but no longer Great Salt Lake. This cannot and should not be allowed. They have already been proven to be terrible stewards of our water supply and land. If this permit is approved, they will continue to destroy the lake, continue to pollute, without regards to anyone, or anything other than their profit. This permit should be denied, a long with revocation of existing permits until they can prove that they can rehabilitate their already egregious rape of our water supply and landscape. If this is approved our children and grandchildren will pay for YOUR MISTAKE. PS. DONT BE EVIL. |
| 537 | Mark Moehling Salt Lake City Resident | Please prioritize our community's water and environmental resources over the operations of a single company. Long-term, a healthy and full Great Salt Lake are more beneficial to the people than any short-term economic gains. If the lake dries up, we run out of water, and the air becomes polluted, no one will be able to live here. And then what use is a good economy? Consider the benefits we've gained by prioritizing and protecting our mountain watersheds. Without that protection, yes we might have some more mining or grazing profits, but the city would be unlivable without clean water and the mountains unvisitable without healthy forests. Yes this may be one minor request with impacts that can be mitigated. But one minor request after another has led us to a drying and dying lake. Please prioritize the long-term health of our unique and fragile environment over all else. |
| 538 | Quaid Atkinson | I wish to make a public comment against the issuance of a permit for the US Magnesium Canal Continuation Project. The company is already one of the biggest consumers of the lakes water in the states as well as a known major polluter. With the state in decades of drought and the Great Salt Lake hitting its lowest known point |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | in history it is unconscionable to allow this company to pull even more water out of the lake. We cannot continue to allow corporate greed and profits destroy the environment of our state. If a business can only succeed by destroying lives and poisoning the environment then it does not deserve to stay in business. |
| 539 | Ben Ludke | I'm writing to strongly OPPOSE the certification on the grounds that pulling or diverting 100,000 gpm from the Great Salt Lake is not sustainable for the lake. I live in Salt Lake City, UT and therefore have a direct interest in opposing this permit. |
| 540 | Leslie Teas | I'm writing to urge the Utah division of water quality to refuse the US magnesium permit to extend their intake canals into the Great Salt Lake. As a lifelong resident of Salt Lake County, I am deeply concerned and fearful for the lake's future and what that means for both the ecosystem of the lake itself and the creatures who depend on it, and our health and well-being as wasatch front residents. The US magnesium project will continue to bring the lake level down resulting in unsustainably high salinity and heavy metal levels in the isolated segments of the lake. The resulting decrease in water quality will result in the destruction of the food chain for the water-oriented wildlife that the DWQ is required by law to protect. |
| 541 | Alexis Paige Utah Valley Resident | My name is Alexis Paige. I am a 26 year old woman. I have lived in the Utah valley my entire life and have seen the harm of the monumental growth the Salt Lake Valley has seen, one of the crises' being the quickly fading Great Salt Lake. I believe in nature doing the job of running it course. Considering we have already poisoned the Salt Lake with numerous types of chemicals that will become airborne if the lake dries, and the the amount of environmental affect and depletion industry has caused, and not to mention the already staggering amount of air pollution the Salt Lake Valley receives, I believe siphoning thousands of gallons of water from a lake that already has nothing to give, is in any way a horrendous act against humanity and the consideration of public and environmental health. I plead and beg you to take your business somewhere else. The Salt Lake has nothing offer you. |
| 542 | Robert Koehn Salt Lake City Resident | I wanted to comment on water quality certification project #401, concerning the expansion of US Magnesium's water usage from the Great Salt Lake. It is well known that the lake is already overtaxed as a water source and is reaching levels so low that it threatens exposing the lakebed causing great environmental harm including polluting the airshed of the entire Wasatch Front. Magnesium production is important, but should not take priority over the health and well-being of the 2 million people living along the Wasatch Front. The presence of a rare resource presents an opportunity to perfect and refine methods for extraction that cause the least harm to the surrounding environment possible, rather than disregarding or minimizing the environmental impact to maximize profits for a corporation's shareholders. US Magnesium has already recently shown disregard of the environment as evidenced by the EPA findings resulting in fines and an eventual settlement in January of 2021. They should be held to much higher environmental standards and improve their water recapture and extraction processes to remove less water from the lake and less pollution to our airshed both directly and indirectly. This request to expand their water usage capabilities due to their direct contribution of causing the issue is bold and shows a continued disregard of the environmental impact their operation has. 100,000 gallons of water per minute is equivalent to over 1,000,000 households average usage. That seems like quite excessive use of a water source that is already over taxed. I respectfully ask their requests to expand operations be denied. |
| 543 | Allison Conner | I am writing to submit a comment on the upcoming water quality certification project #401, concerning the expansion of US Magnesium's water usage from the Great Salt Lake. The lake is already overused as a water source, and this project will threaten the ecosystem, the air quality, and therefore health of the people of Utah. We cannot continue to deplete this lake of its water. While magnesium production is important, it is not more important than the lives of 2 million people along the Wasatch Front. If the great salt lake is depleted, our entire economy and lives in Utah are at risk. I understand that magnesium is rare, however, the Great Salt Lake is a rare resource as well. It is the largest lake of its kind in the Western Hemisphere. US Magnesium should be held to much higher environmental standards and improve their water recapture and extraction processes to remove less water from the lake and pollute our airshed less, directly and indirectly. Companies of their size and in positions as unique as theirs should have the resources in innovate, but instead, they have used their position to exploit our natural resources. They've operated with little to no oversight for far too long and this needs to be reformed and countered at every opportunity. Please deny their requests to expand operations, and push instead for them to use their current resources in a more efficient manner. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 544 | Katie Pappas Salt Lake City Resident | Please reclassify Gilbert Bay water quality to accurately reflect current conditions. The Great Salt Lake is imperiled and we face catastrophic consequences if we fail to adequately address threats to the lake and its ecosystem. We cannot hope to remedy the many problems facing the lake if we don't have an accurate picture of what is happening there. Our future depends on it. |
| 545 | Nicole Balbuena | US Magnesium, a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore is once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster. How can we let this happen? Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use and it should be CLEAN water. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake |
| 546 | Julianna Clay | The people have had enough. Common sense and logic should prevail here. Water should be redirected back into the Great Salt Lake not diverting more out. Alternate water sources need to be found. Scientists are saying the Salt Lake has months left, MONTHS! The lake is the biggest salt lake in the Western Hemisphere, and home to many species of wild and plant life. The ramifications for it drying up will be catastrophic, because not only has the state diverted natural flows, but also enabled mining and arsenic and heavy metals to accumulate in it's bottom. The idea of this being up for debate is scandalous and ridiculous. If the lake dries up, so will precipitation, and then tourism will follow. Look out the window, look at our air quality. What do you think that's going to be like if the lake dries up and toxic metals are being blown around? People will not stay here if they have to wear a gas mask to go outside. Exposure to heavy metals results in long term health conditions, and shortens life spans. The people are tired of leadership's failures to protect public health and the health of our environment. Enough with the short sighted profits over people mentality. If there are no people, which there won't be if the lake dries up, there will be no profit. The magnesium company should not be allowed to extract more water. I can't believe it is even up for discussion the people and the lake say no. |
| 547 | Sarah Thornton | As a concerned citizen, I must urge the DWQ to reject the US Mag Corp permit application. I do not need to repeat what has been said at the hearing, but I feel I must add my voice. The state of the Great Salt Lake is, as far as I have been able to ascertain, in crisis. Every scientific article and study I read tells me action to replenish and repair the lake must be taken, and it must be taken now. At the very least, the first step must be reducing the drain on our lake, from the annual 87 billion gallons diverted before it even reaches the lake, to the companies draining and dredging the lake currently. Allowing any of these companies, including US Magnesium, to take even more water from our critically endangered lake is a distinct step backwards and is working directly against the imperative goal of replenishing the water in the Great Salt Lake. I understand that there is a process for these things, and I thank you for the opportunity to have my voice heard and for taking the time to listen to the people of this great community. Please reject the permit application for US Magnesium |
| 548 | Madeliene Payton | As we can all see, the Great Salt Lake is shrinking, along with so many other lakes in our great region of the world. I'm asking for the concern of us all that we please say no to US Magnesium not being allowed to pipe out 100,000 gallons of water a minute. Magnesium is a very important mineral that is needed for our benefit, but we can not survive without water. If we lose any more water at this time we will be in trouble. It is of utmost importance that the use of water for anything that is not a necessity at this time is wrong and not be allowed. I say no |
| 549 | Casey Parker | This company needs to realize the great salt lake is drying up and they are terrorizing our ecosystem and maybe money solves their problems but not the community |
| 550 | Lucy Allen | I am writing to oppose the issuance of a permit for US Magnesium to extend intake canals in Gilbert Bay. The very fact of US Magnesium's need to apply for this permit due to declining lake levels is evidence that we should not continue allowing US Magnesium to evaporate water away from the Great Salt Lake. US Magnesium |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | evaporates more water than Salt Lake City, Ogden, and Provo combined. The problem of declining lake levels is a problem of their own making. Its continuation will result in an unlivable Salt Lake Valley for the rest of us, thanks to years of US Magnesium's pollution into the lake bed now becoming exposed to air and blowing over the valley. Please consider abandoning this permit. |
| 551 | Pamela Grubaugh Littig Salt Lake City Resident | US Magnesium should not do anything to take more water from OUR lake. The Great Salt Lake is dying and this action would contribute to the collapse of the food chain (which imperils millions of birds) and contribute to the endangerment of human health due to dust storms from the exposed lakebed. The only reasonable and practical mitigation would be for US Magnesium to obtain and donate water rights for Great Salt Lake that are equal to the amount of water that the company plans to extract for the Lake as a result of this permit. The Great Salt Lake is not their lake.... It is critical that everyone do their part NOW to SAVE the Great Salt Lake. We need our lake and we need our water. |
| 552 | Mike Roskelley Salt Lake City | It's outrageous that this is even a consideration. Even Mag. must know that there days are limited as the draw more water than any other entity from shrinking lake. If the lake goes, millions will be affected, not just one company and a few wealthy folks.Please do not allow this permit to go through. |
| 553 | Andrew McNeil | US Magnesium should NOT be granted another permit to extract minerals for profit out of the Great Salt Lake. The potential degradation to the health of the Salt Lake Valley human population is at stake. If this means property tax needs to be raised so be it. Politicians should stop valuing money over preservation of natural resources |
| 554 | Kelly Hannah | Thank you for holding this important hearing last night and your careful consideration of the comments presented. It's time for US Magnesium to take long term action and accountability for the health and longevity of their business and the water they use for it. The only viable solution for US Magnesium is to work diligently to get water INTO the lake so their current canals can function properly. This will allow them to reliably extract Magnesium and the other minerals we need for our use, for economy and for their profitability. Draining the lake from the bottom up is not a viable solution, it's not a viable solution for the long term operation of US Magnesium, it's not a viable solution for the water users upstream, it's not a viable solution for the health, welfare and safety of Utah's people, most notably the millions of people living along the Wasatch Range. I believe the granting of this permit would constitute gross negligence on the part of the State and be an incomprehensible violation of the public trust with which the State is charged. |
| 555 | Lauren M | The great salt lake is getting national attention. I've had multiple friends and family from out of state send me links about the great salt lake deteriorating. If economics/business is your main concern, I ask you to prioritize the ski industry and retaining the population in the Salt Lake Valley. Utah's ski industry depends on the lake effect giving the Wasatch mountains great snow. Plenty of people left Los Angeles in the 80s when it had horrible air quality, there were days when people were told to stay inside when the air quality was so bad. Is that the future for Salt Lake City? We already have the disgusting air quality problem in the winter and now it's happening in other seasons too. It's a shame that the AQI doesn't adequately measure air quality on dusty days when it is clearly/ visually poor air outside. I hope it's only a matter of time before that is fixed. A lot of eyes are on the Great Salt Lake, which means a lot of eyes will be on the DWQ. Please do the right thing. |
| 556 | Rachel Adams Lehi Resident | I am a lifelong resident of the State of Utah, a geologist who works on local mining and environmental projects, and the mom of two small kids. US Magnesium's permit request to extend their canals and increase their capacity to remove water from the Great Salt Lake should be denied given the historically low lake level and the risk for toxic dust storms should the lake bed be exposed. This permit should be revisited once the water balance is restored and the Great Salt Lake is healthy enough to sustain more industrial activities. Until then, please preserve the current water balance and give the lake time to recover as we all work together to cut our water usage. |
| 557 | Josh G | If it goes for anything, I am a North Salt Lake resident and I am against US Magnesium getting those permits approved to take more water out of the lake. |
| 558 | Jake Beckstrand West Jordan Resident | I saw the article in the tribune. Please don't allow US magnesium to divert more water from the Great Salt Lake. It needs every drop it can get. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 559 | | I understand the need for magnesium, but how about my need to breath air? How about the need for billions of birds to live? Why Utah? |
| 560 | Kim Heys Salt Lake City Resident | If Utah wants to continue being a top producer of magnesium, we must first put our efforts toward rising the lakes levels. And that means saying no to diverting more water. |
| 561 | Elliot C Lewis Ogden Resident | My mother loved birds. She used to take us to the shores of the GSL and the marshes and wetlands that surround the lake in hopes of seeing birds. All sorts of birds, bald eagles, killdeers, plovers, gulls, geese, tundra swans and the great American pelicans. Throughout the year birds migrate. They do this to find suitable habitat for their nesting, their breeding and feeding. It is their life. It is their nature. Their existence. Along this sometimes several thousand mile journey they need sanctuary, a place to hold them over, a haven to sustain life. The Great Salt Lake provides this. The mircobialities and brine shrimp and brine flys provide the much needed sustenance to survive, to move on. These birds need the Lake and it's resources. Early in school we are taught about food webs and ecosystems. These are interconnected systems of plants and animals that rely on one another to survive. If one of the species dies out or disappears then all species will suffer and many will perish. The ecosystem could collapse. I recently have seen multiple reports from water conservancy districts around the state that show tremendous progress towards water conservation by the People of Utah, cutting consumption by nearly 40% in some cases. This is material change and we are early in the process. But this progress can be unraveled by the greed of industry so very quickly. The greed for money. I have taken my daughter to the Great Salt Lake to see the birds, but I fear that one day they will not remain. The lake itself will not remain. All of the plants and animals that rely on this tremendously valuable resource will be gone. What will remain is the guilt that is drained through the dry, baron, no longer saturated lake bed as the arsenic and other toxins are blown unrelentlessly towards our families, children, homes and schools. My mother passed away in 2019. She will never have to see the day that the Great Salt Lake has dried up and all of the birds are gone. I hope I never have to either. Please do not proceed with the destruction of our greatest resource by allowing industry to plunder the water it needs to exist. |
| 562 | Bill Davis Salt Lake City Resident | I would like to express my opposition to approving the pending permit to extend the canals to allow more water to be diverted from the Great Salt Lake. I believe that the lake could be at a tipping point which could create a crisis for the entire area. I realize that this might have serious financial consequences for US Magnesium but the consequences to the larger area are too great to risk. We all have to sacrifice and I and many other people are doing so. Things like conserving water, reducing lawn watering and even eliminating them. We all have to pitch in. Thanks for taking my comment. |
| 563 | Spencer Davis Willard Resident | Hi my name is Spencer Davis from Willard. I'm writing to tell you to not allow US magnesium to expand in the great salt lake. The lake is already critically threatened if they get the go ahead it's only a matter of time before their expansion will become defunct as the lake disappears. Focus on rehabilitating the lake. Thank you |
| 564 | Gregg S Alex Draper Resident | My name is Gregg S. Alex. I live at 362 E 12000 S, Draper, 84020. I'm an environmental scientist and am extremely concerned about the permit application to extend the intake canals at US Magnesium Corporation. The BEST available science we have shows that the impacts on the lake from the requested 100,000 gallons per minute extraction, would be devastating. US Mag Corp needs to make efficiency improvements and changes to production, to cut water usage like everyone else in this valley is doing, because the cost of lower lake levels to the State of Utah and its people (estimated to be in the BILLIONS \$), will far exceed any loss of revenues to US Mag Corp. I'm a big fan of the lake and understand the global importance of the ecosystem. I'm urging you to DENY this version of the permit application and demand US Mag Corp make significant reductions in water extraction. Save the Great Salt Lake! |
| 565 | Dylan | Do not allow these parasites to drain another drop of water from our dangerously depleted lake. We will die if they do. |
| 566 | Sidney Doyle Bluffdale Resident | My name is Sidney Doyle and I live in Bluffdale. I am a senior at Juan Diego Catholic School and a part of the environmental club. I have always been very passionate about the environment and I am very concerned about the permit to increase water intake canals at US Magnesium Corp. The amount of water US Mag Corp will be able to take out of the Great Salt Lake will be detrimental to the wellness of the lake and Utah communities. US Mag Corp NEEDS to practice more efficient processes and change production. They should not be asking for more water. This permit will affect the lake and the community in ways that will be irreversible. Please for the benefit of everyone and everything DO NOT approve this permit application! SAVE THE GREAT SALT LAKE!!! |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 567 | Brook Mckenzie | Please protect our birds. Reject the request to extend the canal. |
| 568 | Tim Schulz Sandy Resident | Thank you for taking public comments on this application. As a recreational user of the Great Salt Lake it has been disappointing to see the level of the lake continue to diminish. The lake level is already so low as to prevent use of the south marina. US Magnesium historically draws thousands of gallons per day which further diminishes the lake. It is clear the pumping US Magnesium uses the lake for has an inordinately negative impact on other lake interests. It is also clear that allowing further negative impact on the Great Salt Lake for the benefit of one entity at the expense of all others is not equitable nor reasonable. My hope is that the department will recognize 1) the negative impact US Magnesium's pumping has on the lake 2) further pumping is detrimental to other users and as a result; deny the application for dredging the drainage canals. |
| 569 | Christine Miller Salt Lake City | I want to indicate my grave concern for the proposed project of US Magnesium. The reason the project is being proposed is due to drying up of the lake bed. Utah needs to figure out how to maintain the lake. The thought of dredging the lake to take more water out of the lake is the exact opposite of what needs to be done at this very critical point in time. Given that we are at a tipping point of potential grave ecological collapse with recent documentation of the death of the stromatolites and brine flies, which feed birds and brine shrimp, the thought of doing more to dredge lake and reduce lake levels is showing inhumane arrogance of the suffering and death of migratory bird population. When the lake dies, all business opportunities will be lost as well. So we are not only selfishly serving the interests of just those humans alive today, but cutting off business opportunities in the future. Please put me on the books as being firmly against the US Magnesium dredging/pipeline project. |
| 570 | Megan Earle North Salt Lake Resident | Please do not issue U.S. Magnesium another permit to lengthen their intake canals. The Great Salt Lake is in danger of disappearing...which would be catastrophic for Utahns. Our health, families and livelihood are dependent on the Great Salt Lake |
| 571 | Jessica Sandrock | I'm voicing my opinion against the US Magnesium Permit. Pulling out more water when the lake is at a critical level, would be a disaster in many ways. With the ecosystem on the brink of collapse, we hold the fate of millions of migratory birds in our hands. The failure to protect them would solely be on our state, coming down to the choices we make right now. The threat of arsenic dust constantly looms over the lives of people here. At Owen's Lake in CA, the dust storms are powerful enough to block out the sun, we are not far off from experiencing that reality, having a barrage of poisonous heavy metals raining down on us, lingering in the air for weeks. If the government shows that they value the profit of one corporation, over the lives of a million of people, then I can no longer justify being a tax paying member of this state. It will show the choices that will be made when times get difficult, and they won't be the ones that create a sustainable future in this state that I've called home and loved all my life. New research has come out showing that magnesium can be extracted from sea water. The Salt Lake is no longer the ideal site for domestic magnesium production. It can be produced without putting entire cities in danger. The change will not happen without a push from our state saying we can no longer sustain this industry. The profits gained now will risk the entire collapse of this state's economy, with the destruction of the ski industry, real estate values tanking, and no population growth to be had. I urge you to make the difficult but necessary decision to say no to this permit. There is too much at stake. |
| 572 | Jean Tabin Park City Resident | I do not think we should allow any of the current mineral extraction companies to increase their canal system. The Great Salt Lake is threatened at this time and along with it, migratory bird species that depend on it and so much more. We must work on saving our lake before allowing more water to be drained from it. The mineral extraction companies have been important to our economy but let's not kill the "golden goose," our lake. Again, we must do everything in our power to save the lake, it's birds, it's economic potentials, the air around us which will be forever effected if this lake is destroyed. |
| 573 | Katie Mae Swaner | US Magnesium, a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore is once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster. Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake. |
| 574 | Kylie Dees | I have read an article in the Salt Lake Tribune about "Should companies stop siphoning away the Great Salt Lake until it refills." I found that the Utah Division of Water Quality is accepting comments through October 27th at this email. I believe that the siphoning from companies is causing the Great Lake to decrease substantially in size and depth which becomes a huge problem to many involved with the lake. Mainly, with the US Magnesium LLC who is the only domestic source of magnesium in the country. They are seeking the minimum amount of water to stay in business, but the project they are demanding may violate the federal Clean Water Act. I know it is difficult, but in order for the lake to even have a chance, companies need to stop siphoning water so that the importing of new water in the lake can begin to build up again. It is unreasonable for new water to be imported, but at the same time it is still being taken out. I know the goal is to get more water into the lake, and I have done my research and found out that one unique way to bring in water is from the floods that occurred in Yellowstone this summer. It would be by building a pipeline from the American Falls Reservoir through Arbon Valley down to Spring Bay of the Great Salt Lake. This way the pipeline can be turned on and off again so that it isn't continuous and they have a gauge of how much they want and when to do it. I have also learned that much of the water that enters the lake in the spring comes from the Wasatch Mountains, but it never really makes it into the lake due to human consumption and agricultural purposes. With spring coming up soon, I think it is important that we notice this issue and make it a priority for farmers to obtain their water from a completely separate source in order to maintain an actual vital source of water to the lake this spring. |
| 575 | Sam Nelson Salt Lake City Resident | Hello, I'm a resident of Salt Lake City and concerned about the water levels of the lake. I have considered leaving Salt Lake City due to the diminishing air quality and ecological health that's been caused by lower water levels at the lake among other issues. As a state, we need to commit to the restoration of our great lake. Allowing U.S. Magnesium to extend the canals would exhibit a complete lack of commitment to the health of the valley and the restoration of the lake. It would destroy lakebed and then allow U.S. Magnesium to resume intense diversion of water from the lake. We must stop allowing industry to drain this resource until it's gone. Thank you for listening, |
| 576 | Sarah Hubbard Salt Lake City Resident | I am worried, extremely worried, about the health of our Great Salt Lake and how its decline impacts the health of our environment and Utahns. "What's your backup plan?" is a serious discussion among my friends about where to move before Salt Lake City becomes undesirable due to lack of water and poor air quality (likely with increased exposure of the Great Salt Lake bed). While we are growing as a city now and seem a desirable place to live, what will this city be like in 15-20 years? Change is needed NOW. US Magnesium, a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore is once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster. Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, I am shocked the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. It will threaten the lives of humans as dust from the lake bed enters the air. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake. |
| 577 | Natasha Seegert Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing in opposition to US Magnesium's request to continue and expand their canal on the Great Salt Lake. Granting their request is irresponsible given the current state of the Great Salt Lake. We cannot continue to abuse an entire ecosystem as doing so will ultimately result in larger environmental issues, including increased problems with air quality, habitat loss for migratory birds, and the loss of biodiversity. Please do not grant the request from US Magnesium. The world has changed and we can no longer continue this approach to mindless extraction. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 578 | Kate Griffis Student Juan Diego | My name is Kate Griffis and I attend school at Juan Diego in Draper, Utah. I recently heard about the US Magnesium Corp permit to take 100,000 gallons per minute out of our already the record-low Great Salt Lake. As a Utahn, I am astonished by this and would simply like to say that allowing this to happen will destroy our beautiful state. Not only will many wildlife and aquatic life lose habitats and resources but we as people will lose resources as well. Please save our beautiful state and DO NOT pass this permit. |
| 579 | Andrew Phillips Morgan Resident | My name is Andrew Phillips from Morgan, Utah. I would like to comment on the proposal that would grant US Magnesium the ability to extend their pipeline and drain more of the Great Salt Lake. All of us, including huge companies, must do our part to avoid an economic and ecological disaster. I am vehemently opposed to extending that pipeline. As you likely already know. US magnesium is using more water than the 3 of the cities around it combined. This is completely unacceptable and must stop. Based on my research the private water users have done their part in limiting their water usage. Big corporations need to step up now and do the same. |
| 580 | Tayne Whiting | I hope we the people living in the Salt Lake valley and especially our leaders can stop the mistakes of our predecessors. And save the Great Salt Lake and all of use living here. Please say no to US Magnesium. |
| 581 | Johnny | Hello, how are you? My name is Johnny and I'm from Utah SLC. I'm from Cottonwood Highschool and I'm in the environmental science club. We have read your article about The US Magnesium Canal Continuation project and we as a club agree that it should be stopped. It is affecting all of SLC and we're concerned for our ecosystem and environment. The Great Salt Lake represents us as a city, a state and we don't our Great Salt Lake to go in harm. |
| 582 | Ana Gonzlez | My name is Ana Gonzalez and I'm a student at Cottonwood High School. I oppose this project because the Great Salt Lake is super important to our state, without it, millions of animal species would die every year and our air quality would be drastically affected too. That's why I think this project should be stopped, for the sake of our environment. |
| 583 | Lucas Pop Student | I am a 6th grader in Utah and i think this plan could be done better for the lake and for the people living around the lake. My class has been learning about the lake and it isn't doing too good and if it dries up Utah and a bunch of environments in the area. it would cause dust to rise up and the dust is not good for humans. so here is the idea think of a counter measure and a way to raise the water if it gets to low before you make the choice. |
| 584 | Azelia Hinckley | My name is Azelia Hinckley, and I am a sixth grader at Wasatch Elementary. After learning about the ecosystems at the Great Salt Lake, I have heard about companies wanting to expand canals into the Great Salt Lake. I am against this as it would have horrible effects on the ecosystems in the Great Salt Lake and the people living around it. The dredging of the lake could result in it drying up, and there being no more place for the birds and brine shrimp. The humans living around the lake would also suffer, as we use the Great Salt Lake as a source of water and recreation. Please don't dredge the Great Salt lake as it would be such a big loss for so many people and animals, including you and me. |
| 585 | Student Salt Lake City | I am a 6th grade student from Salt Lake City who has been studying the Lake and I am writing about Mag Corp's proposal to dredge more of the lake. I believe that you shouldn't let Mag Corp do this because it would drain the lake faster and if the lake dried up entirely, it would blow toxic dust into SLC and that would be very bad for residents like me. So, to help protect SLC, the surrounding towns, and the Lake we shouldn't let Mag Corp dredge any more than they have. |
| 586 | Sophia Moreira Student Wasatch Elementary | Hello, I am a student at Wasatch, and I have been learning about the great salt lake and dredge request and your draft approval. I am writing because I disagree with the Mag Corp request. If you let Mag Corp do this, you are increasing the chances of the Great Salt Lake drying up faster and there is deadly dust under that Lake. There's a high possibility of being so deadly that most citizens won't be able to live here and that means one of your highest water users States will be gone. But not just that an ecosystem that thousands and thousands of birds visit ever year will be harmed. This means that this will have a big impact on the ecosystem. If you don't act now Great Salt Lake will be gone along with one of your biggest water users. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 587 | Lucia Gee Student Wasatch Elementary | I am Lucia Gee, I am a sixth grader at Wasatch Elementary. I am against Magnesium Corporation dredging a canal. About a month ago my class went on a field trip to the great salt lake to do investigations on the ecosystem for science. It was sickening to see the lake at such a low level, we barely saw any water the entire time we were on Antelope Island, my class wasn't even able to do are planned investigations. If Mag Corp digs these canals the lake level will only go lower, and with it the wonderful ecosystem will fall apart. Thousands of birds will lose a resting, feeding, and breeding ground. The health of the people like me in Utah and surrounding areas will be impacted by the dust in the air, an example of what will happen is Owens Lake LA, GLS is much larger. When we lose GSL we will also lose an incredible place. If you approve this request, you will be putting the people and animals of Utah at risk. Is one company really worth it? |
| 588 | Zephyr Hayes Student Wasatch Elementary | My name is Zephyr Hayes and I am a 6 th grade student at Wasatch elementary school. And I've been learning about the GSL and all the ecosystems there. But what I am writing about to you is to say that I think you should not approve Mag Corp to dredge the lake. Because then there would toxic dust rising and we would need to wear masks every time we went outside. So just think about the animals they can not wear masks so they would probably die. Also there are people with like Asma and breathing problems so it would be very hard on them we would also probably need to abandon salt lake city. In conclusion I ask that you please do not approve Mag Corp to dredge The GSL |
| 589 | Olive Daniels Student Wasatch Elementary | I am olive a 6th grade student at Wasatch elementary school.I do not want you to let people just take water from the great salt lake. we are in a drought we do not want people to take extra water. Great salt lake is already shrinking every day. when it is gone, the danger will rise very high for everyone who lives in salt lake! we mustn't let the great salt lake dry up. If it does, we are all in danger! Please do not let this lake dry up. We must save the lake, if we don't, we might not have a lake nor a home. The great salt lake is special to us and all the animals who live there. Save The Lake please. The great salt is helping us everyday, we should help it back! Please don't take more water than we need. Mag corp should not get more water! |
| 590 | Auguste Call Student Wasatch Elementary | I am Auguste call, a 6th grader of Wasatch elementary school and resident of the Avenues of Salt Lake City. We have been studying ecosystems and have been using the Great Salt Lake as a model. We have also investigated its shrinking by looking at the precipitation rates and population data. As well as water usage. I write today to ask the Division of Water Quality NOT approve Mag Corp's Request to dredge the lakebed and extend their canals. We are already at a historic low and we do not need to lose more water. I recognize that the drought and water policies have affected the ecosystem and local businesses, but that is no reason to destroy the ecosystem further. If we do there will be potential bad consequences if we do continue. In closing I ask that the Division of Water Quality seek other ways to return our lake to a healthy point and refuse Magnesium Corporation's request to dredge further. I look forward to hearing your decision. |
| 591 | Holli Adams | Please take this opportunity to deny US Magnesiums' petition to extend their infrastructure at the Great Salt Lake. It is mandatory that any and all actions that may negatively impact the lake level and biology immediately cease and the development of further infrastructure can only magnify the current lake crisis. We are very very opposed to any further infrastructure development by US Magnesium or other corporate entities. |
| 592 | Vincent Dreier Student Wasatch Elementary | I am a 6th grade student in SLC Wasatch Elementary, I am sending this in support of against the document, you should not aprove this because you are basically deleting a really important file from the world. If you let MagCorp do this you are killing the 8th wonder of the world. Think of all the life, if you let them do this you could be killing of birds, brine shrimp, brine flies, and even people. It is not right, you are making people lose their jobs of being a scientist for the GSL. |
| 593 | Peter Bowling Kaysville Resident | My name is Peter Bowling from Kaysville Utah.I am writing to request the opposing of MagCorp's request to extend its canals to dredge more water from the lake. Because the lake is at a critical point in elevation, if it gets lower the ecosystem will collapse and the dust will cause breathing difficulties for many people. If we don't save the GSL who will? |
| 594 | John Allan Student Wasatch Elementary | hi, I am john Allan I am a 6th grader. I live in the Aves, and we did a field trip to the great salt lake. I have a request to save the gsl and stop MagCorp from digging up a trench. We will dry up the lake and we will kill all life their dust will come up and kill us. we need to save it. we can make a change for once. We can help it we just |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | need to stop MagCorp and save the gsl and save Utah. we can save the thousands of birds that come to the gsl. if we don't save the gsl who will only you can. plz help us we love our home. let us stay here. stop Magcorp SAVE THE GSL. |
| 595 | Naomi Askren Student Wasatch Elementary | I'm Naomi Askren. I'm in 6th grade at Wasatch Elementary in salt lake. I am writing today because I do not support the permit for MagCorp to dredge GSL, to get water in their evaporation ponds. This will affect the GSL big time, the lake is already really low down, and if we take more water from the GSL and evaporate it, the GSL could turn into a toxic dustbin. If we don't save the GSL who will? |
| 596 | Jack McAdams Student Wasatch Elementary | My name is Jack McAdams and I go to Wasatch Elementary, and I live in the SLC Avenues. I am writing today for a request to not let MagCorp dig a canal farther into the GSL. They should not be able to dredge because if we drain the GSL more it will cause more problems. The brine shrimp and birds will die. The GSL will produce toxic dust that will harm a lot of the people in the Salt Lake Valley. If we keep dredging into the GSL it's going to be even harder to save. I think that MagCorp should not be able to go farther into the GSL. |
| 597 | Hana Onda Student Wasatch Elementary | I am a 6th grade student at Wasatch Elementary who lives in salt lake. I know about the GSL because in 6th grade science we learn about its ecosystems and how they work. I'm writing today not in support of dredging the GSL. Have you thought about how if we take more water from the lake, it will take away the ecosystems of the birds, Brine shrimp, and other animals. If the lake evaporates then the whole ecosystem dies. If we don't save the lake, then we will all die. So please reconsider your decision. |
| 598 | Teri Harman | Please stop the proposal of US Magnesium to dig 2 more outlet canals from the Great Salt Lake. The lake is already on the verge of death and needs MORE WATER. Not less. She's integral to our local water cycle and the health of our ecosystem — which includes all the local residents. Every thing possible should be done to put water IN the lake not take it out—especially not to give it to a company that is a major polluter. |
| 599 | Elizabeth Stickley Student University of Utah | I am contacting you in regards to the extraction and further plans the US has placed on the Great Salt Lake for magnesium extraction. As if we don't have enough factors contributing to the draining of the Great Salt Lake, this is one step too far in using natural resources to help the economy. We must emphasize the negative effects the Great Salt Lake will have on the Salt Lake community if it becomes dry. By using the lake for simply it's resources, we are ignoring environmental issues that will affect thousands of lives in this area. Extracting more magnesium for finical gain is such a poor solution and will cause mass amounts of damage to our ecosystem. We need to stop ignoring these issues and think about the health of our community members and the health of the environment. This plan cannot be implemented and we need to stop magnesium extractions entirely from the Great Salt Lake. |
| 600 | Ben and Rosa Ocon Millcreek Resident | We are submitting a public comment urging the DWQ not to issue a Section 401 Water Quality Certification permit to U.S. Magnesium. We are submitting a public comment online because we were unable to attend the DWQ's public hearing. The DWQ's public hearing was scheduled on the same evening (Oct. 19th) as an event hosted by the Great Salt Lake Collaborative, "Can we save the Great Salt Lake?" held at the Day-Riverside Library in Salt Lake City. The GSLC panel was comprised of House Speaker Brad Wilson, Sarah Null, Watershed Sciences at Utah State University, and Lynn de Freitas, Friends of the Great Salt Lake. We walked away from the event with a much clearer understanding that the Great Salt Lake is drying up and that there will be dire consequences at catastrophic levels if it dries up completely (adversely impacting millions of migratory birds, the Utah economy and the health of millions who reside along the Wasatch Front). It is well documented (with the unfortunate and costly outcome involving Owens Lake in California) that a dried-up Great Salt Lake will unleash its arsenic laden lakebed into harmful toxic dust clouds that will adversely impact the health of millions who reside along the Wasatch Front. In order to save the Great Salt Lake, the GSLC panel concluded that a collective effort is required with the greatest urgency involving State Legislators, government agencies, the media, conservation groups and the general public. The collective effort must proactively pursue solutions and not be hampered by "business as usual" complacency. In light of the urgency, the first steps are to stop further diversion of water that would normally flow into the Great Salt Lake and to stop further polluting the Great Salt Lake. Though the DWQ's draft permit claims that the project will not have an impact on water quality, we respectfully disagree. The permit will authorize U.S. Magnesium to extend two of its in-take canals in Gilbert Bay and to dredge more than 100 acres of lake body which will bleed precious water into toxic evaporation ponds. The draft permit states that "the purpose of the project is to ensure continued |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | operation of the US Magnesium facility.” Why does the DWQ consider this as a valid justification for granting the permit? It is well documented that U.S. Magnesium is one of the country’s top polluters. The Division of Water Quality needs to join the collective effort and exercise proactive leadership by weighing the greater good over supporting a single corporation that has proven to be a polluter of the highest magnitude. We are retired and have decided to stay in Utah because we appreciate all of the amenities that living in Utah provides to our family. Yet, all those amenities that we cherish are in real jeopardy if the Great Salt Lake dries up. If the aforementioned collective effort is unsuccessful in saving the Great Salt Lake, living in Utah will no longer be “Life Elevated”. We will have no choice but to join the many, many others who will also decide to leave Utah. We urge the DWQ not to grant the 401 Water Quality certification permit to U.S. Magnesium. |
| 601 | Doug Tolman Utah Resident | My name is Douglas Tolman, a lifelong Utah resident who has lived within 20 minutes of the Great Salt Lake for my whole life. As lake levels continue to drop, so does the air quality, economic viability, and biodiversity of the Wasatch Front. These things all directly affect my health, and the health of my future children. I have been so happy to see lawmakers, environmentalists, industry and the general public on the same side of this fight to save Great Salt Lake. This is the first time in my 27 years I have seen so many people reach across political and economic divides to find a solution on such a big scale. With almost everyone in our state agreeing that we should do everything we can to save Great Salt Lake, and a broad coalition of government agencies, universities, corporations, and organizations working on that, it becomes very apparent when there is someone working against it. In this case, that is US Magnesium. By proposing to dredge canals that would remove 100,000 gallons of water per minute for evaporative processes, it is very apparent that US Magnesium has a parasitic relationship with the very lake it relies on to survive. When juxtaposed with other recent lawsuits over air pollution and mishandling of toxic waste, it is apparent that US Magnesium exhibits a pattern of abuse towards the watershed and airshed in which it resides. US Magnesium is the only major source of Magnesium in the US. With increasing international tension, we need to be as self-sufficient as possible in our manufacturing and production. For this reason, despite US Magnesium's long history of abuse towards the environment, I am not advocating for its shut down. However, if the multi-billion dollar magnesium industry wants to continue operating without directly harming Utah citizens, they must seek other options to keep lake levels higher. A few options could be purchasing water rights on behalf of the lake, supporting legislation that puts more water in the lake, and investing in solution-oriented science. The State of Utah cannot afford to permit US Magnesium to take more water from the lake while at the same time trying to save it. Please deny US Magnesium's proposal do dredge canals that will remove more water from Great Salt Lake. |
| 602 | Janet Kinneberg | Although I sympathize with the concerns of US Magnesium about the needs of their company, I am much more concerned about the long term viability of the Great Salt Lake. Please reconsider approval of the permits that would allow digging up about 127 acres of lakebed for canals that would give US Magnesium access to 100,000 gallons a minute from the Great Salt Lake. One company’s business needs must not override the needs and concerns for countless others who depend on the Great Salt Lake for their own livelihoods, health, snowpack and actual water storage, biodiversity, and our children’s future in Utah. I believe that permitting these canals is a grave mistake and a disservice to our community and to future generations. The demise of the Great Salt Lake has ramifications beyond Utah and beyond one company’s viability. Thank you for accepting my comment |
| 603 | Bill Rice Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing to urge the Division of Water Quality to not approve the application of US Magnesium to access additional water from the Great Salt Lake. Given the current shrinking water level of the lake it is unconscionable that additional industrial use of the lake’s water would be allowed. |
| 604 | David Taggart | The lake is already shrinking dangerously! Please deny US Magnesium’s permit to drain it any further! Thank you. |
| 605 | Martin Stensaas | The flagrant misuse of great Salt Lake water to support magnesium mining must stop. The lake is at critically low levels, and millions of endangered birds depend on what is left of the lake. Additionally, toxic dust will become an increasing problem to the health of everyone living around the lake. The nightmarish fate of the Aral sea awaits us if we do not act to raise lake levels to a healthy level. Please deny any further water used to magnesium mining. Also encourage more intelligent use of upstream water resources to restore inputs to the lake!! |
| 606 | Nicholas Alba | As a citizen of Salt Lake City with knowledge of The GSL drying up and the acute effects that it will have, I strongly disagree with allowing U.S. Magnesium to extract more water from the GSL. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 607 | Greg Pearson Morgan Resident | I am writing to let you know I am not in favor of the U.S. Magnesium proposal and believe we all need to work to keep water in the Great Salt Lake, now more than ever. Millions of migratory birds and other animals depend on the lake and the science shows that a dry lake bed is going to have devastating results for those of us that live in the Wasatch Front. |
| 608 | Evan Loomis | The money isn't worth the generational reputation you're about to put on yourself. You might say "I just work here" but many people on the wrong side of history said that. As a lifelong resident of Utah I'd like to say that I, at least, gave my thoughts and cleared my conscience (to some degree) before you, or whoever is making this decision, went and did something like this. |
| 609 | Julie Helzer | Once it is gone, it is gone forever. Please put the community before commercial interests. |
| 610 | Jake Lipscomb | Our water is ours! The great salt lake has a right to live beyond their right to profit. |
| 611 | Justin Wright | I honestly don't expect anything to actually happen. But wish to make my voice heard. I oppose anything that pollutes or destroys this great land, our Salt Lake, and it's community. |
| 612 | Elexis Bernstein Utah Resident | I am a student at Utah State University in the College of Natural Resources. I have recently discovered that the Great Salt Lake's health is at risk due to the mining of the magnesium mineral. I'd like to comment and request to stop the DWQ from allowing US Magnesium, the private magnesium mining company, to deplete further and pollute the lake. I understand that the Great Salt Lake is a great source for extraction, however, polluting our already depleting lake will put millions of Utahns health at risk. If you are interested in discussing this further with students at Utah State, we would love to participate. I can also provide sources explaining how this can/will affect the health of Utahns (air pollution is already a concern due to valley inversions and car emissions, so the polluted lake drying up will only increase our air pollution, especially in the Salt Lake Valley), wildlife (particularly migrating birds), brine shrimp, and more if you would like to learn more. |
| 613 | Thomas Kelleher Salt Lake County Resident | My name is Thomas Kelleher, and I am a resident of Salt Lake County. I am writing to express my belief that the Utah Division of Water Quality should absolutely not approve US Magnesium's permit to dredge additional lakebed in the Great Salt Lake to increase the amount of water they can extract. The solution to the lakebed not being high enough to extract water with the current infrastructure should not be to extend canals deeper into the bed, but to focus our efforts on how we can promote the restoration of the lake to higher levels. Any long-term vision for the health of Utahns and the Great Salt Lake is not compatible with increased extraction from an already-depleted resource, and the decision to approve the permit would very clearly demonstrate that the Utah Division of Water Quality is prioritizing short-term financial incentives over the long-term health of local residents and the lake. There is no other interpretation. |
| 614 | Brandie Pearson Mountain Green Resident | I am writing to let you know I am NOT in favor of the U.S. Magnesium proposal and believe we all NEED to work to <u>keep water</u> in the Great Salt Lake now more than ever! Millions of migratory birds and other animals <u>depend</u> on the lake and the science shows that a dry lake bed is going to have devastating results for those of us that live along the Wasatch Front. |
| 615 | Kevin Nash | Our air in this valley is already terrible for the health of the people and animals living here. Please do not allow more water to be taken from the great salt lake. Much more and we will all be living in a toxic environment, please help to keep our lake at least partially filled, if not for the environment, do it for our families and friends. |
| 616 | Danae Rowan | Please stop letting US Magnesium destroy our state for profits while also contributing to the worst pollution in the world. We deserve better! |
| 617 | Heather Doman | Please, please don't let US Magnesium extend further into the great salt lake. We are in danger of losing our lake, the brine shrimp and the thing that makes Salt Lake City so special. US Magnesium is destroying the lake just to line up pockets of the already rich. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 618 | Amy Schmidt | Please do not let U.S. Magnesium extend their pipes further into the Great Salt Lake. Just the fact that the pipes don't reach should be all the proof anyone needs that the water levels are much too low. We need that water! We have all been trying to conserve and the legislature is talking about ways to keep water in the lake so why is this even being considered? Just say no. Please and thank you. |
| 619 | Gina Turville | As an alarmed citizen, I am shocked that this entity would even request a permit when the Great Salt Lake is at it's current state of peril.This request should be denied |
| 620 | Christian Stewart Researcher University of Utah | I am an undergraduate student at USU researching the impacts of water resource problems on people and infrastructure. I am highly concerned that the DWQ is being negligent in permitting the canal extension for US magnesium. Mineral extraction consumptively uses more water than the entire urban development of the Wasatch front, and only several private companies profit. The Great Salt Lake is a public resource critical for nationwide ecosystems and the air quality of Utah. This canal extension allows a private company to deplete the lake at unprecedented low elevations where the lake is already in severe distress. In the wake of legislative actions attempting to save the lake, repermitting to allow one private company to destroy the lake contrasts with stated objectives of many state agencies.I urge against the permitting of the canal. |
| 621 | Patrick Hoecherl Salt Lake City Resident | I'm a Salt Lake City native who has lived here for 39 years. I am concerned about the water levels of the Great Salt Lake and the impact on air quality and health along the Wasatch Front if the lake level continues to decline. I am also an avid birder and fear the consequences for migratory and local birds. Please protect the health and safety of Utahns and our wildlife by denying the request to extend the canals |
| 622 | Karen Skaggs | I am writing to let you know I absolutely do NOT support allowing US Magnesium to extend their canals and continue to deplete the waters in the GSL. |
| 623 | Ashton Smith | Please don't renew US Magnesium's water rights. Our lake is suffering already. |
| 624 | Neil Sweeney-Haney Salt Lake County Resident | US Magnesium should be required to maintain their current canal levels. If they wish to continue diverting water from the lake, which I don't contest, they should have to work with local authorities to raise the water level in the lake to reach their existing canals. The degradation of our lake is going to cost exponentially more than whatever monetary value is being extracted from it now. Please, for our future, do not allow our lake to be exploited into extinction. Below I have quoted a few lines from the water quality certification and commented on them. Some of the comments are sarcastic as that is how I cope with the dread.“Diminishing lake levels have isolated the two intake canals from the Great Salt Lake which has limited the ability of the facility to operate.” “The project would maintain a conveyance of lake water intake flow of 100,000 gallons per minute from the Great Salt Lake.” Surely this will help. "The proposed project would extend the canals to a bottom elevation of 4,185 ft." From what elevation?"The dredged material would be discharged utilizing the aerial broadcast technique adjacent to the canals." Spraying the lakebed into the air will surely have no negative consequences.“Results from the current water quality assessment, as documented in Utah’s Final 2022 Integrated Report[1], indicated insufficient data (Assessment Category 3) were available to assess the Gilbert Bay AU.” Convenient! I like all of my industrial projects into vulnerable ecologies to be conducted on insufficient data!“Waters within the Gilbert Bay AU are considered Category 3 waters for antidegradation purposes. Category 3 waters in Utah are waters where point source discharges are allowed and degradation may occur” No worries about those degraded waters mixing with the rest of the lake.“The Project Proponent must review impairments on the waterbodies where the Project has the potential to discharge and is responsible for ensuring that water quality standards are not exceeded and designated beneficial uses are not impaired” Implicit trust in an industrial resource extracting company to ensure water quality standards is a really good call."110.00/hour" Not enough. |
| 625 | Christopher Wickstrom | I strongly oppose a permit allowing US Magnesium to construct another canal. US Magnesium is requesting the new canal because of the diminishing lake levels. Yet they are a significant cause of the shrinking lake levels, drawing 100,000+ gal/min from the lake day in and day out. The shrinking lake levels are a huge existential concern for Utahns, especially those of us in the vicinity of the Great Salt Lake. US Magnesium should not be permitted to continue desecrating our environment and wasting our precious water resources. They are generating privatized profits while leaving the public holding the bag. We absolutely cannot allow this to continue. No more, enough is enough. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 626 | Jenevieve Hubbard Salt Lake City Resident | I have lived in Salt Lake City for 20 years. My ancestors were among the pioneers who first arrived here. In the short time I have lived here, I have watched the lake evaporate before my eyes. The Lake is a wildlife refuge to migrating birds. And the loss of it will be catastrophic, not only to nature but to the humans who live here. Please do not prioritize private interests over our health and safety and the future of this city. |
| 627 | Gabriel Blackhelm | I'm writing to express my thoughts about the executives at US Magnesium in their request to extend intake canals on the Great Salt Lake. A few months ago I walked about a mile into the Great Salt Lake, and I was hardly chest deep in water. It had been a couple of years since I had been out there, but I was struck by how the Lake vastly diminished in such a short time, to the point it seemed as if I could walk all the way across. It seems cold for a corporation which has benefited so much by taking from this natural wonder, and something that is so deeply rooted in the heritage of the people who settled this land, to deepen its cuts at a time when the Lake is most vulnerable. This request puts into perspective that the relation of US Magnesium to the Great Salt Lake is not one that entails a sense of responsibility, but rather is that of a parasite to a host. The U.S. government, in testing atomic weapons at the Nevada test site in the mid 1900's, did so when the winds were blowing toward Utah. This has led to speculation that the reason for choosing the site was the Pentagon knew that Utahans were patriotic and wouldn't question what the government was doing in the name of national defense, even when people began showing deleterious effects from the fallout. It is illegal in most states to use a name that implies a government entity such as the "United States." I guess US Magnesium is able to get around that by saying that the "US" in its title is a pronoun and doesn't stand for anything, but it seems by their track record as one of the worst polluters in the country, that it's likely chosen for the purpose of tapping into the unquestioning patriotism for which Utah is known. One of the ways that parasites avoid detection is to mimic specific proteins in the body. The implication of being a government entity in the company's title is another way in which US Magnesium is parasitic in nature. The Great Salt Lake is subordinate to the power of Western civilization. It's easy with heavy machinery to do the work of extending the intake canals in the soft clay, but doing so means squandering a rich inheritance. I implore you to be wise. |
| 628 | Ryan Cronin | Utahns Want to Keep Water in the Lake. Why is the Division of Water Quality allowing US Magnesium to take more out?US Magnesium, a historically egregious water abuser in their extractive mining practices on the lake shore is once again threatening the livelihood of our Great Salt Lake. The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of ecological disaster.Despite national attention on the looming environmental crisis facing the lake, the State intends to allow more water to be pulled out of the Great Salt Lake. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to avoid violation of beneficial use. All eyes are on the lake. The DWQ must take full responsibility and say NO to US Magnesium's plans to devastate the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake to ensure that we protect the beneficial uses of Great Salt Lake.Please do the right thing for the future of the human race and for the planet. |
| 629 | Alex Bartz | I think the people of salt lake are pretty unanimously against breathing in poison dust when the lake dries up. You have scientists, community leaders, climatologists, healthcare researchers, and everyday residents in Utah against anything that draws excess water from a lakebed that, once dried up, will blow deadly toxic dust into the atmosphere, collect in high concentrations during inversions, and murder thousands upon thousands of residents in this already troubled state. You even entertaining this idea of allowing us magnesium to take even more than they already are proves this board is either incompetent or murderers. Either way you shouldn't have a job. |
| 630 | Alex Sanchez | I'm a resident in Murray. I've seen the effects of low lake levels throughout the entire valley. As a state, cannot continue letting companies syphon important water resources from our ecosystem. Deny US Magnesium any permits that allow them to continue to do so. |
| 631 | Alison Murphy South Jordan | I live in South Jordan, Utah and have been increasingly worried about the Great Salt Lake's depleting water levels and how it's current state is negatively affecting the air quality, salinity levels, biodiversity, and the many species that depend on it. I want it to be around for my children to enjoy. We can't blindly hope for rain and snow to fill it up when it continues to be dredged at high levels from US Magnesium. Please vote no to give our Great Salt Lake a chance. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 632 | Ryan Moran | I am writing to oppose the extension of US Magnesium's canals. With the Great Salt Lake at dangerously low levels and no end to the drought on the horizon, it is simply irresponsible to allow US Magnesium to divert more water from the Great Salt Lake. If the lake dries up, as you know it will drastically decrease the quality of life for everyone who lives in the valley. The interests of one company should not be given precedence over the entirety of the rest of the population. I thus urge you to reject US Magnesium' petition to extend its canals. |
| 633 | Brenda Voisard, PhD | Don't allow US Magnesium to dredge larger amounts of the Great Salt Lake |
| 634 | Ashley Berkowitz Salt Lake City Resident | I have been a resident of Salt Lake City for over eight years and also enjoy spending time in other parts of our beautiful state. I am writing this to show my support for the Great Salt Lake and Utah as a whole. I respectfully and resolutely request US Magnesium not be permitted to extend any canals or divert any new water from the GSL. The alarmingly dangerous level of the GSL has recently become national news as well as the subject of national legislation; it is a dire issue that absolutely cannot be ignored any longer, let alone made worse. There will be no money to be made by anyone if the lake dries up more, changing the safety of the entire ecosystem for humans as well as plants and animals. It would affect so many industries and businesses crucial to Utah's economy as a whole, negatively impacting the livelihood of so many Utahans and their families. I truly utterly cannot comprehend how anyone would propose taking water out of the lake at a time like this. Please do not allow US Magnesium or any other company to take water from the GSL — it would be catastrophic in the most profoundly terrible ways. This decision literally impacts every single one of us living here and even beyond; I hope we can agree all of our lives and livelihoods are more important than a singular company's self-serving and entirely ignorant request. Thank you for allowing us to comment on this and taking our comments seriously, it is incredibly appreciated. |
| 635 | Mark Hammond Salt Lake Valley Resident | As a citizen of Utah and the Salt Lake Valley, I strongly oppose diverting more water out of the Great Salt Lake. Exposing more of the lake bed will cause air quality issues that could impact our health and our economy. No one wants to live in a dust bowl full of toxic chemicals. My investment properties will be negatively impacted as real estate prices will drop if air quality forces people to leave here and not move here. But our health is the most important issue. |
| 636 | Peter Clark | Please do not allow any more siphoning of the GSL. We all understand the terrible consequences. So why would you put your head in the sand and be part of the problem? Be part of the solution. We need the water! |
| 637 | Valerie Poltoratzsky Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing to urge the Division of Water Quality to not approve the application of US Magnesium to access additional water from the Great Salt Lake. Given the current shrinking water level of the lake it is unconscionable that additional industrial use of the lake's water would be allowed. |
| 638 | Kristy Johnson Ogden Resident | The a Great Salt Lake is becoming less great as the years go by. It is hard for me to even understand that you would be considering allowing a company to siphon water away from the dwindling lake while others try to figure out how to restore it. Utah is no longer home to 'the greatest snow on earth' as the lake is becoming less and less able to provide the much needed lake effect. The winter sports industry has a huge economic impact and the loss of snow means the loss of those dollars to support the local economy. As the lake disappears, so does the ecosystem that thousands of migratory birds rely on each year. And as the lake bed becomes exposed, we become exposed to toxic dust storms. As if the current air quality issues weren't bad enough! Allowing one company the rights to take water from the lake is completely shocking. Please, I beg you, consider the long term view and put the health and well-being of Utah residents and the local environment first. |
| 639 | Lina Boyer Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing to express my great concern over US magnesium extending its canals to suck up more of the great salt lake. We are already in a drought, and the lake is drying up. This will have disastrous effects for wildlife and people alike. The lakebed is filled with toxins. Allowing more water to be drawn away is deeply irresponsible and destructive to our community and is unacceptable. Do not allow this to go through. |
| 640 | Heleena Sideris | I am writing you today to urge you to say NO to US magnesium's request to dig trenches in the great salt lake to further extract water from this already desperately low body of water. The implications could be catastrophic environmentally. Thank you for putting the health safety and values of the Utah people first. I appreciate your consideration. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 641 | Nicole Smith Salt Lake City Resident | Salt Lake City resident and homeowner here. My spouse and I are 30 somethings who thought we were here to stay in Salt Lake for the long haul - we love it! That is until we read up on what's happening with the Great Salt Lake. Now we are reconsidering continuing to be homeowners here. Please do not issue more permits to a company that is so detrimental to the lake. It cannot be good for the water quality affecting the immediate areas that will be disturbed and I seriously doubt it's good for the long term health of the lake and the residents near it. I can't believe that diverting more water from the lake is even a possibility at this point in time - seems like putting more fuel on the already burning fire. The reason they need these permits is because of previous poor use and stewardship of the water, why let them continue? This is a no brainer. Please take capitalism out of this and think of the environment and the future. If the government of Utah continues to not only ignore but worsen the condition of the Great Salt Lake, they are driving away young adults who would start families here to other state |
| 642 | Sontara Nguyen | TOXIC DUST... need I say more??!! Our health is at stake, our planet is at stake, and wildlife is at stake! PLEASE DON'T PUT PROFIT OVER THE PLANET! Don't allow US Magnesium to dredge and extend the canal. |
| 643 | Ian Lamberson Murray Resident | Hi I am citizen of Murray UT and oppose US Magnesium's access to the daily millions of water from the Great Salt Lake. I greatly value the unique ecosystem around where I am lucky to live and wish to do whatever it takes to preserve one of Utah's greatest natural wonders from exploitation. |
| 644 | Nate Jones | Hey, I'll keep this short. It's great we have such a huge, global supplier of magnesium in the state, but what's going on in regards to regulation of this company? Seems like they are an OSHA nightmare from my own research, and they actively contribute to our terrible pollution problem in the state, nevermind the water problem with the GSL. I'd rather not die from a toxic dust cloud, and I think whoever reads this message doesn't want to either. Let's please do something about this? |
| 645 | Jarem Kilby | Hello, I'm Jarem Kilby, a resident of Salt Lake City, Utah. I'm writing to inform the state that I am opposed to the plan to allow U.S. Magnesium to dig canals into Salt Lake. Thank you. |
| 646 | Daniel Patton | I am strongly opposed to allowing US Magnesium to continue using our public water for personal profit. We live in a desert and continuing to allow US Magnesium to consume gluttonous amounts of water is a horrible idea. To approve this proposal in the middle of a water shortage, while living in a desert, would be ludicrous. If we don't not care for and protect the natural resources we have in Utah, they will cease to exist. Please do not allow a for profit company to exploit natural resources in a way that causes harm to the local community. |
| 647 | Shane Benhoff | I really can't understand how you could possibly entertain this idea. This literally sounds like a super-villain plot. I know you have rationalized this in your own mind and will ignore public sentiment, but this project will benefit no one but US magnesium stakeholders. Have fun sleeping at night when you inevitably approve this project in spite of the public good. |
| 648 | Stan Shaw | Please do not allow U.S. Magnesium to extend and deepen their canals in order to suck more water out of the Great Salt Lake as a Utah citizen. Some issues I am concerned about are: Recreation, hunting, boating, air quality, waterfowl migration, wetland destruction, etc. Thanks for caring about our lake and wetlands! |
| 649 | Sara Day Program Manager Utah Microloan Fund | I oppose the US Magnesium Canal Continuation Project. In a typical year, US Magnesium diverts more water from Great Salt Lake than Ogden, Salt Lake City, and Provo combined, pulling on average 100,000 gallons of water per minute. I do not want to live in a toxic dustbowl and Utah needs to be doing everything it can to protect the great Salt Lake. |
| 650 | Lance Hemmert Vernal Resident | The GSL should be maintained at a minimum level before excess waters are used for industrial purposes. It's time we used our natural resources in an ethical manner rather than in the interest of the few |
| 651 | Robin Spicer | With the Great Salt Lake already reeling from record low water levels, the last thing we need is take more water out. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 652 | Devin Wright | I am completely opposed to the expansion of the settlement ponds in the GSL. Not only is this lake our namesake for our city, it is critical to much more important things like LIFE in Utah which far exceeds the contribution on these minerals from this lake. Please deny, especially in light of the weak snow we have had this century. |
| 653 | Emily Maclary | I am a resident of Salt Lake City and am writing to voice my opposition to additional dredging and canal extension by US Magnesium. We constantly hear on the news how the Great Salt Lake is in trouble, and it is incredibly difficult to understand how or why any company would be permitted to siphon additional water from the Great Salt Lake in the middle of the ongoing conversation about catastrophically low water levels. There are so many reasons to refuse additional dredging and canal extension and allow the lake to recover, both from an environmental and a public health perspective, including its importance as migratory bird habitat, and the hazards of toxic dust from a drying lakebed. How can the state in good conscience discuss plans to save the Great Salt Lake while simultaneously issuing permits for processes that will speed its demise? I understand that industrial magnesium production is important, but we should not hasten an ecological and public health disaster for the benefit of a single industry. To do so would show blatant disregard for our environment and the communities who live here. |
| 654 | Valarie Williams | I honestly can't even believe that this is being seriously considered. Do we really have to write in to persuade people that permitting a company to use even more water during a drought from a rapidly dwindling water supply is a TERRIBLE idea? The Salt Lake is drying up at an alarming rate and with climate change bringing hotter summers, longer droughts, more wildfires, stronger and longer inversions - do we really need to add a toxic dust lake bed to the equation? An entire valley's way of living could be irreversibly wiped out. Losing the wildlife and ecosystems that depend upon the Salt Lake would be a devastating loss. I had hoped to be able to plant roots here, and own my first home. But living through 32 days of 100 plus degree weather in a matter of months, water conservation efforts during an extreme drought equating to prayer, the unenviably high world ranking of our noxious air quality, rising rents and home prices, and now the risk of losing the Great Salt Lake completely - it looks like I'll be hightailing it for healthier locations after graduation. Which is a deeply depressing thought as I have strong connections to this city and had hoped to work to better the lives of the people within it post graduation. I truly hope this public comment isn't to check off a "community engagement" box on the process and that the concerns of the people whose lives will be affected will be taken into consideration for a solution promoting a healthier, more resilient valley with a full Great Salt Lake. |
| 655 | Ryan Lenning | Please do not put corporate interest and greed above the health and well being of the residents of the Salt Lake valley. The lake is drying up, land becoming increasingly polluted and soon will not be able to sustain anyone, rich or poor. These environmentally destructive companies need checks and balances |
| 656 | Nathon Kolman | Look, I'll be frank, this is not an acceptable action for the state to allow US Magnesium to do, poison the land, dry up the lake, ruining our lake effect snow pack and destroying our winter sport industries, making The Valley uninhabitable. Honestly if you have any conscious, any sense of empathy towards others, your family, friends, children you'll do the right thing and block this. Haven't they already done enough damage?? |
| 657 | Daniel P Love | Stop passing conservation to the end user, it's a failed strategy. This business needs to update its technology to become more water efficient. It takes institutions to hold big business accountable, it's clearly not in the best infests of Utahns to approve this. |
| 658 | Wade R Owen Weber County Resident | I am a resident of the State of Utah, Weber County.I am strongly against allowing US Magnesium to extend its canals.It is irresponsible to allow one company to use so much water when continuing to shrink the Great Salt adversely affects millions of residents. US Mag is one of the worst polluters in the state. Please do not allow these canal extensions. |
| 659 | Lizzy Elmer Midvale Resident | Why we should let US Magnesium Come In Utah 1) To dry up our Great Salt Lake,2) To desolate millions of people, families, animals, 3) To destroy the beautiful national natural reserves, 4) To pollute the land, air, & little water we have left for generations to come,5) To prove once & for all, this state stands with corporations & once again fail its people.If you cannot tell, I strongly oppose moving forward with US Magnesium Corp. If we do, we will greatly impact the civilization here in Utah. All will cease to exist without our main water source. You would think we would treat water in a desert better than any precious metal, but because that train of thought does not exist for greedy corporations who feed on weak governments, here we are, having this "forum" of comments & concerns. We'll see if someone actually reads |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | this & returns a message. I am not too optimistic about that email response outcome or the outcome of the people v US Magnesium forum. Be better. Make the better call & refuse US Magnesium's call to take our lives from us. |
| 660 | Chris Needham Syracuse Resident | I am opposed to the proposed extension of the intake pipes for US Magnesium. The Great Salt Lake needs solutions to add more water to it, not to remove 100,000 gallons per minute from it. I live on the shoreline of the lake in Syracuse and the continued exploitation of the lake to benefit a for profit business poses a significant threat to our ecosystem and way of life. |
| 661 | Katharine Biele Shauna Bona, Nickie Nelson, Terri McCulloch, League of Women Voters | On behalf of the League of Women Voters of Utah and the Leagues of Salt Lake, Davis and Weber Counties (LWV), we request the Utah Division of Water Quality undertake a Level II Anti-degradation Review before making a ruling on US Magnesium's 401 Water Quality Certification request # DWQ-2022-08001. Great Salt Lake (GSL) is already dangerously close to collapse, and this project will most certainly exacerbate the many problems associated with its current status. As you know, the water level in the lake is at a historic low and continues to decline. Any project that decreases it further will have far-reaching impacts on public health, salinity and water quality in the lake, the brine shrimp industry, migratory bird populations and their vital food sources, air quality, wetlands and riparian areas, and virtually the entire lake ecosystem and economy. These effects need to be thoroughly investigated before reaching a decision. The LWV stands for transparency in government and appreciates this opportunity to comment on behalf of our members, their families and communities. The LWV also supports stewardship of our environment. GSL is not only an asset to Salt Lake City and Utah, but provides a staging, feeding and breeding ground for many migratory bird species from many parts of the world. Its fate has been covered by many national publications because of its importance. To allow US Magnesium to further lower the lake level risks repeating the mistake of draining Owens Lake - a scenario that conflicts with the role of the Division of Water Quality as a protector of our public resources. We urge you to conduct a Level II Anti-degradation Review of the US Magnesium Canal Continuation Project so that you and the public will have a clear understanding of the extraction process, the effects on the lake, and the long-term consequences to an extremely sensitive and essential element of our environment. We ask you to protect one of the most important water bodies on this planet, as well as, our future health. Thank you for the opportunity to express our concerns. |
| 662 | Jamie Printz | This permit should not be issued. The Great Salt Lake is already at record low levels with no improvement forecasted for the future. The US Magnesium plant has other means of improving their production without putting an undue burden on the public's health, environment and economy. The people of Salt Lake City rely on the Great Salt Lake as a foundation for our entire economy and as such should ensure that not only is more water not diverted from it, but to actively reverse the levels from dropping. |
| 663 | Anthony DeVore Logan Resident | I want my voice heard. The Great Salt Lake is dangerously low, toxins from the newly exposed shore bed are dusting into living communities near the lake[https://www.google.com/amp/s/www.nytimes.com/2022/06/07/climate/salt-lake-city-climate-disaster.amp.html] , wildlife that uses our lake as a home and a rest stop are losing food and space [https://www.google.com/amp/s/www.upr.org/utah-news/2021-09-13/the-great-salt-lake-is-low-what-does-this-mean-for-wildlife%3f_amp=true]. And in this crisis to Utah US Magnesium has decided that it is in their best interest to take more water to be evaporated into clouds that probably will not rain on the lake or it's primary river sources (I cannot find good evidence for this other than the fact that the Great Salt Lake is becoming smaller), increasing the toxic dust being exposed, further causing harm to Utahns, but also removing even more land and food for wildlife that hold Utah to be a home as well. All for what? To create magnesium and table salt [https://usmagnesium.com/about-us-mag/]. Magnesium that will be used to further the 'health' of supplement taking humans even though there are little to no side effects to a low intake of magnesium [https://www.mayoclinic.org/healthy-lifestyle/nutrition-and-healthy-eating/expert-answers/magnesium-supplements/faq-20466270#:~:text=Magnesium%20plays%20many%20crucial%20roles,type%20%20diabetes%20and%20osteoporosis.] and can be supplemented easily with some cashews, prunes, or avacado toast [https://www.runnersworld.com/nutrition-weight-loss/a27528828/foods-with-magnesium/?utm_source=google&utm_medium=cpc&utm_campaign=arb_ga_rnw_md_pmx_us_urlx&gclid=CjwKCAjw2OiaBhBSEiwAh2ZSP-IWkgQKH_OZuqcKICty3UhIDX3ltT0d_Uw58kFRSY5IPXZHT6VpSRoCP3QQAuD_BwE] Please take this information seriously. If we were in need of more salt (much more important than magnesium in my mind) than this would be a serious debate, but the negative impacts that taking more water from the Great Salt Lake can cause is not worth it. Please DENY US Magnesium's request to extend their canals into the Great Salt Lake. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 664 | Emily W Allen Millcreek Resident | I just wanted to write as a Salt Lake City native to voice my opposition to the U.S. Magnesium permits allowing them to extend their canals. Having grown up in the shadow of Magcorp and U.S. Magnesium, their unhindered license to spew pollution into our air and their license to use our GSL as their personal resource sickens me and my family, literally: My eldest brother is now suffering the effects of this pollution in the form of lung cancer. Please deny them new permits to hurt our beautiful natural environment and our growing local community |
| 665 | | Please do not extend US Magnesium's permit. We need to start saying no to water use. I'm sure this will affect US magnesium negatively, but it's time to start thinking of all the citizens that rely on the lake. We need to allow the lake to replenish and we can't take more water away. |
| 666 | Ron Mason | US Magnesium's permit request, if granted is in opposition to the Division Of Water Quality's mission statement of balanced regulation. As a landscaper with a clientele developed through water wise irrigation, I urge the Division Of Water Quality to use its fiduciary responsibility responsibly and deny US Magnesium's permit request . Knowing The Great Sale Lake's consumption is 85% agriculture., 7.5% industrial, 5.6% residential outdoor and 1.9% residential indoor, least beneficial use of our Lake's water is residential outdoor. The most beneficial use arguably is agriculture. Industrial use provides needed employment. However, allowing US Magnesium to add intake canals will add to an unfolding environmental disaster that will threaten the economic vitality of Salt Lake City with winds bringing toxic levels of arsenic to a large population base, threaten the food chain with sustained increased levels of salinity and contribute to a growing drought. I am against US Magnesium's permit request. |
| 667 | Cindy Flores Enriquez | I went to to see the lake and it was really low and think you should start a fundraiser for investigation on what to do foward to sale the lake |
| 668 | Zabrina Garcia | Hello, I read the article about mining the Great Salt Lake and I actually disagree with this. I went down to the Salt Lake for a school trip and it was a bit concerning with how dry it's getting. I've also been so a different part of the Salt Lake called The Spiral Jetty and there is a concerning amount of things in parts of the water. I think that we should stop mining it because brine shrimp depend on the water and also the Great Salt Lake has gotten a lot smaller very quickly. We may need that water one day. |
| 669 | Lynette Phillips Midvale Resident | I am 100% against allowing US magnesium to pump more of the Great Salt Lake. We are in record drought and already have too many toxic deposits and chemicals blowing off from the lake bed. US Magnesium, by requesting to pump more of the Great Salt Lake, is attempting to capitalize on one of the greatest ecological disasters this state has ever faced. Please deny their request. |
| 670 | Susan Klinker | I am reaching out with strong opposition to US Magnesium's permit application to extend their canals further into the lake. Allowing them to do so will negate all other upstream water conservation efforts, which are barely becoming established as the lake waters recede at alarming rates. Until we know how we are going to solve this problem, US Magnesium activity must be held in check, to preserve our quality of life, and the air we breathe throughout the Salt Lake Valley. If we create a dustbowl of toxic air, our livelihoods, our communities, our economy, our agricultural systems, our watersheds, and our property values crash, leaving us as climate refugees seeking someplace else to live. Not to mention the reciprocal devastation of all the ecosystems that depend on migratory bird populations stopping off in the Great Salt Lake. This is an unthinkable future, that very well may become a reality even within the next 3-5 years, as the lakebed crust breaks down and becomes increasingly airborne. People are already moving away, and new businesses are rejecting Utah as a potential location for business expansion. US Magnesium already draws more water out of the lake than Salt Lake City, Ogden, and Provo combined, over 100,000 gallons per minute. Approval of the permit brings no benefit to the people of Utah, and presents a great risk of a tragic future for our community. We can do better. Please don't exacerbate the current situation by approving US Magnesium's permit application. Invite them, instead, to work toward raising water levels back up to current intake locations. |
| 671 | Kristen Carey | I am extremely concerned with the request for US Magnesium permit to lengthen their intakes. We are quickly approaching a time where the status quo will not work. The Great Salt Lake is rapidly shrink which has been document to cause numerous public safety issues in the future (https://www.nytimes.com/2022/06/07/climate/salt-lake-city-climate-disaster.html). As noted by the New York Times, the shrinking lake is creating a bowl of toxic dust that could poison the air around Salt Lake City and the Wasatch Front if things don't change. US Magnesium is part of the problem and allowing for them to continue to evaporate Salt Lake water for their operations is |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | part of the problem. DWQ must conduct a Level II Antidegradation review to ensure that US Magnesium's permit request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the division is required by law to protect. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum bar set for future extractive practices on Great Salt Lake in order to ensure the protection of the Lake's beneficial uses. |
| 672 | Silvia Smith | I am commenting as a concerned citizen and lifelong local to the Great Salt Lake. As many scientists, environmental groups, and other commenters have noted, the Great Salt Lake is currently in a crisis due to the low water level of the lake. This affects the lake ecosystem, the millions of birds that rely on the lake during migration and nesting, and therefore all of the ecosystems across the western hemisphere that those birds participate in throughout the year. It affects our economy and national food security, as the lake provides the majority of brine cycsts used to raise fish throughout the world. It affects Utah's daily lives, as without a stable lake ecology, we will see environmental disasters threaten our air quality and water quality. Although US Magnesium has water rights to a significant amount of water from the lake, those water rights don't mean much when the water is not there. We cannot pull water that we do not have. The best solution for Utah and US Magnesium at this time is to REJECT the permit request and encourage US Magnesium and other stakeholders to raise the lake levels to a point that their current canals can draw water at those appropriate water levels. If the Utah Division of Water Quality does not say NO to US Magnesium's permit request, the water quality will be severely affected. Diminishing water in the Great Salt Lake will increase the salinity of the water in the south side of the lake, making it harder to support the brine shrimp, brine fly, algae, and microbialite populations that are the foundations of the ecology of the lake basin, and foundations of many of the benefits we humans derive from the lake. Allowing too much water to be diverted from the lake also creates a self-reinforcing cycle, where low water levels and shallow depths make the lake evaporate faster, leading to lower water levels and shallower depths that again turn into faster evaporation. In order to protect the water quality of the lake, we must do all we can to avoid this feedback cycle, as once we turn past that critical level, it will be extremely difficult and costly to reverse the trend--moreso than it already is. Finally, the diminishing water levels of Great Salt Lake include an acute threat to the air quality and health of the surrounding area. You are no doubt aware of the toxins in the dust of the lake that will become airborne as the lakebed dries. This creates a threat larger than just our region, as airborne toxins will likely travel into other watersheds and regions near us. The prospect of the air in my home becoming more toxic than it already is and dust clouds damaging the environment in my home breaks my heart, as it means that I would not be able to safely raise children in my home state. I do not want to become a climate refugee and be forced to move in order to escape the dire consequences of environmental mismanagement. Our Great Salt Lake needs a lot of different interventions in order to be restored to a sustainable level. Rejecting this permit is one step out of dozens that will be critical to our success in protecting our home and our environment and securing the future of Great Salt Lake. |
| 673 | Lynn Bohs Salt Lake City Resident | I am writing to express my opposition to the proposal for additional dredging in the Great Salt Lake by US Magnesium. The GSL is already at a historic low level, imperiling its very existence as well as the plants, animals, microbes, and humans that depend on it. Dredging of the new canals to extract and evaporate more water from the GSL will further exacerbate the problems already existing due to low lake levels. We need to find ways to put more water into GSL, not take it out. The rationale for opposition to this plan as well as possible mitigation actions are articulately laid out by the FRIENDS of GSL in their letter opposing this project. Please act to save the lake by denying this dredging proposal. |
| 674 | Suzy Martin, RN, NP University of Utah | Please do whatever you can to prevent the magnesium mining canal proposal from passing. This proposal makes no sense to me, and the magnesium mining company should rethink how they do business |
| 675 | Robert Erhardt | Please do not allow the expansion of the US magnesium canal. The great salt lake can't handle it and they will worsen already bad air quality.WE DONT HAVE ENOUGH WATER |
| 676 | Meherban Khalsa Salt Lake City Resident | I am a senior citizen and lifelong resident of Salt Lake City. When our children were young, we would spend weekends at the Great Salt Lake, sailboarding, picnicking, and playing in the sand. My grandchildren have never been to GSL. It is no longer a pleasant place to recreate. I am aware that US Magnesium has applied for permits to lengthen their intake canals by several miles. I ask that the application be denied. I have been educating myself on this topic and now understand that more water |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | diversion will increase the salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in isolated segments of the lake. The GSL's food sources are already on the verge of collapse. Please say no to US Magnesium. |
| 677 | Spencer Tracy Salt Lake County Resident | My name is Spencer Tracy. I am a resident of Salt Lake County and I am reaching out in opposition of the proposed canals by U.S. Magnesium in the Great Salt Lake (GSL). The GSL is already under significant threat both to the local ecosystem as well as the residents of the Salt Lake area. As the GSL continues to dry up more toxic chemicals such as arsenic can and will be released into the atmosphere further exacerbating the awful air quality issues that the state deals with year round. If the lake were to dry up as it seems on pace to do this would greatly damage the continued growth of the state as the Salt Lake Area, the most populous area of the state, becomes significantly less habitable to humans and other life. The GSL is a great asset to the states economy through the farming of Brine Shrimp. In addition to the economic benefits of the Brine Shrimp farms that benefit from the GSL, There are also a great amount of ecological benefits to the entire country as the GSL is used by hundreds of species of birds as a resting area to eat said shrimp and move on. Without the GSL those birds will not have that rest stop that they need to continue their yearly migrations. As for U.S. Magnesium they are well known for being one of the biggest polluters in the nation (https://www.epa.gov/superfund-redevelopment/superfund-sites-reuse-utah#magnesium , https://www.deseret.com/2003/1/22/19700212/u-s-magnesium-still-worst-polluter) which would do nothing but damage the incredible natural asset that is the GSL. In addition to this the canals that have been proposed would use up to 100,000 gallons PER MINUTE of water from our already dying lake. Please, invest in the future of our state and do not allow U.S. Magnesium to take what little water is left from the lake while polluting the area for generations. Utah Lake already has issues with Toxic algae as a result of pollution from decades ago, do not let the same fate fall upon the Great Salt Lake. |
| 678 | Jim Frazer | I urge you to consider the following in making your decision: When the salinity in the lake rises to the point where brine shrimp can no longer reproduce at commercially viable levels, the brine shrimp industry will be out of business. Undeniably, this is a water quality issue, as the life-cycle of the shrimp depends on a particular quality of the water, namely the salinity range within which they can live. The brine shrimp industry should not be sacrificed for the continuation of the magnesium industry. Everyone, from individuals to large commercial agricultural operations, is being asked to conserve water to prevent the lake from drying up. Are all of us being asked to make those sacrifices and accommodations so that US Magnesium can continue its business as usual, removing from the lake daily an amount of water which could furnish the needs of a small city? Although there clearly is a water quality issue here - salinity - you each know that there is more involved. You have been receiving many comments full of facts and figures about how the issuance of this permit will adversely affect the various beneficial uses of the Great Salt Lake. We all live here. When, eventually, all the brine is evaporated and all the magnesium extracted, US Magnesium will close up and move on. If they had dug a hole for a mine, they might be required to fill it up when they leave. But, they will not be able to put the water back into the lake. The only way to keep the lake from disappearing is to not remove more water than flows in. I urge you to consider this commonsense fact when you make your decision. Thank you for your attention. Please do not treat this as an ordinary matter of business. You have the power to positively affect the well-being of the entire valley by saying no to this requested permit |
| 679 | Sally Lyon | I am against future dredging of additional canals. Please do not approve the request. Five generations of family have lived here and we would like future generations to do so. The science say NO. Common sense says NO. Lining the pockets of people who do not live here with profits is not a good decision. When in Tasmania I asked a scientist where they got their food for the species they raise I was told a company that harvests brine shrimp from the Great Salt Lake. This one company shouldn't decide for other businesses that their business is most important especially when further losses of water level will actually cause life as we know it to become unlivable for actual human beings not to live here either. Do not approve is my input. |
| 680 | Matt Lucas | To whom it may concern, I strongly oppose the proposal to remove more water from the Great Salt Lake. This opposed stance comes from a resident recreational user and the negative impacts that I have already seen from de-watering the Great Salt Lake. |
| 681 | Joseph Murphy | US Magnesium Must not be allowed to use more Great Salt Lake water because it Would make the lake too salty for brine shrimp to live. The lake is already on the brink of disaster |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 682 | Laura Maw | I grew up in Provo. I remember spending many days at the GSL. Our schools always took a field trip there to “float” in the water. I used to have a sailboat and loved spending time on the water. It has now been sold because the lake is nowhere near what is needed for a sailing adventure. Having US Magnesium take that much water is absurd! I see no reason to allow that. Please stop the canal extention |
| 683 | Kimberly LeBaron | I’m calling on the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium’s proposal to extend their canals several miles further into Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake down to 4185 feet of elevation.The GSL provides extensive benefits to Utah’s economy, ecology, and well-being for reasons I’m sure you are educated on. Please do your part to do what is right on this matter. |
| 684 | N. Mike Rizk Salt Lake City Resident | I oppose this permit as a resident of Salt Lake City. The rate of water usage under discussion is not sustainable for Utah or US Magnesium. |
| 685 | June S Taylor PhD Salt Lake City Resident | I oppose this request. I understand the Company’s problem. However, they employ a few hundred people at most, and perhaps they should have been more far-seeing? What is at stake is a continuing Tragedy of the Commons that is affecting the health and potentially the economic stability of the Wasatch Front, specifically that part in northern Salt Lake as well as Davis & Weber Counties, which include millions of people.If you do not want to be held responsible for making our capital city into Ulan Bator on the Wasatch, you will take your mandate to PROTECT water quality...which in this case also seriously impacts air quality...more seriously than you have to date. As a citize of Salt Lake City, I am well aware that our state government agencies are often lickspittles of extractive industries while we taxpayers seem to be regarded as so much chopped liver. I’m good and sick of this worship of certain economic interests above all else, and I hope you will think seriously about the Utah citizen taxpayers who fund your salaries and depend on your judgement and long-term planning capacity. |
| 686 | Terry Marasco Salt Lake City Resident | Do not advance this project. Close it down |
| 687 | Oskar Bates Salt Lake City Resident | Allowing the dredging of new canals, to reach water made inaccessible by already horrifically low lake levels would increase the salinity of the remaining lake, precipitating ecosystem collapse. You and I are not outside of that ecosystem. We are a part of it. And we need to respect it and offer all the help we can for it to thrive, and this means not allowing the further rape of the lake as it is already at its worst condition in history. Save the great salt lake.Water is life. |
| 688 | Cameron Jensen | The proposal states that “the proposed project would not result in any permanent loss of any Waters of the Unites States (WOTUS) nor change the function of the existing lakebed”; this seems utterly impossible and preposterous. The intention is to extract and evaporate 100,000 gallons of Waters of the United States from a lake belonging to all of us. No permanent loss of any waters would require that all water extracted is proportionately put back where it was extracted from; evaporated water is permanent loss. Claiming no change to the function of the existing lakebed would require that the lakebed remain submerged under water, not turned to dry land. Per “Current Implementation of Waters of the United States (https://www.epa.gov/wotus/current-implementation-waters-united-states), 40 CFR 230.3(s), defining Waters of the United States, this appears to be in clear violation of section 3 (a., b., and c.). “The term waters of the United States means: 3. All other waters such as intrastate lakes, rivers, streams (including intermittent streams), mudflats, sandflats, wetlands, sloughs, prairie potholes, wet meadows, playa lakes, or natural ponds, the use, degradation or destruction of which could affect interstate or foreign commerce including any such waters:A Which are or could be used by interstate or foreign travelers for recreational or other purposes; or B From which fish or shellfish are or could be taken and sold in interstate or foreign commerce; or C Which are used or could be used for industrial purposes by industries in interstate commerce; ”By granting such a permit for water depletion, we would be deeply subsidizing a company and rewarding an utter lack of innovation. All conservation efforts would be negated by the selfish practices of US Magnesium. We would be gifting our states greatest resources to a select few to dispose of for self enrichment. Philosophy: Often simply invoking the word “business” can distort our reality of sorts, as the business organization by design is a front or a facade. Removing this protective covering, we can see that a few people - I would be surprised if it was more than 6 individuals - are asking permission to drain a lake - one that belongs to all of us - at the rate of 100,000 gallons a minute. A state agency, charged with protecting water on behalf of all state citizens, is considering whether to allow such action. Shall ~6 individuals be allowed to drain a hemispherically critical lake on the verge of collapse (due to |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>detrimentally low water levels no less) at the rate of 100,000 gallons a minute? Intentionally evaporating any water from the Great Salt Lake is irresponsible and should be reprehensible; doing such for money should be a high crime, and doing so at a time when the very survival of the lake is in question is inhumane and deplorable. The lake belongs to all of us, every state citizen, every tribe, every animal, every insect, every river, everyone and everything within our great state. We would all be subsidizing the enrichment of these ~6 individuals at a profound cost. The full force of the state and all that can stand and join should prevent such actions. These individuals will not step in to pay for medical issues that their actions caused, they will not pay for diminished property values, for decreased state livability, for any impact of their actions if we allow such a permit. Fiduciary Duty: The Division of Water Quality represents and works for us all, therefore must represent us. Decreasing the water volume in the lake is a degradation of water quality. Decreasing the water volume of the GLS decreases snowpack levels, something we crucially rely on and every citizen is impassioned about. Decreasing snowpack levels diminishes drinking water availability, something at the forefront of everyone's mind and of dire importance. These things all must be protected with unrelenting fierceness. The Division of Water Quality must know this more than anyone; stand in and protect. It is a fallacy to believe that volume of water is not a critical component of water quality; it won't matter how pure or clean or undisturbed a given lake or stream is if it's the last remaining lake or stream in our state, what matters is the combination of water quality and volume. Please unequivocally strike down US Magnesium's proposed permit and be a fierce advocate for Utah's waters.</p> |
| 689 | Joni Lawver | <p>Our environment needs us to take care of it. The fact that digging additional canals to continue to drain the Great Salt Lake, when it is obviously in distress honestly shocks me. I am totally against such actions and can't believe that anyone who looks at the planet as a whole would not be. Please do NOT approve the new canals</p> |
| 690 | LeRoy and Dianne Anderson Millcreek Residents | <p>PLEASE do NOT allow US Magnesium to keep operating in Utah!!! We live in Millcreek and would be directly impacted by the consequences—TOXIC DUST STORMS from the lake bed of a DRIED UP GREAT SALT LAKE!!! A similar thing has already happened in California with Lake Brisol drying up, devastating the communities close to it. PLEASE, PLEASE STOP US MAGNESIUM BEFORE IT'S TOO LATE!!!</p> |
| 691 | Brian Emerson Salt Lake City Resident | <p>As a long-time resident of Utah and current homeowner living in the Salt Lake Valley, I would like to submit a public comment regarding US Magnesium's permit to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake. I am writing to urge you to deny US Magnesium's permit to lengthen these canals further into the Great Sale Lake (GSL) - or at very least - to postpone your decision on their permit application until the lake's water and salinity return to safe levels. As you know, the GSL's current water level is at a record low which has increased the salinity of the water. The GSL urgently needs more water to prevent further harm to its ecosystems, protect the lives of millions of migratory birds, support the long-term sustainability of lake-related economic activity, and to protect the air quality in the region as low water levels have already exposed residents to toxic dust storms that must be prevented in the future. Furthermore, approving US Magnesium's permit to extend two intake canals in Gilbert Bay would interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that the DWQ is required by law to protect, based on its Class 5A designation as noted in Utah Administrative Code Rule 317-2-6.5(a). US Magnesium already draws more water out of the lake than Salt Lake City, Ogden, and Provo combined. Allowing the company to extend the canals could negate all other upstream water conservation efforts, which are just now becoming established following recent action at the Utah State Legislature. US Magnesium's activity must be halted and any further expansion denied or postponed until the water and salinity levels have returned to safe levels and until we know how we are going to solve this problem in the longer term. Thank you for the important work that you do to protect Utah residents, GSL wildlife, and the critical natural resources we all depend on, and for taking actions that promote the long-term sustainability of the Greater Sale Lake area over short-term interests. Toward these ends, I urge you to please DENY U.S. Magnesium's permit to lengthen these canals further into the Great Sale Lake. Thank you for considering my comment.</p> |
| 692 | Suzi Montgomery | <p>I am reaching out with strong opposition to US Magnesium's permit application to extend their canals further into the lake. Allowing them to do so will negate all other upstream water conservation efforts, which are barely becoming established as the lake waters recede at alarming rates. Until we know how we are going to solve this problem, US Magnesium activity must be held in check, to preserve our quality of life, and the air we breathe throughout the Salt Lake Valley. If we create a dustbowl of toxic air, our livelihoods, our communities, our economy, our agricultural systems, our watersheds, and our property values crash, leaving us as climate refugees seeking someplace else to live. Not to mention the reciprocal devastation of all the ecosystems that depend on migratory bird populations stopping off in the Great Salt Lake.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>This is an unthinkable future, that very well may become a reality even within the next 3-5 years, as the lakebed crust breaks down and becomes increasingly airborne. People are already moving away, and new businesses are rejecting Utah as a potential location for business expansion. US Magnesium already draws more water out of the lake than Salt Lake City, Ogden, and Provo combined, over 100,000 gallons per minute. Approval of the permit brings no benefit to the people of Utah, and presents a great risk of a tragic future for our community. We can do better. Please don't exacerbate the current situation by approving US Magnesium's permit application. Invite them, instead, to work toward raising water levels back up to current intake locations.</p> |
| 693 | Elisabeth Nebeker | <p>I am reaching out with strong opposition to US Magnesium's permit application to extend their canals further into the lake. Allowing them to do so will negate all other upstream water conservation efforts, which are barely becoming established as the lake waters recede at alarming rates. Until we know how we are going to solve this problem, US Magnesium activity must be held in check, to preserve our quality of life, and the air we breathe throughout the Salt Lake Valley. If we create a dustbowl of toxic air, our livelihoods, our communities, our economy, our agricultural systems, our watersheds, and our property values crash, leaving us as climate refugees seeking someplace else to live. Not to mention the reciprocal devastation of all the ecosystems that depend on migratory bird populations stopping off in the Great Salt Lake. US Magnesium already draws more water out of the lake than Salt Lake City, Ogden, and Provo combined, over 100,000 gallons per minute. Approval of the permit brings no benefit to the people of Utah, and presents a great risk of a tragic future for our community. We can do better. Please don't exacerbate the current situation by approving US Magnesium's permit application. Invite them, instead, to work toward raising water levels back up to current intake locations.</p> |
| 694 | Nick Huntington | <p>I have been following US Magnesiums application to dredge and ensure access to the waters of the Great Salt Lake with trepidation. My wife and I relocated to Salt Lake City three years ago for professional and academic pursuits at the University, and over just that short period of time we have seen record low water levels in the lake each year and watched Farmington Bay dry as our southwestern drought continues and the metropolitan areas surrounding the GSL grow. I have been encouraged by recent legislation and actions from our congressional representatives and the non-profit community to ensure that lake water is being treated not as an endless extractive resource but as a public good that requires strict management and oversight. I sincerely hope that the DWQ takes the considerations of the communities that live near and are affected by the GSL, namely regarding health and recreation, as well as the numerous biological systems that are supported by the GSL's unique saline habitat, from brine shrimp to migratory birds. At the absolute minimum I would be encouraged if US Magnesium was required to replace the water that it removes from the lake, whether that is by paying farmers to let water flow or securing additional water from water districts, there need to be solutions offered to protect this treasured and necessary resource if the permit is granted. We have passed the time where water removed from the lake is replaced naturally and entered a period of careful and managed use.</p> |
| 695 | Mary Ellen Navas Sandy Resident | <p>I write in opposition to US Magnesium's request for expansion of their permit. By extending their canals farther into the GSL, they will further contribute to the dangerous environmental effects of the receding lake. Recognize that without intervention the lake bottom will become airborne, creating a dustbowl as it ruins the health and economy of Utah. You stand between a profit hungry business and a threatened population that is disturbed by the degrading air quality of SLC. I have learned that US Magnesium withdraws more water, 100,000 gallons per minute, than the cities of Salt Lake Ogden and Provo combined. The evaporation of this water is a net negative for the people of Utah. I urge you to use your judgment, perspective and authority to put a halt to the prioritization of US Magnesium's profits over the health of people and the ecosystems that support the rich wildlife we still enjoy. I appeal to you Board Members appointed to make judgements that account for all of Utah, to call US Magnesium back to the table to discover a way they can extract at lower cost to the people of Utah. This is imperative if we are to avoid a tragic unnecessary loss of life.</p> |
| 696 | Ramsey Farrage | <p>I write in opposition to US Magnesium's request for expansion of their permit. By extending their canals farther into the GSL, they will further contribute to the dangerous environmental effects of the receding lake. Recognize that without intervention the lake bottom will become airborne, creating a dustbowl as it ruins the health and economy of Utah. You stand between a profit hungry business and a threatened population that is disturbed by the degrading air quality of SLC. I have learned that US Magnesium withdraws more water, 100,000 gallons per minute, than the cities of Salt Lake Ogden and Provo combined. The evaporation of this water is a net negative for the people of Utah. I urge you to use your judgment, perspective and authority to put a halt to the prioritization of US Magnesium's profits over the</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | health of people and the ecosystems that support the rich wildlife we still enjoy.I appeal to you Board Members appointed to make judgements that account for all of Utah, to call US Magnesium back to the table to discover a way they can extract at lower cost to the people of Utah. This is imperative if we are to avoid a tragic unnecessary loss of life. |
| 697 | Lydia Redzich | Please vote against extending permits to US Magnesium.. The health of the lake and 2/3rds if the utah population is at risk. |
| 698 | Cally Flox Partnership Director BYU Arts | I am reaching out with strong opposition to US Magnesium's permit application to extend their canals further into the lake. Allowing them to do so will negate all other upstream water conservation efforts, which are barely becoming established as the lake waters recede at alarming rates. Until we know how we are going to solve this problem, US Magnesium activity must be held in check, to preserve our quality of life, and the air we breathe throughout the Salt Lake Valley. If we create a dustbowl of toxic air, our livelihoods, our communities, our economy, our agricultural systems, our watersheds, and our property values crash, leaving us as climate refugees seeking someplace else to live. Not to mention the reciprocal devastation of all the ecosystems that depend on migratory bird populations stopping off in the Great Salt Lake. This is an unthinkable future, that very well may become a reality even within the next 3-5 years, as the lakebed crust breaks down and becomes increasingly airborne. People are already moving away, and new businesses are rejecting Utah as a potential location for business expansion. US Magnesium already draws more water out of the lake than Salt Lake City, Ogden, and Provo combined, over 100,000 gallons per minute. Approval of the permit brings no benefit to the people of Utah, and presents a great risk of a tragic future for our community. We can do better. Please don't exacerbate the current situation by approving US Magnesium's permit application. Invite them, instead, to work toward raising water levels back up to current intake locations |
| 699 | Allison Stanley | I am reaching out today to try and voice my concern about allowing US Magnesium to extend its permit into the Great Salt Lake. As a resident of Ogden and an Environmental Science student at Weber State University, the state of the lake is of great importance for my future here. From a scientific standpoint, keeping the water levels from dropping any lower is vital for the survival of the marine ecosystem and for influencing our snowpack. From a personal standpoint, I am greatly worried about the health impacts that the toxic dust will have on my family. Along with many others, Utah is my home and worth fighting for. I do hope that the decision to extend permits for US Magnesium is reconsidered for it will have lasting impacts on our state and everyone here. |
| 700 | Olivia Thomas | I do not approve with US magnesium's request to extend their water trench further into the Great Salt Lake. |
| 701 | Claire Zaring | Please DO NOT approve and allow US Magnesium's inconsiderate and harmful request to extend their water intake trenches further into the beautiful Great Salt Lake. We must take every opportunity to preserve our Great Salt Lake. Allowing corporations to utilize more of its water would be a painful mistake. In addition to water overuse, this mineral company, US Magnesium (formerly Mag Corps), has played a detrimental role in Utah's deteriorating environmental health. We must consider the importance of our Great Salt Lake and take action to honor it. |
| 702 | Bridget Stuchly Salt Lake City Resident | I am reaching out with strong opposition to US Magnesium's permit application to extend their canals further into the lake. Allowing them to do so will negate all other upstream water conservation efforts, which are barely becoming established as the lake waters recede at alarming rates. Until we know how we are going to solve this problem, US Magnesium activity must be held in check, to preserve our quality of life, and the air we breathe throughout the Salt Lake Valley. If we create a dustbowl of toxic air, our livelihoods, our communities, our economy, our agricultural systems, our watersheds, and our property values crash, leaving us as climate refugees seeking someplace else to live. Not to mention the reciprocal devastation of all the ecosystems that depend on migratory bird populations stopping off in the Great Salt Lake. This is an unthinkable future, that very well may become a reality even within the next 3-5 years, as the lakebed crust breaks down and becomes increasingly airborne. People are already moving away, and new businesses are rejecting Utah as a potential location for business expansion. US Magnesium already draws more water out of the lake than Salt Lake City, Ogden, and Provo combined, over 100,000 gallons per minute. Approval of the permit brings no benefit to the people of Utah, and presents a great risk of a tragic future for our community. We can do better. Please don't exacerbate the current situation by approving US Magnesium's permit application. Invite them, instead, to work toward raising water levels back up to current intake locations. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 703 | Courtney Leigh Johnson Salt Lake City Resident | I would like to submit my comment against US Magnesium's request to divert more water away from the Great Salt Lake. Lake levels are already the lowest they have ever been and we can't continue to use this water in the same way we were. This is a unique and fragile ecosystem we are watching rapidly fall apart and if we don't take steps now, not only will the birds and wildlife be at stake but the health of many Utahns. It's time to take the fate of the Great Salt Lake seriously and start denying requests like this one from US Magnesium. |
| 704 | Pete Ashdown | This is an existential crisis for Utah and the Wasatch front. Please do not allow industry or agriculture to aggravate and further it. Refill the lake and keep it that way, so everyone can continue to live here |
| 705 | Bonnie Fletcher | Please do not permit US Magnesium's application for new canals to the Division of Water Quality to be granted. We need to allow the lake to restore itself so it can benefit other entities-- other people and other species--that depend on the lake being full of water such as birds, invertebrates such as brine shrimp and brine flies, the brine shrimp industries, and those who recreate on it. The magnesium that is extracted by US Magnesium comprises about 14% of the world's magnesium. Is the economic activity in Utah and the few jobs it creates worth the loss of 100,000 gallons of the lake per minute? Instead of evaporation ponds, both magnesium and sodium chloride by Morton Salt can be extracted using reverse osmosis. The health of US Magnesium's employees will be negatively impacted when the dust storms that will inevitably occur, blow across the landscape. This dust will affect the populations of the cities, all the wildlife, and all "beings" who live along the Wasatch Front, Please, please do not approve this permit. |
| 706 | Kedric Capron | I believe the Utah Division of Water Quality should NOT approve the request of US Magnesium to extend their water intake trenches 3 miles further into the Great Salt Lake. |
| 707 | Dr. Elizabeth Hanna | I cannot believe this needs saying but we cannot sacrifice our children's future for Magnesium barons to deplete our lake. My child has cancer and let me tell you as a health professional and a parent of a child with cancer, the plague you are about to unleash on our community will have repercussions you cannot imagine. People will get sick and childhood cancers will increase. I can tell you first hand that cancer will not ask who is rich and who works for us magnesium it will kill anyone's children. Including yours. This must not happen. In addition to children who are more vulnerable to certain illnesses that the dry bed of the salt lake adults will also get sick and our beautiful city will become uninhabitable. This is the place, surely it is not the place for us to rape and pillage for a few magnesium barons and alfalfa farmers to exploit. No a thousand times no to US magnesium. |
| 708 | Sadie Roestenburg Salt Lake City Resident | I've grown up in Utah, and live in Salt Lake City. It's sad to see the changes in the Great Salt Lake from lower and lower water levels over the years. Why would we allow US Magnesium to take more water out of the Great Salt Lake? The corporation plans to deepen their diversion canals to continue doing business in the face of an ecological disaster. Salinity levels are already too high and the ecosystem is on the brink of collapse. If this permit goes through, it will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. Drying up the lake further will obviously also worsen the air quality due to dust storms with toxic minerals. This is not what the people of Utah want. It's time to say NO to business as usual and accept that the Great Salt Lake crisis demands a new approach. With the current state of the lake, any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in, in the form of upstream water rights. This should be the minimum requirement. Say no to US Magnesium and any other corporation who wants to further dry the lake out, otherwise the health of our residents, migratory birds, and entire valley will ultimately suffer from the consequences. It's not worth it. |
| 709 | Hannah Scharton North Salt Lake Resident | My name is Hannah Scharton and I am a North Salt Lake resident as well as a member of the local artist and LGBTQ+ communities. I was upset to hear that U.S. Magnesium was being considered for a permit to lengthen their intake canals. The receding of the Lake's shoreline is a common topic of conversation in my household and in my friend group. I am 27 years old and I've lived in Utah for 18 years. My partner and I are both homeowners and the majority of our friends are also homeowners. We care deeply about our local community and work to care for our neighbors. In spite of how much we love where we live, many of us have started asking whether or not the chemicals that are being released via the Lake's receding shoreline will someday make this a place that we can no longer call home. In addition to the impact on our human neighbors, we're also concerned about the impact that this will have on local bird populations. Based on my understanding, this water |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | diversion will likely increase salinity and concentrations of heavy metals in the water segments within Gilbert Bay, which would then affect the local brine fly larvae population and disrupt the local food chain. Our lake and the animal populations that live around it are a part of our community. The things that affect the lake deeply affect them and also deeply affect us. It's our responsibility as members of a community to care for each other and that responsibility extends to the lake and the creatures that rely on her to live. I implore you and everyone else involved in this decision to consider the impact that providing this permit to US Magnesium would have on all of our community, both human and otherwise, before moving forward. |
| 710 | Michael Coburn Taylorsville Resident | I would like to provide public comment that I do not support further dredging up of the Great Salt Lake by US Magnesium. The public health threats of becoming an arsenic laced dust bowl city are real and severe. Once the lake has returned to a healthier level, magnesium can once again be collected safely. |
| 711 | Jennifer Stensrud | I'm concerned about and would like to express my opposition to the proposal for a permit for US magnesium to dredge water from our already fragile Great Salt Lake for their operations. People all over the country, all over the world for that matter are hearing about the situation we're facing if water levels continue to drop the way they have. We can't continue to make choices in this same direction. We've got to turn it around. |
| 712 | Aryel Cianflone Millcreek Resident | I live in Millcreek, UT. I'm writing to express my strong opposition to the proposed magnesium extraction in the Great Salt Lake. Given the severity of the water shortage in the Great Salt Lake and the anticipated environmental impacts, now is the time to prioritize the needs of the people of Utah not the magnesium industry. |
| 713 | Karlie Fitzgerald Sandy Resident | I'm submitting my comment and hope that the Utah Division of Water Quality will reject US Magnesium's canal extension project. Gilbert Bay of Great Salt Lake is already dangerously low at below 4189 feet, and every inch of water lost harms the lake's viability and its potential to rebound in the future. The US Magnesium proposal to extend its canals to 4185 feet may buy the company a year or two of operating time, but it devastates a natural waterway, threatens a vibrant ecosystem of hemispheric importance for birds, and it harms the health of Utahns and residents of the Wasatch front, and all of the other industries that rely on the lake. Allowing this canal extension project to move forward would constitute gross negligence by the Utah Division of Water Quality and a violation of the public trust by the State of Utah. If the State of Utah would like to help US Magnesium continue to access water from Great Salt Lake, the only viable option is to broker a solution that raises lake levels first so that US Magnesium's existing canals can function as designed. |
| 714 | Sophia Kautz Murray Resident | I am Sophia, a resident of Murray, Utah. Me and my family moved here a few years ago, and have fallen in love with Utah's community and nature. We dedicated a large portion of our time to learn about the history of the Great Salt Lake (GSL), and its neighbors (including our Jordan River). We have also been learning more, through extensive news coverage, on the impact of industrial activity, negatively impacting communities, and significantly more in poorer neighborhoods (Vox's Batteries are dirty [...], new trending terminology like 'Climate Justice' and 'Environmental Justice', NIEHS's Poor Communities Exposed to Elevated Air Pollution Levels). My whole adolescence has been living below the federal poverty level. Now, as a working professional, I have the time and education of the importance of speaking out on issues that may, and most of the time will, impact the community. Per the summary of the Purpose of Public Hearing: Facility modifications have been ongoing to try to maintain operations with lowered lake levels. The fact that an organization wants to take MORE of the lowered lake levels does not make any logical sense. There have been multiple stories covering the danger of GSL's lakebed (PBS Newshour's Utah's Great Salt Lake shrinks to unsustainable levels amid a decades-long megadrought), Wall Street Journal's As Utah's Great Salt Lake Dries Up, Economic Crisis Looms, ABC News Great Salt Lake dry-up causing dangerous climate ripple effect, ecologists say). Not only will this significantly impact our wildlife (that also impacts non-Utah regions) but it will significantly impact human life. I understand the GDP US Magnesium LLC provides to Utah, however the GSL is no longer flooding with an abundance of water, as it did in the 1980s. They will have to wait until water returns, so their current machinery is able to intake water levels in the future -- if it ever returns. Please, do not allow this permit to be approved, as a steward of our natural resources and the community. |
| 715 | Ashton Lee | Please look beyond money and business and deny the dredging proposal. Utah will be a toxic wasteland if we keep shrinking the lake. As talks happen about pumping water in from the ocean, surely we'd be smart enough to reduce the amount of water leaving the lake by any means necessary. This is an easy choice. As a whole, Utah's economy depends on the ski industry and snow season, which is also at risk. The lake helps create the weather conditions needed for our beautiful winters. So it doesn't |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | matter whether you deny because you want Utah to be a livable place or you deny because you still want Utah to be profitable. We can be so short sighted. Do not give in to small money now just to lose an incomprehensible amount of money later, when no one can live here anymore. |
| 716 | Amy Patterson | I am asking the Utah Division of Water Quality NOT to approve US Magnesium's request to extend their water intake trenches 3 miles further into the Great Salt Lake. |
| 717 | The Fortneys | Regarding US Magnesium's proposal to draw more water from the Great Salt Lake. My family and I find the lakes current level already alarming without further outtake. We have hunted in Farmington bay for over 20 years and have never seen the water level this low. We are concerned that there will be nothing left if the rate of consumption continues. We are also very concerned about the air quality. If more of the lake bed is uncovered, there will be more dust exposed to the air directly in the storm path towards Salt Lake City, worsening our already poor air quality. We cannot see a worse time for US Magnesium's proposal then right now. And we strongly disapprove. |
| 718 | Brian Van Steenkiste | I'm writing to submit my comment in OPPOSITION to MagCorp/US Magnesium's permit application to extend their "straws" into the Great Sale Lake.I'm submitting this comment as both a private citizen, a tax payer, a long time resident, AND a business owner. US Magnesium is one of the worst polluters in the nation and ALREADY makes its profits at the expense of my health, my families health, and all my neighbor's healths. This private industry MUST NOT be allowed to continue degrading our environment at the expense of Utah residents.The Great Salt Lake is in dire health and a private business must not be allowed to put the final nail into this ecosystem's coffin. Further draining this lake is a death sentence to the migratory birds who use it AND to the health of all who breath the air around OUR lake. It's no secret the lake's diminishing volume is exposing toxic legacies that jeopardize all residents near and far from its shores. Allowing the double whammy US Magnesium wants (draining the lake/exposing toxins AND continuing to pollute the air) is sheer lunacy. I'll keep my comment short and to the point. US Magnesium should not be allowed to drain the GSL and emperil the citizens of Utah for their own profit. |
| 719 | Rhea Cone Summit County Resident | As a sixth generation Utahn and Great Salt Lake recreationalist, I am urging the denial of US Magnesium's request to divert additional water from the lake.The Great Salt Lake is not only a recreational hub, source of lake effect snow driving millions of dollars of recreational winter tourism, but also an ecological beacon of the west. Additional water diversion from the lake would impact the already failing and struggling ecosystem, which is reeling from affects of lower lake levels. Millions of birds and other wildlife rely on the lake, and increased salinity from lower water inputs would make the lake too salty for brine shrimp, the key food source. Reduced water levels also pose a threat to the already existing human health crisis, causing toxic dust of the lakebed to become airborne. I urge you to deny the request for the health of the lake, the ecosystem, and our fellow Utahns. Thank you for your time. |
| 720 | Rikki Longino | The Great Salt Lake is drying at a rate that threatens the safety and livelihoods of everybody who lives in the Salt Lake Valley. The New York Times referred to this environmental catastrophe as a "nuclear bomb" of toxic material dusted throughout our vulnerable airshed. I see no reason for US Magnesium to dredge the lake further. I am aware that there is an economic incentive to mine Magnesium, but without the lake, there will be no lake effect, no ski industry and a very likely economic collapse due to absolutely toxic conditions. Instead, perhaps US Mag could join the effort to increase the flow of water into the lake through modifying agriculture and development along the Bear River. Thank you for holding the open comment period. It is my hope that you heed the words of so many informed people with very real concerns about the health of our lake. |
| 721 | Rob Reinfurt | Continuing to let Mag Corp drain the lake after all we know about the current condition and future of the lake is a crime. As one of the biggest polluters in the state, it would be a shame to let them continue to go barely regulated |
| 722 | Alex Nicola | I've only lived in Salt Lake City but I'm from Las Vegas and watching Lake Mead slowly going to, D(r)ying. It's really hard to see as Lake Mead feeds into Hoover Dam and without Hoover Dam running Las Vegas would lose a majority of it power generation. With Las Vegas being one of the top cities that require the most power. Losing huge bodies of water in cities is really hard to see. I'm not sure what the reason why the Great Salt Lake is going out but I will be sure to do my research and see what I could do to potentially help out with this issue. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 723 | Cali Letts Holladay Resident | <p>Mother Nature will survive, but humans may not. We are here because of her. We are slowly destroying her for our own power and greed, especially the power and greed of elected politicians who lie and lie and lie and whose lies become truth in the minds of those who are not discerning enough. Too many of us. We are destroying the air we breathe and Mag Core has contributed greatly to that problem. We've known this for a very, very long time and the powers that be do not care. And only a few profit from money. We are destroying the watershed we depend on for our water. Mag Core has contributed to this problem. We've known this for a very, very long time and the powers that be do not care. And only a few profit from money. How will the airborne dust off the bottom of the lake affect the food we grow in the valley? I don't think we even know the answer to that yet, but given our history, we will come to find out, and the powers that be won't care. And only a few profit from money. It's as if the powers that be are not aware of their own and their family's need for clean air, enough water in the watershed, pollution free food. They are just as vulnerable as the rest of us. Do they not think about this, as they profit from money and power? When will humans, especially those who have the power to make decisions for all of us (Mag Core request to extend canals, just ONE example) let go of greed and power and turn towards the good of all humanity; the good of the community? What would happen if the 99% meant more to government than the 1% who control for their own, their family's and their friends well being? STOP! We've been debating this company's pollution for YEARS! STOP! PLEASE! We are slowly killing ourselves, our family, our friends. AND WHERE, MIGHT I ASK, IS THE CHURCH IN ALL OF THIS, SINCE THEY CONTROL WHAT HAPPENS HERE? WHERE ARE THEIR CHRISTIAN VALUES THEY ESPOUSE? IS THAT ALSO A LIE? THE BILLION DOLLAR CORPORATION! WHAT ARE THEY DOING TO PRESERVE LIFE? THEIRS AND OURS! WHERE ARE THEIR FAMILY VALUES IN ALL OF THESE CLIMATE CHANGE MATTERS? ARE FAMILY VALUES JUST ANOTHER OF THE MANY LIES KILLING US?</p> |
| 724 | Annemarie Brown | <p>I am writing to you to give my comment on the proposal that would allow the US Magnesium company to construct two intake canals to continue their operations. I sincerely request that this permit be abandoned altogether as it has significant potential to result in profound negative consequences on the Great Salt Lake, which is already under extreme pressure and stress at this time. The public notice iterates that there would be no significant impact on the lake but, but I would have to ask where this conclusion came from. Where is their environmental impact statement? Who conducted it? This company has already had a history of settlement with the United States EPA and DOJ for the illegal disposal of hazardous waste as well as a superfund site that still has yet to be fully investigated and remediated at this time. I call into the question the integrity of the statements made on the public notice 'background' and do not believe that US Magnesium truly understands the implications this permit will have for the Great Salt Lake and Utah as a whole. If this permit were to pass, it would suggest that Utah's government values a company's profit over the invaluable integrity and dignity of our environment. In no case should this ever be allowed. US Magnesium's alternative approach, which included a new facility and a floating pipe system, should also be disregarded and abandoned. Perhaps, it would benefit the company more to allocate those funds to remediating damages they have already incurred upon Utah's environment instead of creating new damages that will be beyond repair.</p> |
| 725 | Parker Teitz | <p>My name is Parker Tietz and I don't want to wear a gas mask for the next 30 years. Save the lake.</p> |
| 726 | Lindsey Jespersen | <p>Please do not dredge the Great Salt Lake.</p> |
| 727 | Lindsay Rasmussen Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am a lifelong resident of Salt Lake and I plead with you not to allow dredging the lake for magnesium mining. The lake is at an all time low and allowing 100,000 gallons per minute to be siphoned from it would be inexcusable. Our city cannot survive without lake effect snow. It is time to start reversing the damage done to our lake, not adding to it until it's gone. Please consider the long term effects of this decision.</p> |
| 728 | Erin Bean Salt Lake City Resident | <p>I am a lifelong Utahn and I urge you to reject U.S Magnesium's request to extend its intake canals on Gilbert Bay. The Great Salt Lake is already at historic lows. Without historic action, our community will lose this vital economic resource, and risk environmental catastrophe. It is time to change the way our community deals with the lake, and that means there must be changes in the way all water consumers in Utah behave. This includes industrial users like U.S Magnesium. Responsible land managers recognize that the land can only dependably provide resources if it is shepherded responsibly. Take, for example, the recent decision to cancel the snow crab harvest in the Bering Sea. The snow crab harvest fuels an industry that brings in hundreds of millions of dollars (\$280 million in 2016), but when the population of snow</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | crabs declined precipitously this year, the Alaska Department of Fish and Game made the wise choice to cancel the harvest altogether. This is economically painful in the short term, but by choosing to wisely manage the population of snow crabs today, ADFG helped ensure that there continue to be snow crabs in the future. Wisely shepherding Great Salt Lake today will help ensure its continued existence for all stakeholders in the future. |
| 729 | Cameron Blakely Salt Lake City Resident | I saw that you are accepting comments related to the canal extension permit being submitted by US Magnesium. As a designer and environmental planner, I wanted to voice my concern for this proposal. I understand that this is a very complicated situation and that jobs and money may be on the line. However, I think that considering the state of the peril that the Great Salt Lake is in, we should not be proposing or allowing anything that would contribute to its further depletion. I think the risks are too high, and that US Magnesium should reassess other possible solutions and even ways of helping to raise lake levels before pulling more water from this valuable resource. Please let me know if there are any other ways I can get more involved and thank you for your time in taking comments. |
| 730 | Puneet Singh M.S. Candidate The New School | I am emailing to urge the Utah Division of Water Quality to reject US Magnesium's application to use more Great Salt Lake water for their operations. With the Great Salt Lake's water level the lowest it's ever been, extracting more water will destabilize the ecosystem which the brine shrimp depend on. The Great Salt Lake is a VITAL pit-stop for birds across the Western Hemisphere, birds from Patagonia in South America to Siberia in Russia visit the Great Salt Lake to feed on the brine shrimp as they migrate-- we cannot allow permits like this one being applied for by US Magnesium to continue given the dire state of the Lake as a whole. Utahns deserve healthy air and the animals that live in and visit the Great Salt Lake throughout their lives deserve to have the Lake remain ecologically intact. As a climate change adaptation researcher and activist, I urge you to reject US Magnesium's permit to extend their canals by several miles in the interest of the Great Salt Lake ecosystem as a whole and for the birds who have no control over what we do to their lake. |
| 731 | Diane Horrocks Great Salt Lake Rowing | I am a member of Great Salt Lake rowing and have rowed from the GSL Marina for over 15 years! We even celebrated our 20th club anniversary ... but have had to cancel all rowing since September as there's no water left at our dock inside the Marina. Please say No to US Magnesium who want to evaporate even more of our precious water!! |
| 732 | Charlotte Jarrard | I, and my community want to live safely next to the Great Salt Lake. Please support your community by doing the right thing and oppose the US Magnesium's canal extension permit application. |
| 733 | Matt Brownny | Please do not approve this permit. I understand this may be very important to their business, but the survival of the Great Salt Lake is significantly more important to us all (them included). The death of the lake means we risk arsenic in our air, the collapse of the lake's ecosystem, and the death of millions of animals. Please, don't approve this permit. |
| 734 | David Rasmuson | I am against this proposal for US Mag to dredge and increase their water way inlets to the great Salt Lake. The Lake is already at a critical low level. Taking more water is not sustainable and could potentially aid in the devastation of the eco system. We as a society need to draw the line when millions of lives will be ill effected. Profit should not trump life. |
| 735 | Ben Shepard West Jordan Resident | I'm surprised this isn't obvious to everyone, this is a terrible idea! Just like the inland port! We have to start prioritizing the planet if we want to be able to pass it down to our children. Enough with the worship of filthy lucre and profit over health and community! Shut it down!! |
| 736 | Rachel Taylor | Please do NOT allow US Magnesium to use more water from our precious Great Salt Lake. They are already one of the biggest air polluters in the west, and now at a time when GSL is shrinking beyond recognition, they want to use more water. This must be stopped. For the sake of migratory birds and all of us who benefit from what's left of Great Salt Lake, I urge you to NOT approve the request from US Magnesium. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 737 | Lacey Deines | I oppose the extension of the canals to the Great Salt Lake. Please stop taking water out of a rapidly drying lake. The results of a dried up lake will be devastating for all of Salt Lake City and surrounding areas. |
| 738 | Elizabeth Neilson | US Magnesium should not be permitted to consume more lake water from the Great Salt Lake. I see that Ira Rennert, billionaire, is the owner of US Magnesium. He is from Brooklyn. He lives in The Hamptons in a home valued between 260 and 500 million. Nothing about his personal life intersects with the environmental disaster he is willing to help accelerate in our beautiful state of Utah. If his children were subject to an airborne arsenic wind, I guarantee he would use his billions to oppose industry that would promote this unhealthy environment. Why would we allow someone with no personal stake in our state to influence its liveability? Have we no self-respect? No long view? Even without US Magnesium, the lake is shrinking toward calamity. Why would we let a billionaire outsider rush this process? We still have time to turn this around and prevent our grandchildren from cancer and early death. We should be striving to do so, not rolling out the red carpet for someone to drive us more quickly toward our own personal toxic dust bowl. Please listen. |
| 739 | Izzy Solvang Salt Lake City Resident | Please don't let more piping impact the health of the dying great salt lake. Please stop!NO MAGNESIUM CANAL EXTENSION |
| 740 | Mel Martinez | Please do not renew US Magnesium's permit to take water from the Great Salt Lake. |
| 741 | Rachel Chamberlain Utah Resident | Thank you very much for the work that you do at the UDWQ. It is very important to the health and safety of the citizens in Utah and I appreciate it. I am writing to you in regards to the proposed US Magnesium Canal Continuation Project. As a long time Utah resident of over 20 years I have strong feelings about the Salt Lake valley including the Great Salt Lake. After spending much time reviewing the proposal and past work of US Magnesium it is in my best opinion that this project should NOT proceed for the health and safety of the people of Utah. Since the Great Salt Lake is public trust land to be enjoyed by the entirety of the Utah public I believe that our voice should have weight in this decision. I believe that the proposed project will lead to a reduction of habitat for millions of migratory birds that visit the lake each year by lowering water levels and altering chemical and salinity make up of the lake. The reduction of water levels will lead to a further exposure of the lake bed that contains hazardous amounts of heavy metals. These heavy metals when aerosolized will embed themselves into our lungs to develop future complications such as cancer. These are just 2 of the many reasons that prioritizing the temporary, monetary gain of this Magnesium project will quicken the ecosystem breakdown of the Great Salt Lake and quicken the inhabitability of the surrounding cities due to toxic dust events. If these reasons, the numerous scientific data and legislative action surrounding the lake does not dissuade you from pursuing this project; I ask you to think about your children or friends' children who will be playing at recess when a toxic cloud of arsenic blows onto the playground. It sounds dramatic, but it is the sad reality of the action that has brought us here. So I ask you to take action and stop the proceeding of this Magnesium project for the future of Utah and the Great Salt Lake. |
| 742 | Mary Roalstad Student University of Utah | It has been brought to my attention that, despite the recent bill passed to end all water extraction from the Great Salt Lake, the U.S. Magnesium superfund site is looking to extend its canal in order to process and extract more of this mineral. I am opposed to this exception, because it does not reflect the initial aims of the law: to preserve dwindling lake levels before they cause permanent damage to GSL ecosystems and the surrounding community. It is possible to devise other methods for extraction that do not rely on short-term solutions to an inherently flawed system. The condition of trace heavy metals in Salt Lake sediments was caused by extractive industries and now is causing strife to air quality standards as it becomes airborne. Despite the economic gains from the production of magnesium chloride, we must consider the potential costs in medical expenses in years to come when disruptive activities begin to impact human, animal, and plant health. We cannot strain our water body any more. This operation is an unacceptable choice. |
| 743 | Rebecca Rabiger Salt Lake City Resident | I opposed new permits to US Magnesium. Allowing more water to evaporate from the lake puts residents in the valley at health risk as dust pollutes the valley. Furthermore as the lakes dries up it's killing the brine shrimp population and affecting bird migration. Please stop US Magnesium from taking more water from the lake |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 744 | Annie Struder Salt Lake City Resident | Please do not approve the US Magnesium Canal Continuation Project. It will add to our heightening environmental disaster of the disappearing Great Salt Lake. Drawing water from the increasingly shrinking lake will contribute to the issues of toxic dust that will be disastrous to the millions of people living along the Wasatch Front and to the environmental food chain collapse which has already begun with territory loss along former shorelines. The governor has already declared no more new permits that will draw from the Lake. The Army Corp denied Magnesium's request. Now in the interest of Utah citizens, it is time for the Utah Division of Water Quality team to also deny the expansion. |
| 745 | Marlene Lambert Millcreek Resident | I am vehemently opposed to allowing US Magnesium, or anyone else, any further usage of Great Salt Lake water. The short term profit is far too costly given the long term effect of further endangering the habitat of the lake. We must remember that we humans are part of the ecosystem that relies on the lake for our livelihood. Our quality of life depends on preserving the lives of birds and brine shrimp alike. We cannot separate ourselves from this, and we must not only disallow removal of more water, we must also make efforts to increase the water flow to the lake as it was naturally designed. anything else would be both foolish and irresponsible to the living and future generations of all species, humans included. |
| 746 | Molly Thatcher | The mining practices by the chemical manufacturer, US Magnesium, is known for being extremely abusive towards the ecosystem. Through the company's mining practices, water is being exploited causing further threats to our Great Salt Lake. Recently, the corporation plans to lengthen the diversion canals, so they can continue to access the dwindling water levels of the lake; this will allow the largest producer of Magnesium, US Magnesium, to continue to boom and be an economic success at the dismay of our ecological community. Salinity levels are currently very high. State scientists have taken measurements of the lake's current levels and they are reported to be at 19% salinity. It is reported that the lake's ecosystem will collapse at 18%, so we are already in bad territory. The public has started to pose concern in their observation of less brine flies; less brine flies will threaten the lives of millions of birds who stop along their seasonal migratory flyway. If the draft is passed, these consequences will be rampant. Personally, I believe that the lake shouldn't be up for grabs. There needs to be higher restrictions on the abusive companies for the benefit of the public. The water levels of the Great Salt Lake are at a record low, so the state should become better at avoiding violating practices for beneficial use. The state shouldn't recognize their needs until they recognize the lakes. If the state goes through with the draft, there should at least be an additional draft that sets a minimum standard for the future extractions and ways to come back from them. The Division of Water should be responsible and recognize the issues that US Magnesium brings and say NO to their plans in devastating the natural ecosystem resulting in extinction of life at Great Salt Lake. |
| 747 | Suzanne Larson Salt Lake City Resident | I am a Utah resident of almost 25 years now, and I am writing to you today concerning the Great Salt Lake and the Great Salt Lake ecosystem. I imagine you are getting an awful lot of letters right now. As you know, In the 1980s the level of the Great Salt Lake hit a high point of about 4,211'. Since then however, ongoing diversion of the waters that flow into the Lake and an extended period of drought (that is likely to continue indefinitely) have resulted in a dramatic drop in the level of the GSL. Today Gilbert Bay is reported as standing at a mere 4,188.4'. Given this dire situation, it is truly unthinkable that the Utah Division of Water Quality is even considering honoring U.S. Magnesium's request for a permit to drain Gilbert Bay lower than it already is. The reasons hardly need repeating. Nevertheless, here are some of the main ones. 1. The paramount duty of the DWQ is to be the public trust guardian of the Great Salt Lake, not to ensure the economic prosperity of U.S. Magnesium. 2. Further drawing down of the lake as proposed by U.S. Magnesium would violate the public trust duty of DWQ to protect the Great Salt Lake, its ecosystem, as well as public health. 3. The salinity of the water in Gilbert Bay has reportedly reached 19% - a level at the extreme limit for its ability to support the brine shrimp-based ecosystem that all wildlife inhabiting the ecosystem (millions of birds along the Pacific flyway) depend upon. If the lake level goes down anymore the scientists tell us the brine shrimp could experience a mass extinction event. 4. The further the lake level drops, the more lakebed will be exposed and will this contribute to air pollution with toxic metal laden dust in the valleys of the Wasatch Front, including methyl mercury, lead and arsenic. Thus, not only will the wildlife that depend upon the Lake be harmed, but so will the human residents of the Wasatch Front. This would be entirely unacceptable and a gross dereliction of the duty of the State of Utah to protect both. 5. As the surface area of the Lake shrinks (already only about 40% of the historic average), the amount of "lake effect" precipitation in the Wasatch Mountain will also fall, thereby reducing the annual snowpack that in turn feeds the lake, resulting in a vicious cycle of an ever-decreasing volume of water in the lake. In addition, the dust blown onto the mountains by winds sweeping over the exposed lakebed will cause more rapid melting of the winter snowpack and quicker runoff, resulting in even less water post-runoff to supply the lake and the human inhabitants of most of northern Utah. In light of these considerations, I strongly urge DWQ to immediately grant |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>5A Class status to Gilbert Bay per Utah Admin. Code R317-2-6.5(a) and to deny US Magnesium’s request for a permit to deepen its outtake pipes. US Magnesium must make do with what they have if it can or fail. If the level of the water in Gilbert Bay continues to fall below its already historic low of 4,188.4’ as of today (October 26, 2022) there will come a time in the not too distant future when the loss of water will not only result in a collapse of the Great Salt Lake ecosystem and grave injury to the health of the public, but will necessitate the termination of US Magnesium’s operation anyway. At that point, all will have been lost. It would be extremely unwise and imprudent to contribute to this alarming prospect. Granting 5A Class status to Gilbert Bay is the least that can be done to help ensure the future of a healthy Great Salt Lake, a healthy ecosystem and human population, and a vibrant economy.I just learned the disheartening news that the Governor's recent proclamation suspending any new water appropriations in the Bear, Jordan and Weber river basins does NOT impact U.S. Magnesium Corporation's pending application of a canal expansion 3 miles further into the lake, as it was submitted before the governor's directive. The Tribune article this past weekend underscored that the governor's proclamation will not affect the pending application of US Magnesium to use 100,000 gallons per minute of lake water.For anyone I'm sending this email to who has the power to deny this application, if you have already decided to deny it, THANK YOU for doing the right thing, in the spirit of Governor Cox's proclamation, and to do your part to help save our Great Salt Lake. If you are actually considering approving the U.S Mag Corp request, please return to your senses.I am pasting in below the letter I sent in the other week for the comment period on the Mag Corp application, Thank you for your attention to this urgent matter!</p> |
| 748 | Ran Yehushua Salt Lake City Resident | <p>We need to solve the shrinking Great Salt Lake, not allow removal of more water from it. Please say no to dredging by US Magnesium in the Great Salt Lake!</p> |
| 749 | Isabella Serrano Student University of Utah | <p>I am a student at the University of Utah and have recently researched this topic in our class. This company should absolutely and positively NOT be allowed to take any water from the Great Salt Lake. First of all, not only is it detrimental to our environment but will also be severely damaging to public health. This is because once the Great Salt Lake is dried up enough, the lack of water will allow for more powerful winds to come up, which will cause the bottom of the lake, WHICH IS FULL OF ARSENIC, to be blown into the air we breathe. Even worse is that Salt Lake City sits in a bowl formed by mountains that will trap this air in the valley.</p> |
| 750 | Alison Godlewski | <p>We all know that the Great Salt Lake is in a terribly precarious state and we need to do all we can to restore lake levels. If we allowed US Magnesium to extend their canal deeper into the Great Salt Lake, this would lower water levels, further endanger waterfowl, and completely ruin recreation in Gilbert Bay. It would expose wildlife, recreators and hunters to deadly concentrations of mercury and other pollutants. It would also expose all Utah residents and visitors to harmful gases and dust that would be released from the lakebed. Please DO NOT allow US Magnesium to extend their canal deeper into the Great Salt Lake!!!! Thank you for listening. Please do the right thing for the health of the world and all its creatures.</p> |
| 751 | Teresa Crockett | <p>I oppose additional withdrawal of water from the Great Salt Lake and its tributaries until the lake can achieve and maintain a healthy level. Culture, tourism, recreation, community health, and wildlife are all dependent on the lake being at a healthy, sustainable lake level. Deny the Section 401 permit for this project.</p> |
| 752 | Justin | <p>I appreciate everyone who has taken their time to participate tonight. I'm a dad and relatively new to this cause, though I've been involved in other environmental concerns. I believe the opinions from the group are largely an obvious consensus. My attempt to simplify, how is it possible that a permit request can be granted in the generally accepted idea that it will further drain water from the lake. (I believe as noted by many others, this is not complicated solution, just add water. The how is tough, I'll admit.) So why are we here? How do we stop this permit? Is it just the fat and dirty dollar? How much is needed? This is not rhetorical. There are some of us who have access to resources that could combat this. Being clear here, CASH. International investors, billionaire investors, and dads like me who are fortunate and more humble, but capable. US Magnesium is a business. Partnership could be powerful, weirdly aren't we after the same thing? Shout out to CAM and HEAL!!</p> |
| 753 | Al Rockatansky | <p>US Magnesium just laid off a huge portion of their workers, so who will be benefitting from this? is it the few workers they have left? Or is it the people who get the big money? and who is that? Speaking plainly...Do you, who are considering granting this application, understand what ecosystem collapse means? Have you lived through it? Ecosystem collapse doesn't just mean animals and water. It means everything. That money that everyone is looking forward to, at the heart of this application...that will be gone. And I know right now that feels like an empty threat because you don't know what that means, you haven't ever seen it here. You haven't lived through it.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|---------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | And other places where it's happened are so far away they're out of sight, out of mind. So you dont know what losing the lake entails. What I thought would happen in 40, 50 years is happening right in front of me, it's terrifying. You should be terrified too. |
| 754 | Lydia Greer Saratoga Springs Resident | Hello, my name is Lydia Greer. I am a resident of Saratoga Springs, UT. I have lived in the same place all my life. I have just turned 18, so this will be my first time voting this midterms, the first time involving myself, and my first time excersizing my rights. I encourage you all to do the same this November. As everyone has said before me, the decision should be obvious. We all know the difference between right and wrong, and this is wrong. We have the power to prevent this, it is our first right in our constitution. And I would like to remind everyone that once the decision has been made, the fight will still not be over. We have to constantly put in our best efforts, and not rest until the fight has been won. |
| 755 | Julianna Clay | Look out the window, look at our air quality. What do you think that's going to be like if the lake no longer exists and toxic metals are being blown around? People will not stay here. Exposure to heavy metals results in long term health conditions, increases infant and maternal mortality rates, and shortens life spans. The people are tired of leadership's failures to protect public health and the health of our environment. Enough with the short sighted profits over people mentality. If there are no people, which there won't be if the lake dries up, there will be no profit. US Magnesium should not be allowed to extract more water. I can't believe it's even up for discussion the people and the lake say no. The fact that these departments and the state have let water be diverted and the lake is this way is gross negligence by the state and the departments that are supposed to protect our water and public health by proxy. Egregious. |
| 756 | Kelly Hannah | Further draining this lake from the bottom up is not a viable solution. It is not a viable solution for the long term operation of US Magnesium, it is not a viable solution for the water users upstream, it is not a viable solution for the health, welfare and safety of of Utah's people, most notably the millions of people living along the Wasatch Range. Please deny this permit request, DWQ. |
| 757 | Micah A | The Great Salt Lake is at its lowest level ever recorded already. Letting big companies like US Magnesium waste massive amounts of water would just end up hurting all of us and it's not sustainable for the company either. We need to preserve the ecosystem from inherently selfish corporations. It wouldn't take much more for ecological disaster so what we do now is especially important. |
| 758 | Hailey | At the beginning of the meeting we were asked to keep our comments focused immediately on the issue at hand, but as I've listened to the speakers I've heard the same fears I have slip through the cracks. The environment that we depend on for our existence is collapsing. In this case it is one corporation who's only goal is to extract resources and convert it to wealth. Every single member of the community who has spoken tonight has expressed exact opposition to US Magnesium's interest. And as long as our lives, our environment, and the health of our children are immediately at stake, we will continue to express our exact opposition to the short-sighted interests of entities such as US Magnesium. Deny this application, and focus all efforts on fighting off any similar permits in the future. We must prioritize our environment over the wellbeing of the future generations. |
| 759 | Jim Hopkins RCT Brine Shrimper | I moved to Utah thirty-five years ago, and I started brine shrimping twenty-five years ago.I've been out there a long time and I've seen the changes up close. I think Part of the problem we have is very few. People go more than that shore the edge and see the lake. They're not on the water. There's never power boats out there. Few sailboats, a few kayakers within a few miles of the harbor, but that's it. There's nobody out there. They also think the lakes is dead but the lake is very much alive. There were so many shrimp over the years. We you stick a bucket of water and lift it up there, and literally thousands of brine shrimp, millions of birds. I take my boat, and I drive from one end of the lake to the other. There's five million geese out there. Fall ropes that you can't believe the the size of the cloud of the phaleropes. It's unbelievable.So the lake is very much live, but we're at a critical turning point that we're the one hundred and fifty the bio herms the um.These are like coral structures that provide the oxygen to the water, and they are exposed and dying.And when that lake level dries it, Yeah, we're right at the we're we're at the cusp. If we dig a canal and suck out some more water, that lake will become a dead leg and not a lively lake, that it is still right now, |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 760 | Susan Klinker | Hi, i'm Susan Klinker. Um, I am here today as a resident, a homeowner and a mother raising children in Salt Lake. I love Utah, and I love the quality of life that we enjoy here. And the situation with the lake is very terrifying to me. We really don't know what the impacts of the arsenic in the air and the dust storms are already or how they might change, and how quickly they may change. When we look at what happened with Lake Owens and the um, the area of death around it. Um unlivable areas or um. The quality of life is significantly diminished. We don't yet as a community or as a state know how we're going to fix this problem. Um. Yet the quality of life in Salt Lake depends on us fixing this problem. So, in my opinion, it's unreasonable to think about extending the trenches to pull more water out of the lake when we don't know how we're going to fix the problem yet I think we need long term solutions, and this resource has dried up now, and nothing further should be granted.. |
| 761 | Rose Smith President FRIENDS of the Great Salt Lake | My name is Rose Smith, and I serve as president of friends of Great Salt Lake.I'm sure that everyone here knows that Great Salt Lake is in trouble, but i'm not sure that everyone is aware of just how bad things could get. If we allow this extension of the pipeline to occur.. The State's own modeling shows that the ecosystem is showing signs of collapse already,and that if salinity levels aren't controlled and lowered through addition of water, not draining out more water.The ecosystem will completely crash.I can't say i'm surprised or disappointed that us magnesium has pushed for this permit. I seriously doubt that the company is. It is the least bit concerned for the lake. I am surprised and disappointed. The division of water quality would go along with the company's request and submit a draft. Permit. This permit does nothing more than echo. The company's false claims that this project would have a significant impact, would not have a significant impact on the lake, saying that it would avoid all impacts to sensitive microbial lights, if possible,and it also makes the statement that the impacts would be temporary. We all know that's not true.Nothing further can nothing can be further from the truth. The best available science we have shows that the impacts on the lake from this project would be devastatingly long lasting, and possibly irreversible. It's time for the division of water quality to hit the pause button on this permit process and take a step back and thoroughly consider what the science is telling us, because it's telling us that granting this permit will cause a and contribute to the collapse of the lakes ecosystem, and the deaths of millions of birds from where I stand. I can't say that this is not a significant impact.on behalf of the board, staff and members of friends. I'm. Urging you all to say no to us magnesium, and deny the company's request for a section 401 permit |
| 762 | Peter Jorgensen | Good evening, Everyone uh i'm a fourth generation Utahn, and I just like to thank Rose for her comment. Many of the environmental reasons why this is a terrible idea. I'm not an environmental expert. But I can talk to you about the idiocy and lack of sense of prioritizing short-term profits over long-term community health.Let's take a look at what Us. Magnesium looks like. They employ about four hundred and fifty people in the State of Utah. It's not even in the top. Fifty employers in the State of Utah, you know who is impacted. If the lake goes away. The entire ski industry, You know who's impacted that the lake goes away. Students who want to go to the University of Utah, the largest employer in the State of Utah. What Kid wants to go to school dodging arsenic clouds when there's no water left in the lake.Those are the jobs that go awayoutside of the basic environmental devastation that will happen out of this that I shouldn't even have to tell you why that's bad. The real problem, even beyond that is that this won't be livable for people or businesses. The only decent, half decent argument for why we need to extract more magnesium is a national security argument. You need it for environmental. You need for electric vehicles.I'm. A former CIA analyst. I worked in national security for five years. I can tell you that national security isn't worth it. If people don't have security at home. If people don't have clean water, people don't have clean air to live. In.What's the point of ensuring that we have access to critical minerals. If people can't live their day-to-day lives please, I urge you to vote against and to put, not pass this permit. Thank you. |
| 763 | Kelly Hannah Board Member FRIENDS of the Great Salt Lake | This is intense. Uh, my name is Kelly Hannah. I am on the board of Friends of Great Salt Lake and I'm also a real estate broker, principal broker of eight-line real estate.Um. I have had two depending how you measure. Three clients this year moved out of state because of their concerns about the water quality and the air quality. I spend a lot of time out at the lake. I love the lake and the water in it. Um, I did bring uh a little visual that I would love to show you guys, maybe I could step over to the camera so our folks online can see this as well. So here is a picture. This was taken last year in Gilbert Bay. Me and my buddy paddling out there, got hard to paddle last year with the fins catching on the microbialites hard to get out of the Marina. This was taken last week at Gilbert Bay the Paddle Board will not float. There is nothing on it. That's the water quality. This will not work for much longer. I have some other written comments. I haven't gone to those yet, and I will spare you from those. But I will say that if this permit is approved, I would call that gross negligence on the part of the State for every citizen that lives along the Wasatch Range. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 764 | Cameron Carpenter Salt Lake City Resident | <p>Well, everyone thank you for being here. Uh my name is Cameron Carpenter. I'm a Salt Lake City native. I've lived other places, But this is my hometown, and I love it. I love the lake, I'm a skier, border and mountaineer. I love being in Utah, in Salt Lake, and the wasatch range, and the was that it's back because of the beauty that we all enjoy. It's why we live here. I address these comments directly to division of water quality. You are a State agency correct. You're tasked with the fiduciary duty of caring for the water quality of the state correct? Is that correct? It's in your name. It's a fiduciary duty, and yet it boggles my mind that we're we're here even having to address a permit request for one of the worst polluters in the nation to extend pipes, to further drain hundred thousand gallons of water per minute, and further degrade and decline lake level, increasing the salinity, destroying or greatly damaging the microbiome, and exposing hundreds of thousands of acres. Dry lake bed, which contains arsenic and dust and other poisonous dust and lead. It comes directly from the mining industries that happened in big cotton, with little cottonwood and partly's canyons for over one hundred and twenty years, the affluent of which ran down those streams into Jordan River and directly into the lake, and also the bear ever. It's your fiduciary duty. Your jobs all of you, the director on down in the division of water quality, to know the science and know what is happening to the lake and its ecosystems, and the lake effect snow that doesn't happen anymore, which creates our snow pack. Therefore our water base to know the science and know what happens when you allow the lake to be decimated and drained to the point where it's on the verge of collapse. It's your job. So I am here to say this is a terminal lake. A lot of people don't know that only water flows in There's no there's no outtake other than corporations or or entities, taking water out into evaporation ponds. There's US Mag Corp. There's Car Gill, which harvest salt through hundreds of thousands of acres or hundreds of acres of evaporation ponds. There's more than salt. And then there's um compass minerals which is harvesting lithium out of Ogden. I'm sure the agency is aware of all these operators. Let's speak specifically to the permit request from Us. Magnesium, granting the primary request would result in the in the further draining uh of the lake and and destruction of the beneficial uses. So you associated with the Dw. Queues Class five a designation. The Utah Administrative Code states that the beneficial uses of Gilbert bay are protected for frequent primary and secondary contact recreation, water, fowl, shorebirds and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain three hundred This permit if granted would directly threaten the beneficial use of the bay by destroying this necessary food chain, and should not be issued. Furthermore, it would increase the salinity level, further degrading and possibly killing the entire ecosystem and microbiome that exists in the lake, greatly reducing the amount of lake effect uh snow that is that falls in our. In our wasatch Mountains, and the wasatch front and back, which creates our snow pack, which is our main water source, and also increase the salinity and be a great threat to the migratory birds from north and South and Central America that depend on the lake is a migratory uh stop all along there migratory range at a minimum. I would urge you the DWQ to do your fiduciary duty, and you must conduct a level two anti-degradation review to ensure that the Us. Magnesium permit. Would the request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay that you as the division are required by law to protect, required by law to protect it's your duty. You're a State agency. You're paid by the citizens of this State to protect the water and its quality. If you don't protect the water, and it's quality, and you allow permits to be granted that would further degrade and possibly destroy the water quality in this lake. The lake that our capital city of our State is named after. It's as if you were a parent with fiduciary duty to take care of your children, and you let a virulent virus into your house, and it severely sick, and one of your children, and when you saw the damage, and were aware of the science, and knew what effects it was having on your child rather than getting the virus Us. Magcorp out of your house. You invite it down the hallway and show it to the rooms of your other children. That's what granting this permit would do. Hey, guys, You've drained the lake to a level where it's on the verge of collapse. Yeah, I think we could consider granting you the ability to dredge the lake and extend your intake pipes, and use more water into by dreaming it into evaporation Fonts, so you, as a private enterprise, can profit while degrading the quality of life of every citizen that lives across the lost hatch front. More water is used by Us. Magnesium Court for private profit over forty billion gallons of water a year. Then all the cities of Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake combined. That's egregious. The microbiome is collapsing. The salinity level is increasing the toxic dust. In the exposed former water, covered like bed, is hitting worse, and the lake effect that directly adds to our snow pack decreasing, which also supports the one point five billion dollars a year ski industry, thousands of employees. So all I would call on you to do is, do your fiduciary duty. Take it seriously. Do your jobs protect the water quality because it's important, because that's what you're paid to do. That's what you've taken on a job to do, and and it's it's a sacred and and and important undertaking that shouldn't be taken lightly, no matter who's requesting further permits to further degrade the lake. Thank you very much</p> |
| 765 | Holly Simonsen FRIENDS of the Great Salt Lake | <p>Thank you, and thank you all for coming tonight. I appreciate it. My name is Holly Simonson. I live and work in Salt Lake City. I've been working with Great Salt Lake issues for well over a decade. I work as an artist specifically working with Great Salt Lake as an adjunct professor at Westminster College, where I teach a class called exploring Great Salt Lake, and for the nonprofit friends of Great Salt Lake, where I am the programs Director. A healthy, great Salt Lake is essential for my</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>livelihood,and I plead with you to decline United States magnesium's, recent 401 permit to extend their operating canals to a level of four thousand one hundred and eighty-five feet. Salt Lake levels remain dangerously low. Exposed Microbial lights serve as harbingers of a decimated ecosystem.Ecological collapse would have devastating consequences to all who live and work along the Wasatch front. Most of the activities I participate in as a professional artist and educator occur along the shoreline of Gilbert Bay, including stakeholders college students and industry partners to the hemispherically critical ecosystem via the sensitive habitat of Lee Creek and the Gilmore Sanctuary. I've also spent countless hours along Gilbert bay, both in the water and along the shoreline as a recreationist, where I kayak, Paddle board, sail, and row. Gilbert Bay has a class five, a designation protecting its waters for the beneficial uses of primary and secondary contact. Recreation.A lowered lake level will not only make these waterways inaccessible, but dangerous to public health as the Dry Lake bed at this elevation will concentrate and expose dangerous toxins,methylated mercury, selenium, and arsenic, it will no longer be safe to study or recreate in this area.</p> |
| 766 | Denise Carthwright Save Our Great Salt Lake | <p>Hi, everyone. I'm. Denise Cartwright, I'm. A local small business owner and a founding member of save our Great Salt Lake. I'm. Also someone who wants a future and a family in this valley. i'm calling on the Utah Division of water quality to reject US Magnesium's Canal Extension project. This project would increase salinity and decrease water quality at the lake, and further devastate the great Salt Lake ecosystemThis permit would directly threaten the beneficial use of Gilbert Bay by destroying its ecosystem and food chain, and it should not be issued. In a typical year US. Mag. Extracts more water from the lake than the cities of Ogden, Provo and Salt Lake City combined.mThey intentionally evaporate away more than forty billion gallons of water a year to turn a profit. All while millions of pounds of chlorine are spewed across thousands of acres of lake bed. It's time to prioritize the great Salt Lake Ecosystem and our future in this valley.No more putting industry over people, ecosystems and life and no to us. Magnesium.</p> |
| 767 | Madeleine Bavley | <p>Hi! My name is Madeleine, and I think everyone's done a great job laying out the science and the government legislator side of things. I'm: just a community member here and I farm on a small scale. Urban farm in the summer, and I work at the resort in the mountains in the winter. And people care about this. This is really important as the lake is drying up, and it doesn't just risk the lives of millions and trillions of the um non-human relatives who rely on that ecosystem, but like also our livelihood of the air we breathe, How much snow we're getting. Yeah, everyone else said it all. But i'm just one more person who cares.Thanks.</p> |
| 768 | Alex Vekleux HEAL Utah | <p>My name is Alex Vekleux i'm a policy associate with Heal Utah. it is the healthy Environment Alliance of Utah. So I do our climate and and clean air policy. That's pretty much what brings us here today to talk about the lake. Um, I've got a little bit more of a technical comments. I'm gonna read from my phone a little bit. That's okay. if you're not familiar with the healthy, environmental lines of you, tell, we're grassroots by one C three environmental nonprofit safeguarding the health of you tones across the straight state for over twenty years.I'm here today to urge the division of water quality to reject US Magnesium Section 401 water quality certification for the extension of the two intake canals in Gilbert Bay. Some of the levels have already reached the point on the verge of ecosystem collapse, and the extension of these canals will only exacerbate this water quality issue.Recently, researchers have measured nineteen percent facility levels in the open water of the lake. These levels mean the collapse of Brine Shrimp and Brian fly. Populations are imminent.Further diversion of water from the Gilbert Bay will isolate pockets of segmentation within the body of water, and we'll increase salinity and concentration of heavy metals in these smaller pools, further threatening the loss of Brian shrimp and brine fly life there by negating any current efforts to restore water quality in the Gilbert Bay. Um, I do kind of want to expand on that a little bit. It's just so. I do policy work for Heal, and i'm up on the hill. I was just up there all day to day for interim session. I was up there all last session, and we're all coming together, and we're all trying our best to save the lake Other people have talked about the class five, a designation, and how this is this: is this: this: Permit shouldn't happen because it directly violates what the division of water quality is talking about doing and what they're tasked to do. But most importantly, my perspective is thatit's just so frustrating to see all the work that everyone is doing right now. I mean, some people say it's baby steps. I think that there's some good stuff going on, but it's all being directly negated. We're working so hard to get these farmers to figure out solutions to get water down to the lake. We're so we're working so hard to come up with new ways to get water to the lake,and then I have to hear about some permit that they're going to beextending canals five feet further down. It's just like It's i'm pulling my hair out of here. I'm being unprofessional. But come on, it's it's unbelievable um to get back to my more professional comments here.I mean Brian Shrimp and Brian flies are essential parts of the food chain on the lake that they feed millions of birds that folks have talked about already.They they stop by on their annual migratory voyage. Um! There's so many beautiful birds out there, but it's more about the beauty of the birds. But it's more about the food chain that that feeds these birds. People have hit on it already, but that</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>food chain is explicitly protected by the beneficial use in the class five, a designation granted to Gilbert Bay by the division of water quality, the class five a designation States. It is protected for the frequent primary and secondary contact, recreation, waterfowl shorebirds, and other water-oriented wildlife, including their necessary food chain that is, in the Utah Administrative code rule 317.6.5(a). So it's it's in direct violation of the law. If we're going to disrupt this food chain which this researchers have proven, it will do In short, if us magnesium diverts more water researchers have found, they'll increase salinity and directly impair that food chain as stated as the beneficial. You, as others have spoken of the class. Five day designation by the division of water quality.All is considered, the Dw. And Us. Magnesium should consider a few other options for continued operations at the facility. If that's going to be going onum at minimum the DWQ. Must conduct a level. Two anti-degradation Review. To consider the destruction of the beneficial use through the class five designation by way of increase solidity levels the permit also mentions something called a floating pipe. Alternative. Um, i'm not exactly sure what that is. I'm: I'm excited to maybe learn more about it. Just found that out today. But we urge US magnesium to pursue any alternative strategies that do not impair the water quality of Dealer Bay if they wish to continue operations at the facility. Um. In short, they just need. We need to get more creative. If this is what we're going to be doing, I I don't know. Let's put it with the currency of the lake. The only reasonable and practical mitigation for water. Diversions of any kind should replenish themselves. If an entity wishes to take more water out of the lake, that entity should obtain and donate an equal amount of water in the form of upstream water. It is a minimum bar set for the future for extracted practices on the lake. I don't think a gallon in and a gallon out. Is that much to ask for with the current state of the lake right now approving this permit would negate much of the work being done into restoring the already impaired water quality of the Great Salt Lake, As I already stated. I urge the division of water quality to not experiment. Thanks for your time.</p> |
| 769 | CJ Hellige | <p>Hi. My name is Cj. Helickey, and I am a resident of Rose Park in Salt Lake City. I'm. Also on the board of the West Side Coalition, which is a group of the West Side neighborhoods in Salt Lake City. Who will be the first affected by the negative environmental impacts that a dried like bed would have, such as the arsenic dust storms. I'll keep my comment really brief. But don't mistake my brevity for the anger that I feel that this permit is even being considered. I urge this department to deny this permit request.</p> |
| 770 | Susie Montgomery University of Utah | <p>Hi! I'm Susie Montgomery. Um, I wasn't prepared to speak, but I just got a couple of ideas. One of the ones is Um! I have. I spend half my time in Chicago, and half my time in Salt Lake City at this point, and um I couldn't believe I've never heard any Chicago and talk about Utah, Utah usually lays way under the radar, but I heard so many people i'd go out and they'd say, what's going on with your lake. You know I was like. Wow, everybody is noticing, and this is national news, and I feel like, if you guys do the right thing like you'll really lead the path because we on a grander scale our whole planet's in trouble. So we have to start really paying attention to, not economic growth, but ecological growth. And that's the only solution. They're all tied together. So when we really look at what the decision, the small, maybe what you consider a small decision today, but it's it's It's part of a decision that will really save the planet. Ultimately. Um, we need to start making those decisions, and you'd be a hero to make the right decision, I think. And the other part is that I own a house in Salt Lake City I have, for I don't know twenty some years and um I feel like if the lake disappears, the property value like no one's gonna want to our economy is so great right now. Everybody's like Oh, my house is appreciated so much. But that's gonna go away. No one's gonna want these houses. If we have toxic air at which we already do. But if we have no water in the lake, and everything stops circulating like it's supposed to um. We just can't survive. And so then we become climate refugees or something before our time. And I just think like we can stop this now. We can all work together and be on the same team, and I know you probably feel like your position is difficult for one way or another. But there's just one choice you can make. That's it. Thank You</p> |
| 771 | Nate Houseley Save Our Great Salt Lake | <p>Hi! My name is Nate Housley. I'm with the group uh save our great Salt Lake. Thanks for having this hearing, and thanks to everybody for coming out, So US magnesium's homepage reads US Magnesium is a conservation advocate for the Great Salt Lake, evidenced by its volunteer work with the Utah division of wildlife resources. Sorry to do this show of hands. Who here thinks that us magnesium is a conservation advocate for Grace Salt Lake. No hands, no hands. Um I I do that. So is the cheap point to make, but I do that because sometimes um, we get wrapped up in the worlds of you know, we get into the world of legalese. We get into these languages of public relations. And we start saying, Yeah, they're conservation advocates. They do volunteer work. Yeah, like that's great, but nobody here. We're the people on the ground who have been out to the lake. Thank you, Kelly, for bringing a picture of what the lake looks right. Looks like right now. Um, we're on the ground. We're in touch with how things are, and sometimes all of us need a bit of a reality check. And so I'm here to ask you to deny the permit, because the reality of it</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>is, it's cut and dry because the permit, if approved, would degrade the water quality. For all the reasons that everybody has said, it would increase salinity in the lake. It would lower the level exposing more microbialites. It would endanger the food web of the great salt lake. It would put millions of birds in danger, possibly putting some birds in the protected environment. What am I trying to say? The Endangered Species Act? Thank you alternatives exist. It would be in violation of the code, alternatives exist. They may be more expensive, like Oh, well, who cares. But if we don't, deny this permit, then what are we even doing right if we're not looking at the reality? We're not looking at the situation of the lake. Then what are we even doing? Um. So again I encourage you to deny the permit. Um, and thank you very much for your time. Thank you,</p> |
| 772 | <p>Kirk Robinson Western Wildlife Conservancy</p> | <p>Good evening, everyone. Thanks for showing up and thank you for this opportunity to comment on this issue. My name is Kirk Robinson. I am the executive director and founder of a conservation organization here in Utah, Western wildlife conservancy, on behalf of Western wildlife conservancy, and the millions of people who depend on us to try to protect the environment and our wildlife. I'm. Here to speak on behalf of the lake, and against this permit. I also have a personal stake in this issue. I grew up almost on the shore of the Great Salt Lake in the fifties and sixties. Many times I went out to Farmington Bay to observe birds. I read about the lake. I studied in college for a while. I remember seeing Pelicans World wheel in the sunlight above Powerful peak, when I was a kid, and marveling at What a wonderful place I lived in. Now, as time goes on, I see a lot of our values, our natural values being threatened and slowly disappearing. And that really is kind of a sickening realization frankly, and we need to do something about it. And the division of water quality as a moral duty to protect our environment and to protect we who depend on our environment. It's a public trust duty also to protect the wildlife that the lake supports. I don't need to carry on about the sorry state of the lake at this point. We all know about that. I know about science. I have a Phd. In lost the history of science. I understand most of the science is pretty well, but I don't think you need that in order to see what's going on, and the fear what might happen as time marches on, if something isn't done to protect this resource. Now, what about the birds? Millions of birds? Honestly, I get the feeling that our political class doesn't really care about the birds at all. Maybe a few of them do personally, but I don't get the sense that they really regard birds as fellow citizens in the family of life on earth. It's all about getting certain people rich, expanding the human footprint going along to get along. Never mind what happens to other creatures, or even human beings. Three times the spring. I live in Sugar House all right, near twenty-four, south and eleventh east. There were three times this spring when winds came in from the northwest and created great big clouds of dust. on two of those occasions I could not even see Mount Olympus, twin peaks, its disgusting. I cannot imagine those who are elected and paid to safeguard our environment for us, including the wildlife, even flirting with the idea. giving it all away! Essentially, it's not too hard to imagine and believe that in thirty years time there will not be a lake. Most of those bird species will be gone. Human beings will flee this area. They won't want to live here, and it doesn't take a genius, let alone a profit to see that this is a very, not just possible, but highly probable outcome if we do not change right away. So, having said all that, thank you for your time, and of course I urge the division of water quality to do what feel strongly is the right thing, and to deny this permit. Thank you.</p> |
| 773 | <p>Brooke Larson University of Utah</p> | <p>Hello! My name is Brooke Larson. I grew up in Salt Lake City, and i'm first and foremost here because I love my home, and i'm concerned that I won't have a future here. If the Us. Utah division of water quality approves this permit. I also have a master's degree in environmental humanities from the University of Utah and Mentor, the rising generation of environmental professionals who are deeply concerned about Great Salt Lake. My fellow community members have done an excellent job sharing the important scientific facts tonight. I thank you all for that. But this isn't just a science problem. This is also a culture problem, and the Director and the division of water quality. You have an opportunity to be part of ushering in a new culture that protects the lake for present and future generations. We know Great Great Salt Lake can't afford to lose any more water. The lake is already on the brink of ecosystem collapse with salinity levels at nineteen percent. We know Us. Magnesium's request to lengthen their intake canals and take more water from the lake will increase salinity and the concentrations of heavy metals threatening the food chain for water, Oriented wildlife that you by law are required to protect, and the humanities We examine our histories, to understand the present and create a better future. I can guarantee you. History will not look at you fondly. If you approve this, permit, it will have devastating consequences for the water quality of Great Salt Lake, and threaten all life, human and more than human, in this region. We cannot just continue with business as usual, and act as if we can engineer ourselves out of this crisis. As my friend Darren Perry, the former chairman of the Northwestern band of the Shoshone nation says: All the science in the world is not going to make up for our selfish behaviors. We've been polluting, extracting, and exploiting Great Salt Lake. For over a century she has been protecting us from ourselves. And now, as she sits at the brink of ecosystem collapse, she is telling us no more. Will you listen? It's time to say no to the selfish, short term interest of US Magnesium and protect Great Salt Lake.</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 774 | Michael Morgan Millcreek Resident | <p>Uh, thank you so much for sticking around and allowing us to issue some comments. My name is Mike Morgan. I live in Millcreek, Utah. I'm a Utah native. My family came across with the Pioneers and I have deep Utah roots, and I deeply love this state. I want to make uh kind of two, please. First of all, uh, I want to request that the division of water quality deny the issuance of this permit to Mag Corp. Science is sound. It's irrefutable. There will be incredibly devastating consequences to the quality of the water of the lake and the quality of the ecosystem of the lake. i'm a physician, i'm a health care provider, and so health is a big issue to me. And we can talk about the health of the water and the health of the lake, but we can't look at it in isolation. We have to talk about the health of the air, the health of the community, the health of the economy, all of those things. The health of every single person in this room sits in your hands. That's not hyperbole. It sits in the hands of the division of water quality as you stare at this request by Mag Corp. There can be no question, no doubt, that issuance of this will lead to further devastation of the Great Salt Lake, which in turn will lead to devastation of our air quality which will lead to devastation of our environment. Our snowpack. It's all been said. It's open, stated already. I'm tired of taking care of sick patients in the emergency department that come in when the storms kick up pollen and dirt and dust, and cause asthma, exacerbations, and COPD. Exacerbations. I'm tired of seeing infant mortality raised due to air pollution. I'm tired of seeing an increase in stroke rates and heart attacks that are directly linked to air pollution, and that air pollution is directly linked to the lake, and the quality of the water and the depth of the water of the lake. The health of our community is in your hands. Please, please, please do the right thing. Thank you.</p> |
| 775 | Sarah J Balland (She/They) | <p>Thank you. Uh, My name is actually Sarah J. Bland. For the minutes record I use. She they pronouns I am a resident of the Rose Park neighborhood in Salt Lake City, and here, representing myself and future right generations rights to experience and live with the ecological functions innate to the Great Salt Lake, from two thousand and seventeen to throughs up to two thousand and twenty-one. I also served as a policy analyst for the Utah Legislature's public utilities, energy and Technology Committee, the missing and murdered indigenous Women and Girls Task force, and the native American legislatively is on committee. So i'm speaking to you from that formal background, while also trying to channel the voices of those who continue to educate me. Now that I no longer work for that harmful institution. Firstly, I am urging you to deny US Magnesium's request for a canal extension in Gilbert Bay on the Great Salt Lake, and to not issue a section for a one water quality certification to us magnesium. Secondly, I'm. Asking you to at minimum conduct a level two anti-degradation review to ensure that us magnesium's permit. Request would not interfere with the beneficial uses of Gilbert Bay, that the division is required by law to protect; and last, but not least, I want you to use your access and power to explore what it would take to grant upstream water rights to the Great Salt Lake, meaning that any entity that wishes to divert more water out of the lake should be required to put an equal amount of water back in consultation with the indigenous tribes who are the original stewards of the lake, and hold the greatest wisdom as to where we go from here, since it is apparent that our non-native settler institutions of governance and conservation are incapable of caring for the sacred body of water or our environment. In general, such tribal consultation would include, but not be limited to all you bands of Utah, the Northwestern band of Shoshone, and all go shoot bands of Utah. Thank you for your time and consideration in this hearing do the right thing.</p> |
| 776 | Colin Kelly Ogden Resident | <p>i'm a resident of South Ogden, and you know uh directly in line of lake effect First of all, I would yield my time to a representative from us magnesium, but i'm sure they're not in this area. So state scientists have already taken measurements of nineteen percent salinity in the open water, and eighteen percent above is the region in which ecosystem collapse occurs for brine flies and for brine fish and when that ecosystem collapses and has larger effects than just those things. And um, it's very um concerning that. This body is not taking that into consideration the lake levels would drop due to climate change and unprecedented drought which the governor himself asked for prayer to fix. Uh, but yet we're looking to extend intake to types, to draw more water from the lake. Those types were built at normal lake level, and the lake is not at a normal level, and it's only decreasing, and they want to decrease it more at their minimum. Us. Magnesium should have to provide an equal, or really a greater amount of water shares to be flown into the lake rather than draw it out, and with health effects. Cancer is insidious, and it can't really be tracked, which is really great for companies like us magnesium, because they can deny it, and it's very easy to do so. So please, for the sake of current and future generations, deny this. Permit to us magnesium</p> |
| 777 | Helene Cuomo | <p>coming off and on for most of my adulthood to division of water quality meetings. I've seen it going from scientists to more business minded people, and we just got to stop business as usual, as well as the state needs to stop business as usual. Our health is at stake. The planet is at stake. Wildlife is at stake, I guess, support Governor Cox, who at the beginning of his term suing for the Great Salt Lake, made a big deal of it, and said, We need to support the lake, so I think we all need to stand behind</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|-----------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>that statement, and especially as this Government agency, that you are My comment is definitely to say no to US Mag Corp. Um! And I just want to read something real quick from It's the UN Chronicle and the Aral Sea. In Central Asia, and at the point that this article was written I'm. Not reading the whole thing just three short paragraphs. Um at the time; the fourth, fourth largest lake in one thousand nine hundred and sixty. It had already shrunk to its former size.Uh, but though the sea itself can no longer be saved, we can't get to that point. Here it's toxic. Salt planes have paradoxically given rise to a new spirit in the region. The three points. Five million people who live in this region have seen their health jobs and living conditionally. Living conditions literally go down the drain. The once thriving fishing and canning industry has evaporated, replaced by anemia, high infant mortality, and debilitating respiratory intestinal. Ailments. And I have one more paragraph that you could find all this in the un um papers as well as just just Google it. Soviet scientists understood that the massive water withdrawals needed to sustain the sea. And that's what was drying all the water out. The Russians decide. We need to have this crop, So it's business, I guess, but they need would cause the Aral sea level to plummet, but they believe that a hard crust would form over the exposed seabed salt and minimize health and environmental fallout. They were wrong, in fact, toxic salts and minerals, including sodium, chloride, sodium, sulfate, and magnesium chloride, now constitute the greatest danger. From the aral sea catastrophe because of airblown salts and the larger toxic salts. Now rain down hundreds of kilometers from the Arals basin, damaging crops and people's health and increasing circumference, and it goes on. And basically the tragedy is, they knew when you could see it happen. You can't wait until it's too late to make the right decisions, and that's what's in your hands right now is to make the right decisions andtalking. We're talking about birds. We're talking about resources that are being lost. Um, I think when people leave the State there should be an exit survey. We are losing resources here. I don't know if um you've been to Galvan Center or weddings, but the one of the premier. I guess Ted Keller, but one of the Premier um jazz and dance bands, Joe Muskolini. You might have seen him at the Italian festival. He has recently moved to California because he couldn't breathe here anymore, and he's a musician. And now where he's living, he can breathe, and he can play his music, but he's no longer our resource here, and it makes me sad. Marjorie Janoff. You might have heard her play at Temple Square, and with the Utah Symphony. She was a pianist there. Her husband can't breathe when he lived here, and now, when he comes back for business can't wait to leave the State. So we're losing resources, let alone the health of the future generations and the health of the birds and the animals to rely on it. This this does not make any sense to grant this, and this is more of a question than a comment. But, um, i'm not good to comment, because I can't do questions the um. The statement at the beginning says The water quality, certification, and compliance. It was biological integrity and chemical integrity, and that sounded like it was discharge. But what happens? Where is it saying that when stuff gets taken out it's totally detrimental as well, and it needs to be considered, and does something need to change with that that we also have to consider the withdrawal as well as discharges.But please please do the right thing. We all know we all know what that is. Thank you.</p> |
| 778 | Heather Dove Great Salt Lake Audubon | <p>Thanks to DWQ for realizing how many people are concerned about this permit application, and choosing to hold this public hearing . It's much appreciated. My name is Heather Dove. I'm. Commenting today as President of Great Salt Lake Audubon. So this is on behalf of that organization. Our chapter is very concerned about the potential consequences to a great salt lake to the millions of birds who utilize it annually, and to the people along the Wasatch front, as you know, we are in a period of a ratification that's been going on for decades. The Great Salt Lake water level has been steadily dropping. It's over eleven feet lower than it was in the mid eighteen hundreds due primarily to human use and diversion. And now, complicated by climate change and drought, over forty percent of the lake bed is now exposed. The salinity in the South arm has hit nineteen percent. The microbialites which are the nursery for all life in the lake are now exposed and desiccated the brine flies this year are dead. They're not producing the next generation brine flies, and their larvae are a critical food source, for many of the birds that historically have come to forage at this lakeBrine Shrimp are not doing well either bird numbers which are already in decline from habitat loss, and other multiple human-cost factors are demonstrating a sharp drop this year in short great salt lake the great Salt Lake ecosystem which for millennia has functioned as a critical stop over on the Pacific Flyway is truly on the verge of collapse. These are extraordinary times, which require extraordinary measures. We understand that Us. Magnesium's ability to carry on business as usual, has been impacted by the drought, and that in order to continue their production, they will require better access to the mineral rich waters of the lake. But this will also mean extracting even more water from this lake that is already severely depleted. Given the lakes dire state, we believe that this permit should be denied. But if us magnesium is granted this permit, and truly we hope it is not at the very least they should be required to obtain and donate water rights for Great Salt Lake, that are equal to the amount of water that they plan to extract as a result of this permit. And also I I wanted to say that I agree with Alex that us magnesium needs to get creative uh with developing some innovative technologies. I keep thinking that, you know, since their extraction process is evaporative by nature, all that water lost that us magnesium should be working on a strategy for recapturing, recapturing the evaporated water and returning it to the lake. If this could be accomplished, this strategy would surely</p> |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | bring up the lake level and make their ability to access mineral rich water viable again. So Great Salt Lake Audubon urges you. Please deny this. Permit and suit. Send US magnesium back to the drawing board. |
| 779 | Oscar Zavala | I would like toto talk about is how the Great Salt Lake must be saved. Liketo have It's water to be nice and clean |
| 780 | Michael Shipplet Great Salt Lake Rowing Club | Hi, I'm Michael Shipplet, I'm. I'm. Representing the Great Salt Lake Rowing Club. I'm. A board member for the club. Um. We. We have been rowing on the Great Salt Lake since two thousand and two. So this marks our twenty year anniversary of being a club and a nonprofit in the region. It also marks the first time in either our clubs history or the preceding clubs history. Bonneville rowing that we've had to cancel our season due to the level of the lake. We had to cancel it nearly a month and a half ago, because at the time um, as was previously demonstrated, might even a paddle board can exit the Marina um between paddle boards and and the shell. The shells and boats that we use. The draw is probably less than pretty much anything else out there, and uh when we can no longer get the boats out. When the pad of borders come longer gets to get the boats out, It's a sign that there's some real problems happening. We spend several hours every week out of the lake Um, oftentimes several miles into the body of the lake, and I can speak from firsthand experience that it is truly one of the most sublime and beautiful things I have ever experienced. I grew up near the ocean. I've grown up near water. I've traveled the world. The Great Salt Lake is honestly and truthfully unique, and the fact that we're willing to trade it um, or even willing to consider trading it for the short term profits of one of the biggest exploiters of the lake, is abhorrent to me and to everyone within the club. We've also had historic growth in the past two years. Last year we had a record number of members join this year. We are close to eclipsing that number and every person that we bring to the lake. We do corporate events, we do social events, we do. Educational events come away from the lake, seeing it with a new lens of beauty, and a new lens of understanding. So I I urge the division of water quality to reject this application? Um! And to consider whether now is the time that we make the decision. Are we going to continue to be the Utah of Salt Lake City, or are we going to be the Utah of Salt Basin City? We are trading our namesake. We are trading our nation's heritage for the profit of a company that will never distribute it to anyone else, even if that were a reason to do so. Thank you. |
| 781 | Mary Paul Murray Resident | Hi, Thank you. Uh, my name is Mary Paul, My fifth generation resident live in Murray, Utah. I'm also a member of you. Tell Moms for clean air. Um! So many wonderful points have been reiterated multiple times. I just wanted to touch on a few from my perspective. One is fairness. I am highly upset that here so many of us have worked with the local scape programs, with others, investing thousands and thousands of dollars into our landscapes, into more efficient appliances, into cutting back um, changing our lifestyles to use less water out of respect for preserving our ecosystem. And the other day in the Tribune I saw an article that multiple water districts are going to be releasing billions of gallons back into the great lake by the end of this year. And then I came across this today. And what a slap in the face! Fair is fair. There's just absolutely no a way that this can be justified when so many other people are bending over backwards to create a solution. And this board that we put our great trust in with you to to guide us in the right one hundred and fifty. It's it's terrifying to think that this could even be a consideration. It's just terrifying. And I look at my kids, and I think even about you know, hard to imagine. What is it going to be like three years from now, let alone thirty, when they're adults here, will they even be able to live in this valley? So first of all, I want to say fairness is a major consideration. If if we're going to solve this, it's going to take everybody pitching in everybody Second of all. When I heard the physician speak, I I did start to tear up a bit, because that's a lot of my experience. I have children that have suffered from pollution induced asthma and other chronic respiratory issues, myself included, had a very scary second pregnancy due to you know, Red air days two hundred and fifty, and had some health repercussions because of that, and I know, and i'm already seeing it in these days with the haze and the the smog that we have right now. It's getting worse, and it's getting worse. And yes, that impacts breathing, but it also impacts, you know, uh spending for medications, loss of work for sick days, caring for loved ones, or being unable to work yourself. Ah! Investing in these crazy, expensive air filtering systems. Um! Not being able to tell your child they can go outside to play. You gotta figure out other indoor activities. And what kind of life is that if a child can't go outside to play. I just want to speak from the heart of hearts, as far as you know, a real quality One way of living here. What's the point? If we're not living? If we aren't free to go outside and breathe, and and you know, be able to we're literally begging for a life, sustaining resource to be preserved here while I'm. Making dinner, trying not to burn it, you know, trying to live daily life. And then every you know, these meetings come up, and we we have to call and beg for mercy. It's it's hard. It's so hard, and I do think you know I I to put my trust to you all at the end of the day, and I i'm just gonna pray, and i'm gonna keep hope of hopes you will do the right thing for for my family, for your families, for all of us. Thank you very much. |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|----------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 782 | Pasha Densley | This is just one of the many examples of inevitable results of our changing climate. The extension of pipelines is an admission that the lake will likely continue to recede, impacts of the receding lake levels will not be resolved from accelerating the water depletion. Those easy-fixed solutions will not serve you toons in the long term. In my opinion, it is imperative that we protect our environment, which cannot protect itself. Businesses that survive on the extraction of dwindling resources, must find new directions to go. Humans are adaptable. The Great Salt Lake is far less so. |
| 783 | Sarah Woodbury | Hi! My name is Sarah Woodbury. I am representing myself. I am a fifth generation Utah, meaning I descend from those who saw the shimmering lake from hand carts, and would later flock to the lake for healing, for hunting and for dancing. I grew up in Davis County. I would sail. I would kayak and play in Great Salt Lake. I'd snowboard, thanks to the lake effect, and I've long worked with the lake for art and poetry and healing. If you've been on the lake at sunset, you know what I know that, thanks to this body of pastels and water, it's possible to kayak the sky. I'm currently a master student at Utah State University. Um. Here I study and work to improve water quality at the site of the Bear River Massacre. This project is led by the Northwestern band at the site of the Bear River massacre. It's upstream from Great Salt Lake, and my piece of the project is to interview landowners and agriculturalists to figure out how we can work together to heal degraded water quality. We talk often about the hope that our work can support the urgent work of our managers downstream. As you know, water quality efforts take collaboration across water bodies and diverse communities. Previous speakers have described the awful state of the lake in great detail, and I don't need to spend too long on what our science and senses have made clear for decades. The lake needs water, and maintaining the quality of this water and habitat is crucial to wildlife and habitats, as well as human communities and well-being as myself and colleagues have worked along the Bear River. I have been moved by a phrase that we've heard among the managers along the Bear River. Water is life. I want to bring the sentiment forward from communities upstream. We Utahns care about water, and this permit jeopardizes the water quality, ecosystems, recreation and well being of our namesake and source of pride, I think it's common sense that this permit, with its lowering of lake levels would make a dire situation even worse. However, the division has a chance here to show its commitment to water quality and to Utons, and to show us what its values are, and that it's committed to healthy bodies of water, including wildlife and human bodies. Please decline this permit, and enable the collaborative spirit of Utah to ensure our great gem survives into the future. Thank you so much. I appreciate the chance to be heard. |
| 784 | Evan Anderson | I'm Speaking as a concerned citizen, I have been a resident of this state for the last fourteen years, and have frankly fallen in love with it. I love Utah. I think it's one of the most beautiful places I have ever been in my life. I don't have very much to add. I think the people who've spoken before me have spoken very well to the importance of the Great Salt Lake, to the environment, to the well-being of our people, to the All the aspects of this and I would just like to my voice to theirs, and i'd also like to say that this does seem like it should be a very simple thing to to see our senses tell us what is happening on the problems. Since I moved to this State in two thousand and eight. I've seen the Great Salt Lake. I've seen it shores or a seed, and I've seen it become just in that short amount of time, much smaller than it used to be, and I believe it was Helen Como who brought up the Rlc. Russia. We are not immune to environmental catastrophe. If we don't pay attention to the warning signs, and there are plenty of warning signs, then we will have an environmental catastrophe. So I would also urge the Department of Water Quality declines this request, and that we continue to do everything that we can to save the Great Salt Lake and the gem that it is. Thank you for your time |
| 785 | Carina Wells | Hi, yes, thank you. Um. Good evening. My name is Carina Wells, and I grew up here in Utah. It has been wrenching to see the species get shorter each year, and the wake at smaller each time I see it. I am a law student now at the University of Utah. In school we have learned about the public trust doctrine mit Ctl and the Public Trust Doctrine is a State common law doctrine that says that certain natural and cultural resources must be preserved for public use. The Utah Constitution embodies this principle. It sees that public lands of the State are held in trust for the people. Courts, including the Supreme Court. One hundred and fifty have held that States must use submerged lands in a manner that protects the collective interest of citizens to use and enjoy the resources, and that prohibited States from giving away natural resources to private corporations. When those resources weren't value to the public, we know that the great Salt Lake is necessary for the health and welfare of the public, the State should not approve the permit. Thank you. |
| 786 | Kaleb Nordwald | I just wanted to give a little bit of a background to myself. I'm. From a small town in the midwest uh my hometown has less than a my hometown. I'm sorry I'm having a child here. My hometown is less than a third of the size of Salt Lake.. The main industry is natural resources and mining in my hometown, and our hometown was |

| Number | Commenter | Comment |
|--------|--------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <p>instrumental in the and the war efforts of the great World wars, and even in the Space race fourteen. Us Presidents have made over thirty visits to a town that makes to will it look like a thriving metropolis. My grandfather, father, and myself in my early years worked in the mining and natural resources, industries, and unfortunately, the natural resource companies and my hometown didn't conduct their businesses sustainably, and are now all bankrupt due to the environmental and human health, related issues that their business practices caused one hundred and fifty. Do the collapse of non-sustainable natural resource companies. I don't even live in the Midwest anymore. I live actually on the shores of the Great Salt Lake, and I don't even work in the same industry. My father who knew that industry, his whole life um was out of a job, and doesn't even live in the same part of the state. The town that welcomed over thirty presidential visits. Um now rinks high in crime, High School dropouts and teenage pregnancies recently, and the great factories and mansions that introduced our small town on a global stage. Were torn down to provide way for Section eight housing and parks. I want to be clear that i'm not saying no to us. I'm not saying no to us magnesium, but I am saying no to how us magnesium proposes to conduct their mind their mineral extraction. Utah is virtually the only magnesium mine in the Us. And Utah's unique geology is an important part of the economy. , However, I've been given a front row seat, and how this movie plays out, and I don't like the ending mining profits are already under pressure due to sustainability concerns of the Great Salt Lake as evidenced in House Bill one hundred and fifty-seven one. The Utah Government has announced multiple grants to improve sustainability in the area to the tunes of tens of millions of dollars and more. And if the health effects of humans, wildlife, and children isn't enough to cause concern, Let's talk about money. I think us magnesium, the State of Utah, and ultimately the State citizens and residents will all likely make more money if natural resource companies perform their business practices sustainably. One hundred and fifty, usually the majority of the value of a company. Uh, that the the majority of the value that that provides the owner, the company owner, with the most money is in the going concerned value of the company or the terminal value, as some financial analysts like to call it, and it seems like us magnesium doesn't mine the already dry. It seems like us magnesium doesn't mind the already dry Lake bed. Um, to my knowledge. So, therefore, water is an important part of their mineral extraction practices, and so a Us. Magnesium is likely to make more money if there's more water in the lake, if the um ski industries as we've seen dry up um, the then um and Utah will make less money and in tax revenues, and they make more money in tax revenues and tourism from the ski industry, anyway, than from the mining industry, is what it seems like one hundred and fifty. And then also, if the State residents um have a decline in property values and in um workability and livability concerns. Then property values in the state of Utah will dry up as well as um. Just individual people needing to uproot their lives and sell their houses for less because they can't live in the area. Um, thank you for your time today,</p> |
| 787 | Abbie Simons | <p>Um, hi! Yeah, My name's Abby Um i'm! Twenty-nine. I have lived here my whole life born and raised in Salt Lake Valley. Um! I just want to add my voice to what everyone else has been saying. Um, in my age group. There's a lot of concern about our features here in Utah. You know, my friends, we love living here. We envision futures here, but unfortunately we're not really able to do that. Um, as we see almost constantly just the land in the environment. Sacrifice to corporate profits more often than not. And I think we all know that uh, not only in Utah but in the world. A major shift needs to happen where we prioritize the land over money, or else there's going to be no more money to have. So. That's all. I also would love to see. I think it would be impressive to see US Magnesium. Uh, if they want to take more water from the lake. Um! I think that it would make sense for them to contribute to raising the levels of Lake back to where that such a thing is possible. So i'd love to see that I uh, we'll see. But uh, yeah, that's all I have to say, thanks.</p> |

DWQ-2022-032392